

No. 15-1363 (and consolidated cases)

---

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT**

---

STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA, *et al.*,  
*Petitioners,*

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY, *et al.*,  
*Respondents.*

---

**On Petition for Review of Final Agency Action of the  
United States Environmental Protection Agency  
80 Fed. Reg. 64,662 (Oct. 23, 2015)**

---

**OPENING BRIEF OF PETITIONERS ON CORE LEGAL ISSUES**

---

Ken Paxton  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
Charles E. Roy  
First Assistant Attorney General  
Scott A. Keller  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 12548  
Austin, TX 78711-2548  
Tel: (512) 936-1700  
scott.keller@texasattorneygeneral.gov  
  
*Counsel for Petitioner State of Texas*

Patrick Morrissey  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WEST  
VIRGINIA  
Elbert Lin  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
J. Zak Ritchie  
Assistant Attorney General  
State Capitol Building 1, Room 26-E  
Charleston, WV 25305  
Tel: (304) 558-2021  
Fax: (304) 558-0140  
elbert.lin@wvago.gov

**DATED: February 19, 2016**

*Counsel for Petitioner State of West Virginia*

*Additional counsel listed on following pages*

---

---

F. William Brownell  
Allison D. Wood  
Henry V. Nickel  
Tauna M. Szymanski  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
bbrownell@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Utility Air Regulatory  
Group and American Public Power Association*

Peter S. Glaser  
Carroll W. McGuffey III  
Justin T. Wong  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
401 Ninth Street N.W., Suite 1000  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 274-2998  
peter.glaser@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner National Mining  
Association*

Peter D. Keisler  
Roger R. Martella, Jr.  
C. Frederick Beckner III  
Ryan C. Morris  
Paul J. Ray  
SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP  
1501 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 736-8027  
pkeisler@sidley.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Chamber of Commerce of  
the United States of America; National  
Association of Manufacturers; American Fuel  
& Petrochemical Manufacturers; and National  
Federation of Independent Business*

Luther Strange  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ALABAMA  
Andrew Brasher  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
501 Washington Avenue  
Montgomery, AL 36130  
Tel: (334) 590-1029  
abrasher@ago.state.al.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Alabama*

Mark Brnovich  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARIZONA  
John R. Lopez IV  
*Counsel of Record*  
Dominic E. Draye  
Keith Miller  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Maureen Scott  
Janet Wagner  
Janice Alward  
Arizona Corp. Commission,  
Staff Attorneys  
1275 West Washington  
Phoenix, AZ 85007  
Tel: (602) 542-5025  
john.lopez@azag.gov  
dominic.draye@azag.gov  
keith.miller@azag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Arizona Corporation  
Commission*

Thomas A. Lorenzen  
D.C. Cir. Bar No. 394369  
Daniel W. Wolff  
Sherrie A. Armstrong  
CROWELL & MORING LLP  
1001 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 624-2500  
tlorenzen@crowell.com  
dwolff@crowell.com  
sarmstrong@crowell.com

*Counsel for Petitioners National Rural Electric Cooperative Association; Big Rivers Electric Corporation; Brazos Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Buckeye Power, Inc.; Central Montana Electric Power Cooperative; Central Power Electric Cooperative, Inc., Corn Belt Power Cooperative; Dairyland Power Cooperative; East River Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Georgia Transmission Corporation; Kansas Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; North Carolina Electric Membership Corporation; Northwest Iowa Power Cooperative; Oglethorpe Power Corporation; PowerSouth Energy Cooperative; Prairie Power, Inc.; Rushmore Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Seminole Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Southern Illinois Power Cooperative; Sunflower Electric Power Corporation; and Upper Missouri G. & T. Electric Cooperative, Inc.*

Leslie Rutledge  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARKANSAS  
Lee Rudofsky  
Solicitor General  
Jamie L. Ewing  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
323 Center Street, Suite 400  
Little Rock, AR 72201  
Tel: (501) 682-5310  
jamie.ewing@arkansasag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Arkansas*

Cynthia H. Coffman  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF COLORADO  
Frederick Yarger  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
1300 Broadway, 10th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203  
Tel: (720) 508-6168  
fred.yarger@state.co.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Colorado*

*Of Counsel*

Rae Cronmiller  
Environmental Counsel  
NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF RURAL  
ELECTRIC COOPERATIVES  
4301 Wilson Blvd.  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Tel: (703) 907-5500  
rae.cronmiller@nreca.coop

*Counsel for Petitioner National Rural Electric  
Cooperative Association*

Eric L. Hiser  
JORDEN BISCHOFF & HISER, PLC  
7272 E. Indian School Road, Suite 360  
Scottsdale, AZ 85251  
Tel: (480) 505-3927  
ehiser@jordenbischoff.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Arizona Electric Power  
Cooperative, Inc.*

Brian A. Prestwood  
Senior Corporate and Compliance  
Counsel  
ASSOCIATED ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE,  
INC.  
2814 S. Golden, P.O. Box 754  
Springfield, MO 65801  
Tel: (417) 885-9273  
bprestwood@aeci.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Associated Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.*

Pamela Jo Bondi  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF FLORIDA  
Allen Winsor  
Solicitor General of Florida  
*Counsel of Record*  
Office of the Attorney General  
PL-01, The Capitol  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050  
Tel: (850) 414-3681  
Fax: (850) 410-2672  
allen.winsor@myfloridalegal.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Florida*

Samuel S. Olens  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF GEORGIA  
Britt C. Grant  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
40 Capitol Square S.W.  
Atlanta, GA 30334  
Tel: (404) 656-3300  
Fax: (404) 463-9453  
bgrant@law.ga.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Georgia*

David Crabtree  
Vice President, General Counsel  
DESERET GENERATION & TRANSMISSION  
CO-OPERATIVE  
10714 South Jordan Gateway  
South Jordan, UT 84095  
Tel: (801) 619-9500  
Crabtree@deseretpower.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Deseret Generation &  
Transmission Co-operative*

John M. Holloway III, DC Bar # 494459  
SUTHERLAND ASBILL & BRENNAN LLP  
700 Sixth Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 383-0100  
Fax: (202) 383-3593  
jay.holloway@sutherland.com

*Counsel for Petitioners East Kentucky Power  
Cooperative, Inc.; Hoosier Energy Rural Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.; Minnkota Power Cooperative,  
Inc.; and South Mississippi Electric Power  
Association*

Gregory F. Zoeller  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF INDIANA  
Timothy Junk  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Indiana Government Ctr. South  
Fifth Floor  
302 West Washington Street  
Indianapolis, IN 46205  
Tel: (317) 232-6247  
tim.junk@atg.in.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Indiana*

Derek Schmidt  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KANSAS  
Jeffrey A. Chanay  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Bryan C. Clark  
Assistant Solicitor General  
120 S.W. 10th Avenue, 3rd Floor  
Topeka, KS 66612  
Tel: (785) 368-8435  
Fax: (785) 291-3767  
jeff.chanay@ag.ks.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Kansas*

Patrick Burchette  
HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP  
800 17<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W., Suite 1100  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 469-5102  
Patrick.Burchette@hklaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioners East Texas Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.; Northeast Texas Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.; Sam Rayburn G&T Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.; and Tex-La Electric  
Cooperative of Texas, Inc.*

Christopher L. Bell  
GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP  
1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 1700  
Houston, TX 77002  
Tel: (713) 374-3556  
bellc@gtlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Golden Spread Electrical  
Cooperative, Inc.*

Andy Beshear  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KENTUCKY  
Gregory T. Dutton  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
700 Capital Avenue  
Suite 118  
Frankfort, KY 40601  
Tel: (502) 696-5453  
gregory.dutton@ky.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Commonwealth of  
Kentucky*

Jeff Landry  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF LOUISIANA  
Steven B. “Beaux” Jones  
*Counsel of Record*  
Duncan S. Kemp, IV  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Environmental Section – Civil Division  
1885 N. Third Street  
Baton Rouge, LA 70804  
Tel: (225) 326-6085  
Fax: (225) 326-6099  
jonesst@ag.state.la.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana*

Mark Walters  
D.C. Cir. Bar No. 54161  
Michael J. Nasi  
D.C. Cir. Bar No. 53850  
JACKSON WALKER L.L.P.  
100 Congress Avenue, Suite 1100  
Austin, TX 78701  
Tel: (512) 236-2000  
mwalters@jw.com  
mnasi@jw.com

*Counsel for Petitioners San Miguel Electric  
Cooperative, Inc. and South Texas Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.*

Randolph G. Holt  
Jeremy L. Fetty  
PARR RICHEY OBREMSKEY FRANSEN &  
PATTERSON LLP  
Wabash Valley Power Association, Inc.  
722 N. High School Road  
P.O. Box 24700  
Indianapolis, IN 46224  
Tel: (317) 481-2815  
R\_holt@wvpa.com  
jfetty@parrlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Wabash Valley Power  
Association, Inc.*

Herman Robinson  
Executive Counsel  
Donald Trahan  
*Counsel of Record*  
Elliott Vega  
LOUISIANA DEPARTMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY  
Legal Division  
P.O. Box 4302  
Baton Rouge, LA 70821-4302  
Tel: (225) 219-3985  
Fax: (225) 219-4068  
donald.trahan@la.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana  
Department of Environmental Quality*

Monica Derbes Gibson  
Lesley Foxhall Pietras  
LISKOW & LEWIS, P.L.C.  
701 Poydras Street, Suite 5000  
New Orleans, LA 70139  
Tel: (504) 556-4010  
Fax: (504) 556-4108  
mdgibson@liskow.com  
lfpietras@liskow.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Louisiana Public Service  
Commission*

Megan H. Berge  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Western Farmers Electric  
Cooperative*

Steven C. Kohl  
Gaetan Gerville-Reache  
WARNER NORCROSS & JUDD LLP  
2000 Town Center, Suite 2700  
Southfield, MI 48075-1318  
Tel: (248) 784-5000  
skohl@wnj.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Wolverine Power Supply  
Cooperative, Inc.*

Bill Schuette  
ATTORNEY GENERAL FOR THE PEOPLE  
OF MICHIGAN  
Aaron D. Lindstrom  
Michigan Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 30212  
Lansing, MI 48909  
Tel: (515) 373-1124  
Fax: (517) 373-3042  
lindstroma@michigan.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner People of the State of  
Michigan*

Jim Hood  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF  
MISSISSIPPI  
Harold E. Pizzetta  
Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Litigation Division  
Office of the Attorney General  
Post Office Box 220  
Jackson, MS 39205  
Tel: (601) 359-3816  
Fax: (601) 359-2003  
hpizz@ago.state.ms.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Mississippi*



Christina F. Gomez  
Lawrence E. Volmert  
Garrison W. Kaufman  
Jill H. Van Noord  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
555 Seventeenth Street, Suite 3200  
Denver, CO 80202  
Tel: (303) 295-8000  
Fax: (303) 295-8261  
cgomez@hollandhart.com  
lvolmert@hollandhart.com  
gwkaufman@hollandhart.com  
jhvan Noord@hollandhart.com

Patrick R. Day  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
2515 Warren Avenue, Suite 450  
Cheyenne, WY 82001  
Tel: (307) 778-4200  
Fax: (307) 778-8175  
pday@hollandhart.com

Emily C. Schilling  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
222 South Main Street, Suite 2200  
Salt Lake City, UT 84101  
Tel: (801) 799-5800  
Fax: (801) 799-5700  
ecschilling@hollandhart.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Basin Electric Power  
Cooperative*

Donna J. Hodges  
Senior Counsel  
MISSISSIPPI DEPARTMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY  
P.O. Box 2261  
Jackson, MS 39225-2261  
Tel: (601) 961-5369  
Fax: (601) 961-5349  
donna\_hodges@deq.state.ms.us

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Department of  
Environmental Quality*

Todd E. Palmer  
Valerie L. Green  
MICHAEL, BEST & FRIEDRICH LLP  
601 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20004-2601  
Tel: (202) 747-9560  
Fax: (202) 347-1819  
tepalmer@michaelbest.com  
vlgreen@michaelbest.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Public Service  
Commission*

Stacey Turner  
SOUTHERN COMPANY SERVICES, INC.  
600 18<sup>th</sup> Street North  
BIN 14N-8195  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 257-2823  
staturne@southernco.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Alabama Power Company, Georgia Power Company, Gulf Power Company, and Mississippi Power Company*

C. Grady Moore, III  
Steven G. McKinney  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 Sixth Avenue North, Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35303-4642  
Tel: (205) 251-8100  
Fax: (205) 488-5704  
gmoore@balch.com  
smckinney@balch.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Alabama Power Company*

Margaret Claiborne Campbell  
Angela J. Levin  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
600 Peachtree Street, NE, Suite 5200  
Atlanta, GA 30308-2216  
Tel: (404) 885-3000  
margaret.campbell@troutmansanders.com  
angela.levin@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Georgia Power Company*

Chris Koster  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MISSOURI  
James R. Layton  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 899  
207 W. High Street  
Jefferson City, MO 65102  
Tel: (573) 751-1800  
Fax: (573) 751-0774  
james.layton@ago.mo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Missouri*

Timothy C. Fox  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MONTANA  
Alan Joscelyn  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
Dale Schowengerdt  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
215 North Sanders  
Helena, MT 59620-1401  
Tel: (406) 444-7008  
dales@mt.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Montana*

Terese T. Wyly  
Ben H. Stone  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1310 Twenty Fifth Avenue  
Gulfport, MS 39501-1931  
Tel: (228) 214-0413  
twyly@balch.com  
bstone@balch.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Power  
Company*

Jeffrey A. Stone  
BEGGS & LANE, RLLP  
501 Commendancia Street  
Pensacola, FL 32502  
Tel: (850) 432-2451  
JAS@beggslane.com

James S. Alves  
2110 Trescott Drive  
Tallahassee, FL 32308  
Tel: (850) 566-7607  
jim.s.alves@outlook.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Gulf Power Company*

Doug Peterson  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEBRASKA  
Dave Bydlaek  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
Justin D. Lavene  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
2115 State Capitol  
Lincoln, NE 68509  
Tel: (402) 471-2834  
justin.lavene@nebraska.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Nebraska*

John J. Hoffman  
ACTING ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEW  
JERSEY  
David C. Apy  
Assistant Attorney General  
Robert J. Kinney  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Division of Law  
R.J. Hughes Justice Complex  
P.O. Box 093  
25 Market Street  
Trenton, NJ 08625-0093  
Tel: (609) 292-6945  
Fax: (609) 341-5030  
robert.kinney@dol.lps.state.nj.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of New Jersey*

James S. Alves  
2110 Trescott Drive  
Tallahassee, FL 32308  
Tel: (850) 566-7607  
jim.s.alves@outlook.com

*Counsel for Petitioner CO<sub>2</sub> Task Force of the  
Florida Electric Power Coordinating Group, Inc.*

John J. McMackin  
WILLIAMS & JENSEN  
701 8th Street, N.W., Suite 500  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 659-8201  
jjmcmackin@wms-jen.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Energy-Intensive  
Manufacturers Working Group on Greenhouse  
Gas Regulation*

William M. Bumpers  
Megan H. Berge  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
william.bumpers@bakerbotts.com  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

Kelly McQueen  
ENERGY SERVICES, INC.  
425 W. Capitol Avenue, 27th Floor  
Little Rock, AR 72201  
Tel: (501) 377-5760  
kmcque1@entergy.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Entergy Corporation*

Wayne Stenehjem  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NORTH  
DAKOTA  
Margaret Olson  
Assistant Attorney General  
North Dakota Attorney General's Office  
600 E. Boulevard Avenue #125  
Bismarck, ND 58505  
Tel: (701) 328-3640  
maiolson@nd.gov

Paul M. Seby  
Special Assistant Attorney General  
State of North Dakota  
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
1200 17th Street, Suite 2400  
Denver, CO 80202  
Tel: (303) 572-6500  
Fax: (303) 572-6540  
sebyp@gtlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of North Dakota*

Michael DeWine  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO  
Eric E. Murphy  
State Solicitor  
*Counsel of Record*  
30 E. Broad Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Tel: (614) 466-8980  
eric.murphy@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Ohio*

Paul J. Zidlicky  
SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP  
1501 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 736-8000  
pzidlicky@sidley.com

*Counsel for Petitioners GenOn Mid-Atlantic, LLC; Indian River Power LLC; Louisiana Generating LLC; Midwest Generation, LLC; NRG Chalk Point LLC; NRG Power Midwest LP; NRG Rema LLC; NRG Texas Power LLC; NRG Wholesale Generation LP; and Vienna Power LLC*

David M. Flannery  
Kathy G. Beckett  
Edward L. Kropp  
STEPTOE & JOHNSON, PLLC  
505 Virginia Street East  
Charleston, WV 25326  
Tel: (304) 353-8000  
dave.flannery@steptoe-johnson.com  
kathy.beckett@steptoe-johnson.com  
skipp.kropp@steptoe-johnson.com

Stephen L. Miller  
STEPTOE & JOHNSON, PLLC  
700 N. Hurstbourne Parkway, Suite 115  
Louisville, KY 40222  
Tel: (502) 423-2000  
steve.miller@steptoe-johnson.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Indiana Utility Group*

E. Scott Pruitt  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OKLAHOMA  
Patrick R. Wyrick  
Solicitor General of Oklahoma  
313 N.E. 21st Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73105  
Tel: (405) 521-4396  
Fax: (405) 522-0669  
fc.docket@oag.state.ok.us  
scott.pruitt@oag.ok.gov

David B. Rivkin, Jr.  
*Counsel of Record*  
Mark W. DeLaquil  
Andrew M. Grossman  
BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP  
Washington Square, Suite 1100  
1050 Connecticut Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
Tel: (202) 861-1731  
Fax: (202) 861-1783  
drivkin@bakerlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioners State of Oklahoma and Oklahoma Department of Environmental Quality*

F. William Brownell  
Eric J. Murdock  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
bbrownell@hunton.com  
emurdock@hunton.com

Nash E. Long III  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
Bank of America Plaza, Suite 3500  
101 South Tryon Street  
Charlotte, NC 28280  
Tel: (704) 378-4700  
nlong@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioner LG&E and KU Energy  
LLC*

Alan Wilson  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
CAROLINA  
Robert D. Cook  
Solicitor General  
James Emory Smith, Jr.  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 11549  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Tel: (803) 734-3680  
Fax: (803) 734-3677  
esmith@scag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Carolina*

Marty J. Jackley  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
DAKOTA  
Steven R. Blair  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
1302 E. Highway 14, Suite 1  
Pierre, SD 57501  
Tel: (605) 773-3215  
steven.blair@state.sd.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Dakota*

P. Stephen Gidiere III  
Thomas L. Casey III  
Julia B. Barber  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 6th Ave. N., Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 251-8100  
sgidiere@balch.com

Stephanie Z. Moore  
Vice President and General Counsel  
LUMINANT GENERATION COMPANY LLC  
1601 Bryan Street, 22nd Floor  
Dallas, TX 75201

Daniel J. Kelly  
Vice President and Associate General  
Counsel  
ENERGY FUTURE HOLDINGS CORP.  
1601 Bryan Street, 43rd Floor  
Dallas, TX 75201

*Counsel for Petitioners Luminant Generation  
Company LLC; Oak Grove Management  
Company LLC; Big Brown Power Company  
LLC; Sandow Power Company LLC; Big  
Brown Lignite Company LLC; Luminant  
Mining Company LLC; and Luminant Big  
Brown Mining Company LLC*

Sean Reyes  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF UTAH  
Tyler R. Green  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Parker Douglas  
Federal Solicitor  
Utah State Capitol Complex  
350 North State Street, Suite 230  
Salt Lake City, UT 84114-2320  
pdouglas@utah.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Utah*

Brad Schimel  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WISCONSIN  
Misha Tseytlin  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Andrew Cook  
Deputy Attorney General  
Delanie M. Breuer  
Assistant Deputy Attorney General  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
17 West Main Street  
Madison, WI 53707  
Tel: (608) 267-9323  
tseytlinm@doj.state.wi.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wisconsin*

Ronald J. Tenpas  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS  
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 739-3000  
rtenpas@morganlewis.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Minnesota Power (an  
operating division of ALLETE, Inc.)*

Allison D. Wood  
Tauna M. Szymanski  
Andrew D. Knudsen  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
awood@hunton.com  
tszymanski@hunton.com  
aknudsen@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Montana-Dakota Utilities  
Co., a Division of MDU Resources Group, Inc.*

Peter K. Michael  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WYOMING  
James Kaste  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Michael J. McGrady  
Erik Petersen  
Senior Assistant Attorneys General  
Elizabeth Morrisseau  
Assistant Attorney General  
2320 Capitol Avenue  
Cheyenne, WY 82002  
Tel: (307) 777-6946  
Fax: (307) 777-3542  
james.kaste@wyo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wyoming*

Sam M. Hayes  
General Counsel  
*Counsel of Record*  
Craig Bromby  
Deputy General Counsel  
Andrew Norton  
Deputy General Counsel  
NORTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY  
1601 Mail Service Center  
Raleigh, NC 27699-1601  
Tel: (919) 707-8616  
sam.hayes@ncdenr.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner North Carolina  
Department of Environmental Quality*



William M. Bumpers  
Megan H. Berge  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
william.bumpers@bakerbotts.com  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner NorthWestern  
Corporation d/b/a NorthWestern Energy*

Joshua R. More  
Jane E. Montgomery  
Amy Antonioli  
Raghav Murali  
SCHIFF HARDIN LLP  
233 South Wacker Drive  
Suite 6600  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Tel: (312) 258-5500  
jmore@schiffhardin.com  
jmontgomery@schiffhardin.com  
aantonioli@schiffhardin.com  
rmurali@schiffhardin.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Prairie State Generating  
Company, LLC*

Dennis Lane  
STINSON LEONARD STREET LLP  
1775 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 800  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 785-9100  
Fax: (202) 785-9163  
dennis.lane@stinson.com

Parthenia B. Evans  
STINSON LEONARD STREET LLP  
1201 Walnut Street, Suite 2900  
Kansas City, MO 64106  
Tel: (816) 842-8600  
Fax: (816) 691-3495  
parthy.evans@stinson.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Kansas City Board of  
Public Utilities – Unified Government of  
Wyandotte County/Kansas City, Kansas*

Allison D. Wood  
Tauna M. Szymanski  
Andrew D. Knudsen  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
awood@hunton.com  
tszymanski@hunton.com  
aknudsen@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Tri-State Generation and  
Transmission Association, Inc.*

William M. Bumpers  
Megan H. Berge  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
william.bumpers@bakerbotts.com  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Westar Energy, Inc.*

Peter D. Keisler  
Roger R. Martella, Jr.  
C. Frederick Beckner III  
Ryan C. Morris  
Paul J. Ray  
SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP  
1501 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 736-8027  
pkeisler@sidley.com

*Counsel for Petitioners American Chemistry Council; American Coke and Coal Chemicals Institute; American Foundry Society; American Forest & Paper Association; American Iron & Steel Institute; American Wood Council; Brick Industry Association; Electricity Consumers Resource Council; Lignite Energy Council; National Lime Association; National Oilseed Processors Association; and Portland Cement Association*

Jeffrey R. Holmstead  
Sandra Y. Snyder  
BRACEWELL & GIULIANI LLP  
2000 K Street, N.W., Suite 500  
Washington, D.C. 20006-1872  
Tel: (202) 828-5852  
Fax: (202) 857-4812  
jeff.holmstead@bgllp.com

*Counsel for Petitioner American Coalition for Clean Coal Electricity*

Geoffrey K. Barnes  
J. Van Carson  
Wendlene M. Lavey  
John D. Lazzaretti  
Robert D. Cheren  
SQUIRE PATTON BOGGS (US) LLP  
4900 Key Tower  
127 Public Square  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
Tel: (216) 479-8646  
geoffrey.barnes@squirepb.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Murray Energy  
Corporation*

Andrew C. Emrich  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
6380 South Fiddlers Green Circle  
Suite 500  
Greenwood Village, CO 80111  
Tel: (303) 290-1621  
Fax: (866) 711-8046  
acemrich@hollandhart.com

Emily C. Schilling  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
222 South Main Street, Suite 2200  
Salt Lake City, UT 84101  
Tel: (801) 799-5753  
Fax: (202) 747-6574  
ecschilling@hollandhart.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Newmont Nevada  
Energy Investment, LLC and Newmont USA  
Limited*

Charles T. Wehland

*Counsel of Record*

Brian J. Murray

JONES DAY

77 West Wacker Drive, Suite 3500

Chicago, IL 60601-1692

Tel: (312) 782-3939

Fax: (312) 782-8585

ctwehland@jonesday.com

bjmurray@jonesday.com

*Counsel for Petitioners The North American Coal Corporation; The Coteau Properties Company; Coyote Creek Mining Company, LLC; The Falkirk Mining Company; Mississippi Lignite Mining Company; North American Coal Royalty Company; NODAK Energy Services, LLC; Otter Creek Mining Company, LLC; and The Sabine Mining Company*

Robert G. McLusky

JACKSON KELLY, PLLC

1600 Laidley Tower

P.O. Box 553

Charleston, WV 25322

Tel: (304) 340-1000

rmclusky@jacksonkelly.com

*Counsel for Petitioner West Virginia Coal Association*

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
Tel: (301) 639-5238 (cell)  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner International Brotherhood  
of Boilermakers, Iron Ship Builders,  
Blacksmiths, Forgers & Helpers*

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
Tel: (301) 639-5238 (cell)  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner International Brotherhood  
of Electrical Workers, AFL-CIO*

Grant F. Crandall  
General Counsel  
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA  
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive  
Triangle, VA 22172  
Tel: (703) 291-2429  
gcrandall@umwa.org

Arthur Traynor, III  
Staff Counsel  
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA  
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive  
Triangle, VA 22172  
Tel: (703) 291-2457  
atraynor@umwa.org

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner United Mine Workers of  
America*

Steven P. Lehotsky  
Sheldon B. Gilbert  
U.S. CHAMBER LITIGATION CENTER, INC.  
1615 H Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20062  
Tel: (202) 463-5337  
slehotsky@uschamber.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Chamber of Commerce of  
the United States of America*

Linda E. Kelly  
Quentin Riegel  
MANUFACTURERS' CENTER FOR LEGAL  
ACTION  
733 10th Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 637-3000  
qriegel@nam.org

*Counsel for Petitioner National Association of  
Manufacturers*

Richard S. Moskowitz  
AMERICAN FUEL & PETROCHEMICAL  
MANUFACTURERS  
1667 K Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 457-0480  
rmoskowitz@afpm.org

*Counsel for Petitioner American Fuel &  
Petrochemical Manufacturers*

Karen R. Harned  
Executive Director  
Elizabeth A. Gaudio  
Senior Executive Counsel  
NATIONAL FEDERATION OF  
INDEPENDENT BUSINESS  
SMALL BUSINESS LEGAL CENTER  
1201 F Street, N.W., Suite 200  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 314-2061  
karen.harned@nfib.org  
elizabeth.milito@nfib.org

*Counsel for Petitioner National Federation of  
Independent Business*



Megan H. Berge  
William M. Bumpers  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com  
william.bumpers@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner National Association of  
Home Builders*

Kathryn D. Kirmayer  
General Counsel  
Evelyn R. Nackman  
Associate General Counsel  
ASSOCIATION OF AMERICAN RAILROADS  
425 3rd Street, S.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20024  
Tel: (202) 639-2100  
kkirmayer@aar.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Association of American  
Railroads*

Chaim Mandelbaum  
Litigation Manager  
FREE MARKET ENVIRONMENTAL LAW  
CLINIC  
726 N. Nelson Street, Suite 9  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Tel: (703) 577-9973  
chaim12@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Energy and Environment  
Legal Institute*

Catherine E. Stetson  
Eugene A. Sokoloff  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
555 Thirteenth Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004-1109  
Tel: (202) 637-5600  
Fax: (202) 637-5910  
cate.stetson@hoganlovells.com  
eugene.sokoloff@hoganlovells.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Denbury Onshore, LLC*

C. Boyden Gray  
Adam R.F. Gustafson  
*Counsel of Record*  
Derek S. Lyons  
James R. Conde  
BOYDEN GRAY & ASSOCIATES, PLLC  
1627 I Street, N.W., Suite 950  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 955-0620  
gustafson@boydengrayassociates.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Competitive Enterprise  
Institute; Buckeye Institute for Public Policy  
Solutions; Independence Institute; Rio Grande  
Foundation; Sutherland Institute; Klaus J.  
Christoph; Samuel R. Damewood; Catherine C.  
Dellin; Joseph W. Luquire; Lisa R. Markham;  
Patrick T. Peterson; and Kristi Rosenquist*

Sam Kazman  
Hans Bader  
COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE  
1899 L Street, N.W., 12th Floor  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
Tel: (202) 331-1010

*Counsel for Petitioner Competitive Enterprise  
Institute*

Robert Alt  
BUCKEYE INSTITUTE FOR PUBLIC POLICY  
SOLUTIONS  
88 E. Broad Street, Suite 1120  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Tel: (614) 224-4422  
robert@buckeyeinstitute.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Buckeye Institute for  
Public Policy Solutions*

**CERTIFICATE AS TO PARTIES, RULINGS, AND RELATED CASES**

Pursuant to Circuit Rule 28(a)(1), Petitioners state as follows:

**A. Parties, Intervenors, and Amici Curiae**

These cases involve the following parties:

**Petitioners:**

No. 15-1363: State of West Virginia; State of Texas; State of Alabama; State of Arizona Corporation Commission; State of Arkansas; State of Colorado; State of Florida; State of Georgia; State of Indiana; State of Kansas; Commonwealth of Kentucky; State of Louisiana; State of Louisiana Department of Environmental Quality; Attorney General Bill Schuette, People of Michigan; State of Missouri; State of Montana; State of Nebraska; State of New Jersey; State of North Carolina Department of Environmental Quality; State of Ohio; State of South Carolina; State of South Dakota; State of Utah; State of Wisconsin; and State of Wyoming.

No. 15-1364: State of Oklahoma *ex rel.* E. Scott Pruitt, in his official capacity as Attorney General of Oklahoma and Oklahoma Department of Environmental Quality.

No. 15-1365: International Brotherhood of Boilermakers, Iron Ship Builders, Blacksmiths, Forgers & Helpers.

No. 15-1366: Murray Energy Corporation.

No. 15-1367: National Mining Association.

No. 15-1368: American Coalition for Clean Coal Electricity.

No. 15-1370: Utility Air Regulatory Group and American Public Power Association.

No. 15-1371: Alabama Power Company; Georgia Power Company; Gulf Power Company; and Mississippi Power Company.

No. 15-1372: CO<sub>2</sub> Task Force of the Florida Electric Power Coordinating Group, Inc.

No. 15-1373: Montana-Dakota Utilities Co., a Division of MDU Resources Group, Inc.

No. 15-1374: Tri-State Generation and Transmission Association, Inc.

No. 15-1375: United Mine Workers of America.

No. 15-1376: National Rural Electric Cooperative Association; Arizona Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Associated Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Big Rivers Electric Corporation; Brazos Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Buckeye Power, Inc.; Central Montana Electric Power Cooperative; Central Power Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Corn Belt Power Cooperative; Dairyland Power Cooperative; Deseret Generation & Transmission Co-operative; East Kentucky Power Cooperative, Inc.; East River Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; East Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Georgia Transmission Corporation; Golden Spread Electrical Cooperative, Inc.; Hoosier Energy Rural Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Kansas Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Minnkota Power Cooperative, Inc.; North Carolina Electric Membership Corporation; Northeast Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Northwest Iowa Power

Cooperative; Oglethorpe Power Corporation; PowerSouth Energy Cooperative; Prairie Power, Inc.; Rushmore Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Sam Rayburn G&T Electric Cooperative, Inc.; San Miguel Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Seminole Electric Cooperative, Inc.; South Mississippi Electric Power Association; South Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Southern Illinois Power Cooperative; Sunflower Electric Power Corporation; Tex-La Electric Cooperative of Texas, Inc.; Upper Missouri G. & T. Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Wabash Valley Power Association, Inc.; Western Farmers Electric Cooperative; and Wolverine Power Supply Cooperative, Inc.

No. 15-1377: Westar Energy, Inc.

No. 15-1378: NorthWestern Corporation d/b/a NorthWestern Energy.

No. 15-1379: National Association of Home Builders (“NAHB”).

No. 15-1380: State of North Dakota.

No. 15-1382: Chamber of Commerce of the United States of America; National Association of Manufacturers; American Fuel & Petrochemical Manufacturers; National Federation of Independent Business; American Chemistry Council; American Coke and Coal Chemicals Institute; American Foundry Society; American Forest & Paper Association; American Iron & Steel Institute; American Wood Council; Brick Industry Association; Electricity Consumers Resource Council; Lignite Energy Council; National Lime Association; National Oilseed Processors Association; and Portland Cement Association.

No. 15-1383: Association of American Railroads.

No. 15-1386: Luminant Generation Company LLC; Oak Grove Management Company LLC; Big Brown Power Company LLC; Sandow Power Company LLC; Big Brown Lignite Company LLC; Luminant Mining Company LLC; and Luminant Big Brown Mining Company LLC.

No. 15-1393: Basin Electric Power Cooperative.

No. 15-1398: Energy & Environment Legal Institute.

No. 15-1409: Mississippi Department of Environmental Quality; State of Mississippi; and Mississippi Public Service Commission.

No. 15-1410: International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, AFL-CIO.

No. 15-1413: Entergy Corporation.

No. 15-1418: LG&E and KU Energy LLC.

No. 15-1422: West Virginia Coal Association.

No. 15-1432: Newmont Nevada Energy Investment, LLC, and Newmont USA Limited.

No. 15-1442: The Kansas City Board of Public Utilities – Unified Government of Wyandotte County/Kansas City, Kansas.

No. 15-1451: The North American Coal Corporation; The Coteau Properties Company; Coyote Creek Mining Company, LLC; The Falkirk Mining Company; Mississippi Lignite Mining Company; North American Coal Royalty

Company; NODAK Energy Services, LLC; Otter Creek Mining Company, LLC; and The Sabine Mining Company.

No. 15-1459: Indiana Utility Group.

No. 15-1464: Louisiana Public Service Commission.

No. 15-1470: GenOn Mid-Atlantic, LLC; Indian River Power LLC; Louisiana Generating LLC; Midwest Generation, LLC; NRG Chalk Point LLC; NRG Power Midwest LP; NRG Rema LLC; NRG Texas Power LLC; NRG Wholesale Generation LP; and Vienna Power LLC.

No. 15-1472: Prairie State Generating Company, LLC.

No. 15-1474: Minnesota Power (an operating division of ALLETE, Inc.).

No. 15-1475: Denbury Onshore, LLC.

No. 15-1477: Energy-Intensive Manufacturers Working Group on Greenhouse Gas Regulation.

No. 15-1483: Local Government Coalition for Renewable Energy.

No. 15-1488: Competitive Enterprise Institute; Buckeye Institute for Public Policy Solutions; Independence Institute; Rio Grande Foundation; Sutherland Institute; Klaus J. Christoph; Samuel R. Damewood; Catherine C. Dellin; Joseph W. Luquire; Lisa R. Markham; Patrick T. Peterson; and Kristi Rosenquist.

**Respondents:**

Respondents are the United States Environmental Protection Agency (in Nos. 15-1364, 15-1365, 15-1367, 15-1368, 15-1370, 15-1373, 15-1374, 15-1375, 15-1376,



15-1380, 15-1383, 15-1398, 15-1410, 15-1418, 15-1442, 15-1472, 15-1474, 15-1475, 15-1483) and the United States Environmental Protection Agency and Gina McCarthy, Administrator (in Nos. 15-1363, 15-1366, 15-1371, 15-1372, 15-1377, 15-1378, 15-1379, 15-1382, 15-1386, 15-1393, 15-1409, 15-1413, 15-1422, 15-1432, 15-1451, 15-1459, 15-1464, 15-1470, 15-1477, 15-1488).

**Intervenors and *Amici Curiae*:**

Dixon Bros., Inc.; Gulf Coast Lignite Coalition; Joy Global Inc.; Nelson Brothers, Inc.; Norfolk Southern Corp.; Peabody Energy Corp.; and Western Explosive Systems Company are Petitioner-Intervenors.

Advanced Energy Economy; American Lung Association; American Wind Energy Association; Broward County, Florida; Calpine Corporation; Center for Biological Diversity; City of Austin d/b/a Austin Energy; City of Boulder; City of Chicago; City of Los Angeles, by and through its Department of Water and Power; City of New York; City of Philadelphia; City of Seattle, by and through its City Light Department; City of South Miami; Clean Air Council; Clean Wisconsin; Coal River Mountain Watch; Commonwealth of Massachusetts; Commonwealth of Virginia; Conservation Law Foundation; District of Columbia; Environmental Defense Fund; Kanawha Forest Coalition; Keepers of the Mountains Foundation; Mon Valley Clean Air Coalition; National Grid Generation, LLC; Natural Resources Defense Council; New York Power Authority; NextEra Energy, Inc.; Ohio Environmental Council; Ohio Valley Environmental Coalition; Pacific Gas and Electric Company; Sacramento

Municipal Utility District; Sierra Club; Solar Energy Industries Association; Southern California Edison Company; State of California by and through Governor Edmund G. Brown, Jr., and the California Air Resources Board, and Attorney General Kamala D. Harris; State of Connecticut; State of Delaware; State of Hawaii; State of Illinois; State of Iowa; State of Maine; State of Maryland; State of Minnesota by and through the Minnesota Pollution Control Agency; State of New Hampshire; State of New Mexico; State of New York; State of Oregon; State of Rhode Island; State of Vermont; State of Washington; and West Virginia Highlands Conservancy are Respondent-Intervenors.

Philip Zoebisch; Pedernales Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Municipal Electric Authority of Georgia; Pacific Legal Foundation; Texas Public Policy Foundation; Morning Star Packing Company; Merit Oil Company; Loggers Association of Northern California; and Norman R. “Skip” Brown are *amici curiae* in support of Petitioners. Southeastern Legal Foundation is a movant *amicus curiae* in support of Petitioners.

Former EPA Administrators William D. Ruckelshaus and William K. Reilly; Institute for Policy Integrity at New York University School of Law; National League of Cities; U.S. Conference of Mayors; Baltimore, MD; Boulder County, CO; Coral Gables, FL; Grand Rapids, MI; Houston, TX; Jersey City, NJ; Los Angeles, CA; Minneapolis, MN; Pinecrest, FL; Portland, OR; Providence, RI; Salt Lake City, UT; San Francisco, CA; West Palm Beach, FL; American Thoracic Society; American

Medical Association; American College of Preventive Medicine; American College of Occupational and Environmental Medicine; and the Service Employees International Union are *amici curiae* in support of Respondents. American Sustainable Business Council and South Carolina Small Business Chamber of Commerce are movant *amici curiae* in support of Respondents.

**B. Rulings Under Review**

These consolidated cases involve final agency action of the United States Environmental Protection Agency titled, “Carbon Pollution Emission Guidelines for Existing Stationary Sources: Electric Utility Generating Units,” and published on October 23, 2015, at 80 Fed. Reg. 64,662.

**C. Related Cases**

These consolidated cases have not previously been before this Court or any other court. Counsel is aware of five related cases that, as of the time of filing, have appeared before this Court:

- (1) *In re Murray Energy Corporation*, No. 14-1112,
- (2) *Murray Energy Corporation v. EPA*, No. 14-1151 (consolidated with No. 14-1112),
- (3) *State of West Virginia v. EPA*, No. 14-1146,
- (4) *In re State of West Virginia*, No. 15-1277, and
- (5) *In re Peabody Energy Corporation*, No. 15-1284 (consolidated with No. 15-1277).

Per the Court's order of January 21, 2016, the following cases are consolidated and being held in abeyance pending potential administrative resolution of biogenic carbon dioxide emissions issues in the Final Rule: *National Alliance of Forest Owners v. EPA*, No. 15-1478; *Biogenic CO2 Coalition v. EPA*, No. 15-1479; and *American Forest & Paper Association, Inc. and American Wood Council v. EPA*, No. 15-1485.

## CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENTS

Non-governmental Petitioners submit the following statements pursuant to

Rule 26.1 of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure and Circuit Rule 26.1:

**Alabama Power Company** is a wholly-owned subsidiary of Southern Company, which is a publicly held corporation. Other than Southern Company, no publicly-held company owns 10% or more of Alabama Power Company's stock. Southern Company is traded publicly on the New York Stock Exchange under the symbol "SO."

**American Chemistry Council** ("ACC") states that it represents the leading companies engaged in the business of chemistry. ACC members apply the science of chemistry to make innovative products and services that make people's lives better, healthier, and safer. ACC is committed to improved environmental, health, and safety performance through Responsible Care®, common sense advocacy designed to address major public policy issues, and health and environmental research and product testing. The business of chemistry is an \$801 billion enterprise and a key element of the nation's economy. ACC has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in ACC.

**American Coalition for Clean Coal Electricity** ("ACCCE") is a partnership of companies that are involved in the production of electricity from coal. ACCCE recognizes the inextricable linkage between energy, the economy and our environment. Toward that end, ACCCE supports policies that promote the wise use of coal, one of America's largest domestically produced energy resources, to ensure a reliable and affordable supply of electricity to meet our nation's demand for energy. The ACCCE is a "trade association" within the meaning of Circuit Rule 26.1(b). It has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company owns a 10% or greater interest in the ACCCE.

**American Coke and Coal Chemicals Institute** ("ACCCI"), founded in 1944, is the international trade association that represents 100% of the U.S. producers of metallurgical coke used for iron and steelmaking, and 100% of the nation's producers of coal chemicals, who combined have operations in 12 states. ACCCI also represents chemical processors, metallurgical coal producers, coal and coke sales agents, and suppliers of equipment, goods, and services to the industry. ACCCI has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in ACCCI.

**American Forest & Paper Association** ("AF&PA") is the national trade association of the paper and wood products industry, which accounts for approximately 4 percent

of the total U.S. manufacturing gross domestic product. The industry makes products essential for everyday life from renewable and recyclable resources, producing about \$210 billion in products annually and employing nearly 900,000 men and women with an annual payroll of approximately \$50 billion. AF&PA has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in AF&PA.

**American Foundry Society** (“AFS”), founded in 1896, is the leading U.S. based metalcasting society, assisting member companies and individuals to effectively manage their production operations, profitably market their products and services, and equitably manage their employees. AFS is comprised of more than 7,500 individual members representing over 3,000 metalcasting firms, including foundries, suppliers, and customers. AFS has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in AFS.

**American Fuel & Petrochemical Manufacturers** (“AFPM”) states that it is a national trade association whose members comprise more than 400 companies, including virtually all United States refiners and petrochemical manufacturers. AFPM’s members supply consumers with a wide variety of products that are used daily in homes and businesses. AFPM has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in AFPM.

**American Iron and Steel Institute** (“AISI”) states that it serves as the voice of the North American steel industry and represents 19 member companies, including integrated and electric furnace steelmakers, accounting for the majority of U.S. steelmaking capacity with facilities located in 41 states, Canada, and Mexico, and approximately 125 associate members who are suppliers to or customers of the steel industry. AISI has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in AISI.

**American Public Power Association** (“APPA”) is the national association of publicly-owned electric utilities. APPA has no outstanding shares or debt securities in the hands of the public. APPA has no parent company. No publicly held company has a 10% or greater ownership in APPA.

**American Wood Council** (“AWC”) is the voice of North American traditional and engineered wood products, representing over 75% of the industry that provides approximately 400,000 men and women with family-wage jobs. AWC members make products that are essential to everyday life from a renewable resource that absorbs and sequesters carbon. AWC has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has a 10% or greater ownership interest in AWC.

**Arizona Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Arizona Electric Power Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Associated Electric Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Associated Electric Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Association of American Railroads** (“AAR”) is a nonprofit trade association whose members include all of the Class I freight railroads (the largest freight railroads), as well as some smaller freight railroads and Amtrak. AAR represents its member railroads in proceedings before Congress, the courts, and administrative agencies in matters of common interest, such as the issues that are the subject matter of this litigation. AAR has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company owns a 10% or greater interest in AAR.

**Basin Electric Power Cooperative** (“Basin Electric”) is a not-for-profit regional wholesale electric generation and transmission cooperative owned by over 100 member cooperatives. Basin Electric provides wholesale power to member rural electric systems in nine states, with electric generation facilities in North Dakota, South Dakota, Wyoming, Montana, and Iowa serving approximately 2.9 million customers. Basin Electric has no parent companies. There are no publicly held corporations that have a 10% or greater ownership interest in Basin Electric.

**Big Brown Lignite Company, LLC** is a wholly owned subsidiary of Luminant Holding Company LLC, which is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Texas Competitive Electric Holdings Company LLC (“TCEH”). TCEH is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Competitive Holdings Company (“EFCH”), which is a Texas corporation and a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Holdings Corp. (“EFH Corp.”). Substantially all of the common stock of EFH Corp., a Texas corporation, is owned by Texas Energy Future Holdings Limited Partnership, which is a privately held limited partnership. No publicly held entities have a 10% or greater equity ownership interest in EFH Corp.

**Big Brown Power Company, LLC** is a wholly owned subsidiary of Luminant Holding Company LLC, which is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Texas Competitive Electric Holdings Company LLC (“TCEH”). TCEH is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Competitive Holdings Company (“EFCH”), which is a Texas corporation and a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Holdings Corp. (“EFH Corp.”). Substantially all of the common stock of EFH Corp., a Texas corporation, is



owned by Texas Energy Future Holdings Limited Partnership, which is a privately held limited partnership. No publicly held entities have a 10% or greater equity ownership interest in EFH Corp.

**Big Rivers Electric Corporation** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Big Rivers Electric Corporation, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Brazos Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Brazos Electric Power Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Brick Industry Association** (“BIA”), founded in 1934, is the recognized national authority on clay brick manufacturing and construction, representing approximately 250 manufacturers, distributors, and suppliers that historically provide jobs for 200,000 Americans in 45 states. BIA has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in BIA.

**Buckeye Institute for Public Policy Solutions** (“Buckeye Institute”) is a nonprofit organization incorporated in Ohio under Section 501(c)(3) of the Internal Revenue Code. The Buckeye Institute seeks to improve Ohio policies by performing research and promoting market-oriented policy solutions. No parent company or publicly-held company has a 10% or greater ownership interest in the Buckeye Institute.

**Buckeye Power, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Buckeye Power, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Central Montana Electric Power Cooperative** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Central Montana Electric Power Cooperative, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Central Power Electric Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Central Power Electric Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Chamber of Commerce of the United States of America** (the “Chamber”) is the world’s largest business federation. The Chamber represents 300,000 direct members and indirectly represents the interests of more than 3 million companies, state and local chambers, and trade associations of every size, in every industry sector, and from every region of the country. The Chamber has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in the Chamber.



**CO<sub>2</sub> Task Force of the Florida Electric Power Coordinating Group, Inc.**

(“FCG”) is a non-profit, non-governmental corporate entity organized under the laws of Florida. The FCG does not have a parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns 10% or more of the FCG’s stock.

**Competitive Enterprise Institute** (“CEI”) is a nonprofit organization incorporated in Washington D.C. under Section 501(c)(3) of the Internal Revenue Code. CEI focuses on advancing market approaches to regulatory issues. No parent company or publicly-held company has a 10% or greater ownership interest in CEI.

**Corn Belt Power Cooperative** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Corn Belt Power Cooperative, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Coteau Properties Company** (“Coteau Properties”) is a wholly-owned subsidiary of The North American Coal Corporation (“NACoal”). No publicly held entity has a 10% or greater ownership interest in Coteau Properties. The general nature and purpose of Coteau Properties, insofar as relevant to this litigation, is the mining and marketing of lignite coal as fuel for power generation in North Dakota.

**Coyote Creek Mining Company, LLC** (“Coyote Creek Mining”) is a wholly-owned subsidiary of NACoal. No publicly held entity has a 10% or greater ownership interest in Coyote Creek Mining. The general nature and purpose of Coyote Creek Mining, insofar as relevant to this litigation, is the mining and marketing of lignite coal as fuel for power generation in North Dakota.

**Dairyland Power Cooperative** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Dairyland Power Cooperative, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Denbury Onshore, LLC** is a wholly owned subsidiary of Denbury Resources Inc., a publicly held corporation whose shares are listed on the New York Stock Exchange. Other than Denbury Resources Inc., no publicly-held company owns 10% or more of any of Petitioner’s stock and no publicly-held company holds 10% or more of Denbury Resources, Inc., stock. The stock of Denbury Resources, Inc. is traded publicly on the New York Stock Exchange under the symbol “DNR.” Denbury is an oil and gas production company. As a part of its oil recovery operations (generally termed “tertiary” or “enhanced” recovery) that are performed in several states, Denbury, with its affiliated companies, produces, purchases, transports, and injects carbon dioxide for the purpose of the recovery of hydrocarbon resources.

**Deseret Generation & Transmission Co-operative** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Deseret Generation & Transmission Co-operative, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**East Kentucky Power Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of East Kentucky Power Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**East River Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of East River Electric Power Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**East Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of East Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Electricity Consumers Resource Council** (“ELCON”) is the national association representing large industrial consumers of electricity. ELCON member companies produce a wide range of industrial commodities and consumer goods from virtually every segment of the manufacturing community. ELCON members operate hundreds of major facilities in all regions of the United States. Many ELCON members also cogenerate electricity as a by-product to serving a manufacturing steam requirement. ELCON has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in ELCON.

**Energy & Environment Legal Institute** (“EELI”) is a non-profit, non-governmental corporate entity organized under the laws of the Commonwealth of Virginia. EELI does not have a parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns 10% or more of EELI’s stock.

**Energy-Intensive Manufacturers Working Group on Greenhouse Gas Regulation** (“EIM”) is a coalition of individual companies. EIM has no outstanding shares or debt securities in the hands of the public. EIM has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in EIM.

**Entergy Corporation** (“Entergy”) is a publicly traded company incorporated in the State of Delaware, with its principal place of business in the city of New Orleans, Louisiana. Entergy does not have any parent companies that have a 10% or greater ownership interest in Entergy. Further, there is no publicly-held company that has a 10% or greater ownership interest in Entergy. Entergy is an integrated energy company engaged primarily in electric power production and electric retail

distribution operations. Entergy delivers electricity to approximately 2.8 million customers in Arkansas, Louisiana, Mississippi, and Texas.

**Falkirk Mining Company** (“Falkirk Mining”) is a wholly-owned subsidiary of NACoal. No publicly held entity has a 10% or greater ownership interest in Falkirk Mining. The general nature and purpose of Falkirk Mining, insofar as relevant to this litigation, is the mining and marketing of lignite coal as fuel for power generation in North Dakota.

**GenOn Mid-Atlantic, LLC** exists to provide safe, reliable, and affordable electric power to consumers. It is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG North America LLC, a limited liability corporation wholly owned by GenOn Americas Generation, LLC. GenOn Americas Generation, LLC is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Americas, Inc. NRG Americas, Inc. is a corporation wholly owned by GenOn Energy Holdings, Inc., a corporation wholly owned by GenOn Energy, Inc. GenOn Energy, Inc. is a corporation wholly owned by NRG Energy, Inc. a Delaware publicly-traded corporation. NRG Energy, Inc. has no parent corporation. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. held a 10% or greater ownership in NRG Energy, Inc. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. was a subsidiary of T. Rowe Price Group, Inc., a publicly-traded company.

**Georgia Power Company** is a wholly-owned subsidiary of Southern Company, which is a publicly held corporation. Other than Southern Company, no publicly-held company owns 10% or more of Georgia Power Company’s stock. Southern Company is traded publicly on the New York Stock Exchange under the symbol “SO.”

**Georgia Transmission Corporation** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Georgia Transmission Corporation, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Golden Spread Electrical Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Golden Spread Electrical Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Gulf Power Company** is a wholly-owned subsidiary of Southern Company, which is a publicly held corporation. Other than Southern Company, no publicly-held company owns 10% or more of Gulf Power Company’s stock. Southern Company is traded publicly on the New York Stock Exchange under the symbol “SO.”

**Hoosier Energy Rural Electric Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Hoosier Energy Rural Electric

Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Independence Institute** is a nonprofit organization incorporated in Colorado under Section 501(c)(3) of the Internal Revenue Code. The Independence Institute is a public policy think tank whose purpose is to educate citizens, legislators, and opinion makers in Colorado about policies that enhance personal and economic freedom. No parent company or publicly-held company has a 10% or greater ownership interest in the Independence Institute.

**Indian River Power LLC** exists to provide safe, reliable, and affordable electric power to consumers. It is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Energy, Inc., a Delaware publicly-traded corporation. NRG Energy, Inc. has no parent corporation. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. held a 10% or greater ownership in NRG Energy, Inc. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. was a subsidiary of T. Rowe Price Group, Inc. a publicly-traded company.

**Indiana Utility Group** (“IUG”) is a continuing association of individual electric generating companies operated for the purpose of promoting the general interests of the membership of electric generators. IUG has no outstanding shares or debt securities in the hand of the public and has no parent company. No publicly held company has a 10% or greater ownership interest in IUG.

**International Brotherhood of Boilermakers, Iron Ship Builders, Blacksmiths, Forgers, and Helpers** (“IBB”) is a non-profit national labor organization with headquarters in Kansas City, Kansas. IBB’s members are active and retired members engaged in various skilled trades of welding and fabrication of boilers, ships, pipelines, and other industrial facilities and equipment in the United States and Canada, and workers in other industries in the United States organized by the IBB. IBB provides collective bargaining representation and other membership services on behalf of its members. IBB is affiliated with the American Federation of Labor-Congress of Industrial Organizations. IBB and its affiliated lodges own approximately 60 percent of the outstanding stock of Brotherhood Bancshares, Inc., the holding company of the Bank of Labor. Bank of Labor’s mission is to serve the banking and other financial needs of the North American labor movement. No entity owns 10% or more of IBB.

**International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, AFL-CIO** (“IBEW”) is a non-profit national labor organization with headquarters located at 900 7th Street, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20001. IBEW’s members are active and retired skilled electricians and related professionals engaged in a broad array of U.S. industries, including the

electrical utility, coal mining, and railroad transportation sectors that stand to be impacted adversely by implementation of EPA's final agency action. IBEW provides collective bargaining representation and other membership services and benefits on behalf of its members. IBEW is affiliated with the American Federation of Labor-Congress of Industrial Organizations. IBEW has no parent companies, subsidiaries, or affiliates that have issued shares or debt securities to the public.

**Kansas Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Kansas Electric Power Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**LG&E and KU Energy LLC** is the holding company for Louisville Gas and Electric Company ("LG&E") and Kentucky Utilities Company ("KU"), regulated utilities that serve a total of 1.2 million customers. LG&E serves 321,000 natural gas and 400,000 electric customers in Louisville, Kentucky and 16 surrounding counties, whereas KU serves 543,000 customers in 77 Kentucky counties and five counties in Virginia. LG&E and KU Energy LLC is a wholly-owned subsidiary of PPL Corporation. Other than PPL Corporation, no publicly-held company owns 10% or more of any of LG&E and KU Energy LLC's membership interests. No publicly held company has a 10% or greater ownership interest in PPL Corporation.

**Lignite Energy Council** ("LEC") is a regional, non-profit organization whose primary mission is to promote the continued development and use of lignite coal as an energy resource. LEC's membership includes: (1) producers of lignite coal who have an ownership interest in and who mine lignite; (2) users of lignite who operate lignite-fired electric generating plants and the nation's only commercial scale "synfuels" plant that converts lignite into pipeline-quality natural gas; and (3) suppliers of goods and services to the lignite coal industry. LEC has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in LEC.

**Louisiana Generating LLC** exists to provide safe, reliable, and affordable electric power to consumers. It is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG South Central Generating LLC, a limited liability corporation which in turn is wholly owned by NRG Energy, Inc., a Delaware publicly-traded corporation. NRG Energy, Inc. has no parent corporation. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. held a 10% or greater ownership in NRG Energy, Inc. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. was a subsidiary of T. Rowe Price Group, Inc. a publicly-traded company.

**Luminant Big Brown Mining Company, LLC** is a wholly owned subsidiary of Luminant Holding Company LLC, which is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Texas Competitive Electric Holdings Company LLC



(“TCEH”). TCEH is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Competitive Holdings Company (“EFCH”), which is a Texas corporation and a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Holdings Corp. (“EFH Corp.”). Substantially all of the common stock of EFH Corp., a Texas corporation, is owned by Texas Energy Future Holdings Limited Partnership, which is a privately held limited partnership. No publicly held entities have a 10% or greater equity ownership interest in EFH Corp.

**Luminant Generation Company, LLC** is a wholly owned subsidiary of Luminant Holding Company LLC, which is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Texas Competitive Electric Holdings Company LLC (“TCEH”). TCEH is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Competitive Holdings Company (“EFCH”), which is a Texas corporation and a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Holdings Corp. (“EFH Corp.”). Substantially all of the common stock of EFH Corp., a Texas corporation, is owned by Texas Energy Future Holdings Limited Partnership, which is a privately held limited partnership. No publicly held entities have a 10% or greater equity ownership interest in EFH Corp.

**Luminant Mining Company, LLC** is a wholly owned subsidiary of Luminant Holding Company LLC, which is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Texas Competitive Electric Holdings Company LLC (“TCEH”). TCEH is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Competitive Holdings Company (“EFCH”), which is a Texas corporation and a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Holdings Corp. (“EFH Corp.”). Substantially all of the common stock of EFH Corp., a Texas corporation, is owned by Texas Energy Future Holdings Limited Partnership, which is a privately held limited partnership. No publicly held entities have a 10% or greater equity ownership interest in EFH Corp.

**Midwest Generation LLC** exists to provide safe, reliable, and affordable electric power to consumers. It is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by Midwest Generation Holdings II, LLC. Midwest Generation Holdings II, LLC is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by Midwest Generation Holdings I, LLC. Midwest Generation Holdings I, LLC is a limited liability corporation 95% of which is owned by Mission Midwest Coal, LLC and 5% of which is owned by Midwest Generation Holdings Limited, which in turn is wholly owned by Mission Midwest Coal, LLC. Mission Midwest Coal, LLC is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Midwest Holdings LLC, which in turn is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by Midwest Generation EME, LLC. Midwest Generation EME, LLC is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Energy Holdings Inc. which is a

corporation wholly owned by NRG Acquisition Holdings Inc. NRG Acquisition Holdings is a corporation wholly owned by NRG Energy, Inc., a Delaware publicly-traded corporation. NRG Energy, Inc. has no parent corporation. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. held a 10% or greater ownership in NRG Energy, Inc. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. was a subsidiary of T. Rowe Price Group, Inc. a publicly-traded company.

**Minnesota Power** is an operating division of ALLETE, Inc. No publicly-held company has a 10% or greater ownership interest in ALLETE, Inc.

**Minnkota Power Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Minnkota Power Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Mississippi Lignite Mining Company** (“Mississippi Lignite Mining”) is a wholly-owned subsidiary of NACoal. No publicly held entity has a 10% or greater ownership interest in Mississippi Lignite Mining. The general nature and purpose of Mississippi Lignite Mining, insofar as relevant to this litigation, is the mining and marketing of lignite coal as fuel for power generation in Mississippi.

**Mississippi Power Company** is a wholly-owned subsidiary of Southern Company, which is a publicly held corporation. Other than Southern Company, no publicly-held company owns 10% or more of Mississippi Power Company’s stock. Southern Company is traded publicly on the New York Stock Exchange under the symbol “SO.”

**Montana-Dakota Utilities Co.** is engaged in the distribution of natural gas and the generation, transmission, and distribution of electricity in the states of North Dakota, South Dakota, Montana, and Wyoming. Montana-Dakota Utilities Co. is a division of MDU Resources Group, Inc. No publicly held company has a 10% or greater ownership interest in MDU Resources Group, Inc.

**Murray Energy Corporation** has no parent corporation and no publicly held corporation owns 10% or more of its stock. Murray Energy Corporation is the largest privately-held coal company and largest underground coal mine operator in the United States.

**National Association of Home Builders** (“NAHB”) is a not-for-profit trade association organized under the laws of Nevada. NAHB does not have any parent companies that have a 10% or greater ownership interest in NAHB. Further, there is no publicly-held company that has a 10% or greater ownership interest in NAHB. NAHB has issued no shares of stock to the public. NAHB is comprised of

approximately 800 state and local home builders associations with whom it is affiliated, but all of those associations are, to the best of NAHB's knowledge, nonprofit corporations that have not issued stock to the public. NAHB's purpose is to promote the general commercial, professional, and legislative interests of its approximately 140,000 builder and associate members throughout the United States. NAHB's membership includes entities that construct and supply single-family homes, as well as apartment, condominium, multi-family, commercial, and industrial builders, land developers, and remodelers.

**National Association of Manufacturers** ("NAM") states that it is the largest manufacturing association in the United States, representing small and large manufacturers in every industrial sector and in all 50 states. Manufacturing employs nearly 12 million men and women, contributes roughly \$2.17 trillion to the U.S. economy annually, has the largest economic impact of any major sector, and accounts for three-quarters of private-sector research and development. The NAM is the powerful voice of the manufacturing community and the leading advocate for a policy agenda that helps manufacturers compete in the global economy and create jobs across the United States. The NAM has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in the NAM.

**National Federation of Independent Business** ("NFIB") is a nonprofit mutual benefit corporation that promotes and protects the rights of its members to own, operate, and grow their businesses across the fifty States and the District of Columbia. NFIB has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in NFIB.

**National Lime Association** ("NLA") is the national trade association of the lime industry and is comprised of U.S. and Canadian commercial lime manufacturing companies, suppliers to lime companies, and foreign lime companies and trade associations. NLA's members produce more than 99% of all lime in the U.S., and 100% of the lime manufactured in Canada. NLA provides a forum to enhance and encourage the exchange of ideas and technical information common to the industry and to promote the use of lime and the business interests of the lime industry. NLA is a non-profit organization. It has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in NLA.

**National Mining Association** ("NMA") is a non-profit, incorporated national trade association whose members include the producers of most of America's coal, metals, and industrial and agricultural minerals; manufacturers of mining and mineral processing machinery, equipment, and supplies; and engineering and consulting firms that serve the mining industry. NMA has no parent companies, subsidiaries, or



affiliates that have issued shares or debt securities to the public, although NMA's individual members have done so.

**National Oilseed Processors Association** ("NOPA") is a national trade association that represents 12 companies engaged in the production of vegetable meals and vegetable oils from oilseeds, including soybeans. NOPA's member companies process more than 1.6 billion bushels of oilseeds annually at 63 plants in 19 states, including 57 plants which process soybeans. NOPA has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company has 10% or greater ownership in NOPA.

**National Rural Electric Cooperative Association** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of National Rural Electric Cooperative Association, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Newmont Nevada Energy Investment, LLC** is a wholly-owned subsidiary of Newmont USA Limited and is the owner and operator of the TS Power Plant, a 242 MW coal-fired power plant located in Eureka County, Nevada, which provides power to Newmont USA Limited's mining operations. No other publicly held corporation owns 10% or more of the stock of Newmont Nevada Energy Investment, LLC.

**Newmont USA Limited** owns and operates 11 surface gold and copper mines, eight underground mines, and 13 processing facilities in Nevada that are served by the TS Power Plant. Newmont USA Limited is a wholly owned subsidiary of Newmont Mining Corporation and no other publicly held corporation owns 10% or more of its stock.

**NODAK Energy Services, LLC** ("NODAK") is a wholly-owned subsidiary of NACoal. No publicly held entity has a 10% or greater ownership interest in NODAK. The general nature and purpose of NODAK, insofar as relevant to this litigation, is the operation of a lignite beneficiation facility within Great River Energy's Coal Creek Station, a lignite-fired power generating station in North Dakota.

**The North American Coal Corporation** ("NACoal") is a wholly-owned subsidiary of NACCO Industries, Inc. NACoal is not publicly held, but NACCO Industries, Inc., its parent, is a publicly traded corporation that owns more than 10% of the stock of NACoal. No other publicly-held corporation owns more than 10% of the stock of NACoal. The general nature and purpose of NACoal, insofar as relevant to this litigation, is the mining and marketing of lignite coal as fuel for power generation and the provision of mining services to natural resources companies.

**North American Coal Royalty Company** (“North American Coal Royalty”) is a wholly-owned subsidiary of NACoal. No publicly held entity has a 10% or greater ownership interest in North American Coal Royalty. The general nature and purpose of North American Coal Royalty, insofar as relevant to this litigation, is the acquisition and disposition of mineral and surface interests in support of NACoal’s mining of lignite coal as fuel for power generation, and the provision of mining services to natural resources companies.

**North Carolina Electric Membership Corporation** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of North Carolina Electric Membership Corporation, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Northeast Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Northeast Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Northwest Iowa Power Cooperative** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Northwest Iowa Power Cooperative, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**NorthWestern Corporation** is a publicly traded company (NYSE: NWE) incorporated in the State of Delaware with corporate offices in Butte, Montana and Sioux Falls, South Dakota. NorthWestern Corporation has no parent corporation. As of February 17, 2016, based on a review of statements filed with the Securities and Exchange Commission pursuant to Sections 13(d), 13(f), and 13(g) of the Securities and Exchange Act of 1934, as amended, BlackRock Fund Advisors is the only shareholder owning more than 10% or more of NorthWestern Corporation’s stock. In addition to publicly traded stock, NorthWestern Corporation has issued debt and bonds to the public.

**NRG Chalk Point LLC** exists to provide safe, reliable, and affordable electric power to consumers. It is wholly owned by GenOn Mid-Atlantic, LLC. GenOn Mid-Atlantic, LLC is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG North America LLC, a limited liability corporation wholly owned by GenOn Americas Generation, LLC. GenOn Americas Generation, LLC is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Americas, Inc. NRG Americas, Inc. is a corporation wholly owned by GenOn Energy Holdings, Inc., a corporation wholly owned by GenOn Energy, Inc. GenOn Energy, Inc. is a corporation wholly owned by NRG Energy, Inc., a Delaware publicly-traded corporation. NRG Energy, Inc. has no parent corporation. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. held a 10% or greater ownership in NRG Energy, Inc. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price

Associates, Inc. was a subsidiary of T. Rowe Price Group, Inc. a publicly-traded company.

**NRG Power Midwest LP** exists to provide safe, reliable, and affordable electric power to consumers. It is a limited partnership 99% of which is owned by NRG Power Generation Assets LLC and 1% of which is owned by NRG Power Midwest GP LLC, a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Power Generation Assets LLC. NRG Power Generation Assets LLC is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Power Generation LLC, which is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Americas, Inc. NRG Americas, Inc. is a corporation wholly owned by GenOn Energy Holdings, Inc., a corporation wholly owned by GenOn Energy, Inc. GenOn Energy, Inc. is a corporation wholly owned by NRG Energy, Inc., a Delaware publicly-traded corporation. NRG Energy, Inc. has no parent corporation. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. held a 10% or greater ownership in NRG Energy, Inc. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. was a subsidiary of T. Rowe Price Group, Inc. a publicly-traded company.

**NRG Rema LLC** exists to provide safe, reliable, and affordable electric power to consumers. It is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Northeast Generation, Inc., a corporation wholly owned by NRG Northeast Holdings Inc. NRG Northeast Holdings Inc. is a corporation wholly owned by NRG Power Generation LLC, a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Americas, Inc. NRG Americas, Inc. is a corporation wholly owned by GenOn Energy Holdings, Inc., a corporation wholly owned by GenOn Energy, Inc. GenOn Energy, Inc. is a corporation wholly owned by NRG Energy, Inc., a Delaware publicly-traded corporation. NRG Energy, Inc. has no parent corporation. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. held a 10% or greater ownership in NRG Energy, Inc. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. was a subsidiary of T. Rowe Price Group, Inc. a publicly-traded company.

**NRG Texas Power LLC** exists to provide safe, reliable, and affordable electric power to consumers. It is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Texas LLC, which in turn is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Energy, Inc., a Delaware publicly-traded corporation. NRG Energy, Inc. has no parent corporation. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. held a 10% or greater ownership in NRG Energy, Inc. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. was a subsidiary of T. Rowe Price Group, Inc. a publicly-traded company.

**NRG Wholesale Generation LP** exists to provide safe, reliable, and affordable electric power to consumers. It is a limited partnership 99% owned by NRG Power

Generation Assets LLC and 1% owned by NRG Wholesale Generation GP LLC, both of which are wholly owned by NRG Power Generation LLC. NRG Power Generation LLC is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Americas, Inc. NRG Americas, Inc. is a corporation wholly owned by GenOn Energy Holdings, Inc., a corporation wholly owned by GenOn Energy, Inc. GenOn Energy, Inc. is a corporation wholly owned by NRG Energy, Inc., a Delaware publicly-traded corporation. NRG Energy, Inc. has no parent corporation. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. held a 10% or greater ownership in NRG Energy, Inc. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. was a subsidiary of T. Rowe Price Group, Inc. a publicly-traded company.

**Oak Grove Management Company, LLC** is a wholly owned subsidiary of Luminant Holding Company LLC, which is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Texas Competitive Electric Holdings Company LLC (“TCEH”). TCEH is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Competitive Holdings Company (“EFCH”), which is a Texas corporation and a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Holdings Corp. (“EFH Corp.”). Substantially all of the common stock of EFH Corp., a Texas corporation, is owned by Texas Energy Future Holdings Limited Partnership, which is a privately held limited partnership. No publicly held entities have a 10% or greater equity ownership interest in EFH Corp.

**Oglethorpe Power Corporation** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Oglethorpe Power Corporation, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Otter Creek Mining Company, LLC** (“Otter Creek”) is a wholly-owned subsidiary of NACoal. No publicly held entity has a 10% or greater ownership interest in Otter Creek. The general nature and purpose of Otter Creek, insofar as relevant to this litigation, is the development of a mine to deliver lignite coal as fuel for power generation in North Dakota.

**Portland Cement Association** (“PCA”) is a not-for-profit “trade association” within the meaning of Circuit Rule 26.1(b). It represents companies responsible for more than 80 percent of cement-making capacity in the United States. PCA members operate manufacturing plants in 35 states, with distribution centers in all 50 states. PCA conducts market development, engineering, research, education, technical assistance, and public affairs programs on behalf of its members. Its mission focuses on improving and expanding the quality and uses of cement and concrete, raising the quality of construction, and contributing to a better environment. PCA has no parent corporation, and no publicly held company owns a 10% or greater interest in PCA.

**PowerSouth Energy Cooperative** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of PowerSouth Energy Cooperative, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Prairie Power, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Prairie Power, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Prairie State Generating Company, LLC** (“PSGC”) is a private non-governmental corporation that is principally engaged in the business of generating electricity for cooperatives and public power companies. PSGC does not have a parent corporation and no publicly-held corporation owns ten percent or more of its stock.

**Rio Grande Foundation** is a nonprofit organization incorporated in New Mexico under Section 501(c)(3) of the Internal Revenue Code. The Rio Grande Foundation is a research institute dedicated to increasing liberty and prosperity for New Mexico’s citizens. No parent company or publicly-held company has a 10% or greater ownership interest in the Rio Grande Foundation.

**Rushmore Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Rushmore Electric Power Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**The Sabine Mining Company** (“Sabine Mining”) is a wholly-owned subsidiary of NACoal. No publicly held entity has a 10% or greater ownership interest in Sabine Mining. The general nature and purpose of Sabine Mining, insofar as relevant to this litigation, is the mining of lignite coal as fuel for power generation in Texas.

**Sam Rayburn G&T Electric Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Sam Rayburn G&T Electric Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**San Miguel Electric Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of San Miguel Electric Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Sandow Power Company, LLC** is a wholly owned subsidiary of Luminant Holding Company LLC, which is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Texas Competitive Electric Holdings Company LLC (“TCEH”). TCEH is a Delaware limited liability company and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Competitive Holdings Company (“EFCH”), which is a Texas corporation and a wholly owned subsidiary of Energy Future Holdings Corp. (“EFH Corp.”).



Substantially all of the common stock of EFH Corp., a Texas corporation, is owned by Texas Energy Future Holdings Limited Partnership, which is a privately held limited partnership. No publicly held entities have a 10% or greater equity ownership interest in EFH Corp.

**Seminole Electric Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Seminole Electric Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**South Mississippi Electric Power Association** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of South Mississippi Electric Power Association, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**South Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of South Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Southern Illinois Power Cooperative** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Southern Illinois Power Cooperative, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Sunflower Electric Power Corporation** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Sunflower Electric Power Corporation, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Sutherland Institute** is a nonprofit organization incorporated in Utah under Section 501(c)(3) of the Internal Revenue Code. The Sutherland Institute is a public policy think tank committed to influencing Utah law and policy based on the core principles of limited government, personal responsibility, and charity. No parent company or publicly-held company has a 10% or greater ownership interest in the Sutherland Institute.

**Tex-La Electric Cooperative of Texas, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Tex-La Electric Cooperative of Texas, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Tri-State Generation and Transmission Association, Inc.** (“Tri-State”) is a wholesale electric power supply cooperative which operates on a not-for-profit basis and is owned by 1.5 million member-owners and 44 distribution cooperatives. Tri-State issues no stock and has no parent corporation. Accordingly, no publicly held corporation owns 10% or more of its stock.

**United Mine Workers of America** (“UMWA”) is a non-profit national labor organization with headquarters in Triangle, Virginia. UMWA’s members are active and retired miners engaged in the extraction of coal and other minerals in the United States and Canada, and workers in other industries in the United States organized by the UMWA. UMWA provides collective bargaining representation and other membership services on behalf of its members. UMWA is affiliated with the America Federation of Labor-Congress of Industrial Organizations. UMWA has no parent companies, subsidiaries, or affiliates that have issued shares or debt securities to the public.

**Upper Missouri G. & T. Electric Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Upper Missouri G. & T. Electric Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Utility Air Regulatory Group** (“UARG”) is a not-for-profit association of individual generating companies and national trade associations that participates on behalf of its members collectively in administrative proceedings under the Clean Air Act, and in litigation arising from those proceedings, that affect electric generators. UARG has no outstanding shares or debt securities in the hands of the public and has no parent company. No publicly held company has a 10% or greater ownership interest in UARG.

**Vienna Power LLC** exists to provide safe, reliable, and affordable electric power to consumers. It is a limited liability corporation wholly owned by NRG Energy, Inc., a Delaware publicly-traded corporation. NRG Energy, Inc. has no parent corporation. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. held a 10% or greater ownership in NRG Energy, Inc. As of the last reporting period, T. Rowe Price Associates, Inc. was a subsidiary of T. Rowe Price Group, Inc. a publicly-traded company.

**Wabash Valley Power Association, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Wabash Valley Power Association, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**West Virginia Coal Association** (“WVCA”) is a trade association representing more than 90% of West Virginia’s underground and surface coal mine production. No publicly-held company has 10% or greater ownership of the WVCA.

**Western Farmers Electric Cooperative** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Western Farmers Electric Cooperative, and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.

**Westar Energy, Inc.** (“Westar”) is a publicly traded company (symbol: WR) incorporated in the State of Kansas, with its principal place of business in the city of Topeka, Kansas. Westar is the parent corporation of Kansas Gas and Electric Company (“KGE”), a Kansas corporation with its principal place of business in Topeka, Kansas. Westar owns all of the stock of KGE. In addition to Westar’s publicly traded stock, both Westar and KGE have issued debt and bonds to the public. Westar does not have any parent companies that have a 10% or greater ownership interest in Westar. Further, there is no publicly-held company that has a 10% or greater ownership interest in Westar.

**Wolverine Power Supply Cooperative, Inc.** has no parent corporation. No publicly held corporation owns any portion of Wolverine Power Supply Cooperative, Inc., and it is not a subsidiary or an affiliate of any publicly owned corporation.



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
CERTIFICATE AS TO PARTIES, RULINGS, AND RELATED CASES.....	i
CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENTS.....	x
TABLE OF CONTENTS .....	xxx
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES .....	xxxiii
GLOSSARY OF TERMS .....	xlvii
JURISDICTIONAL STATEMENT.....	1
STATEMENT OF ISSUES .....	1
STATUTES AND REGULATIONS .....	2
INTRODUCTION.....	2
STATEMENT OF THE CASE .....	6
I. Section 111 of the Clean Air Act .....	6
A. The Definition of “Standard of Performance”.....	7
B. Standards of Performance for Existing Sources.....	8
II. The President’s Climate Action Plan.....	11
A. The Section 111(b) New Source Rule.....	11
B. The Section 111(d) Existing Source Rule: “The Clean Power Plan”.....	12
1. EPA’s “Performance Rates” and Compliance Requirements.....	13
a. EPA’s “Building Blocks” and “Performance Rates”.....	13
b. EPA’s Rationale.....	16
2. State Plans.....	18
3. The Proposed Federal Plan .....	19
4. The Rule’s Effects.....	21
5. The Supreme Court Stay.....	22
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT .....	23
STANDING .....	27

STANDARD OF REVIEW.....	28
ARGUMENT .....	29
I. The Rule Transgresses Section 111. ....	29
A. Congress Did Not Authorize EPA To Restructure the Power Sector. ....	31
1. The Rule Asserts Novel and Vast Authority Over the States’ Energy Grids Without Clear Congressional Authorization.....	32
2. EPA Seeks To Invade a Traditional State Regulatory Domain Without a Clear Statement From Congress. ....	36
B. Section 111 Unambiguously Forecloses EPA’s Requirements Based on “Generation Shifting.”.....	41
1. Section 111 Does Not Authorize EPA To Mandate Emission Reductions That Cannot Be Implemented at Individual Regulated “Stationary Sources.”.....	41
a. Section 111(d) provides that standards apply to the “source,” not to owners and operators.....	43
b. This Court’s precedents foreclose EPA’s reading of section 111(d).....	46
c. The Rule’s reading of section 111(d) is contrary to EPA’s regulations and consistent agency practice.....	48
2. Setting Rates Based on “Generation Shifting” Is Inconsistent With the Definition of “Standard of Performance.” .....	50
a. The Rule does not comport with the statutory terms.....	51
b. EPA’s Rule confuses “standards of performance” with other programs.....	54
3. EPA’s Attempt To Use Section 111(d) To Reengineer the Grid Is Inconsistent With Section 111 as a Whole.....	56
II. The Section 112 Exclusion Unambiguously Prohibits the Rule. ....	61
A. EPA May Not Employ Section 111(d) To Regulate a Source Category That It Has Chosen To “Regulate[] Under Section [1]12.”.....	62

B. EPA’s Attempts To Escape the Literal Reading of the Exclusion Are Unavailing..... 64

    1. EPA’s New Assertions of Ambiguity Lack Merit..... 65

    2. The Failed Clerical Amendment Is Entirely Irrelevant..... 68

III. The Rule Unlawfully Abrogates Authority Granted to the States by the Clean Air Act. .... 74

IV. The Rule Unconstitutionally Commandeers and Coerces States and Their Officials into Carrying Out Federal Energy Policy..... 78

    A. The Rule Unlawfully Commandeers the States and Their Officials..... 80

    B. The Rule Unlawfully Coerces the States..... 84

CONCLUSION ..... 86

CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

ADDENDUM PURSUANT TO FEDERAL RULE OF APPELLATE PROCEDURE 32.1 AND CIRCUIT RULE 32.1(B)(3)

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

### FEDERAL CASES

	<u>Page</u>
<i>Alden v. Maine</i> , 527 U.S. 706 (1999).....	80
* <i>Am. Bar Ass’n v. FTC</i> , 430 F.3d 457 (D.C. Cir. 2005).....	23, 28, 29, 37, 38
<i>Am. Elec. Power Co. v. Connecticut</i> , 131 S. Ct. 2527 (2011) .....	9, 62
<i>Am. Petroleum Inst. v. SEC</i> , 714 F.3d 1329 (D.C. Cir. 2013) .....	73
<i>Ark. Elec. Coop. Corp. v. Ark. Pub. Serv. Comm’n</i> , 461 U.S. 375 (1983).....	24, 37
* <i>ASARCO Inc. v. EPA</i> , 578 F.2d 319 (D.C. Cir. 1978) .....	24, 46, 53, 54
<i>Bond v. United States</i> , 134 S. Ct. 2077 (2014) .....	3, 36
<i>Brown v. Gardner</i> , 513 U.S. 115 (1994) .....	58
<i>Chevron, U.S.A., Inc. v. NRDC</i> , 467 U.S. 837 (1984).....	18
<i>Conn. Dep’t of Pub. Util. Control v. FERC</i> , 569 F.3d 477 (D.C. Cir. 2009).....	37
<i>Del. Dep’t of Nat. Res. &amp; Envtl. Control v. EPA</i> , 785 F.3d 1 (D.C. Cir. 2015).....	36
<i>District of Columbia v. Train</i> , 521 F.2d 971 (D.C. Cir. 1975), <i>vacated on other grounds, EPA v. Brown</i> , 431 U.S. 99 (1977) .....	84
<i>Edward J. DeBartolo Corp. v. Fla. Gulf Coast Bldg. &amp; Constr. Trades Council</i> , 485 U.S. 568 (1988) .....	79
<i>Envtl. Def., Inc. v. EPA</i> , 509 F.3d 553 (D.C. Cir. 2007).....	58
* <i>FDA v. Brown &amp; Williamson Tobacco Corp.</i> , 529 U.S. 120 (2000).....	32, 33, 35

---

\* Authorities upon which we chiefly rely are marked with asterisks.

<i>Fed. Power Comm'n v. S. Cal. Edison Co.</i> , 376 U.S. 205 (1964).....	38
<i>FERC v. Mississippi</i> , 456 U.S. 742 (1982).....	86
* <i>Gregory v. Ashcroft</i> , 501 U.S. 452 (1991).....	31, 36, 41
<i>Hodel v. Va. Surface Mining &amp; Reclamation Ass'n</i> , 452 U.S. 264 (1981).....	83
* <i>King v. Burwell</i> , 135 S. Ct. 2480 (2015) .....	3, 23, 28, 32, 35
<i>Koons Buick Pontiac GMC, Inc. v. Nigh</i> , 543 U.S. 50 (2004) .....	69, 70
<i>Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife</i> , 504 U.S. 555 (1992).....	28
<i>Meghrig v. KFC Western, Inc.</i> , 516 U.S. 479 (1996).....	47, 56
<i>Michigan v. EPA</i> , 268 F.3d 1075 (D.C. Cir. 2001).....	29
<i>Michigan v. EPA</i> , 135 S. Ct. 2699 (2015).....	56
<i>Miss. Comm'n on Env'tl. Quality v. EPA</i> , 790 F.3d 138 (D.C. Cir. 2015) .....	84
* <i>Nat'l Fed'n of Indep. Bus. v. Sebelius</i> , 132 S. Ct. 2566 (2012).....	27, 79, 84, 85, 86
<i>Nat'l-Southwire Aluminum Co. v. EPA</i> , 838 F.2d 835 (6th Cir. 1988) .....	29, 55
<i>New Jersey v. EPA</i> , 517 F.3d 574 (D.C. Cir. 2008).....	68
<i>New York v. FERC</i> , 535 U.S. 1 (2002) .....	39
* <i>New York v. United States</i> , 505 U.S. 144 (1992).....	26, 81, 82, 83, 84
<i>Nken v. Holder</i> , 556 U.S. 418 (2009) .....	23
<i>North Dakota v. EPA</i> , No. 15-1381 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. filed Oct. 23, 2015).....	12
<i>NRDC v. EPA</i> , 777 F.3d 456 (D.C. Cir. 2014) .....	29
* <i>Pac. Gas &amp; Elec. Co. v. State Energy Res. Conservation &amp; Dev. Comm'n</i> , 461 U.S. 190 (1983).....	3, 24, 37, 38, 83

*Printz v. United States*, 521 U.S. 898 (1997) ..... 81, 82, 86

*Raygor v. Regents of Univ. of Minn.*, 534 U.S. 533 (2002) ..... 36

*Reiter v. Sonotone Corp.*, 442 U.S. 330 (1979) ..... 74

*Scialabba v. Cuellar de Osorio*, 134 S. Ct. 2191 (2014)..... 74

*Sierra Club v. EPA*, 292 F.3d 895 (D.C. Cir. 2002)..... 28

*Solid Waste Agency of N. Cook Cnty. v. U.S. Army Corps of Eng’rs*, 531 U.S. 159 (2001) ..... 51

*South Dakota v. Dole*, 483 U.S. 203 (1987) ..... 85, 86

*Stephan v. United States*, 319 U.S. 423 (1943) ..... 69

*Transbrasil S.A. Linhas Aereas v. Dep’t of Transp.*, 791 F.2d 202 (D.C. Cir. 1986)..... 44

*United States v. O’Brien*, 560 U.S. 218 (2010) ..... 70

\**Util. Air Regulatory Grp. v. EPA*, 134 S. Ct. 2427 (2014) ..... 3, 4, 23, 25, 28,  
..... 31, 32, 34, 57, 58, 66

*W. Minn. Mun. Power Agency v. FERC*, 806 F.3d 588 (D.C. Cir. 2015) ..... 65, 66

*West Virginia v. EPA*, 362 F.3d 861 (D.C. Cir. 2004)..... 28

*Wis. Elec. Power Co. v. Reilly*, 893 F.2d 901 (7th Cir. 1990)..... 52

**STATE CASES**

*Ariz. Corp. Comm’n v. State ex rel. Woods*, 830 P.2d 807 (Ariz. 1992) ..... 38

*La. Power & Light Co. v. La. Pub. Serv. Comm’n*, 609 So. 2d 797 (La. 1992)..... 38

**FEDERAL CONSTITUTION**

U.S. CONST. amend. X..... 80

## STATE CONSTITUTIONS

ARIZ. CONST. art. XV, § 1 .....	38
GA. CONST. art. IV, § 1.....	38
LA. CONST. art. IV, § 21(A)(1) .....	38

## FEDERAL STATUTES

1 U.S.C. § 204(a) .....	69
2 U.S.C. §§ 285a-285g.....	69
7 U.S.C. § 2018, Revisor’s Note.....	70
10 U.S.C. § 869, Revisor’s Note.....	70
10 U.S.C. § 1407, Revisor’s Note .....	70
10 U.S.C. § 2306a, Revisor’s Note.....	70
10 U.S.C. § 2533b, Revisor’s Note .....	70
11 U.S.C. § 101, Revisor’s Note.....	70
12 U.S.C. § 1787, Revisor’s Note .....	70
12 U.S.C. § 4520, Revisor’s Note .....	70
14 U.S.C. ch. 17 Front Matter, Revisor’s Note.....	70
15 U.S.C. § 2064, Revisor’s Note .....	70
15 U.S.C. § 2081, Revisor’s Note .....	70
16 U.S.C. § 230f, Revisor’s Note .....	70
16 U.S.C. §§ 791a, <i>et seq.</i> .....	38

16 U.S.C. § 824(a) .....	38
16 U.S.C. § 824(b)(1) .....	38
16 U.S.C. § 824o(i)(2) .....	38
18 U.S.C. § 2327, Revisor’s Note .....	70
20 U.S.C. § 1226c, Revisor’s Note .....	70
20 U.S.C. § 1232, Revisor’s Note .....	70
20 U.S.C. § 4014, Revisor’s Note .....	70
21 U.S.C. § 355, Revisor’s Note .....	70
22 U.S.C. § 3651, Revisor’s Note .....	70
22 U.S.C. § 3723, Revisor’s Note .....	70
23 U.S.C. § 104, Revisor’s Note .....	70
26 U.S.C. § 105, Revisor’s Note .....	70
26 U.S.C. § 219, Revisor’s Note .....	70
26 U.S.C. § 1201, Revisor’s Note .....	70
26 U.S.C. § 4973, Revisor’s Note .....	70
29 U.S.C. § 1053, Revisor’s Note .....	70
33 U.S.C. § 1316 .....	54
33 U.S.C. § 2736, Revisor’s Note .....	70
37 U.S.C. § 414, Revisor’s Note .....	70
38 U.S.C. § 3015, Revisor’s Note .....	70
40 U.S.C. § 11501, Revisor’s Note .....	70



42 U.S.C. § 218, Revisor’s Note.....	70
42 U.S.C. § 290bb-25, Revisor’s Note .....	70
42 U.S.C. § 300ff-28, Revisor’s Note .....	70
42 U.S.C. § 1395u, Revisor’s Note .....	70
42 U.S.C. § 1395ww, Revisor’s Note .....	70
42 U.S.C. § 1395x, Revisor’s Note .....	70
42 U.S.C. § 1396a, Revisor’s Note.....	70
42 U.S.C. § 1396b, Revisor’s Note .....	70
42 U.S.C. § 1396r, Revisor’s Note.....	70
42 U.S.C. § 3025, Revisor’s Note .....	70
42 U.S.C. § 5776, Revisor’s Note .....	70
Clean Air Act, CAA § 111(d), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(d) (1989) .....	70, 71
Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7401, <i>et seq.</i> (2014)	
CAA § 108, 42 U.S.C. § 7408 .....	55
CAA § 109, 42 U.S.C. § 7409 .....	55
CAA § 110, 42 U.S.C. § 7410 .....	55
CAA § 110(a)(2)(A), 42 U.S.C. § 7410(a)(2)(A).....	55, 56
CAA § 111, 42 U.S.C. § 7411 .....	47, 54
CAA § 111, 42 U.S.C. § 7411, Revisor’s Note .....	72
*CAA § 111(a)(1), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(a)(1) .....	4, 7, 10, 24, 30, 51, 55

CAA § 111(a)(2), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(a)(2) .....	7, 12, 41, 44
CAA § 111(a)(3), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(a)(3) .....	4, 7, 14, 29, 44
CAA § 111(a)(5), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(a)(5) .....	44
CAA § 111(b)(1)(A), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(b)(1)(A) .....	7, 44
CAA § 111(b)(1)(B), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(b)(1)(B) .....	7, 44
*CAA § 111(d), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(d) .....	7, 76
CAA § 111(d)(1), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(d)(1) .....	4, 7, 9, 26, 29, 41, ..... 43, 45, 74, 75, 76
CAA § 111(d)(1)(A), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(d)(1)(A) .....	5, 9, 26
CAA § 111(d)(1)(B), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(d)(1)(B) .....	7
CAA § 111(d)(2), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(d)(2) .....	43, 75
CAA § 111(d)(2)(A), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(d)(2)(A) .....	10
CAA § 111(e), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(e) .....	44, 45
CAA § 112(b)(2), 42 U.S.C. § 7412(b)(2) .....	63
CAA § 112(d), 42 U.S.C. § 7412(d) .....	54
CAA § 165(a)(4), 42 U.S.C. § 7475(a)(4) .....	54
*CAA § 302(k), 42 U.S.C. § 7602(k) .....	7, 30, 52, 53
CAA § 307(b)(1), 42 U.S.C. § 7607(b)(1) .....	1
CAA § 307(d)(9), 42 U.S.C. § 7607(d)(9) .....	28
CAA §§ 401, <i>et seq.</i> , 42 U.S.C. §§ 7651, <i>et seq.</i> .....	55
CAA § 403(a), 42 U.S.C. § 7651b(a) .....	56

CAA § 403(b), 42 U.S.C. § 7651b(b) .....	56
CAA § 403(d), 42 U.S.C. § 7651b(d) .....	56
CAA § 404, 42 U.S.C. § 7651c.....	56
CAA § 405, 42 U.S.C. § 7651d.....	56
CAA § 406, 42 U.S.C. § 7651e.....	56
42 U.S.C. § 9601, Revisor’s Note .....	70
42 U.S.C. § 9875, Revisor’s Note .....	70

### LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

136 CONG. REC. 36,067 (Oct. 27, 1990).....	74
Clean Air Act, as amended 1990, <i>reprinted in</i> 1 A LEGISLATIVE HISTORY OF THE CLEAN AIR ACT AMENDMENTS OF 1990, at 1 (Comm. Print 1993) .....	68, 69
Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990, Pub. L. No. 101-549, 104 Stat. 2399 (1990).....	9, 71
Clean Air Amendments of 1970, Pub. L. No. 91-604, 84 Stat. 1676 (1970).....	9
Clean Energy Jobs & Am. Power Act, S. 1733, 111th Cong. (2009).....	11
Climate Prot. Act of 2013, S. 332, 113th Cong. (2013) .....	11
H.R. Rep. No. 95-294 (1977), <i>reprinted in</i> 1977 U.S.C.C.A.N. 1077 .....	30, 52, 76
S. Con. Res. 8, S. Amdt. 646, 113th Cong. (2013) .....	11
S. Rep. No. 91-1196 (1970), <i>reprinted in</i> 1 CLEAN AIR ACT AMENDMENTS OF 1970, at i (Comm. Print 1970) .....	63

**EXECUTIVE MATERIALS**

Executive Office of the President, *The President’s Climate Action Plan* (June 2013), <https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/image/president27sclimateactionplan.pdf> ..... 11

The President, *Power Sector Carbon Pollution Standards: Memorandum for the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency* (June 25, 2013), 78 Fed. Reg. 39,535 (July 1, 2013) ..... 11

White House Fact Sheet, Ex. B to State Pet’rs’ Mot. for Stay & for Expedited Consideration of Pet. for Review, *West Virginia v. EPA*, No. 15-1363 (D.C. Cir. Oct. 23, 2015), ECF 1579999 ..... 2, 23

**FEDERAL REGULATIONS**

40 C.F.R. § 60.15 ..... 12

\*40 C.F.R. Part 60, Subpart B.....10, 49, 75

    40 C.F.R. § 60.21(b) ..... 49

    40 C.F.R. § 60.21(e) ..... 49

    40 C.F.R. § 60.22(a) ..... 10, 75

    40 C.F.R. § 60.22(b) ..... 10

    40 C.F.R. § 60.22(b)(3) ..... 49

    40 C.F.R. § 60.22(b)(5) ..... 75

    40 C.F.R. § 60.24(b)(3) ..... 49

    40 C.F.R. § 60.24(d) ..... 77

    40 C.F.R. § 60.24(f) ..... 10, 75, 77

40 C.F.R. Part 60, Subparts Cb-OOOO ..... 8, 48

    40 C.F.R. § 60.32c(a)..... 49

40 C.F.R. Part 60, Subpart UUUU.....	2, 15
40 C.F.R. § 60.5720.....	85
40 C.F.R. § 60.5740(a)(2)(i).....	17
40 C.F.R. § 60.5745(a)(7).....	81
40 C.F.R. § 60.5780(a)(5)(iii).....	82
40 C.F.R. § 60.5790(c).....	17
40 C.F.R. § 60.5790(c)(1).....	18, 19, 46
40 C.F.R. § 60.5790(c)(2)(ii).....	18
40 C.F.R. § 60.5855(a).....	18
40 C.F.R. § 60.5855(b).....	19
40 C.F.R. § 60.5880.....	18
40 C.F.R. Part 60, Subpart UUUU, Table 1.....	75, 76

### **FEDERAL REGISTER**

36 Fed. Reg. 24,876 (Dec. 23, 1971).....	59
*40 Fed. Reg. 53,340 (Nov. 17, 1975).....	10, 49, 58, 60, 61, 75, 77
41 Fed. Reg. 19,585 (May 12, 1976).....	50
41 Fed. Reg. 48,706 (Nov. 4, 1976).....	50
42 Fed. Reg. 55,796 (Oct. 18, 1977).....	59
44 Fed. Reg. 29,828 (May 22, 1979).....	49, 50, 59
45 Fed. Reg. 26,294 (Apr. 17, 1980).....	49, 59

47 Fed. Reg. 28,099 (June 29, 1982).....	75
47 Fed. Reg. 50,868 (Nov. 10, 1982).....	75
49 Fed. Reg. 35,771 (Sept. 12, 1984).....	75
61 Fed. Reg. 9905 (Mar. 12, 1996).....	34, 49, 59
69 Fed. Reg. 4652 (Jan. 30, 2004).....	63, 69
70 Fed. Reg. 15,994 (Mar. 29, 2005) .....	63, 64, 68
70 Fed. Reg. 28,606 (May 18, 2005).....	68
73 Fed. Reg. 44,354 (July 30, 2008).....	67
75 Fed. Reg. 31,514 (June 3, 2010).....	66
77 Fed. Reg. 9304 (Feb. 16, 2012).....	5, 11, 61, 62
78 Fed. Reg. 39,535 (July 1, 2013).....	11
79 Fed. Reg. 34,830 (June 18, 2014).....	16
79 Fed. Reg. 34,960 (June 18, 2014).....	16, 51
79 Fed. Reg. 36,880 (June 30, 2014).....	48
80 Fed. Reg. 64,510 (Oct. 23, 2015).....	11, 12, 49, 59
*80 Fed. Reg. 64,662 (Oct. 23, 2015).....	1, 11, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 34, 35, 41, 42, 45, 47, 48, 52, 53, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 65, 66, 67, 72, 76, 78, 81, 83, 84, 85
80 Fed. Reg. 64,966 (Oct. 23, 2015).....	19, 20

## MISCELLANEOUS

EPA, Air Emissions from Municipal Solid Waste Landfills – Background Information for Final Standards and Guidelines, EPA-453/R-94-021 (Dec. 1995), <a href="http://www3.epa.gov/ttn/atw/landfill/bidfl.pdf">http://www3.epa.gov/ttn/atw/landfill/bidfl.pdf</a> .....	63, 72
EPA, CO <sub>2</sub> Emission Performance Rate and Goal Computation Technical Support Document for CPP Final Rule (Aug. 2015), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-36850.....	15
• Appendix 5 – State Goals, EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-36849.....	78
EPA, Demand-Side Energy Efficiency Technical Support Document (Aug. 2015), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-36842 .....	15
EPA, Final Guideline Document: Control of Fluoride Emissions from Existing Phosphate Fertilizer Plants, EPA-450/2-77-005 (Mar. 1977), <a href="http://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyPURL.cgi?Docket=2000UNFK.TXT">http://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyPURL.cgi?Docket=</a> <a href="http://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyPURL.cgi?Docket=2000UNFK.TXT">2000UNFK.TXT</a> .....	59
EPA, Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Measures Technical Support Document (Aug. 3, 2015), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-37114 .....	16, 51
EPA, Kraft Pulping: Control of TRS Emissions from Existing Mills, EPA-450/2-78-003b (Mar. 1979), <a href="http://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyPURL.cgi?Dockey=2000ZF3I.TXT">http://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/</a> <a href="http://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyPURL.cgi?Dockey=2000ZF3I.TXT">ZyPURL.cgi?Dockey=2000ZF3I.TXT</a> .....	59
EPA, Legal Memorandum Accompanying Clean Power Plan for Certain Issues (undated), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-36872 .....	77
EPA, Legal Memorandum for Proposed Carbon Pollution Emission Guidelines for Existing Electric Utility Generating Units (undated), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-0419 .....	17, 63
EPA, Primary Aluminum: Guidelines for Control of Fluoride Emissions From Existing Primary Aluminum Plants, EPA-450/2-78-049b (Dec. 1979), <a href="http://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyPDF.cgi?Dockey=2000M9Hs.pdf">http://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyPDF.cgi?Dockey=</a> <a href="http://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyPDF.cgi?Dockey=2000M9Hs.pdf">2000M9Hs.pdf</a> .....	50, 59

EPA, Regulatory Impact Analysis for the Clean Power Plan Final Rule, EPA-452/R-15-003 (Aug. 2015), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-37105 .....	15, 22
FERC, <i>Energy Primer: A Handbook of Energy Market Basics</i> (Nov. 2015), <a href="http://www.ferc.gov/market-oversight/guide/energy-primer.pdf">www.ferc.gov/market-oversight/guide/energy-primer.pdf</a> .....	21
Final Br. of Resp't EPA, <i>New Jersey v. EPA</i> , No. 05-1097, 2007 WL 2155494 (D.C. Cir. July 23, 2007).....	63, 71
King, Melanie, Energy Strategies Group, Memorandum to EPA Docket EPA-HQ-OAR-2008-0708, Response to Public Comments on Proposed Amendments to National Emission Standards for Hazardous Air Pollutants for Existing Stationary Reciprocating Internal Combustion Engines and New Source Performance Standards for Stationary Internal Combustion Engines (Jan. 14, 2013), EPA-HQ-OAR-2008-0708-1491 .....	36
Martineau, Robert J., Jr. & Michael K. Skagg, <i>New Source Performance Standards</i> , in <i>THE CLEAN AIR ACT HANDBOOK</i> (Julie R. Domike & Alec C. Zacaroli eds., 3d ed. 2011).....	58, 59
McCarthy, Gina, <i>In 2016, We're Hitting the Ground Running</i> , THE EPA BLOG (Jan. 4, 2016), <a href="https://blog.epa.gov/blog/tag/clean-power-plan/">https://blog.epa.gov/blog/tag/clean-power-plan/</a> .....	33
Office of the Legislative Counsel, U.S. House of Representatives, House Legislative Counsel's Manual on Drafting Style § 332(b) (Nov. 1995), <a href="http://legcounsel.house.gov/HOLC/Drafting_Legislation/Drafting_Guide.html">http://legcounsel.house.gov/HOLC/Drafting_Legislation/Drafting_Guide.html</a> .....	69, 71, 73
Office of the Legislative Counsel, U.S. Senate, Legislative Drafting Manual § 126(b) (1997), <a href="https://www.law.yale.edu/system/files/documents/pdf/Faculty/SenateOfficeoftheLegislativeCounsel_LegislativeDraftingManual(1997).pdf">https://www.law.yale.edu/system/files/documents/pdf/Faculty/SenateOfficeoftheLegislativeCounsel_LegislativeDraftingManual(1997).pdf</a> .....	69, 71, 73
OXFORD ENGLISH DICTIONARY (J.A. Simpson & E.S.C. Weiner eds., 2d ed. 1989).....	30, 62
Petition for Writ of Certiorari, <i>FERC v. Elec. Power Supply Ass'n</i> , No. 14-840 (U.S. Jan. 15, 2015).....	39



*President Obama’s Clean Power Plan is a Strong Signal of International Leadership*  
(Aug. 5, 2015), <https://climate.america.gov/clean-power-plan-strong-signal-international-leadership> ..... 3

Schwartz, Seth, Evaluation of the Immediate Impact of the Clean Power Plan Rule on the Coal Industry (Oct. 2015), Att. to Ex. 1, Decl. of Seth Schwartz (Oct. 14, 2015) to Coal Indus. Mot. for Stay (Oct. 23, 2015), *West Virginia v. EPA*, No. 15-1363 (D.C. Cir. Oct. 23, 2015), ECF 1580004..... 22

U.S. Energy Information Administration, Today In Energy, Most states have Renewable Portfolio Standards (Feb. 3, 2012), <https://www.eia.gov/todayinenergy/detail.cfm?id=4850> ..... 39

*West Virginia v. EPA*, No. 15A773 (and related cases) (U.S. Feb. 9, 2016)

- Mem. for the Fed. Resp’ts in Opp’n (Feb. 4, 2016) ..... 31
- Order in Pending Case (Feb. 9, 2016).....22, 23, 35

**GLOSSARY OF TERMS**

Act (or CAA)	Clean Air Act
CO <sub>2</sub>	Carbon Dioxide
EPA	United States Environmental Protection Agency
FERC	Federal Energy Regulatory Commission
JA	Joint Appendix
MWh	Megawatt-Hour
Rule	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Carbon Pollution Emission Guidelines for Existing Stationary Sources: Electric Utility Generating Units, Final Rule, 80 Fed. Reg. 64,662 (Oct. 23, 2015)

## JURISDICTIONAL STATEMENT

Petitioners seek review of a U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (“EPA”) final rule entitled “Carbon Pollution Emission Guidelines for Existing Stationary Sources: Electric Utility Generating Units,” 80 Fed. Reg. 64,662 (Oct. 23, 2015) (“Rule”), Joint Appendix (“JA”), \_\_\_-\_\_\_. Petitions for review were timely filed in this Court under section 307(b)(1) of the Clean Air Act (“Act” or “CAA”).<sup>1</sup>

### STATEMENT OF ISSUES

1. Whether the Rule violates section 111 of the Clean Air Act by:
  - a. Requiring that States adopt standards of performance that are not “for,” and cannot be “applied” to, individual existing fossil fuel-fired electric generating units, but that instead require the owners and operators of these facilities to subsidize EPA-preferred facilities;
  - b. Requiring that States adopt standards of performance that are not based on technological or operational processes that continuously limit the rate at which the regulated pollutant is emitted by regulated sources, but instead require non-performance by sources; and/or
  - c. Requiring that States adopt standards for *existing* units that are more stringent even than those EPA contemporaneously established under section 111(b) for the best state-of-the-art *new* units.

---

<sup>1</sup> All citations are to the CAA; the Table of Authorities provides parallel citations to the U.S. Code.

2. Whether the Rule exceeds EPA’s authority under CAA section 111(d) by requiring States to adopt standards of performance for sources in source categories that are already regulated under section 112.

3. Whether the Rule abrogates authority granted to the States under section 111(d) by forbidding States from setting performance standards less stringent than the Rule’s national performance rates, and failing to authorize States “to take into consideration, among other factors, the remaining useful life” of an existing source.

4. Whether the Rule violates rights reserved to the States by the United States Constitution by reordering the mix of energy generation in such a way that States will have no choice but to carry out EPA’s preferred energy policy, regardless of whether the Rule is implemented through a state or federal plan.

## **STATUTES AND REGULATIONS**

The Rule is codified in 40 C.F.R. Part 60, Subpart UUUU. The Statutory and Regulatory Addendum reproduces pertinent portions of cited statutes and regulations.

## **INTRODUCTION**

Relying on an obscure provision of the Clean Air Act, EPA’s Rule seeks to effect an “aggressive transformation”<sup>2</sup> of the mix of electricity generation in nearly every State by systematically “decarboniz[ing]” power generation and ushering in a

---

<sup>2</sup> State Pet’rs’ Mot. for Stay (Oct. 23, 2015), Ex. B, White House Fact Sheet, ECF 1579999 (“White House Fact Sheet”), JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_.

new “clean energy” economy.<sup>3</sup> Although Congress has debated a number of bills designed to achieve that very result, it has not adopted any such legislation. Frustrated with Congress, EPA now purports to have discovered sweeping authority in section 111(d) of the Clean Air Act—a provision that has been used only five times in 45 years—to issue a “Power Plan” that forces States to fundamentally alter electricity generation throughout the country.

But as the Supreme Court recently said, courts should “greet ... with a measure of skepticism” claims by EPA to have “discover[ed] in a long-extant statute an unheralded power to regulate a significant portion of the American economy” and make “decisions of vast economic and political significance,” *Util. Air Regulatory Grp. v. EPA*, 134 S. Ct. 2427, 2444 (2014) (“*UARG*”) (internal quotation marks omitted), especially in areas outside an agency’s “expertise,” *King v. Burwell*, 135 S. Ct. 2480, 2489 (2015). That skepticism is doubly warranted here where EPA’s Rule intrudes on an “area[] of traditional state responsibility,” *Bond v. United States*, 134 S. Ct. 2077, 2089 (2014)—namely, the States’ “traditional authority over the need for additional generating capacity, the type of generating facilities to be licensed, land use, ratemaking, and the like,” *Pac. Gas & Elec. Co. v. State Energy Res. Conservation & Dev. Comm’n*, 461 U.S. 190, 212 (1983) (“*PG&E*”).

---

<sup>3</sup> *President Obama’s Clean Power Plan is a Strong Signal of International Leadership* (Aug. 5, 2015), <https://climate.america.gov/clean-power-plan-strong-signal-international-leadership/>.

EPA’s audacious assertion of authority in this Rule is more far-reaching than any previous effort by the agency. According to EPA, section 111(d) authorizes it to use the States to impose on fossil fuel-fired power plants emission reduction requirements that are premised not just on pollution control measures at the regulated plants, but also (and predominantly) on reducing or eliminating operations at those plants and shifting their electricity generation to competitors, including those not regulated by the Rule. Those reduction requirements far exceed what EPA has found may be achieved individually by even a new plant with the agency’s state-of-the-art “best system of emission reduction.” Rather, the reduction requirements can be met *only* by shutting down hundreds of coal-fired plants, limiting the use of others, and requiring the construction and operation of other types of facilities preferred by EPA—a directive EPA euphemistically calls “generation shifting.”

EPA’s legal theory is at odds with the plain language of section 111 and certainly is not “clearly” authorized by that provision. *UARG*, 134 S. Ct. at 2444. Section 111(d) authorizes EPA to establish “procedure[s]” under which States set “standards of performance for any existing source,” i.e., standards that are “appl[icable] ... to a[] particular source” within a regulated “source category.” CAA § 111(a)(1), (d)(1). Those standards must reflect the “application of the best system of emission reduction” to that “source,” i.e., to a “building, structure, facility, or installation.” *Id.* § 111(a)(1), (3). In other words, EPA may seek to reduce emissions only through measures that can be implemented by individual facilities. Indeed, for 45

years, EPA has consistently interpreted section 111 standards of performance in this way—not only in the five instances in which it has addressed existing sources, but also in the more than one hundred rulemakings in which it has adopted standards for new sources.

The Rule is further barred by the fact that coal-fired electric generating units are already regulated under section 112 of the Clean Air Act. *See* 77 Fed. Reg. 9304 (Feb. 16, 2012). Section 111(d) expressly prohibits EPA’s use of that section to require States to regulate “any air pollutant . . . emitted from a source category which is regulated under section [1]12.” CAA § 111(d)(1)(A).

Additionally, even if EPA were permitted to regulate in this instance, the Rule is unlawful because it prevents States from exercising the authority granted to them under section 111 to establish standards of performance and to take into consideration the remaining useful life of an existing source when applying a standard to that source.

Finally, the Rule violates the Constitution. In order to pass constitutional muster, cooperative federalism programs must provide States with a meaningful opportunity to decline implementation. But the Rule does not do so; States that decline to take legislative or regulatory action to ensure increased generation by EPA’s preferred power sources face the threat of insufficient electricity to meet demand. The Rule is thus an act of commandeering that leaves States no choice but to alter their

laws and programs governing electricity generation and delivery to accord with federal policy.

If upheld, the Rule would lead to a breathtaking expansion of the agency's authority. The Rule's restructuring of nearly every State's electric grid would exceed even the authority that Congress gave to the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission ("FERC"), the federal agency responsible for electricity regulation. But EPA's theory of "generation shifting"—which is not about making regulated sources reduce their emissions while operating but rather about preventing many sources from operating at all—does not stop with the power sector. EPA's newly-discovered authority threatens to enable the agency to mandate that any existing source's owners in *any* industry reduce their source's production, shutter the existing source entirely, and even subsidize their non-regulated competitors. Section 111(d) would be transformed from a limited provision into the most powerful part of the Clean Air Act, making the agency a central planner for every single industry that emits carbon dioxide. Congress did not intend and could not have imagined such a result when it passed the provision more than 45 years ago.

The Rule must be vacated.

## **STATEMENT OF THE CASE**

### **I. Section 111 of the Clean Air Act**

Enacted in 1970, section 111 authorizes the regulation of air pollutants emitted by stationary sources. Under section 111, EPA is directed to "list" categories of



“stationary sources”—defined as “any building, structure, facility, or installation which emits or may emit any air pollutant,” CAA § 111(a)(3)—whose pollutants endanger public health or welfare, *id.* § 111(b)(1)(A). EPA must establish nationally-applicable “standards of performance” for new stationary sources within that category. *Id.* § 111(b)(1)(B). EPA also may, in limited circumstances, call upon States to submit plans containing State-established standards of performance for the same pollutant from *existing* sources within the same source category. *Id.* § 111(d)(1).

#### **A. The Definition of “Standard of Performance”**

Under section 111(d), a “standard of performance” must be “for” and “appl[icable] ... to a[] particular source” within a regulated source category. *Id.* § 111(d), (d)(1)(B); *accord id.* § 111(b)(1)(B) (discussing standards of performance “which will be applicable to” individual new sources); *id.* § 111(a)(2). Section 111(a)(1) defines the phrase to mean, for both new and existing sources:

a standard for emissions of air pollutants which reflects the degree of emission limitation achievable through the application of the best system of emission reduction which (taking into account the cost of achieving such reduction and any nonair quality health and environmental impact and energy requirements) the Administrator determines has been adequately demonstrated.

The term “emission limitation” means a “requirement ... which limits the quantity, rate, or concentration of emissions of air pollutants on a continuous basis ....” *Id.* § 302(k). Thus, a “standard of performance” must reflect the emission limitation that can be achieved by “the application of the best system of emission reduction” that has

been “demonstrated” to limit emissions from an individual source in the listed source category on a “continuous basis,” after considering cost and other factors.

Since 1970, every performance standard has adhered to the requirement of this plain text. Each has been based upon a best system of emission reduction involving technological controls or low-polluting production processes that: (i) are capable of being implemented at the source, (ii) limit the individual source’s emissions while it operates, and (iii) do not limit the individual source’s level of production. *See generally* 40 C.F.R. pt. 60, subpts. Cb-OOOO.

#### **B. Standards of Performance for Existing Sources**

Though section 111’s primary focus—as reflected in its title, “Standards of performance for new stationary sources”—is the regulation of new sources, EPA has on a few occasions called upon States to establish standards of performance for *existing* sources under section 111(d) in a category for which EPA has issued a national new source standard. Compared to the roughly one hundred new source performance standards under section 111(b), EPA has promulgated only five rules under section 111(d).

Section 111(d)’s infrequent use stems partly from an important limitation on EPA’s authority contained in that provision itself: the Section 112 Exclusion. In the 1990 CAA Amendments, Congress broadly expanded the stringency and reach of

section 112,<sup>4</sup> and at the same time limited the reach of section 111(d) for the purpose of prohibiting double regulation of sources also regulated under section 112. Since the 1990 Amendments, section 111(d) has expressly prohibited EPA from requiring States to regulate “any air pollutant ... emitted from a source category which is regulated under section [1]12.” CAA § 111(d)(1)(A). This means “EPA may not employ § [1]11(d) if existing stationary sources of the pollutant in question are regulated under ... § [1]12.” *Am. Elec. Power Co. v. Connecticut*, 131 S. Ct. 2527, 2537 n.7 (2011) (“*AEP*”).

In contrast to the standard-setting authority granted to *EPA* for new sources under section 111(b), section 111(d) grants to *the States* the authority to set performance standards for existing sources. Section 111(d) permits EPA only to prescribe regulations “establish[ing] a procedure” under which “each State shall submit” to EPA “a plan which ... establishes standards of performance for any existing source” meeting the statutory criteria. CAA § 111(d)(1). It further directs that EPA’s regulations “shall permit the State in applying a standard of performance to any particular source” to “take into consideration, among other factors, the remaining useful life of the existing source to which such standard applies.” *Id.* “[I]n cases where

---

<sup>4</sup> Compare Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990, Pub. L. No. 101-549, § 301, 104 Stat. 2399, 2531-74 (1990) (amending CAA § 312), JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_, with Clean Air Amendments of 1970, Pub. L. No. 91-604, § 112, 84 Stat. 1676, 1685-86 (1970), JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_.

the State fails to submit a satisfactory plan,” EPA has the authority to “prescribe a plan for a State.” *Id.* § 111(d)(2)(A).

EPA’s 1975 regulations reflect these statutory directives. Establishing the procedure for section 111(d) state plans, 40 C.F.R. pt. 60, subpt. B, those regulations provide that EPA will issue under section 111(d) only a “guideline document” containing an “emission guideline” “for the development of State plans.” 40 C.F.R. § 60.22(a), (b). Each individual State then submits a plan establishing standards of performance, *id.* § 60.22(b), which may be less stringent than the EPA emission guidelines if the State makes certain demonstrations, including infeasibility or unreasonable cost given a plant’s age, *id.* § 60.24(f).

No previous section 111(d) regulation has identified emission guidelines for existing sources that are more stringent than the corresponding section 111(b) standards for new sources in that category. *See infra* pp. 58-59 & n.30. This is consistent with the Act’s directive that EPA must take cost and feasibility into account in setting the best system of emission reduction, CAA § 111(a)(1), because retrofitting an existing source with pollution controls will be more expensive and technologically challenging than incorporating controls into a new plant’s design, 40 Fed. Reg. 53,340, 53,344 (Nov. 17, 1975), JA \_\_\_\_.

## II. The President's Climate Action Plan

After Congress declined to pass legislation authorizing CO<sub>2</sub> reduction programs,<sup>5</sup> President Obama issued his “Climate Action Plan” in June 2013.<sup>6</sup> The President ordered EPA to mandate steep reductions in CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from power plants under section 111.<sup>7</sup> EPA subsequently adopted separate rules under section 111(b) and section 111(d) for new and existing fossil fuel-fired electric generating units, including the Rule at issue here. *See* 80 Fed. Reg. 64,510 (Oct. 23, 2015); 80 Fed. Reg. 64,662. It did so even though existing coal-fired units had recently been regulated under section 112. *See* 77 Fed. Reg. 9304.

### A. The Section 111(b) New Source Rule

In October 2015, EPA promulgated standards limiting CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from new facilities within two source categories—coal- and natural gas-fired electric generating units. 80 Fed. Reg. 64,510. EPA determined that the best system of emission reduction for newly constructed coal-fired facilities is partial carbon capture and sequestration technology, based on which EPA set a performance standard of

---

<sup>5</sup> *See, e.g.*, S. Con. Res. 8, S. Amdt. 646, 113th Cong. (2013) (rejecting carbon tax); Climate Prot. Act of 2013, S. 332, 113th Cong. (2013) (rejecting fees on greenhouse gas emissions); Clean Energy Jobs & Am. Power Act, S. 1733, 111th Cong. (2009) (rejecting greenhouse gas cap-and-trade program).

<sup>6</sup> Executive Office of the President, *The President's Climate Action Plan* (June 2013), <https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/image/president27sclimateactionplan.pdf>.

<sup>7</sup> *Power Sector Carbon Pollution Standards: Memorandum for the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency* (June 25, 2013), 78 Fed. Reg. 39,535, 39,535-36 (July 1, 2013).

1,400 lbs CO<sub>2</sub>/megawatt-hour (“MWh”). *Id.* at 64,512-13, Tbl. 1. For modified and reconstructed coal-fired facilities,<sup>8</sup> EPA rejected carbon capture technology and concluded that improved operational efficiency was the best system of emission reduction. Applying this system, EPA established standards for modified coal-fired facilities of no less than 1,800 to 2,000 lbs CO<sub>2</sub>/MWh, to be determined on a case-by-case basis. *Id.* For new and reconstructed gas-fired facilities, the standard is 1,000 lbs CO<sub>2</sub>/MWh, based on natural gas combined cycle technology. *Id.*<sup>9</sup>

**B. The Section 111(d) Existing Source Rule: “The Clean Power Plan”**

Notwithstanding the express prohibition of the Section 112 Exclusion, the same day EPA issued the section 111(b) rule, it separately issued under section 111(d) the Rule at issue to address CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from existing facilities within the coal and gas plant categories. Because EPA concluded that emission controls implementable at individual existing coal plants cannot yield sufficient CO<sub>2</sub> emission reductions to meet the Administration’s policy goals, EPA abandoned the approach it took in every other performance standard rulemaking, including the contemporaneous section 111(b) rule. As EPA recognized, the carbon capture technology that formed the basis for its new source performance standard for new coal units is not feasible for existing coal

---

<sup>8</sup> The statute defines modified and reconstructed sources as new sources. CAA § 111(a)(2); *see also* 40 C.F.R. § 60.15.

<sup>9</sup> EPA’s section 111(b) rule is being challenged in a separate proceeding before this Court. *See North Dakota v. EPA*, No. 15-1381 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. filed Oct. 23, 2015).

units. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,756, JA \_\_\_\_\_. And though EPA believed existing coal plants could feasibly make the combustion efficiency improvements that form the basis for the section 111(b) standards for modified coal facilities, those improvements would not achieve sufficient reductions to meet the Administration's goals. *Id.* at 64,748, JA \_\_\_\_\_. The only way to obtain the desired reductions, EPA decided, was to restructure the entire power sector—by reducing the use of existing coal-fired power plants altogether and replacing their generation through increased use of existing natural gas-fired power plants and yet-to-be-built renewable resources. *See generally id.* at 64,717-811, JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_\_.

### **1. EPA's "Performance Rates" and Compliance Requirements**

To achieve this policy outcome, EPA devised national "emission performance rates" for coal and gas power plants based on a best system of emission reduction consisting of three so-called "Building Blocks." *Id.* at 64,719-20, 64,752, JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_\_.

#### **a. EPA's "Building Blocks" and "Performance Rates"**

Building Block 1 (the only element of EPA's rule that resembles its historic practice) is based on improved combustion efficiency at individual coal-fired generating facilities, which can result in lower CO<sub>2</sub> emissions per unit of electric output. *Id.* at 64,745, JA \_\_\_\_\_. As EPA explained, however, Building Block 1 would "yield only a small amount of emission reductions," nowhere near enough to satisfy EPA's policy goals. *Id.* at 64,769, JA \_\_\_\_\_.

Building Block 2 is based on displacing large quantities of existing coal-fired generation with additional generation from existing natural gas generating facilities. *Id.* at 64,745-46, JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_. Put another way, existing natural gas generating facilities would be called on to produce much more power than they currently do and coal units much less. *Id.* at 64,795, 64,800, JA \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_.<sup>10</sup>

Building Block 3 is based on displacing both existing coal- and gas-fired generation with large increases in generation from new renewable energy resources like wind and solar. *Id.* at 64,747-48, JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_. Together, Blocks 2 and 3 represent “[t]he amount of reduced generation” from coal- and gas-fired plants by which EPA plans to achieve the bulk of its desired emission reductions. *Id.* at 64,782, JA \_\_\_\_; *see also id.* at 64,728 (“[M]ost of the CO<sub>2</sub> controls need to come in the form of those other measures ... that involve, in one form or another, replacement of higher emitting generation with lower- or zero-emitting generation.”), JA \_\_\_\_\_. The fundamental restructuring of the current mix of power generation among regulated and non-regulated entities<sup>11</sup> reflected in Building Blocks 2 and 3 is what EPA refers to as “generation shifting.”

---

<sup>10</sup> To ensure that gas-fired generation is replaced by renewable generation in the long term, the Rule actually forbids the use of *new* natural gas plants to calculate rate reductions. *See* 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,729-30, 64,903, JA \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_.

<sup>11</sup> Non-emitting renewable energy facilities are not regulated “sources” under section 111 because they do not “emit any air pollutant.” CAA § 111(a)(3) (definition of “stationary source”).



Based on these “Building Blocks,” and an assumed decline in demand for electricity,<sup>12</sup> EPA set uniform “emission performance rates” for existing fossil fuel-fired generating facilities nationwide. To do so, EPA determined the theoretical CO<sub>2</sub> emission rates at which existing coal- and gas-fired plants would have to operate to obtain the emission reductions assumed to be achievable through implementation of the three sector-wide Building Blocks. *See generally* CO<sub>2</sub> Emission Performance Rate and Goal Computation Technical Support Document (Aug. 2015) (“Goal Computation TSD”), JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_. The resulting rate for existing coal-fired plants is 1,305 lbs CO<sub>2</sub>/MWh, and for existing gas-fired plants is 771 lbs CO<sub>2</sub>/MWh. 40 C.F.R. pt. 60, subpt. UUUU, Tbl. 1. These emission rates are the “chief regulatory requirement of th[e] rulemaking”; plants may not emit CO<sub>2</sub> in excess of these rates. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,823, 64,667, JA \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_.

But, as EPA concedes, no existing facility can actually meet these rates. They are not achievable by pollution controls or operational improvements at any individual source, and simply reducing generation at the source does not reduce (and

---

<sup>12</sup> Despite population and economic growth and the fact that electric demand has *never* fallen over a multi-year period absent a significant economic downturn, EPA assumed that demand for electricity will *fall* between 2020 and 2030. Regulatory Impact Analysis at 3-14, Tbl. 3-2, 3-25, 3-27, Tbl. 3-11 (Aug. 2015) (“RIA”), JA \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_; Demand-Side Energy Efficiency Technical Support Document at 62-64, Tbl. 25 (Aug. 2015), JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_.

may actually increase) the source's emissions rate. *Id.* at 64,754, JA \_\_\_\_.<sup>13</sup> They are even stricter than the emission rates established by EPA for *new* plants using what EPA considers to be the “best” available technology.

### Summary of Emission Rates (lbs CO<sub>2</sub>/MWh)

	New	Reconstructed	Modified	Existing	2012 Average
<b>Coal</b>	1,400	1,800 - 2,000	1,800-2,000 <sup>14</sup>	1,305	2,217 <sup>15</sup>
<b>Natural Gas</b>	1,000	1,000	N/A	771	905 <sup>16</sup>

#### b. EPA's Rationale

EPA's legal justification for its “Building Blocks” shifted substantially during the rulemaking. Because pollution controls that could be implemented by fossil fuel-fired generating units “yield only a small amount of emission reductions,” *id.* at 64,769, JA \_\_\_\_, EPA's proposed rationale for the rule was not based on what fossil fuel-fired sources themselves could achieve. Instead, attributing a capacious meaning to the word “system,” 79 Fed. Reg. 34,830, 34,885 (June 18, 2014), JA \_\_\_\_, EPA claimed that it could “include [within its best system of emission reduction] *anything*

---

<sup>13</sup> As EPA acknowledges, coal plants that reduce operations actually are generally *less* efficient, and have *higher* emission rates. Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Measures Technical Support Document at 2-34 (Aug. 3, 2015) (“Mitigation TSD”), JA \_\_\_\_\_. Conversely, gas plants can have higher emission rates when they *increase* operations. *See* 79 Fed. Reg. 34,960, 34,980 (June 18, 2014) (EPA noting some gas plants “are designed to be highly efficient when operated as load-following units” but are less efficient at baseload), JA \_\_\_\_\_.

<sup>14</sup> Modified coal-fired units are subject to case-by-case standards that may not be more stringent than these levels.

<sup>15</sup> Mitigation TSD at 3-4, JA \_\_\_\_\_.

<sup>16</sup> *Id.*

that reduces emissions,” including obligations imposed on entities beyond the regulated sources themselves, Legal Memorandum for Proposed Carbon Pollution Emission Guidelines at 51-52, EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-0419 (“EPA Legal Memo”), JA \_\_\_\_ (emphasis added).

But in the final Rule, EPA took a different approach. Retreating from its sweeping assertions in the proposed rule, EPA conceded that a best system of emission reduction must be “*limited to measures that can be implemented—’appl[ie]d’—by the sources themselves.*” 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,720 (emphasis added), JA \_\_\_\_ . It then provided a new legal theory for nevertheless setting performance rates that are demonstrably not achievable by regulated sources and for including in the best system “actions that may occur off-site and actions that a third party takes.” *Id.* at 64,761, JA \_\_\_\_ . Specifically, EPA equated a source with its owner or operator: “[a]s a practical matter, the ‘source’ includes the ‘*owner or operator*’ of any building, structure, facility, or installation for which a standard of performance is applicable.” *Id.* at 64,762 (emphasis added), JA \_\_\_\_ ; *see also id.* at 64,720, JA \_\_\_\_ . An *owner or operator* of a regulated source, EPA said, can “invest in actions at facilities owned by others,” *id.* at 64,733, JA \_\_\_\_ , including generation from other sources or facilities, in order to generate “emission rate credits,” *id.* at 64,669, JA \_\_\_\_ , to offset the regulated source’s emission rate, 40 C.F.R. § 60.5740(a)(2)(i); *see also id.* § 60.5790(c). Alternatively, the *owner or operator* of a regulated unit can comply with the performance rate by simply shutting the unit down. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,750, 64,780 n.590, JA \_\_\_\_ , \_\_\_\_ . EPA claimed deference for

its interpretation under *Chevron, U.S.A., Inc. v. NRDC*, 467 U.S. 837 (1984). 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,719 n.301, JA \_\_\_\_.

The Rule’s performance rates thus are based on the availability of tradable “emission rate credits” that implement EPA’s “Building Blocks.” Because the Rule’s performance rates cannot be met by any single regulated source, a source’s owner or operator must comply by “calculat[ing] an adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate” of 1,305 or 771 lbs/MWh using (i) actual stack emissions data, and (ii) proof (in the form of tradable “emission rate credits”) that actual lower- or zero-emitting generation elsewhere has occurred. 40 C.F.R. § 60.5790(c)(1). An “emission rate credit” is a “tradable compliance instrument[ ]” that “represent[s] one MWh of actual energy generated or saved....” *Id.* §§ 60.5880, 60.5790(c)(2)(ii). Implementing the Building Blocks through emissions trading, EPA admits, is “an *integral* part of [the] ... analysis” used to justify the Rule’s “performance rates.” 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,734, JA \_\_\_\_ (emphasis added). According to EPA, “trading allows each affected [unit] to access ... all the building blocks as well as other measures,” *id.* at 64,733, JA \_\_\_\_, and to do so using “a virtually nationwide emissions trading market for compliance,” *id.* at 64,732, JA \_\_\_\_\_. No such nationwide trading market exists at present.

## 2. State Plans

Under the Rule, States must submit plans establishing CO<sub>2</sub> emissions standards for existing coal-fired and gas-fired generating units that will meet EPA’s emissions performance rates. 40 C.F.R. § 60.5855(a). Alternatively, the Rule allows States to

impose emission standards that will “collectively meet” EPA-assigned state-wide “goals” derived from an average of the rates for all regulated generating units within a State. *Id.* § 60.5855(b). These goals are expressed either in “rate-based” terms (pounds of CO<sub>2</sub> per megawatt-hour that all regulated sources in a State can emit on average) or “mass-based” terms (total tons of CO<sub>2</sub> that all regulated sources in a State can emit in aggregate). *Id.*

Both types of plans require owners and operators of regulated plants to subsidize alternative generation. In a plan implementing a rate-based State goal, the State must require an owner or operator to “calculate an adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate” based on stack emissions and any “emission rate credits” from other facilities. 40 C.F.R. § 60.5790(c)(1). Under a mass-based plan, achieving the state-wide CO<sub>2</sub> emissions cap “involve[s], in one form or another, replacement of higher emitting [coal or gas-fired] generation with lower-or zero-emitting generation,” 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,728, JA \_\_\_\_\_. New, more efficient gas-fired plants are restricted from participating in both types of state plans. *See, e.g., id.* at 64,887-91, 64,903, JA \_\_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_\_.

### **3. The Proposed Federal Plan**

Because EPA has the authority “to prescribe a plan for a State in cases where the State fails to submit a satisfactory plan,” CAA § 111(d), the agency has separately proposed (but not yet finalized) two approaches to a federal plan. *See* 80 Fed. Reg. 64,966 (Oct. 23, 2015). Both approaches are trading programs. The plants in a rate-based trading program would be required to meet the emission rates established under

the Rule through the use of emission rate credits that could be bought, sold, transferred, or banked for future use under an EPA-administered program. *Id.* at 64,970-71. Under the mass-based approach, EPA would distribute transferrable emissions allowances up to the mass-based goal established for the State under the Rule. *Id.* at 64,971.

Because no regulated unit can achieve the Rule's uniform performance rates, States will be required even under federal plans to facilitate the reordering of each State's mix of electricity generation in order to "ensure that electric system reliability will be maintained" as coal generation is forced to retire and alternative generation must be constructed to take its place. *Id.* at 64,981; *see* 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,678, 64,874, JA \_\_\_, \_\_\_. As commenters warned, the "emission performance requirements set by EPA necessarily require compliance and enforcement activities that include changing dispatch methodology, efficiency measures, the type of generation to be constructed, and renewable energy considerations, all of which are matters within the [States'] exclusive jurisdiction."<sup>17</sup>

---

<sup>17</sup> Comments of Fla. Pub. Serv. Comm'n, at 8 (Dec. 1, 2014), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-23650, JA \_\_\_; *see also* Comments of Pub. Util. Comm'n of Texas, at 9 (Dec. 1, 2014), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-23305, JA \_\_\_; Comments of North Dakota Pub. Serv. Comm'n, at 14-16 (Nov. 25, 2014), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-25944, JA \_\_\_-\_\_\_; Comments of Thomas Jefferson Inst. for Public Policy, at 5, 8 (Dec. 1, 2014), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-23286, JA \_\_\_, \_\_\_; Comments of La. Pub. Serv. Comm'n, at 5-6 (undated), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-23175, JA \_\_\_-\_\_\_.

#### 4. The Rule's Effects

In the Administration's own words, the Rule is intended to effect through the States an "aggressive transformation" of the electric sector by "decarboniz[ing]" power generation. *Supra* nn. 2, 3. Today, "[g]rid operators dispatch plants—or, call them into service—with the simultaneous goals of providing reliable power at the lowest reasonable cost." FERC, *Energy Primer: A Handbook of Energy Market Basics* at 48 (Nov. 2015), <http://www.ferc.gov/market-oversight/guide/energy-primer.pdf>. But the Rule subordinates the energy diversity, consumer protection, reliability, and other policies in current state dispatch law to the single overarching goal of shifting the generation of electricity to zero- or low-emitting resources. In fact, by setting emission rates that can be met only by a substantial shift in generation to new, renewable facilities, *see supra* pp. 12-19, the Rule *constrains* industry's ability to keep consumer prices low and to guarantee grid reliability through dispatch decisions.<sup>18</sup> In this regard, the Rule also forbids sources from complying by investing in new gas generation facilities. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,903, JA \_\_\_\_.

---

<sup>18</sup> As EPA recognizes, the nation's fleet of fossil fuel-fired units cannot keep operating at existing levels and meet the Rule's requirements simply by subsidizing additional renewable generation. There is not enough demand for electricity to allow that result. *See* 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,928 (EPA "assumes that overall electric demand will decrease."), JA \_\_\_\_; *id.* at 64,677 (Electricity "supply and demand [must] constantly be[] balanced."), JA \_\_\_\_ . That is why EPA describes the Rule as requiring "generation shifting." *Id.* at 64,729, JA \_\_\_\_ . Fossil generators must reduce generation while subsidizing renewable replacement generation. *Id.* at 64,749 (Under the Rule, "the volume of coal-fired generation will decrease."), JA \_\_\_\_ .

The Rule thus would reverse countless decisions made by States and industry throughout the country as to the optimal mix of power generation to reliably satisfy electricity demand. EPA's own data show that coal-fired generating capacity will be cut nearly in half, from over 336,000 MW in 2012, to 183,000 MW in 2030. RIA at 2-3, 3-31, JA \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_. Conversely, EPA forecasts that the Rule will expand non-hydroelectric renewable generating capacity to a level in 2030—174,000 MW—almost equal to the forecast for coal capacity. *Id.* To achieve this remarkable result, EPA projects that the amount of electricity from wind and solar generation, the principal types of non-hydroelectric renewable generation, will need to triple. Coal Indus. Mot. for Stay (Oct. 23, 2015), Ex. 1, Decl. of Seth Schwartz (Oct. 14, 2015), Attach., Seth Schwartz, Evaluation of the Immediate Impact of the Clean Power Plan Rule on the Coal Industry at 29 (Oct. 2015), ECF 1580004, JA \_\_\_\_. But even these data understate the Rule's transformative effect on the power sector. Had EPA accounted for increases in electric demand forecasted by the Energy Information Administration, the U.S. Department of Energy agency created by Congress to collect energy data and project energy trends, even greater levels of renewable generation will be necessary to satisfy the Rule's emission rates. *Id.* at 21-29, JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_.

## 5. The Supreme Court Stay

On February 9, 2016, the Supreme Court stayed the Rule, halting its enforceability and its deadlines pending disposition of the petitions for review in this Court and any petitions for a writ of certiorari or merits determination. Order in



Pending Case, *West Virginia v. EPA*, No. 15A773 (U.S. Feb. 9, 2016) (*see also* Nos. 15A776, 15A778, 15A787, 15A793), JA \_\_\_-\_\_\_; *see Nken v. Holder*, 556 U.S. 418, 428 (2009).

## SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT

**I.A.** For the Clean Air Act to authorize the Rule’s wholesale transformation of the U.S. energy system, EPA must show that the Act contains a clear statement *compelling* the agency’s reading of section 111(d). Because the Act includes no such congressional authorization (and EPA does not even attempt to argue that it does), the Rule fails two separate clear-statement rules.

*First*, the Rule’s reliance on section 111(d) to “aggressively transform[] ... the domestic energy industry,” White House Fact Sheet, JA \_\_\_-\_\_\_, is precisely the kind of “transformative expansion in EPA’s regulatory authority” based on a “long-extant statute” that requires “clear congressional authorization,” *UARG*, 134 S. Ct. at 2444; *see also King*, 135 S. Ct. at 2489. EPA is making “decisions of vast ‘economic and political significance’” based on a rarely used provision of the Clean Air Act without a “clear[]” statement from Congress, *UARG*, 134 S. Ct. at 2444, and in an area where the agency has no claim of expertise, *King*, 135 S. Ct. at 2489. *See infra* Section I.A.1.

*Second*, “[f]ederal law may not be interpreted to reach” areas traditionally subject to State regulation “unless the language of the federal law compels the intrusion” with “unmistakably clear ... language.” *Am. Bar Ass’n v. FTC*, 430 F.3d 457, 471-72 (D.C. Cir. 2005) (internal quotation marks omitted). The States’ authority over the intrastate

generation and consumption of energy is “one of the most important of the functions traditionally associated with the police power of the States.” *Ark. Elec. Coop. Corp. v. Ark. Pub. Serv. Comm’n*, 461 U.S. 375, 377 (1983). By arrogating to itself the authority to control each State’s energy mix, EPA undermines the States’ authority to govern the intrastate “[n]eed for new power facilities, their economic feasibility, and rates and services,” *PG&E*, 461 U.S. at 205, with no clear statement of authority. *See infra* Section I.A.2.

**I.B.** The Rule is unlawful because section 111(d) unambiguously forecloses it.

*First*, section 111(d) forbids EPA to mandate emission reductions by requiring the owners or operators of existing sources to subsidize lower-emitting generation, including generation entirely outside section 111’s reach. Section 111’s performance standards “appl[y]” to sources themselves, not to the owners and operators of those sources. CAA § 111(a)(1). This is not only EPA’s longstanding interpretation of the statute, it is compelled by the statutory text and by *ASARCO Inc. v. EPA*, 578 F.2d 319 (D.C. Cir. 1978), which bars the Rule’s approach of setting emission performance rates that can be achieved only by the electricity sector in aggregate, rather than by individual sources. *See infra* Section I.B.1.

*Second*, EPA cannot require States to adopt as a “standard of performance” reduction obligations that can be met only through *non*-performance by regulated sources. A “standard of performance” requires *better* emission performance from an individual regulated source, not *less* (or no) performance. The Rule’s “generation-

shifting” mandate does not involve a source improving its emissions performance when it generates, but instead consists of plants *reducing* or *ceasing* work, or *non-performance*, as their production is “shifted” to EPA-preferred facilities. Congress specifically amended the CAA in 1977 to preclude standards of performance set on this basis. *See infra* Section I.B.2.

*Third*, the Rule contravenes the purpose and design of section 111 by requiring that States adopt existing source standards that are more stringent than the corresponding new source standards. The point of section 111’s division of authority between new and existing sources was to require the most stringent emission reductions when it was most economically sensible to require those stringent reductions—at the time of new construction or modification. The Rule’s disregard for this fundamental aspect of Congress’s statutory design is unlawful and results in a statute that would be “unrecognizable to the Congress that designed” it. *UARG*, 134 S. Ct. at 2437 (internal quotation marks omitted). Indeed, under EPA’s inconsistent reading of section 111, the Rule’s emission reduction requirements cannot be met even if every coal- and natural gas-fired plant is closed and replaced with brand new plants using what EPA has determined to be state-of-the-art technology. *See infra* Section I.B.3.

**II.** The Rule is categorically foreclosed by the Section 112 Exclusion. Since the 1990 CAA Amendments, section 111(d) has expressly prohibited EPA from using section 111(d) to regulate “a source category which is regulated under [CAA section

112].” CAA § 111(d)(1)(A). Congress enacted this language to prevent the costly double regulation that coal-fired power plants are facing with this Rule, having already sunk billions of dollars to comply with section 112 regulations. Much of this investment will now become stranded as the units are forced to retire. *See infra* Section II.

**III.** The Clean Air Act is a program of cooperative federalism, which expressly provides States—not EPA—with the right under section 111(d) to “establish” and “apply” performance standards and to “take into consideration, among other factors, the remaining useful life of the existing source to which [a] standard [of performance] applies.” CAA § 111(d)(1). But with this Rule, EPA, not the States, effectively established standards of performance and prohibited States from establishing and applying standards to sources reflecting the statutory considerations, even when applying EPA’s emission rates would force a source to shut down before the end of its useful life. *See infra* Section III.

**IV.** The U.S. Constitution preserves the sovereignty of the States by barring the federal government from compelling them to implement federal policies. The federal government may not “use the States as implements of regulation”—in other words, to commandeer them to carry out federal law. *New York v. United States*, 505 U.S. 144, 161 (1992). The Rule violates this sovereignty by commandeering and coercing the States to enable EPA’s decarbonization of the U.S. power system. But achieving the Rule’s emissions targets requires States to fundamentally revamp their

regulation of their utility sectors and to undertake a series of regulatory actions, all to satisfy EPA's dictates. *See infra* Section IV.A.

Moreover, States have no "legitimate choice" but to take action to carry out EPA's federal decarbonization policy. *Nat'l Fed. of Indep. Bus. v. Sebelius*, 132 S. Ct. 2566, 2602 (2012) (Roberts, C.J.) (plurality opinion) ("*NFIB*"); *see also id.* at 2659 (Scalia, Kennedy, Thomas, and Alito, JJ., dissenting). Because EPA lacks the authority to take all of the regulatory actions necessary to ensure a sufficient supply of power to accommodate the Rule's changes, States face the threat of blackouts and consequent threats to their public safety and economies unless they help implement federal policy. The federal government cannot legitimately put States to that non-choice. *See infra* Section IV.B.

## STANDING

Petitioners include States and state agencies that are required by the Rule to implement federal policy, electric utilities that own or operate units regulated by the Rule, coal companies that will have to reduce operations or close mines as a result of the Rule's shift away from coal-fired generation, industries and other consumers affected by higher rates and less reliable electricity produced by the Rule's closure of some of the most affordable and reliable power sources, and labor unions representing workers who will lose jobs as a result of the Rule.<sup>19</sup> Individual Petitioners

---

<sup>19</sup> Petitioners in Case No. 15-1488, *Competitive Enterprise Institute et al. v. EPA*, are filing pursuant to Circuit Rule 28(a)(7) a separate addendum to support their standing.

have standing because they have suffered an injury-in-fact caused by the Rule that is redressable by the relief they seek. *Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife*, 504 U.S. 555, 560-61 (1992); see, e.g., *West Virginia v. EPA*, 362 F.3d 861, 868 (D.C. Cir. 2004). Trade association Petitioners have standing on behalf of their members. *Sierra Club v. EPA*, 292 F.3d 895, 898 (D.C. Cir. 2002).

### STANDARD OF REVIEW

This Court must set aside final EPA action that is “arbitrary, capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accordance with law; contrary to constitutional right, power, privilege, or immunity; in excess of statutory jurisdiction, authority, or limitations, or short of statutory right ....” CAA § 307(d)(9). Where “decisions of vast economic and political significance” are concerned, the statute must “speak clearly” to authorize the agency’s action, *UARG*, 134 S. Ct. at 2444 (internal quotation marks omitted), “especially” where the agency “has no expertise” in the matter, *King*, 135 S. Ct. at 2489. Likewise, “[f]ederal law may not be interpreted to reach” areas traditionally subject to State regulation absent “unmistakably clear ... language.” *Am. Bar Ass’n*, 430 F.3d at 471-72. Moreover, “the existence of ambiguity is not enough per se to warrant deference to the agency’s interpretation”; *Chevron* deference is warranted only if “[t]he ambiguity [is] such as to make it appear that Congress either explicitly or implicitly delegated authority to cure that ambiguity.” *Id.* at 469.

## ARGUMENT

### I. The Rule Transgresses Section 111.

As an executive agency, EPA has “only those authorities conferred upon it by Congress.” *Michigan v. EPA*, 268 F.3d 1075, 1081 (D.C. Cir. 2001). Where “there is no statute conferring authority, [EPA] has none.” *Id.*; *see also NRDC v. EPA*, 777 F.3d 456, 468 (D.C. Cir. 2014) (“[N]o statutory provision giv[es] [EPA] free-form discretion to set [requirements] based on its own policy assessment....”). In some circumstances, that delegation of authority not only must be apparent in the law, it must be stated with “unmistakably clear ... language.” *Am. Bar Ass’n*, 430 F.3d at 471-72.

EPA’s requirement that States adopt standards of performance based on what EPA calls “generation shifting” is foreclosed by section 111’s unambiguous language and structure. *See infra* Section I.B. Under section 111(d), EPA’s role is to establish a “procedure” for States to submit plans “establish[ing] standards of performance *for any existing source.*” CAA § 111(d)(1) (emphasis added). State plans in turn must “apply[] a standard of performance to any *particular source.*” *Id.* (emphasis added). The CAA defines a “stationary source” as “any building, structure, facility, or installation which emits or may emit any air pollutant.” *Id.* § 111(a)(3). Thus, section 111(d) permits EPA to call upon States to establish performance standards only for the building, structure, facility, or installation whose emissions are being controlled. *See also Nat’l-Southwire Aluminum Co. v. EPA*, 838 F.2d 835, 837 n.3 (6th Cir. 1988)

(section 111 performance standards “specif[y] the maximum rate at which an *individual source* may emit pollution”) (emphasis added). Requiring an owner or operator of a fossil fuel-fired source to construct, or to subsidize generation at, other facilities, as the Rule does, is not a standard “for” that source at all.

The Rule violates section 111 in another fundamental respect: it mandates that regulated sources *cease producing* electricity, rather than addressing *how* they produce electricity with fewer emissions. “Performance” is “[t]he accomplishment, execution, carrying out, ... [or] doing of any action or work.” 11 OXFORD ENGLISH DICTIONARY 544 (J.A. Simpson & E.S.C. Weiner eds., 2d ed. 1989). A “standard of performance” is thus a principle to judge the execution of work by the source, not an order to stop working. Furthermore, a “standard of performance” must reflect reductions from an “emission limitation,” which in turn must “limit[] the quantity, rate, or concentration of emissions of air pollutants *on a continuous* basis.” CAA § 302(k) (emphasis added); *see also id.* § 111(a)(1). As Congress made clear, the terms “standard of performance” and “emission limitation” are defined to *preclude* performance rates based on “intermittent controls,” such as cutting or shifting production to other facilities. *Id.* §§ 111(a)(1), 302(k); H.R. Rep. No. 95-294, at 92 (1977), *reprinted in* 1977 U.S.C.C.A.N. 1077, 1170, JA \_\_\_; *see id.* at 81, 86-87, *reprinted in* 1977 U.S.C.C.A.N. 1159-60, 1164-65, JA \_\_\_-\_\_\_, \_\_\_-\_\_\_. Yet EPA’s Rule requires exactly that. Most emission reductions that occur result from shifting production to new renewable facilities that do not emit a



regulated pollutant and are not regulated under section 111(d). EPA's Rule is the antithesis of a "standard of performance" for a source.

But as explained immediately below, there is an even simpler reason why the Rule should be vacated. EPA must show that Congress *clearly authorized* the agency to restructure power markets under section 111(d), and nowhere has EPA even attempted to shoulder that burden. *See infra* Section I.A. The Rule's attempt to reorder the power grid is precisely the sort of significant and transformative assertion of authority that, under the Supreme Court's decisions, requires "clear congressional authorization." *UARG*, 134 S. Ct. at 2444. A clear statement of congressional intent is also necessary under cases like *Bond* and *Gregory v. Ashcroft*, 501 U.S. 452 (1991), because the Rule intrudes on the States' authority over the intrastate generation of energy. Section 111 cannot be read to "clearly" confer such authority on EPA. In fact, EPA has never attempted to argue as much and effectively conceded the point in stay briefing before the Supreme Court. Mem. for the Fed. Resp'ts in Opp'n at 41, *West Virginia v. EPA*, No. 15A773 (and related cases) (U.S. Feb. 4, 2016) ("EPA Opp'n in 15A773") (section 111 "does not expressly address such measures"), JA \_\_\_\_.

**A. Congress Did Not Authorize EPA To Restructure the Power Sector.**

Under controlling Supreme Court precedent, the Rule's attempt to radically transform the electric sector and assert EPA authority over traditional State functions

requires a clear statement from Congress. Because there is no such clear statement, the Rule must fail.

**1. The Rule Asserts Novel and Vast Authority Over the States' Energy Grids Without Clear Congressional Authorization.**

The Supreme Court's recent cases have made clear that an agency cannot exercise transformative power over matters of economic and political significance unless it has clear congressional authorization. Two years ago, in *UARG*, EPA attempted to expand two CAA programs to cover stationary sources based solely on their greenhouse gas emissions. 134 S. Ct. at 2437-38. The Supreme Court rejected that effort, explaining that when an agency seeks to make "decisions of vast 'economic and political significance'" or "bring about an enormous and transformative expansion" in its authority under a "long-extant statute," it must point to a "clear[]" statement from Congress. *Id.* at 2444 (quoting *FDA v. Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp.*, 529 U.S. 120, 160 (2000)). Last term, the Court built on *UARG*, holding in *King v. Burwell* that courts are not to presume that Congress would implicitly delegate to agencies "question[s] of deep 'economic and political significance'" because, if "Congress wished to assign [such] question[s] to an agency, it surely would have done so expressly." *King*, 135 S. Ct. at 2489 (citation omitted).

There is no question that the Rule, which garnered 4.3 million comments,<sup>20</sup> is of great economic and political significance. As explained above, the Administration has admitted that the Rule is an attempt to “aggressive[ly] transform[]... the domestic energy industry.” *See supra* n.2. EPA claims authority to mandate that States reorder their mixes of electricity generation, to force the closure of coal-fired plants that generate some of America’s most affordable and reliable electricity, to govern how much electricity each source may produce, to require the owners of regulated sources to subsidize and invest in their non-regulated competitors, and to develop a carbon dioxide emissions trading system of the sort Congress has rejected. Under EPA’s logic, the agency could eventually require emission reductions premised on a complete shift of electric generation away from fossil fuel-fired power plants to other resources preferred by EPA. In short, EPA claims the authority to become a central planning authority for the power sector, with unilateral authority to end the use in this country of certain kinds of energy generation. *See Brown & Williamson*, 529 U.S. at 160 (stating that clear statement rule applies to “whether an industry will be entirely, or even substantially,” subjected to a new regulatory regime) (internal quotation marks omitted).

Nor would EPA be confined to the power sector. If the Rule is upheld, EPA could use section 111(d) to force the States to undertake a restructuring of almost any

---

<sup>20</sup> Gina McCarthy, *In 2016, We’re Hitting the Ground Running*, THE EPA BLOG (Jan. 4, 2016), <https://blog.epa.gov/blog/tag/clean-power-plan/>.

industry by claiming that shifting production to other plants (including plants not yet built) will reduce emissions. While EPA claims the power sector is uniquely suitable for such measures due to the interconnected electric grid, 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,677, JA \_\_\_\_, many industries likewise involve both sales of interchangeable products or services and the potential to achieve lower emissions if production were shifted to “cleaner” plants. For instance, EPA could require States to reduce pollutant emissions from municipal landfills (the last source category regulated under section 111(d)) by switching to recycling plants.

EPA’s assertion of authority is also an “enormous and transformative expansion” of the agency’s power. *UARG*, 134 S. Ct. at 2444. Section 111 was enacted more than 45 years ago and assumed its current form in 1990. The focus of that provision has always been regulation of new sources. Until the Rule, EPA used section 111(d) to require state regulation of just “four pollutants from five source categories,” 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,703, JA \_\_\_\_, with only one of these rulemakings in the last three decades, *see* 61 Fed. Reg. 9905 (Mar. 12, 1996); *see also supra* p. 8. Not once in the history of section 111 has EPA asserted the authority to mandate emission reductions premised on the notion that EPA may force a source to subsidize “cleaner” alternatives that would increase production at the source’s expense. Rather, EPA has consistently promulgated emission limitations achievable only by improved performance of *the individual facilities* in a regulated source category. But under the Rule, section 111(d) now overshadows every other provision of the CAA, for no

other environmental regulation has purported to give EPA such enormous power over the American economy.

The clear-statement requirement is fatal to the Rule. EPA has made no attempt to show clear congressional authorization for the market restructuring required by the Rule, relying instead exclusively on a *Chevron* deference argument to defend its interpretation of section 111. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,719 n.301, 64,783-85, JA \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_. The Court can vacate the Rule on this basis alone.

In any event, there is no plausible claim that Congress in section 111(d) authorized EPA—clearly or otherwise—to set emission performance rates on the basis that the owners of fossil fuel-fired sources could subsidize lower-emitting generation that would displace their own generation. If it did, Congress would have had no reason to debate heatedly and then reject legislation enacting a CO<sub>2</sub> “cap-and-trade” program similar to the program the Rule authorizes and encourages. *See supra* pp. 10-11 & n.5; *see also Brown & Williamson*, 529 U.S. at 144. Indeed, EPA has acknowledged in recent filings before the Supreme Court that section 111(d) “does not expressly address” its concept of “generation shifting.” EPA Opp’n in 15A773, at 41, JA \_\_\_\_.

The clear statement rule applies with particular force here, where EPA has “no expertise” in the subject matter. *King*, 135 S. Ct. at 2489. As EPA has acknowledged, “[t]he issues related [to] management of energy markets and competition between various forms of electric generation are far afield from EPA’s responsibilities for

setting standards under the CAA.”<sup>21</sup> This Court has agreed: “[G]rid reliability is not a subject of the Clean Air Act and is not the province of EPA.” *Del. Dep’t of Nat. Res. & Env’tl. Control v. EPA*, 785 F.3d 1, 18 (D.C. Cir. 2015). For this reason, it is “especially unlikely” that Congress implicitly delegated to EPA the myriad technical and policy judgments needed to reconfigure the entire grid to lower overall emissions while maintaining reliable and low-cost operation. Absent a clear statement, Congress should not be presumed to have entrusted to EPA any more than the authority over pollution control equipment and processes as to which EPA is presumed to have expertise.

## **2. EPA Seeks To Invade a Traditional State Regulatory Domain Without a Clear Statement From Congress.**

Clear congressional authorization is further required here because the Rule raises serious federalism concerns. It is a “well-established principle that it is incumbent upon the federal courts to be certain of Congress’ intent before finding that federal law overrides the usual constitutional balance of federal and state powers.” *Bond*, 134 S. Ct. at 2089 (internal quotation marks omitted). “This principle applies when Congress ‘intends to pre-empt the historic powers of the States’ or when it legislates in ‘traditionally sensitive areas’ that ‘affec[t] the federal balance.’” *Raygor v. Regents of Univ. of Minn.*, 534 U.S. 533, 543 (2002); *see also Gregory*, 501 U.S. at 460-61.

---

<sup>21</sup> Response to Comments on Amendments to Standards for Stationary Internal Combustion Engines, at 50 (Jan. 14, 2013), EPA-HQ-OAR-2008-0708-1491, JA \_\_\_\_.

As this Court has said, “[f]ederal law may not be interpreted to reach” areas traditionally subject to State regulation “unless the language of the federal law compels the intrusion” with “unmistakably clear ... language.” *Am. Bar Ass’n*, 430 F.3d at 471-72 (internal quotation marks omitted). This “plain statement rule is nothing more than an acknowledgment that the States retain substantial sovereign powers under our constitutional scheme, powers with which Congress does not readily interfere.” *Id.* at 472 (citation omitted). Where “[t]he states have regulated [a sector] throughout the history of the country ... it is not reasonable for an agency to decide that Congress has chosen” to entrust regulation of that sector to a federal agency. *Id.*

“[T]he regulation of utilities is one of the most important of the functions traditionally associated with the police power of the States,” *Ark. Elec. Coop. Corp.*, 461 U.S. at 377, which the Supreme Court has specifically recognized should not be “superseded” “unless that was the clear and manifest purpose of Congress.” *PG&E*, 461 U.S. at 206 (internal quotation marks omitted). Particularly relevant here, the “[n]eed for new power facilities, their economic feasibility, and rates and services, are areas that have been characteristically governed by the States”—indeed, the “franchise to operate a public utility ... is a special privilege which ... may be granted or withheld at the pleasure of the State.” *Id.* at 205 (internal quotation marks omitted); *see also Conn. Dep’t of Pub. Util. Control v. FERC*, 569 F.3d 477, 481 (D.C. Cir. 2009). Certain States’ constitutions vest these powers in independent commissions whose

members are elected,<sup>22</sup> while other States have exercised sovereign power to deregulate the electric sector.<sup>23</sup>

Far from granting EPA authority over power generation with “unmistakably clear ... language,” *Am. Bar Ass’n*, 430 F.3d at 471-72, Congress has clearly *confirmed* the States’ plenary authority in this area and granted to a different agency—FERC—the limited federal jurisdiction in this sphere. In the Federal Power Act, 16 U.S.C. §§ 791a, *et seq.*, Congress drew “a bright line easily ascertained, between state and federal jurisdiction,” *Fed. Power Comm’n v. S. Cal. Edison Co.*, 376 U.S. 205, 215 (1964). Under the Federal Power Act, “the States retain their traditional responsibility in the field of regulating electrical utilities for determining questions of need, reliability, cost, and other related state concerns.” *PG&E*, 461 U.S. at 205. Congress cabined the power of FERC “to those matters which are not subject to regulation by the States,” 16 U.S.C. § 824(a), and disclaimed federal authority “over facilities used for the generation of electric energy,” *id.* § 824(b)(1); *see also id.* § 824o(i)(2) (“This section

---

<sup>22</sup> For example, the Louisiana Constitution grants its Public Service Commission “broad and independent power and authority to regulate ... public utilities.” *La. Power & Light Co. v. La. Pub. Serv. Comm’n*, 609 So. 2d 797, 800 (La. 1992). The Arizona Constitution provides its Corporation Commission with “full power’ to regulate, set rates, and make reasonable rules for public service companies.” *Ariz. Corp. Comm’n v. State ex rel. Woods*, 830 P.2d 807, 811 (Ariz. 1992). Commissioners in both States are elected. LA. CONST. art. IV, § 21(A)(1); ARIZ. CONST. art. XV, § 1. *See also* GA. CONST. art. IV, § 1 (providing for elected Public Service Commission in Georgia).

<sup>23</sup> *See* Opening Br. of Pet’rs on Procedural and Record-Based Issues at Section V.E (Feb. 19, 2016) (noting New Jersey’s deregulation of energy markets).



does not authorize ... [FERC] to order the construction of additional generation or transmission capacity ....”). Even FERC lacks power to interfere with “state authority in such traditional areas as the ... administration of integrated resource planning and ... utility generation and resource portfolios.” *New York v. FERC*, 535 U.S. 1, 24 (2002). Indeed, the United States recently acknowledged to the Supreme Court that “promot[ion of] new generation facilities” is “an area expressly reserved to state authority.” Pet. for Writ of Cert. at 26, *FERC v. Elec. Power Supply Ass’n*, No. 14-840 (U.S. Jan. 15, 2015).

Nevertheless, EPA seeks to usurp these important traditional State police powers. Until now, the States have determined for themselves the extent to which they should (or should not) mandate particular levels of renewable generation, balancing such generation’s benefits against other considerations, including the risks that energy dependent on weather events (such as wind speed, cloudiness, and snow cover) often pose to the grid’s reliability.<sup>24</sup> But as explained *supra*, pp. 12-22, to achieve the Rule’s emission reduction demands, States will be forced to shift vast amounts of generation from fossil fuel-fired plants to new renewable resources. The Rule thus mandates changes to the power generation mix in individual States,

---

<sup>24</sup> U.S. Energy Information Administration, Today In Energy, Most states have Renewable Portfolio Standards (Feb. 3, 2012), <https://www.eia.gov/todayinenergy/detail.cfm?id=4850> (while Congress has rejected federal renewable portfolio standards, “30 States and the District of Columbia had enforceable [renewable portfolio standards] or other mandated renewable capacity policies,” and seven had adopted voluntary renewable energy goals).

supplanting the States' traditional authority in this area. Indeed, the very reason EPA issued the Rule is that to date States have not sought to “decarboniz[e]” their economies to the extent favored by EPA. The Rule thus amounts to a takeover of power generation decisions in the States, despite longstanding exclusive State jurisdiction—reaffirmed by Congress—over this field.

Moreover, to meet EPA's emission reduction demands, States will be forced to undertake many legislative and regulatory actions they would not have otherwise chosen. States will have to enact legislation and regulations restructuring their power systems, decommissioning coal-fired plants, and granting regulatory and siting approval to new renewable energy projects. Okla.'s Mot. for Stay at 18-19, No. 15-1364 (Oct. 28, 2015), ECF 1580577; State Pet'rs' Mot. for Stay at 15-18, No. 15-1363 (Oct. 23, 2015), ECF 1579999 (“State Pet'rs' Mot. for Stay”). In many States, regulatory proceedings will be needed to determine how the costs of prematurely-retired plants must be recovered from ratepayers. State Pet'rs' Mot. for Stay at 20; States' Joint Reply at 14-15, No. 15-1363 (and consolidated cases), ECF 1590286 (Dec. 23, 2015). States may have to incentivize development of renewable resources previously found cost-prohibitive, State Pet'rs' Mot. for Stay at 15-16, while ensuring that the Rule's change in power generation does not adversely impact the grid's reliability, *id.* at 16. Even if the Rule's demand that States take these actions were constitutional (which, as explained below, it is not), EPA may not make these

“decision[s] of the most fundamental sort” for the States without clear authorization from Congress. *Gregory*, 501 U.S. at 460.

**B. Section 111 Unambiguously Forecloses EPA’s Requirements Based on “Generation Shifting.”**

The text and structure of section 111 unambiguously bar the “generation shifting” the Rule imposes.

**1. Section 111 Does Not Authorize EPA To Mandate Emission Reductions That Cannot Be Implemented at Individual Regulated “Stationary Sources.”**

The unambiguous requirement that standards of performance must be set “*for*” and be “*applicable ... to*” individual *sources* within a regulated source category forecloses EPA’s claim to authority to reorder grid operations. CAA §§ 111(d)(1), 111(a)(2) (emphases added). What EPA calls “generation shifting” does not entail setting standards that are “for” or “applicable” to regulated sources. Rather, it involves something else entirely—replacing or reducing the operation of the source category with that of entirely different kinds of facilities, selected by EPA based on CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. *See supra* pp. 12-19. That is plainly beyond what the statutory text permits.

Confronted with this plain text, EPA claimed it faced a “dilemma.” 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,769, JA \_\_\_\_\_. EPA conceded that the phrase “best system of emission reduction” may only include “measures that can be implemented—‘*appl[ie]d*’—*by the sources themselves.*” *Id.* at 64,720 (emphasis added), JA \_\_\_\_\_. And while EPA sought large reductions in CO<sub>2</sub>, it also recognized that emission control measures that can be

applied at coal- and natural gas-fired units either are not commercially or technologically feasible (in the case of carbon capture and sequestration systems) or will not achieve the desired emission reductions (in the case of efficiency improvements). *See supra* pp. 12-13; 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,751, 64,787-90, JA \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_.

To resolve this purported “dilemma,” EPA redefined “source” to “*include[] the ‘owner or operator’ of any building ... for which a standard of performance is applicable.*” *Id.* at 64,762 (emphasis added), JA \_\_\_\_\_. On this basis, EPA set stringent standards that cannot be met by *any* individual coal or gas-fired generating unit, even if it installs the type of state-of-the-art equipment EPA has required for brand new units. *See supra* pp. 14-16. Instead, to comply with the standard, the owner or operator must invest in lower- or zero-emitting generation, either directly or by purchasing emission allowances or credits, 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,720, 64,725-26, 64,728, 64,731, JA \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_; *see also supra* pp. 18-20, and shift generation to this new lower- or zero-emitting generation, 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,911, JA \_\_\_\_; *see also id.* at 64,745-47 (“generation shifts”), JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_.

This reading of section 111(d) to permit standards based on “generation shifting” is unambiguously foreclosed by the language of the statute, established case law, and nearly a half century of consistent administrative practice.

a. **Section 111(d) provides that standards apply to the “source,” not to owners and operators.**

Section 111 could not be clearer: performance standards apply to sources, not owners and operators of sources that might take actions beyond the source itself. Under section 111(d), a State-established performance standard may be set for an existing source that would be regulated under section 111(b) “if such existing *source* were a new *source*.” CAA § 111(d)(1) (emphases added). State plans must “apply[] a standard of performance to any *particular source*.” *Id.* (emphasis added). And EPA’s role is to establish a “procedure” for States to submit plans “establish[ing] standards of performance *for any existing source*.” *Id.* (emphasis added).

The statute also expressly contemplates adjustments to a standard of performance as it applies to individual sources in varying conditions. States must be permitted to take into consideration “the remaining useful life of the existing *source*” when “applying a standard of performance” to “any particular *source*.” *Id.* (emphases added). If EPA promulgates a federal plan in lieu of an unsatisfactory state plan, EPA “shall take into consideration ... [the] remaining useful lives of the *sources* in the category of *sources* to which [the] standard applies.” *Id.* § 111(d)(2) (emphases added).

Finally, EPA cannot regulate existing sources under section 111(d) unless the agency first regulates under section 111(b), and Congress likewise made individual “sources” the focus of new source regulation under that section. To commence section 111(b) regulation, Congress requires EPA first to list categories of “stationary

*sources*” to be regulated. *Id.* § 111(b)(1)(A) (emphasis added). EPA then sets federal standards for new “*sources* within such [listed] category.” *Id.* § 111(b)(1)(B) (emphasis added); *see also id.* § 111(a)(2) (defining the term “new source” and discussing standards of performance “which will be applicable to such source”).

For all of these section 111 provisions, “source” is defined as an individual physical “building, structure, facility, or installation.” *Id.* § 111(a)(3). It is not defined to include the “owner or operator” of the “building, structure, facility, or installation.”

Indeed, section 111 makes this distinction explicit. Congress differentiated the term “owner or operator” from the term “source” by giving the former a distinct definition: “any person who owns, leases, operates, controls, or supervises a stationary source.” *Id.* § 111(a)(5). If Congress had intended to include a facility’s owner or operator *within* the term “source,” it would not have separately defined those terms. Section 111 further states that it is unlawful “for any owner or operator of any new source to operate such source in violation of any standard of performance applicable to such source.” *Id.* § 111(e).

In sum, Congress adopted distinct definitions of “source” and “owner or operator” as well as a specific provision to hold an “owner or operator” of a new source liable precisely because, contrary to the Rule’s central assumption, the owner or operator of a source is legally distinct from the “source” itself. *See Transbrasil S.A. Linhas Aereas v. Dep’t of Transp.*, 791 F.2d 202, 205 (D.C. Cir. 1986) (“[W]here different terms are used in a single piece of legislation, the court must presume that Congress

intended the terms to have different meanings.”) (internal quotation marks and citation omitted).

Given the lack of textual support for its position, EPA falls back on what it calls the “commonsense” proposition that, because sources are inanimate objects, it is the owner or operator of the source that must take action to comply with any standards, so the Rule is not unusual by requiring action from owners or operators. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,767, JA \_\_\_\_\_. But EPA overlooks that a standard of performance must be “for” a particular “source.” CAA § 111(d)(1). It is one thing to recognize that the owner or operator must take steps at its source—e.g., installing new equipment or ordering more efficient operations—to implement a standard of performance that was set “for” the source. It is quite another to say that EPA may require a standard that forces owners or operators to construct, or subsidize generation at, other facilities. A rule that requires construction of or generation at a second facility is not a standard “for” the first source at all, even if the first source’s owner or operator can somehow bring about the generation at the second facility. Indeed, section 111(e) makes clear that the “owner or operator of any ... source” may only be held liable for “violation of any standard of performance applicable to *such source*” (emphasis added), not for violating standards that apply to any other facilities (including non-sources) the owner or operator may control or invest in.

**b. This Court's precedents foreclose EPA's reading of section 111(d).**

This Court's decision in *ASARCO* also squarely forecloses EPA's reading of section 111(d). As interpreted by EPA, the Rule's performance rates force the owner or operator of a source to invest in lower-emitting generation—whether by building a plant, investing in someone else's plant, or buying credits from another plant. This is because the only way a source can comply with the performance rate is to average its actual emissions rate with the rate of the lower-emitting plant. 40 C.F.R.

§ 60.5790(c)(1) (providing formula “to calculate an adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate to demonstrate compliance”). Thus, the Rule's “generation shifting” mandate demands that two or more facilities *together* achieve the required rate—effectively treating distant and unrelated facilities, some of which may not even be regulated sources at all, as a single “stationary source” for purposes of setting EPA's emission performance rates.

*ASARCO*, however, holds that EPA may not “embellish[]” the statutory definition of “stationary source” by “rewrit[ing] the definition of a stationary source.” 578 F.2d at 324, 326 n.24. According to the Court, the statute “limit[s] the definition of ‘stationary source’ to one ‘facility’” and not a “‘combination of facilities.’” *Id.* at 324. As a result, EPA cannot “change the basic unit to which the [standards] apply from a *single* building, structure, facility, or installation—the unit prescribed in the statute—to a *combination* of such units.” *Id.* at 327 (emphasis in original). Certainly, EPA cannot treat as a single source separate generating units that may be hundreds of



miles apart, may be owned by different parties, and may not even be section 111 sources at all.

Indeed, EPA concedes that the Rule goes beyond setting reduction requirements on a source-by-source basis; the agency states that it is setting reduction requirements at the level of the entire *source category*. According to EPA, the Rule “focus[es] on the ... overall source category,” 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,725-26, JA \_\_\_-\_\_\_; its best system of emission reduction is “for the source category as a whole,” *id.* at 64,727, JA \_\_\_; *see also id.* at 64,723, JA \_\_\_; and its “emission limits [are] for the source category as a whole,” *id.* at 64,732, JA \_\_\_. The Rule is thus indifferent to how much—and even whether—any particular source reduces its emissions; in EPA’s words, “it is the total amount of emissions from the source category that matters, not the specific emissions from any one” source. *Id.* at 64,734, JA \_\_\_.

EPA, however, lacks authority to address “standards of performance” at the level of an entire source category. Section 111 plainly provides for EPA to “list” source categories and then, where section 111(d) applies, to call on States to set “standards of performance *for any existing source*” within that category. Had Congress wished to base section 111(d) reduction requirements on systems of emission reduction for an entire source category, rather than “for” any sources within the listed category, it would have said so. *See, e.g., Meghrig v. KFC Western, Inc.*, 516 U.S. 479, 485 (1996). In fact, the Rule strays even further afield from what Congress specified in section 111: by basing its emission performance rates on shifting generation from

existing fossil-fuel fired sources to renewable facilities, EPA goes well-beyond even the “source category,” which does not include the renewable generation EPA prefers.

**c. The Rule’s reading of section 111(d) is contrary to EPA’s regulations and consistent agency practice.**

The Rule departs from 45 years of consistent agency practice, further confirming that EPA’s current interpretation of its section 111(d) authority does not follow that provision’s “plain meaning.” 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,761, JA \_\_\_\_\_. Each of the approximately one hundred new source performance standards that EPA has set in more than 60 source categories has been based on a system of emission reduction that can be achieved with technological or operational measures that the regulated source itself can implement. *See generally* 40 C.F.R. pt. 60, subpts. Cb-OOOO. In promulgating standards of performance for refineries, EPA reiterated its long-standing view that “[t]he standard that the EPA develops [is] based on the [best system of emission reduction] *achievable at that source*.” 79 Fed. Reg. 36,880, 36,885 (June 30, 2014) (emphasis added).

EPA took the same settled approach in promulgating its CO<sub>2</sub> standards of performance for *new* coal and gas plants under section 111(b). EPA based the standards on its examination of the level of emissions performance these plants could achieve by using control technologies and operating practices at the plants themselves, not on the level that could be achieved on some combined basis if their owners also

built or paid for new lower- or zero-emitting resources. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,512-13, Tbl. 1.

The same focus on setting standards for the source, rather than the source's owner or operator, is central to EPA's 40-year-old Subpart B regulations establishing the section 111(d) "procedure." 40 C.F.R. pt. 60, subpt. B (promulgated by 40 Fed. Reg. 53,340 (Nov. 17, 1975), JA \_\_\_\_). In those regulations, EPA determined that section 111(d) "emissions guideline[s]" must "reflect[] ... the application of the best system of emission reduction ... [that] has been adequately demonstrated *for designated facilities*," 40 C.F.R. § 60.21(e) (emphasis added), defined as the facility within the regulated source category for which the standard is developed, *id.* § 60.21(b).<sup>25</sup> And, thus, every other section 111(d) guideline EPA has promulgated has defined the "designated facility"<sup>26</sup> and is based on emission reduction systems that the "designated facility" can implement.<sup>27</sup> As EPA stated in one of its earliest guidelines,

---

<sup>25</sup> See also 40 C.F.R. § 60.22(b)(3) (guideline document to include "[i]nformation on the ... costs and environmental effects of *applying each system to designated facilities*") (emphasis added); *id.* § 60.24(b)(3) ("[e]missions standards *shall apply to all designated facilities* within the State") (emphasis added).

<sup>26</sup> See, e.g., 40 C.F.R. § 60.32c(a) (setting forth "each [municipal solid waste] landfill" constructed before May 30, 1991, as the "designated facility to which the guidelines apply"); 44 Fed. Reg. 29,828, 29,829 (May 22, 1979) ("[T]he guideline document for kraft pulp mills is written in terms of standards of performance for each designated facility.").

<sup>27</sup> 61 Fed. Reg. at 9914 (landfill guideline based on "[p]roperly operated gas collection and control systems achieving 98 percent emission reduction"); 45 Fed. Reg. 26,294, 26,294 (Apr. 17, 1980) (aluminum plant guideline based on "effective collection of emissions, followed by efficient fluoride removal by dry scrubbers or by

“[t]he emission guidelines will reflect the degrees of emission reduction attainable with the best adequately demonstrated systems of emission reduction, considering costs[,] *as applied to existing facilities.*”<sup>28</sup>

**2. Setting Rates Based on “Generation Shifting” Is Inconsistent With the Definition of “Standard of Performance.”**

The Rule’s attempt to rearrange the grid also transgresses EPA’s authority under section 111(d) by contravening the term “standard of performance,” which calls for standards based on controls or operating practices that provide emission reductions from regulated sources “on a continuous basis”—and which reflect the inherent capabilities of those controls or operating practices—not “intermittent controls” such as temporarily reducing operations or shifting production to other facilities. Thus, even if a standard of performance were not unambiguously required to be applicable to an individual source, the Rule still would be unlawful.

---

wet scrubbers”); 44 Fed. Reg. at 29,829 (pulp mill guideline based on digester systems, multiple-effect evaporator systems, and straight kraft recovery furnace systems); 41 Fed. Reg. 48,706, 48,706 (Nov. 4, 1976) (proposed guideline for sulfuric acid production units based on “fiber mist eliminators”); 41 Fed. Reg. 19,585, 19,585 (May 12, 1976) (draft guideline for fertilizer plants based on “spray cross-flow packed scrubbers”).

<sup>28</sup> EPA, Primary Aluminum: Guidelines for Control of Fluoride Emissions From Existing Primary Aluminum Plants, at 1-2 (Dec. 1979), <http://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyPDF.cgi?Dockey=2000M9HS.pdf> (“Primary Aluminum Guidelines”) (emphasis added).

**a. The Rule does not comport with the statutory terms.**

As a threshold matter, the Rule gives no meaning to Congress's use of the word "performance" in the phrase "standard of performance." As noted previously, "performance" means "[t]he accomplishment, execution, carrying out, ... [or] working out of anything ordered or undertaken; the doing of any action or work." *See supra* p. 30. "Generation shifting" as used by EPA does not involve a source improving the emission rate at which it performs work, but instead consists of plants *reducing* or *ceasing* work, or *non-performance*. As the Supreme Court held in *Solid Waste Agency of Northern Cook County v. U.S. Army Corps of Engineers*, 531 U.S. 159 (2001), courts must give statutory terms meaning, even where they are part of a larger statutorily defined phrase, *id.* at 172 (requiring that the word "navigable" in the Clean Water Act's statutorily defined term "navigable waters" be given "effect").

More specifically, a section 111 "standard of performance" is defined as a "standard for emissions," which reflects the "degree of emission limitation" that a source may "achiev[e]" using the "best system of emission reduction." CAA § 111(a)(1). The Rule, however, does not reflect a "degree of emission limitation" achievable by any source. *See supra* pp. 14-16. In fact, increasing generation at existing gas plants (e.g., under Building Block 2) and reducing generation at existing coal plants (e.g., under Building Blocks 2 and 3) both typically *increase* those plants' CO<sub>2</sub> emission rates, as EPA has acknowledged. 79 Fed. Reg. at 34,980; Mitigation TSD at 2-34, JA \_\_\_\_.

Furthermore, the phrase “emission limitation” is defined as a “requirement ... which limits the quantity, rate, or concentration of emissions of air pollutants *on a continuous basis*.” CAA § 302(k) (emphasis added). Congress’s intent is clear: the term “continuous” was added to this definition in 1977 to signify that technological or low-polluting processes to achieve pollutant reductions during production are “to be the basis of the standard.” H.R. Rep. No. 95-294, at 11 (1977), *reprinted in* 1977 U.S.C.C.A.N. 1077, 1088, JA \_\_\_. As Congress explained, it used this term to *preclude* “intermittent controls” such as temporarily reducing operations or “shifting” production to other sources. *Id.* at 92, *reprinted in* 1977 U.S.C.C.A.N. 1170, JA \_\_\_; *see id.* at 81, 86-87, *reprinted in* 1977 U.S.C.C.A.N. 1159-60, 1164-65, JA \_\_\_-\_\_\_, \_\_\_-\_\_\_.<sup>29</sup> In this way, Congress required that performance standards reflect new control technology or operational innovations, rather than “load switching from one powerplant ... to another.” *Id.* at 81, 89, 92, *reprinted in* 1977 U.S.C.C.A.N. 1159, 1167, 1170, JA \_\_\_, \_\_\_, \_\_\_. Thus, a “standard of performance” must be derived from *better* emission performance from an individual regulated source, not *non*-performance.

---

<sup>29</sup> The word “technological” was inserted in the definition of “standard of performance” in 1977 to require certain sources to comply by installing technological controls (e.g., scrubbers) rather than burning low-sulfur fuel without controls. *See, e.g., Wis. Elec. Power Co. v. Reilly*, 893 F.2d 901, 918-19 (7th Cir. 1990). Congress removed “technological” from section 111(a)(1)’s definition in 1990 to allow sources to comply by using either technological *or* low-polluting operational processes (e.g., low-sulfur fuel). 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,702, JA \_\_\_.

The Rule's generation-shifting mandate is the antithesis of the definition of "standard of performance" and mandates the very "load switching" that Congress sought to prevent in the development of standards. The Rule's emission rates are based on regulated units collectively reducing operations and producing collective emission reductions; they do not flow from an assessment that "any particular source ... [can] reduce its emissions ...." 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,779, JA \_\_\_\_\_. The very standards that the Rule defines contemplate that emission reductions vary for each unit in timing, amount, and duration. Units able to purchase enough emission credits to meet the rate can continue operating (and emitting) at past or even higher levels. Other units will have to reduce or cease operations altogether. *See supra* pp. 18-22. As a result, the Rule is not based on "a requirement ... which limits ... emissions [from any individual regulated unit] ... on a continuous basis," as Congress used that term. CAA § 302(k).

As this Court explained in *ASARCO*, the purpose of the section 111 performance standard program is to "enhance air quality by forcing all ... [regulated] buildings, structures, facilities, or installations *to employ pollution control systems* that will limit emissions to the level 'achievable'" by the "'best technological system of continuous emission reduction'" that is "'adequately demonstrated.'" 578 F.2d at 327 (quoting the 1977 CAA) (emphasis added). In defining "standard of performance," Congress never contemplated that such standards could be based on reductions that are impossible to achieve without shifting generation from one type of plant to

another, including to non-emitting facilities, when one source operates while another cuts production. *Id.* at 328. The plain language of the statute and *ASARCO* preclude an approach in which standards of performance are based on achieving emission reductions from groups of multiple sources rather than from application of demonstrated controls on individual regulated sources to achieve continuous emission reductions.

**b. EPA’s Rule confuses “standards of performance” with other programs.**

Section 111(d) reflects a broader programmatic distinction Congress drew between control programs focused on a source’s performance and air quality programs focused on the health and welfare impact of a source category’s aggregate emissions. For control programs, including section 111(d), Congress required sources to incorporate available, low-emitting production processes or control technologies into their design and operations. *See, e.g.*, CAA § 111 (new source performance standards); *id.* § 112(d) (maximum achievable control technology standards); *id.* § 165(a)(4) (best achievable control technology standards); Clean Water Act § 306, 33 U.S.C. § 1316 (standards of performance for source pollutant discharge). These programs do not limit a source’s ability to operate but do require that the source limit emissions during operations.

In air quality-based programs, Congress gave EPA authority to pursue a particular air quality objective by capping overall levels of emissions and by using



mechanisms such as trading that result in aggregate reductions from a category of sources. *See, e.g.*, CAA §§ 108-110 (national ambient air quality standards); *id.* §§ 401 *et seq.* (acid rain cap-and-trade program); *see also Nat'l-Southwire Aluminum Co.*, 838 F.2d at 837 n.3 (“An ambient air quality standard differs from an emission or performance standard .... An ambient air quality standard specifies a maximum pollutant concentration in the ambient air, while a performance standard specifies the maximum rate at which an individual source may emit pollution.”). Under section 110, for example, state plans implementing ambient air quality standards may include, in addition to “emission limitations” for individual sources, “other control measures,” “means,” or “techniques,” like “marketable permits” to assure attainment and maintenance of ambient air quality standards. CAA § 110(a)(2)(A).

As explained above, the Rule expressly relies upon trading to establish its emission performance rates. *See supra* pp. 17-20. As justification, the Rule points to several trading programs that were adopted as a “control measure[], means or technique[]” under section 110 to meet an air quality goal. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,696-97, 64,734 n.381, 64,735, JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_\_. EPA’s analogy overlooks Congress’s decades-long distinction between those programs and programs limiting emissions from individual sources. Section 110 itself highlights that distinction: It provides for “emission limitations” (like section 111), but also (unlike section 111) “other control measures” including “marketable permits[] and auctions of emissions rights.” CAA §§ 110(a)(2)(A), 111(a)(1). The Rule elides the distinction between “emission

limitations” and “other control measures” by adopting an emission limitation in which “marketable permits” and “auctions of emissions rights,” *id.* § 110(a)(2)(A), are “integral,” 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,734, JA \_\_\_\_.

EPA’s reliance on the statutory Title IV cap-and-trade program is similarly misplaced. *Id.* at 64,770, JA \_\_\_\_ . In Title IV, Congress created a detailed statutory cap-and-trade program after more than a decade of debate. The statute specifically spells out how emission allowances are to be allocated, CAA §§ 403(a), 404-406, restricts how they may be traded, *id.* § 403(b), and sets parameters for the allowance tracking system, *id.* § 403(d), among other features. Title IV underscores that Congress knew how to design a grid-wide cap-and-trade program, and it did not do so when it called for EPA to provide for “standards of performance” under section 111. *See Meghrig*, 516 U.S. at 485.

While EPA may wish that Congress took the same approach in section 111 as it did in authorizing “other measures, means, or techniques” in section 110, or in spelling out a cap-and-trade program under Title IV, EPA’s “preference for symmetry cannot trump an asymmetrical statute.” *Michigan v. EPA*, 135 S. Ct. 2699, 2710 (2015) (internal quotation marks omitted).

### **3. EPA’s Attempt To Use Section 111(d) To Reengineer the Grid Is Inconsistent With Section 111 as a Whole.**

The Rule also contravenes the requirement that “reasonable statutory interpretation must account for both the specific context in which ... language is used

and the broader context of the statute as a whole.” *UARG*, 134 S. Ct. at 2442 (internal quotation marks omitted). EPA undermines this basic principle by mandating performance rates for existing sources that are far more stringent than the standards EPA contemporaneously set for existing sources that are “modified” or “reconstructed.” *See supra* pp. 11-12, 15-16. Indeed, the Rule’s performance rates cannot be met even if every coal- and natural gas-fired unit were closed and replaced with brand new units using what EPA has determined to be state-of-the-art technology. *Id.*

Congress could not have intended this bizarre outcome, which stems from a fundamental flaw in statutory construction: EPA’s adoption of a definition of “standard of performance” for section 111(d) that is fundamentally inconsistent with EPA’s understanding of the same statutory term in section 111(b). For both sections, the term “standard of performance” is defined by a *single* sub-section—section 111(a)(1). As noted above, in EPA’s parallel rulemaking to establish standards of performance for *new* units under section 111(b), EPA determined that it could not read the term “best system of emission reduction” in section 111(a)(1) to set standards of performance based on shifts in generation from new plants to other sources with lower emissions but would consider only reductions that those plants could themselves achieve. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,627. In the Rule, however, EPA gives a radically different reading to “best system of emission reduction” on the grounds that considering only those efficiency reductions that existing sources can achieve would

not produce “enough” reductions to meet EPA’s objectives. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,729, JA \_\_\_\_\_. As a basic textual matter, EPA cannot reasonably adopt two conflicting interpretations of the very same term. *See Brown v. Gardner*, 513 U.S. 115, 118-20 (1994); *see also Env’t. Def., Inc. v. EPA*, 509 F.3d 553, 560-61 (D.C. Cir. 2007).

That is particularly true here because EPA’s contrived and inconsistent reading of the phrase “best system of emission reduction” stands section 111 on its head: EPA has unlawfully required States to establish performance standards that are more stringent for *existing* coal and gas plants (which must retrofit controls) than the standards EPA itself established for *new* coal and gas plants (which can incorporate controls into their design). It makes no sense that the “best system of emission reduction,” after consideration of cost and other relevant factors, would lead to a scheme in which existing plants face more stringent regulation than new plants. “[A]n agency interpretation that is inconsisten[t] with the design and structure of the statute as a whole” must be struck down. *UARG*, 134 S. Ct. at 2442 (alteration in original).

EPA recognized as much when it first published its section 111(d) implementing regulations in 1975, explaining that “the degree of control [for existing sources] ... will ordinarily be less stringent than ... required by standards of performance for new sources” based on the fact that “controls cannot be included in the design of an existing facility and ... physical limitations may make installation of particular control systems [at an existing facility] impossible or unreasonably expensive in some cases.” 40 Fed. Reg. at 53,341, 53,344, JA \_\_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_\_; *see also* Robert

J. Martineau, Jr. & Michael K. Skagg, *New Source Performance Standards*, in *THE CLEAN AIR ACT HANDBOOK* 321 (Julie R. Domike & Alec C. Zacaroli eds., 3d ed. 2011) (Section 111 “reflects the basic notion that it is cheaper and easier to design emissions control equipment into production equipment at the time of initial construction than it is to engage in costly retrofits.”), JA \_\_\_\_\_. Precisely because new plants can be designed to accommodate new controls while existing plants cannot, EPA determined that carbon capture and storage technology is not the best system of emission reduction for existing coal plants, 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,751, JA \_\_\_\_, while at the same time determining that this technology is the best system for new plants, *see* 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,558. Reflecting the structure and purpose of section 111, EPA has never before adopted new source standards that were *less* stringent than the standards its existing source guidelines required States to adopt.<sup>30</sup>

---

<sup>30</sup> *See* 61 Fed. Reg. at 9907 (same standards for new and existing landfills); 45 Fed. Reg. at 26,294 & Primary Aluminum Guidelines at 8-1 (recommended range of control technologies for existing primary aluminum plants and a maximum emissions rate of fluoride for new plants); 44 Fed. Reg. at 29,828 & EPA, Kraft Pulping: Control of TRS Emissions from Existing Mills, at 1-6 (Mar. 1979), <http://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyPURL.cgi?Dockey=2000ZF3I.TXT> (“the application of the best adequately demonstrated technology for new sources could result in excessive control costs at existing sources”); 42 Fed. Reg. 55,796 (Oct. 18, 1977) (emission guideline for existing sulfuric acid production units established in 1977 less stringent than the standard for new sources issued in 1971, 36 Fed. Reg. 24,876, 24,881 (Dec. 23, 1971)); EPA, Final Guideline Document: Control of Fluoride Emissions from Existing Phosphate Fertilizer Plants at 8-1 to 8-12 (Mar. 1977), <http://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyPURL.cgi?Dockey=2000UNFK.TXT>.

Finally, having effectively upended the section 111 regulatory paradigm, EPA then had to deploy *ad hoc* fixes to address the consequences of doing so. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,821, JA \_\_\_\_\_. Under the new source and existing source rules, overall emissions in a State could *increase* if the State encouraged construction of new sources to replace older, existing sources, because new sources—even though new coal units are required to use carbon capture and sequestration technology—are subject to less stringent standards than existing sources. *Id.* EPA thus ordered States to take steps to *prevent* shifting generation from older plants to newer plants with more efficient technologies, *id.* at 64,822-23, JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_, even though that appears to be exactly what Congress intended.

This “fix” again underscores that the Rule has enacted a regulatory program the *opposite* of what Congress conceived. Whereas Congress sought to ensure that emission reductions would be realized as existing sources were retired and replaced with well-controlled new sources, EPA has told States they must impose measures that will prevent this from happening. *Id.*

EPA’s inconsistent interpretation of the term “best system of emission reduction” contradicts EPA’s own understanding of Congress’s intent. When EPA first adopted regulations interpreting and implementing that provision in 1975, it concluded that, because of the interrelationship of sections 111(b) and 111(d), “the general principle (application of best adequately demonstrated control technology, considering costs) will be the same in both cases.” 40 Fed. Reg. at 53,341, JA \_\_\_\_\_. As

EPA explained, Congress’s decision to make the existing source performance standard program part of section 111, and not a stand-alone provision, “reflected a decision in conference that a similar approach [to that applied to new sources] (making allowances for the costs of controlling existing sources) was appropriate for the pollutants to be controlled under section 111(d).” *Id.* at 53,342, JA \_\_\_\_\_. EPA emphasized that both provisions require a “technology-based approach” and that EPA would be able to take advantage of its analysis of the “availability and costs of control technology” for new sources in determining the best “control technology” for existing sources. *Id.* at 53,342, 53,343, JA \_\_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_\_.

EPA had it right in its implementing regulations and in all of its prior section 111(d) rulemakings. Reading sections 111(b) and 111(d) as a part of a single program avoids conflicting interpretations of the very same statutory provision and the arbitrary result of standards that are more stringent for existing sources than for new sources—a result Congress could not have intended.

## **II. The Section 112 Exclusion Unambiguously Prohibits the Rule.**

The Section 112 Exclusion invalidates the Rule irrespective of the Rule’s contents. Under EPA’s own longstanding reading of the text in the U.S. Code, the Exclusion prohibits EPA from employing section 111(d) to regulate a source category that is already regulated under section 112. And because it is undisputed that coal-fired generating units are already regulated under section 112, *see* 77 Fed. Reg. 9304

(Feb. 16, 2012), the Exclusion prohibits EPA's attempt in the Rule to invoke section 111(d) to regulate those same plants.

**A. EPA May Not Employ Section 111(d) To Regulate a Source Category That It Has Chosen To “Regulate[] Under Section [1]12.”**

The Exclusion's prohibition against employing section 111 to regulate “any air pollutant” emitted from a “source category ... regulated under section [1]12” has a straightforward and unambiguous meaning. “Regulated” means “[g]overned by rule, properly controlled or directed, adjusted to some standard, etc.” 13 OXFORD ENGLISH DICTIONARY 524. Thus, if a source category is “governed by [a] rule” under section 112, EPA may not require States to set a standard of performance for sources in that category under section 111(d). Or, as the Supreme Court has said, “EPA may not employ [section 111(d)] if existing stationary sources of the pollutant in question are regulated under ... § [1]12.” *AEP*, 131 S. Ct. at 2537 n.7.

EPA has repeatedly agreed that this prohibition against regulating under section 111(d) any existing “source category ... regulated under section [1]12” means what it says. In five analyses spanning three different Administrations—in 1995, 2004, 2005, 2007, and 2014—the agency consistently concluded that this text means that “a standard of performance under CAA section 111(d) cannot be established for any air



pollutant ... emitted from a source category regulated under section 112,” *repeatedly* describing this as the text’s “literal” meaning.<sup>31</sup>

This “literal” reading of the Exclusion is, as EPA itself has explained, consistent with the statutory and legislative history of the CAA’s 1990 Amendments. Before 1990, section 112 covered an extremely narrow category of life-threatening pollutants. *See* S. Rep. No. 91-1196, at 20 (1970), *reprinted in* 1 CLEAN AIR ACT AMENDMENTS OF 1970 at i, 20 (Comm. Print 1970), JA \_\_\_\_\_. But in 1990, Congress greatly expanded the reach of the section 112 program, significantly broadening the definition of pollutants under section 112 to include those “which present, or may present ... a threat of adverse human health effects ... or adverse environmental effects,” and increasing the stringency of regulation on those source categories subject to the section 112 program. CAA § 112(b)(2); *see supra* pp. 8-9. As EPA has said in the past, the House of Representatives (where the current text of the Exclusion originated) responded to this fundamental expansion in section 112 by “chang[ing] the focus of [the Exclusion and] seeking to preclude regulation of those pollutants that are emitted from a particular source category that is actually regulated under section 112.” 70 Fed. Reg. at 16,031, JA \_\_\_\_\_. That is, the House determined that

---

<sup>31</sup> 69 Fed. Reg. 4652, 4685 (Jan. 30, 2004); *see* EPA, Air Emissions from Municipal Solid Waste Landfills—Background Information for Final Standards and Guidelines at 1-6 (Dec. 1995) (“1995 EPA Analysis”), <http://www3.epa.gov/ttn/atw/landfill/bidfl.pdf>; 70 Fed. Reg. 15,994, 16,031 (Mar. 29, 2005), JA \_\_\_\_; Final Br. of Resp’t EPA, *New Jersey v. EPA*, No. 05-1097, 2007 WL 2155494 (D.C. Cir. July 23, 2007) (“2007 EPA Brief”); EPA Legal Memo at 26, JA \_\_\_\_\_.

existing sources, which have significant capital investments and sunk costs, should not be burdened by both the expanded section 112 program and performance standards under section 111(d). *Id.* at 16,031-32, JA \_\_\_\_,

The House, EPA has also explained, was especially concerned about “duplicative or otherwise inefficient regulation” when it came to existing power plants, the source category at issue here. *Id.* at 15,999, JA \_\_\_\_\_. In the 1990 Amendments, the House drafted a new provision that—similar to the provision now codified at section 112(n)(1)—gave EPA authority to decline entirely to regulate power plants under section 112. *Id.* at 16,031, JA \_\_\_\_\_. The House revised the Exclusion also to work in tandem with this new provision, so that EPA had a choice between regulating existing power plants under the national standards of section 112 or under the state-by-state standards of section 111(d). *See id.* (“[W]e believe that the House sought to change the focus of section 111(d) by seeking to preclude regulation of those pollutants that are emitted from a particular source category that is actually regulated under section 112.”); *id.* (“[T]he House did not want to subject Utility Units to duplicative or overlapping regulation.”).

**B. EPA’s Attempts To Escape the Literal Reading of the Exclusion Are Unavailing.**

In the Rule, EPA offers two arguments to avoid what it has consistently concluded is the “literal” meaning of the Section 112 Exclusion. *First*, the agency claims for the first time in 20 years that the phrase “regulated under section [1]12” is

ambiguous. *Second*, EPA exhumes an argument it advanced during its unsuccessful Clean Air Mercury Rule rulemaking that a second “version” of the Exclusion exists in the 1990 Statutes at Large. Neither argument withstands scrutiny.

### 1. EPA’s New Assertions of Ambiguity Lack Merit.

Despite consistency over 20 years and three Administrations, EPA now claims to find ambiguous the phrase “source category ... regulated under section [1]12.” 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,713, JA \_\_\_\_\_. EPA admits it could be read in the way the agency has always read it. *Id.* at 64,714, JA \_\_\_\_\_. But EPA now claims the phrase could also be read “only [to] exclud[e] the regulation of [hazardous air pollutant] emissions under CAA section 111(d) and only when th[e] source category [at issue] is regulated under CAA section 112.” *Id.*

EPA’s belated attempt to “manufacture[] ambiguity” and rewrite the Exclusion is impermissible. *W. Minn. Mun. Power Agency v. FERC*, 806 F.3d 588, 592 (D.C. Cir. 2015) (internal quotation marks omitted). There is no ambiguity in the phrase “source category ... regulated under section [1]12.” Clearly, if a source category is subject to section 112’s stringent national hazardous air pollutant standards, that source category is “regulated under” section 112. EPA’s interpretation would read new words into the Exclusion’s plain terms, turning the straightforward prohibition against regulating under section 111(d) any source category “regulated under section [1]12” into a prohibition against the regulation of any “source category which is regulated under

section 112 *only where the air pollutant is included on a list published under section 112(b)(1).*”

Those extra words are not in the statute.

EPA’s new reading of the statute runs afoul of precedent of this Court and the Supreme Court. EPA is attempting to “qualif[y] or restrict[]” the phrase “regulated under section [1]12” when “[n]othing in this language” does so. *W. Minn. Mun. Power Agency*, 806 F.3d at 592. Moreover, EPA’s effort resembles its failed attempt in the *UARG* litigation to evade “a literal reading” of the CAA. 75 Fed. Reg. 31,514, 31,516 (June 3, 2010). In that case, the Supreme Court rebuked the agency for seeking to “rewrite clear statutory terms to suit its own sense of how the statute should operate.” *UARG*, 134 S. Ct. at 2446.

EPA attempts to bolster its statutory rewrite with a plea to legislative history, but this argument cuts against the agency’s position. According to EPA, reading the Exclusion as prohibiting section 111(d) regulation of pollutants not listed under section 112(b)(1) that are emitted from a source category regulated under section 112 would create an impermissible “gap” in the CAA. Such a “gap,” EPA asserts, is contrary to the intent of those who wrote the 1970 version of the Act. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,714 (discussing legislative history from the 1970 CAA), JA \_\_\_\_.

As a threshold matter, *UARG* forecloses such non-textual appeals to purpose or legislative history where a statute’s literal terms are clear and unambiguous. The Supreme Court stated unequivocally that an agency’s authority “does not include a

power to revise clear statutory terms that turn out not to work in practice.” 134 S. Ct. at 2446.

Moreover, EPA ignores the fundamental change in the section 112 program Congress enacted in 1990. As explained above, *supra* pp. 8-9, 63-64, the 1990 Congress expanded section 112 from a program that covered only a small universe of extremely dangerous pollutants into an expansive program that covered 189 listed pollutants. And since 1990, EPA has never identified a single pollutant that the agency believes would meet the definition of pollutant under section 111 but not section 112. *See, e.g.*, 73 Fed. Reg. 44,354, 44,493-95 (July 30, 2008) (considering regulation of carbon dioxide under section 112).<sup>32</sup>

In fact, since the 1990 Amendments, EPA has issued only two section 111(d) regulations, and both were consistent with the Exclusion’s plain terms. In the first rule, the Clinton-era EPA expressly acknowledged the Exclusion’s prohibition against regulating a source category under section 111(d) where that source category is already regulated under section 112, but explained that its section 111(d) regulation of municipal solid waste landfills was permissible because the landfills were not “actually being regulated under section 112.” 1995 EPA Analysis at 1-6. The second rule was the Clean Air Mercury Rule, in which EPA sought first to delist power plants entirely

---

<sup>32</sup> Petitioners believe that both section 111 and section 112 are “ill suited to accommodating greenhouse gases”—for both similar and different reasons. *See UARG*, 134 S. Ct. at 2441 n.5.

under section 112 before regulating those plants under section 111(d). 70 Fed. Reg. at 15,994 (delisting); 70 Fed. Reg. 28,606 (May 18, 2005) (imposing standards).<sup>33</sup>

EPA further ignores that with respect to power plants in particular, the 1990 Amendments gave EPA an explicit choice between regulating existing power plants under the national standards of section 112 or under the state-by-state standards of section 111(d). *See supra* p. 64. What EPA claims to be a regulatory gap is a regulatory regime deliberately designed by Congress to avoid double regulation.

## 2. The Failed Clerical Amendment Is Entirely Irrelevant.

EPA's alternative avenue for avoiding the "literal" meaning of the Section 112 Exclusion, as it appears in the U.S. Code, is the argument that a second "version" of the Exclusion exists in the 1990 Statutes at Large and creates ambiguity. This theory derives from the fact that in 1990, Congress passed an erroneous "conforming amendment" that appears in the Statutes at Large but was not included in the U.S. Code.<sup>34</sup>

---

<sup>33</sup> In the Clean Air Mercury Rule, EPA attempted to use section 111(d) to regulate hazardous air pollutants from coal- and oil-fired electric generating units. In *New Jersey v. EPA*, 517 F.3d 574 (D.C. Cir. 2008), this Court held that EPA violated the CAA in the manner it delisted power plants under section 112, and vacated the section 111(d) regulation of those power plants based on the Section 112 Exclusion, *id.* at 582-83.

<sup>34</sup> EPA's claim that the Statutes at Large contains "two versions" of the Section 112 Exclusion can be traced to 2004, when EPA mistook for the Statutes at Large an unofficial compilation of the Clean Air Act littered with errors that was included in the Committee Print of the 1990 Amendments' legislative history. *See* 1 A LEGISLATIVE HISTORY OF THE CLEAN AIR ACT AMENDMENTS OF 1990 at 46 (Comm. Print 1993), JA \_\_\_\_\_. This document renders the relevant section using brackets: "any

EPA's contention is that the non-partisan Office of the Law Revision Counsel of the U.S. House of Representatives, *see* 2 U.S.C. §§ 285a-285g, erred in compiling the U.S. Code. By law, the Code "establish[es] prima facie the laws of the United States." 1 U.S.C. § 204(a). It is controlling unless the Law Revision Counsel has made an error, such that the Code is "inconsistent" with the Statutes at Large. *Stephan v. United States*, 319 U.S. 423, 426 (1943) (per curiam). The Law Revision Counsel did not err.

The issue is the Law Revision Counsel's treatment of a "substantive amendment" and a "conforming amendment" that altered the same text in the Exclusion. As explained in Congress's official legislative drafting guides, there are "substantive amendments" and "conforming amendments," the latter of which make clerical adjustments to "table[s] of contents" and corrections to pre-existing cross-references that are "necessitated by the substantive amendments."<sup>35</sup> *Cf. Koons Buick*

---

air pollutant ... which is not included on a list published under section 108(a) [or emitted from a source category which is regulated under section 112] [or 112(b)]." *Id.*, JA \_\_\_\_\_. In 2004, EPA quoted from this document in the Federal Register, identifying it as the Statutes at Large and, as a result of this error, stated incorrectly that "two amendments are reflected in parentheses in the Statutes at Large." 69 Fed. Reg. at 4685.

<sup>35</sup> *See* Office of the Legislative Counsel, U.S. Senate, Legislative Drafting Manual § 126(b) (Feb. 1997), [https://www.law.yale.edu/system/files/documents/pdf/Faculty/SenateOfficeoftheLegislativeCounsel\\_LegislativeDraftingManual\(1997\).pdf](https://www.law.yale.edu/system/files/documents/pdf/Faculty/SenateOfficeoftheLegislativeCounsel_LegislativeDraftingManual(1997).pdf) ("Senate Manual"), JA \_\_\_\_; *accord* Office of the Legislative Counsel, U.S. House of Representatives, House Legislative Counsel's Manual on Drafting Style § 332(b) (Nov. 1995), [http://legcounsel.house.gov/HOLC/Drafting\\_Legislation/Drafting\\_Guide.html](http://legcounsel.house.gov/HOLC/Drafting_Legislation/Drafting_Guide.html) ("House Manual"), JA \_\_\_\_\_.



*Pontiac GMC, Inc. v. Nigh*, 543 U.S. 50, 60-61 (2004) (relying on drafting manuals);

*United States v. O'Brien*, 560 U.S. 218, 233-34 (2010) (same).

Consistent with these official drafting manuals, the Law Revision Counsel follows a regular practice of first executing substantive amendments, then executing subsequent conforming amendments and excluding as “could not be executed” conforming amendments rendered unnecessary by previously executed substantive amendments.<sup>36</sup> And that is what happened here.

The Law Revision Counsel correctly executed first a substantive amendment that Congress made to the Exclusion in 1990 (the “Substantive Amendment”). Before 1990, the Exclusion prohibited EPA from regulating under section 111(d) any air pollutant “included on a list published under ... [1]08(a) ... or [1]12(b)(1)(A).” 42

---

<sup>36</sup> See, e.g., Revisor’s Note, 11 U.S.C. § 101; Revisor’s Note, 12 U.S.C. § 4520; Revisor’s Note, 15 U.S.C. § 2064; Revisor’s Note, 18 U.S.C. § 2327; Revisor’s Note, 21 U.S.C. § 355; Revisor’s Note, 23 U.S.C. § 104; Revisor’s Note, 26 U.S.C. § 1201; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 1395u; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 1395ww; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 1396b; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 3025; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 9875; see also Revisor’s Note, 7 U.S.C. § 2018; Revisor’s Note, 10 U.S.C. § 869; Revisor’s Note, 10 U.S.C. § 1407; Revisor’s Note, 10 U.S.C. § 2306a; Revisor’s Note, 10 U.S.C. § 2533b; Revisor’s Note, 12 U.S.C. § 1787; Revisor’s Note, 14 U.S.C. ch. 17 Front Matter; Revisor’s Note, 15 U.S.C. § 2081; Revisor’s Note, 16 U.S.C. § 230f; Revisor’s Note, 20 U.S.C. § 1226c; Revisor’s Note, 20 U.S.C. § 1232; Revisor’s Note, 20 U.S.C. § 4014; Revisor’s Note, 22 U.S.C. § 3651; Revisor’s Note, 22 U.S.C. § 3723; Revisor’s Note, 26 U.S.C. § 105; Revisor’s Note, 26 U.S.C. § 219; Revisor’s Note, 26 U.S.C. § 4973; Revisor’s Note, 29 U.S.C. § 1053; Revisor’s Note, 33 U.S.C. § 2736; Revisor’s Note, 37 U.S.C. § 414; Revisor’s Note, 38 U.S.C. § 3015; Revisor’s Note, 40 U.S.C. § 11501; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 218; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 290bb–25; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 300ff–28; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 1395x; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 1396a; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 1396r; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 5776; Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 9601.



U.S.C. § 7411(d) (1989). The reference to section 112(b)(1)(A) prohibited EPA from regulating under section 111(d) any listed hazardous air pollutants. The Substantive Amendment instructed:

*strike[e] “or 112(b)(1)(A)” and insert[] “or emitted from a source category which is regulated under section 112.”*

Pub. L. No. 101-549, § 108(g), 104 Stat. 2399, 2467 (1990) (emphasis added), JA \_\_\_\_.

As EPA previously explained to this Court, this amendment substantively “change[d] the focus of” the Exclusion from precluding the double regulation of listed hazardous air pollutants to prohibiting the double regulation of any “source category that is actually regulated under section 112.” 2007 EPA Brief, 2007 WL 2155494. This amendment was appropriately listed, in EPA’s own words, “with a variety of substantive provisions.” *Id.* at n.35.

The Law Revision Counsel then correctly looked to a list of “[c]onforming [a]mendments” to the CAA. Senate Manual, § 126(d), JA \_\_\_\_; House Manual, § 332(b), JA \_\_\_\_.

As relevant here, one of those conforming amendments addressed the Exclusion and instructed:

*strike[e] “112(b)(1)(A)” and insert[] in lieu thereof “112(b).”*

Pub. L. No. 101-549, § 302(a), 104 Stat. at 2574 (“Conforming Amendments”) (emphasis added), JA \_\_\_\_.

This clerical update reflected the fact that certain other substantive amendments expanding the section 112 regime had renumbered and

restructured section 112(b), rendering obsolete the pre-1990 cross-reference to “112(b)(1)(A).”

Having already executed the Substantive Amendment, the Law Revision Counsel properly found the Conforming Amendment to be extraneous. Because the Substantive Amendment had already deleted the reference to “112(b)(1)(A),” it was impossible to follow the instructions of the Conforming Amendment to “strick[e] ‘112(b)(1)(A)’ and insert[] in lieu thereof ‘112(b).’” Following its regular practice in such circumstances, the Office of the Law Revision Counsel noted that the Conforming Amendment “could not be executed” and correctly excluded it as a clerical error. *See* Revisor’s Note, 42 U.S.C. § 7411. Writing just five years after the amendments, the Clinton-era EPA agreed, explaining that the Conforming Amendment should be disregarded because it was a clearly erroneous clerical update: “a simple substitution of one subsection citation for another, [made] without consideration of other amendments of the section in which it resides.” 1995 EPA Analysis at 1-5 to 1-6.

EPA contends that the Law Revision Counsel erred in not somehow giving “effect” to both amendments. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,714 n.294, JA \_\_\_\_\_. But EPA has identified, and Petitioners are aware of, no instances in which the Law Revision Counsel—or any court or even another agency—gave *any* meaning to a conforming amendment that could not be executed as a result of a previously executed substantive amendment. To the contrary, this Court has made clear that these routine errors—

which are common in modern, complex legislation—do not create any statutory “ambiguity.” *See Am. Petroleum Inst. v. SEC*, 714 F.3d 1329, 1336-37 (D.C. Cir. 2013). Indeed, if courts were to adopt EPA’s approach to interpreting un-executable conforming amendments, then every one of the numerous instances of such amendments would become previously unnoticed versions-in-exile, causing severe disruptions throughout the U.S. Code. *See supra* pp. 69-70 & n.36.

There are several other valid justifications for the Law Revision Counsel’s treatment of the Conforming Amendment. To begin, it is well-established that amendments are to be executed in order and that an amendment fails to execute if a prior amendment in the same bill removes or alters the text that the subsequent amendment purports to amend.<sup>37</sup> Moreover, even if the amendments were executed in reverse order, the result would be the same, as the Substantive Amendment would still strike out and replace the cross-reference. And finally, the legislative history of the 1990 Amendments shows that the Conforming Amendment, which had originated in the Senate, was passed in error. Records show that the Senate Managers specifically “recede[d]” to seven substantive changes in section 108 of the House bill, expressly including the section 108(g) provision “amending section 111 of the Clean Air Act

---

<sup>37</sup> *See* Senate Manual § 126(d) (“If after a first amendment to a provision is made ... the provision is again amended, the assumption is that the earlier (preceding) amendments have been executed.”), JA \_\_\_\_; House Manual § 332(d) (“The assumption is that the earlier (preceding) amendments have been executed.”), JA \_\_\_\_.

relating to ... existing stationary sources.” 136 CONG. REC. 36,067 (Oct. 27, 1990), JA

—.

In any event, even if this Court agrees with EPA’s “second version” theory, that would not save the Rule. Assuming there are two “versions” of the Exclusion, EPA would need to give “effect” to “every word” of *both* Exclusions, *Reiter v. Sonotone Corp.*, 442 U.S. 330, 339 (1979), by prohibiting EPA from regulating under section 111(d) *both* any “source category which is regulated under Section [1]12” (the text in the U.S. Code), *and* any air pollutant listed pursuant to section 112(b)(1) (EPA’s view of the Conforming Amendment). The Rule would still be unlawful because the prohibition in the U.S. Code against regulating under section 111(d) any “source category which is regulated under Section [1]12” would remain fully intact.<sup>38</sup>

### **III. The Rule Unlawfully Abrogates Authority Granted to the States by the Clean Air Act.**

Section 111(d) grants the authority to “establish[] standards of performance” for existing sources to the States—*not* EPA. CAA § 111(d)(1). EPA is empowered under section 111(b) to adopt “regulations ... establishing Federal standards of performance for new sources.” In contrast, EPA’s authority under section 111(d) is limited to adopting a “procedure” under which “each State shall submit to [EPA] a plan which ... establishes standards of performance for any existing source,” and to

---

<sup>38</sup> *Scialabba v. Cuellar de Osorio*, 134 S. Ct. 2191 (2014), on which EPA relies in the Rule, 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,715, thus provides no support for the agency’s position. That case dealt with a situation where—unlike here—the U.S. Code contained two irreconcilable, substantive commands.

“prescrib[ing] a plan for a State in cases where the State fails to submit a satisfactory plan.” *Id.* § 111(d)(1), (2).

EPA’s 1975 regulations establishing the procedure for section 111(d) state plans, *see* 40 C.F.R. pt. 60, subpt. B, recognize this important division of authority, providing only that EPA will issue a “guideline document” containing an “emission guideline” that “reflects the application of the best system of emission reduction.” 40 C.F.R. § 60.22(a), (b)(5). It is States that are to submit plans establishing standards of performance, which may be less stringent than the EPA emission guidelines if a State makes certain demonstrations, including infeasibility or unreasonable cost given a plant’s age. *Id.* § 60.24(f). As EPA explained in 1975 when promulgating these procedural regulations, “to emphasize that a legally enforceable standard is *not* intended, the term ‘emission limitation’ has been *replaced* with the term ‘emission guideline.’” 40 Fed. Reg. at 53,341, JA \_\_\_\_ (emphases added).<sup>39</sup>

But under the Rule, EPA assumes for itself the power to establish definitive uniform performance rates. Though EPA uses the term emission “guidelines,” it has in fact promulgated national performance rates that set the minimum stringency for standards of performance imposed by the States. 40 C.F.R. pt. 60, subpt. UUUU, Tbl.

---

<sup>39</sup> EPA has approved numerous state plans containing standards of performance less stringent than EPA’s guidelines. *See, e.g.*, 49 Fed. Reg. 35,771 (Sept. 12, 1984) (approving Arkansas plan for kraft pulp mill total reduced sulfur emissions); 47 Fed. Reg. 50,868 (Nov. 10, 1982) (approving Georgia plan for same); 47 Fed. Reg. 28,099 (June 29, 1982) (approving California plan for phosphate fertilizer plant fluoride emissions).

1. As EPA admits, the Rule forbids the States to impose emission standards that are less stringent than EPA has mandated through the national performance rates. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,870 (“[C]onsideration of facility-specific factors and in particular, remaining useful life, does not justify a state making further adjustments to the performance rates ... that the guidelines define for affected [units] in a state and that must be achieved by the state plan.”), JA \_\_\_\_\_. By establishing a minimum stringency for emission standards imposed by States and then leaving only the work of implementation for the States, EPA has unlawfully rewritten the statutory text in which Congress expressly gave only to the States the authority to “establish[] standards of performance.” CAA § 111(d)(1).

For similar reasons, the Rule violates section 111(d)’s express grant of authority to States “to take into consideration, among other factors, the remaining useful life of the existing source to which [a] standard [of performance] applies.” *Id.* Consistent with the primacy that section 111(d) affords the States in setting standards of performance, Congress amended the CAA in 1977 to clarify that “the State[s] would be responsible for determining the applicability of ... guidelines [under section 111(d)] to any particular source or sources.” H.R. Rep. No. 95-294, at 195, *reprinted in* 1997 U.S.C.C.A.N. 1274, JA \_\_\_\_\_. Part of the power thus guaranteed to the States includes authority to grant variances from an otherwise-applicable standard of performance guideline “to take into consideration, among other factors, the remaining useful life of the existing source.” CAA § 111(d).

In amending section 111(d)(1), Congress sought to codify the availability of variances that EPA's implementing regulations already provided. *See* EPA, Legal Memorandum Accompanying Clean Power Plan for Certain Issues at 32 (undated), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-36872, JA \_\_\_\_\_. EPA previously had recognized the States' right to grant variances from emission guidelines on the basis of "economic hardship" to regulated sources and other factors, 40 Fed. Reg. at 53,343-44, JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_, and had permitted States to "provide for the application of less stringent emissions standards" on a "case-by-case basis," *id.* at 53,347, JA \_\_\_\_; *see also* 40 C.F.R. § 60.24(d), (f). As a result, "[i]n most if not all cases ... [there] is likely to be substantial variation in the degree of control required for particular sources, rather than identical standards for all sources." 40 Fed. Reg. at 53,343, JA \_\_\_\_\_. When it enacted the 1977 amendments, Congress codified this right.

Despite the statute's clear language, the Rule forbids States from relaxing the emission rate the agency set, even where applying it would force a source to shut down before the end of its useful life. Many coal plants have made substantial retrofit investments in the past decade to comply with environmental regulations.<sup>40</sup> Yet the emission rates EPA has established effectively prohibit some States from taking into

---

<sup>40</sup> For example, in the last four years, EPA has required the six largest coal-fired power plants in Kansas to invest more than \$3 billion to comply with regional haze, cross-state air pollution, local ozone maintenance, and mercury and air toxics rules. *See* Comments of Kan. Dep't of Health & Env't, at 12-13 (Nov. 17, 2014), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-23255, JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_; Comments of Kan. Corp. Comm'n, at 30-33 (Oct. 29, 2014), EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-21276, JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_.

consideration the remaining useful life of those plants.<sup>41</sup> As a result, these retrofitted plants will have to curtail operations or close long before the financing for these investments is paid off or the benefits of the EPA-required improvements are realized. Congress amended section 111(d)(1) to prevent precisely this situation and this is yet another reason to vacate the Rule.

#### **IV. The Rule Unconstitutionally Commandeers and Coerces States and Their Officials into Carrying Out Federal Energy Policy.**

EPA's unprecedented decision to attempt to decarbonize the U.S. energy system through section 111 regulation leaves States no choice but to alter their laws and programs governing electricity generation and delivery to accord with and carry out federal policy. Whether implemented by federal plan or state plan, the Rule will not work unless States facilitate the Rule's changes and exercise their "responsibility to maintain a reliable electric system" in the face of the Rule's disruptions. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,678, JA \_\_\_\_\_. Where a State declines to administer the Rule and thus has a federal plan imposed on it, it still must take a myriad of actions to ensure that the reductions in coal generation that a federal plan will mandate are matched by increases

---

<sup>41</sup> For instance, the Rule requires Kansas to achieve a 25.7% CO<sub>2</sub> reduction by 2022 and a 44.2% reduction by 2030 under the rate-based limits, and 18.7% by 2022 and 36.0% by 2030 under the mass-based limits. *See* Goal Computation TSD, App. 5, EPA-HQ-OAR-2013-0602-36849, JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_. As a result, Kansas ratepayers "must continue to pay for coal-fired generation resources (including the recent environmental upgrades) that will either be curtailed or forced to retire early." Comments of Kansas Corp. Comm'n, at 30, JA \_\_\_\_\_.



in more costly forms of EPA-favored generation—leaving States to bear the brunt of citizen complaints about the increased costs and lost jobs.

As a result, the Rule runs roughshod over rights reserved to the States under the Constitution. It commandeers the States’ exclusive authority to regulate the intrastate generation and transmission of electricity. And in the end, the States’ “choice” whether to maintain reliable electric service for their citizens is no choice at all; it is an unconstitutional “gun to the head” given the consequences if they refuse to carry out this federal policy. *NFIB*, 132 S. Ct. at 2604 (Roberts, C.J.) (plurality opinion); *see also id.* at 2659 (Scalia, Kennedy, Thomas, and Alito, JJ., dissenting). In States where electricity generation is regulated by constitutionally created bodies, like Louisiana, Georgia, and Arizona, the Rule’s intrusion on state power not only violates the U.S. Constitution, but state constitutions as well.

This commandeering and coercion of States and state officials is unconstitutional and requires that the Rule be vacated. At a minimum, statutory constructions that raise constitutional concerns are to be avoided.<sup>42</sup> *See, e.g., Edward J. DeBartolo Corp. v. Fla. Gulf Coast Bldg. & Constr. Trades Council*, 485 U.S. 568, 575 (1988).

---

<sup>42</sup> Other constitutional issues that would be created by EPA’s “generation shifting” interpretation of section 111(d) are developed further in the brief of Petitioner-Intervenors.

**A. The Rule Unlawfully Commandeers the States and Their Officials.**

At the Rule’s heart is an unprecedented mismatch between what EPA requires—partial decarbonization of the U.S. economy—and what EPA has authority to do under section 111(d)—provide for the application of standards of performance to individual power plants. Whether implemented by the States or the federal government, this mismatch creates a unique situation. States will be required in both instances to facilitate the elimination or reduction of massive quantities of fossil-fuel-fired electric generation as there is no federal means of carrying out the numerous planning and regulatory activities necessary to accommodate the retirement of existing sources and the construction and integration of new capacity. In effect, EPA intends in all events for States to clean up its mess by exercising what EPA calls their “responsibility to maintain a reliable electric system” in the face of the Rule’s disruptions, which amounts to unconstitutional commandeering of the States and their officials.

“Although the Constitution grants broad powers to Congress, our federalism requires that Congress treat the States in a manner consistent with their status as residuary sovereigns and joint participants in the governance of the Nation.” *Alden v. Maine*, 527 U.S. 706, 748 (1999); *see also* U.S. CONST. amend. X (“The powers not delegated to the United States by the Constitution, nor prohibited by it to the States, are reserved to the States respectively, or to the people.”). Among the powers that the Constitution denies to the federal government is the power to “use the States as

implements of regulation”—in other words, to commandeer them to carry out federal law. *New York*, 505 U.S. at 161.

On that basis, the Supreme Court in *New York* struck down a provision of the Low-Level Radioactive Waste Policy Amendments Act that required States either to legislate to provide for the disposal of radioactive waste according to the statute or to take title to such waste and assume responsibility for its storage and disposal. *Id.* at 153-54. The Court explained that the federal government may “offer States the choice of regulating [an] activity according to federal standards or having state law preempted by federal regulation.” *Id.* at 167. But merely providing States flexibility in how to carry out federal policy is unlawful because it “only underscores the critical alternative a State lacks: A State may not decline to administer the federal program.” *Id.* at 176-77. *Printz v. United States*, 521 U.S. 898 (1997), reaffirmed and extended these principles to the commandeering of state officials, striking down a federal statute that directed state law enforcement officers to conduct background checks on gun buyers and perform related tasks. State officials, it held, may not be “‘dragooned’ ... into administering federal law.” *Id.* at 928 (citation omitted).

The Rule violates this anti-commandeering principle by forcing States and state officials to exercise their sovereign powers by revamping their utility sectors. Under the Rule, state actors will be the ones to account for the Rule’s impact on electric reliability, 40 C.F.R. § 60.5745(a)(7), through such means as “[public utility commission] orders,” 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,848, JA \_\_\_\_, and “state measures” that make

unregulated renewable energy generators “responsible for compliance and liable for violations” if they do not fill the gap, 40 C.F.R. § 60.5780(a)(5)(iii).

Indeed, the Rule pushes substantial duties on even those States that “decline” to administer it, just like the low-level nuclear waste program struck down in *New York*. A federal plan’s mandate to retire coal-fired plants or reduce their utilization (including by requiring the purchase of emissions allowances) would force state utility and electricity regulators to respond in the same way as if the State itself had ordered the retirements. Likewise, if EPA orders through a federal plan that power-plant owners construct new electric generating capacity, state officials will be forced to review siting decisions, grant permit applications, and issue certificates of public convenience for EPA’s preferred generation sources and for the associated new transmission lines that EPA’s transformation of the power sector will require. These state officials—which include, in States like Louisiana, Georgia, and Arizona, state constitutional officers elected to sit on public utility commissions—will be “dragooned’ ... into administering federal law.” *Printz*, 521 U.S. at 928 (citation omitted).

And political accountability will be frustrated because it is these state officials who “will bear the brunt of public disapproval” for increased costs and lost jobs, because they appear to retain exclusive authority under state law over electricity generation but “cannot regulate in accordance with the views of the local electorate.” *New York*, 505 U.S. at 169. EPA lacks the authority to supplant the States in carrying

out these aspects of the Rule, so it cannot make the essential trade-off—demanding that States adhere to federal policy at the price of exemption from federal preemption—that the Supreme Court has always required for a program to be truly “cooperative.” *See id.* at 176 (“A choice between two unconstitutionally coercive regulatory techniques is no choice at all.”). The result is that States have no choice but to act, and state officials lose their ability to “remain accountable to the people.” *Id.* at 168.

EPA’s response is simply to assert that no State action is required to implement the Rule. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,881-82, JA \_\_\_\_-\_\_\_\_. But even under a federal implementation plan, state agencies will have to be involved in decommissioning coal-fired plants, addressing replacement capacity, addressing transmission and integration issues, and undertaking all manner of related regulatory proceedings.<sup>43</sup> *See id.* at 64,678, JA\_\_; *supra* pp. 20-21. In fact, EPA’s proposed federal plan expressly relies on state authorities to address reliability issues caused by the Rule. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,981. In this regard, the Rule fundamentally departs from the statutory scheme upheld in *Hodel v. Virginia Surface Mining & Reclamation Ass’n*, 452 U.S. 264, 288 (1981), because the mine reclamation program at issue in that case ensured that “the full regulatory

---

<sup>43</sup> As noted above, federal law recognizes States’ exclusive jurisdiction “over facilities used for the generation of electric energy.” *See supra* pp. 38-39. That includes States’ “traditional authority over the need for additional generating capacity, the type of generating facilities to be licensed, land use, ratemaking, and the like”—the very things the Rule targets. *PG&E*, 461 U.S. at 212.

burden” of regulation would “be borne by the Federal Government” if a State chose not to regulate. *See also Miss. Comm’n on Env’tl. Quality v. EPA*, 790 F.3d 138, 175 (D.C. Cir. 2015) (per curiam) (similar). As this Court has said, a federal plan under the Clean Air Act cannot “commandeer the regulatory powers of the states, along with their personnel and resources.” *District of Columbia v. Train*, 521 F.2d 971, 992 (D.C. Cir. 1975), *vacated on other grounds*, *EPA v. Brown*, 431 U.S. 99 (1977).

In short, while EPA makes much of the purported flexibility States have in implementing the Rule, *see, e.g.*, 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,665, JA \_\_\_\_, the Constitution requires the federal government to allow States the choice to “decline to administer the federal program,” *New York*, 505 U.S. at 177, not a multitude of choices of how to administer the federal program. Because that is the one choice the Rule denies to States, it impinges on the States’ sovereign authority and, like the actions under review in *New York* and *Printz*, exceeds the federal government’s power.

#### **B. The Rule Unlawfully Coerces the States.**

Just as the federal government may not commandeer States to carry out federal policy, it also may not coerce them to the same end by denying them “a legitimate choice whether to accept the federal conditions.” *NFIB*, 132 S. Ct. at 2602 (Roberts, C.J.) (plurality opinion); *see also id.* at 2659 (Scalia, Kennedy, Thomas, and Alito, JJ., dissenting). The Rule violates this anti-coercion doctrine by threatening to disrupt the electric systems of States that do not carry out federal policy.

Federal action directed at States “has crossed the line distinguishing encouragement from coercion” when it leverages existing and substantial State entitlements to induce the State to implement federal policy. *Id.* at 2603 (internal quotation marks omitted). When “not merely in theory but in fact,” such threats amount to “economic dragooning that leaves the States with no real option but to acquiesce” to federal demands, they impermissibly “undermine the status of the States as independent sovereigns in our federal system.” *Id.* at 2602, 2604-05 (quoting *South Dakota v. Dole*, 483 U.S. 203, 211-12 (1987)).

That precisely describes the Rule. If a State declines to implement the Rule, EPA will impose a federal plan that does so. 40 C.F.R. § 60.5720. But because the Rule’s aggressive emission rates cannot be achieved by the type of operational efficiency improvements that individual sources can make and that can actually be federally administered, States will have to take regulatory action to administer and facilitate generation-shifting, or face electricity shortfalls and the associated consequences for state services and operations, public health and safety, and economy. *See supra* pp. 12-16, 20-21, 78-83. Indeed, EPA is quite clear that it expects state actors to exercise “responsibility to maintain a reliable electric system” in the face of the Rule’s disruptions. 80 Fed. Reg. at 64,678, JA \_\_\_\_\_. The Rule places States in an untenable position.

The whole point is to force States to do what is necessary to maintain reliable and affordable electric service by taking regulatory actions that are beyond EPA’s

authority. Regardless of whether a State implements its own plan or is subject to the federal plan, in neither instance does the decision to adopt or reject EPA's preferred policies "remain the prerogative of the States." *NFIB*, 132 S. Ct. at 2604 (Roberts, C.J.) (plurality opinion) (alteration in original) (quoting *Dole*, 483 U.S. at 211); *see also id.* at 2659 (Scalia, Kennedy, Thomas, and Alito, JJ., dissenting). Instead, EPA's "inducement' ... is a gun to the head." *Id.* at 2604 (Roberts, C.J.) (plurality opinion). This prospect of requiring state action in order to maintain reliable electricity for its residents leaves States no choice but to carry out EPA's dictates.

The Rule identifies no precedent for this invasion of state sovereignty. "[H]aving the power to make decisions and to set policy is what gives the State its sovereign nature." *FERC v. Mississippi*, 456 U.S. 742, 761 (1982). But, as in *New York* and *NFIB*, the Rule deprives the States of that core aspect of their sovereignty, requiring them to exercise regulatory authority while stripping them of policymaking discretion. This is not cooperative federalism; the "the Federal Government may not compel the States to implement ... federal regulatory programs." *Printz*, 521 U.S. at 925.

## CONCLUSION

For the foregoing reasons, the petitions should be granted and the Rule vacated.



Dated: February 19, 2016

/s/ F. William Brownell

F. William Brownell  
Allison D. Wood  
Henry V. Nickel  
Tauna M. Szymanski  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
bbrownell@hunton.com  
awood@hunton.com  
hnickel@hunton.com  
tszymanski@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Utility Air Regulatory  
Group and American Public Power Association*

/s/ Peter S. Glaser

Peter S. Glaser  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
401 Ninth Street N.W., Suite 1000  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 274-2998  
peter.glaser@troutmansanders.com

Carroll W. McGuffey III  
Justin T. Wong  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
600 Peachtree Street, N.E., Suite 5200  
Atlanta, GA 30308  
Tel: (404) 885-3000  
mack.mcguffey@troutmansanders.com  
justin.wong@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner National Mining  
Association*

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Elbert Lin

Patrick Morrissey  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WEST  
VIRGINIA  
Elbert Lin  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
J. Zak Ritchie  
Assistant Attorney General  
State Capitol Building 1, Room 26-E  
Charleston, WV 25305  
Tel: (304) 558-2021  
Fax: (304) 558-0140  
elbert.lin@wvago.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of West Virginia*

/s/ Scott A. Keller

Ken Paxton  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
Charles E. Roy  
First Assistant Attorney General  
Scott A. Keller  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 12548  
Austin, TX 78711-2548  
Tel: (512) 936-1700  
scott.keller@texasattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Texas*

/s/ Peter D. Keisler

Peter D. Keisler  
 Roger R. Martella, Jr.  
 C. Frederick Beckner III  
 Ryan C. Morris  
 Paul J. Ray  
 SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP  
 1501 K Street, N.W.  
 Washington, D.C. 20005  
 Tel: (202) 736-8027  
 pkeisler@sidley.com  
 rmartella@sidley.com  
 rbeckner@sidley.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Chamber of Commerce of the United States of America; National Association of Manufacturers; American Fuel & Petrochemical Manufacturers; National Federation of Independent Business; American Chemistry Council; American Coke and Coal Chemicals Institute; American Foundry Society; American Forest & Paper Association; American Iron & Steel Institute; American Wood Council; Brick Industry Association; Electricity Consumers Resource Council; Lignite Energy Council; National Lime Association; National Oilseed Processors Association; and Portland Cement Association*

/s/ Andrew Brasher

Luther Strange  
 ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ALABAMA  
 Andrew Brasher  
 Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
 501 Washington Avenue  
 Montgomery, AL 36130  
 Tel: (334) 590-1029  
 abrasher@ago.state.al.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Alabama*

/s/ John R. Lopez IV

Mark Brnovich  
 ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARIZONA  
 John R. Lopez IV  
*Counsel of Record*  
 Dominic E. Draye  
 Keith Miller  
 Assistant Attorneys General  
 Maureen Scott  
 Janet Wagner  
 Janice Alward  
 Arizona Corp. Commission,  
 Staff Attorneys  
 1275 West Washington  
 Phoenix, AZ 85007  
 Tel: (602) 542-5025  
 john.lopez@azag.gov  
 dominic.draye@azag.gov  
 keith.miller@azag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Arizona Corporation Commission*

/s/ Thomas A. Lorenzen

Thomas A. Lorenzen  
D.C. Cir. Bar No. 394369  
Daniel W. Wolff  
Sherrie A. Armstrong  
CROWELL & MORING LLP  
1001 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 624-2500  
tlorenzen@crowell.com  
dwolff@crowell.com  
sarmstrong@crowell.com

*Counsel for Petitioners National Rural Electric Cooperative Association; Big Rivers Electric Corporation; Brazos Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Buckeye Power, Inc.; Central Montana Electric Power Cooperative; Central Power Electric Cooperative, Inc., Corn Belt Power Cooperative; Dairyland Power Cooperative; East River Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Georgia Transmission Corporation; Kansas Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; North Carolina Electric Membership Corporation; Northwest Iowa Power Cooperative; Oglethorpe Power Corporation; PowerSouth Energy Cooperative; Prairie Power, Inc.; Rushmore Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Seminole Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Southern Illinois Power Cooperative; Sunflower Electric Power Corporation; and Upper Missouri G. & T. Electric Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Jamie L. Ewing

Leslie Rutledge  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARKANSAS  
Lee Rudofsky  
Solicitor General  
Jamie L. Ewing  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
323 Center Street, Suite 400  
Little Rock, AR 72201  
Tel: (501) 682-5310  
jamie.ewing@arkansasag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Arkansas*

/s/ Frederick Yarger

Cynthia H. Coffman  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF COLORADO  
Frederick Yarger  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
1300 Broadway, 10th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203  
Tel: (720) 508-6168  
fred.yarger@state.co.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Colorado*

*Of Counsel*

Rae Cronmiller  
Environmental Counsel  
NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF RURAL  
ELECTRIC COOPERATIVES  
4301 Wilson Blvd.  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Tel: (703) 907-5500  
rae.cronmiller@nreca.coop

*Counsel for Petitioner National Rural Electric  
Cooperative Association*

/s/ Eric L. Hiser

Eric L. Hiser  
JORDEN BISCHOFF & HISER, PLC  
7272 E. Indian School Road, Suite 360  
Scottsdale, AZ 85251  
Tel: (480) 505-3927  
ehiser@jordenbischoff.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Arizona Electric Power  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Brian A. Prestwood

Brian A. Prestwood  
Senior Corporate and Compliance  
Counsel  
ASSOCIATED ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE,  
INC.  
2814 S. Golden, P.O. Box 754  
Springfield, MO 65801  
Tel: (417) 885-9273  
bprestwood@aeci.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Associated Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Allen Winsor

Pamela Jo Bondi  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF FLORIDA  
Allen Winsor  
Solicitor General of Florida  
*Counsel of Record*  
Office of the Attorney General  
PL-01, The Capitol  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050  
Tel: (850) 414-3681  
Fax: (850) 410-2672  
allen.winsor@myfloridalegal.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Florida*

/s/ Britt C. Grant

Samuel S. Olens  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF GEORGIA  
Britt C. Grant  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
40 Capitol Square S.W.  
Atlanta, GA 30334  
Tel: (404) 656-3300  
Fax: (404) 463-9453  
bgrant@law.ga.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Georgia*

/s/ David Crabtree  
David Crabtree  
Vice President, General Counsel  
DESERET GENERATION & TRANSMISSION  
CO-OPERATIVE  
10714 South Jordan Gateway  
South Jordan, UT 84095  
Tel: (801) 619-9500  
Crabtree@deseretpower.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Deseret Generation &  
Transmission Co-operative*

/s/ John M. Holloway III  
John M. Holloway III, DC Bar # 494459  
SUTHERLAND ASBILL & BRENNAN LLP  
700 Sixth Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 383-0100  
Fax: (202) 383-3593  
jay.holloway@sutherland.com

*Counsel for Petitioners East Kentucky Power  
Cooperative, Inc.; Hoosier Energy Rural Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.; Minnkota Power Cooperative,  
Inc.; and South Mississippi Electric Power  
Association*

/s/ Timothy Junk  
Gregory F. Zoeller  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF INDIANA  
Timothy Junk  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Indiana Government Ctr. South  
Fifth Floor  
302 West Washington Street  
Indianapolis, IN 46205  
Tel: (317) 232-6247  
tim.junk@atg.in.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Indiana*

/s/ Jeffrey A. Chanay  
Derek Schmidt  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KANSAS  
Jeffrey A. Chanay  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Bryan C. Clark  
Assistant Solicitor General  
120 S.W. 10th Avenue, 3rd Floor  
Topeka, KS 66612  
Tel: (785) 368-8435  
Fax: (785) 291-3767  
jeff.chanay@ag.ks.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Kansas*

/s/ Patrick Burchette

Patrick Burchette  
HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP  
800 17<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W., Suite 1100  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 469-5102  
Patrick.Burchette@hkllaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioners East Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Northeast Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Sam Rayburn G&T Electric Cooperative, Inc.; and Tex-La Electric Cooperative of Texas, Inc.*

/s/ Christopher L. Bell

Christopher L. Bell  
GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP  
1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 1700  
Houston, TX 77002  
Tel: (713) 374-3556  
bellc@gtllaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Golden Spread Electrical Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Mark Walters

Mark Walters  
D.C. Cir. Bar No. 54161  
Michael J. Nasi  
D.C. Cir. Bar No. 53850  
JACKSON WALKER L.L.P.  
100 Congress Avenue, Suite 1100  
Austin, TX 78701  
Tel: (512) 236-2000  
mwalters@jw.com  
mnasi@jw.com

*Counsel for Petitioners San Miguel Electric Cooperative, Inc. and South Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Gregory T. Dutton

Andy Beshear  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KENTUCKY  
Gregory T. Dutton  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
700 Capital Avenue  
Suite 118  
Frankfort, KY 40601  
Tel: (502) 696-5453  
gregory.dutton@ky.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Commonwealth of Kentucky*

/s/ Steven B. "Beaux" Jones

Jeff Landry  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF LOUISIANA  
Steven B. "Beaux" Jones  
*Counsel of Record*  
Duncan S. Kemp, IV  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Environmental Section – Civil Division  
1885 N. Third Street  
Baton Rouge, LA 70804  
Tel: (225) 326-6085  
Fax: (225) 326-6099  
jonesst@ag.state.la.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana*

/s/ Randolph G. Holt  
Randolph G. Holt  
Jeremy L. Fetty  
PARR RICHEY OBREMSKEY FRANSEN &  
PATTERSON LLP  
Wabash Valley Power Association, Inc.  
722 N. High School Road  
P.O. Box 24700  
Indianapolis, IN 46224  
Tel: (317) 481-2815  
R\_holt@wvpa.com  
jfetty@parrlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Wabash Valley Power  
Association, Inc.*

/s/ Megan H. Berge  
Megan H. Berge  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Western Farmers Electric  
Cooperative*

/s/ Steven C. Kohl  
Steven C. Kohl  
Gaetan Gerville-Reache  
WARNER NORCROSS & JUDD LLP  
2000 Town Center, Suite 2700  
Southfield, MI 48075-1318  
Tel: (248) 784-5000  
skohl@wnj.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Wolverine Power Supply  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Donald Trahan  
Herman Robinson  
Executive Counsel  
Donald Trahan  
*Counsel of Record*  
Elliott Vega  
LOUISIANA DEPARTMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY  
Legal Division  
P.O. Box 4302  
Baton Rouge, LA 70821-4302  
Tel: (225) 219-3985  
Fax: (225) 219-4068  
donald.trahan@la.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana  
Department of Environmental Quality*

/s/ Monica Derbes Gibson  
Monica Derbes Gibson  
Lesley Foxhall Pietras  
LISKOW & LEWIS, P.L.C.  
701 Poydras Street, Suite 5000  
New Orleans, LA 70139  
Tel: (504) 556-4010  
Fax: (504) 556-4108  
mdgibson@liskow.com  
lfpietras@liskow.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Louisiana Public Service  
Commission*



/s/ Christina F. Gomez  
Christina F. Gomez  
Lawrence E. Volmert  
Garrison W. Kaufman  
Jill H. Van Noord  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
555 Seventeenth Street, Suite 3200  
Denver, CO 80202  
Tel: (303) 295-8000  
Fax: (303) 295-8261  
cgomez@hollandhart.com  
lvolmert@hollandhart.com  
gwkaufman@hollandhart.com  
jhvan Noord@hollandhart.com

Patrick R. Day  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
2515 Warren Avenue, Suite 450  
Cheyenne, WY 82001  
Tel: (307) 778-4200  
Fax: (307) 778-8175  
pday@hollandhart.com

Emily C. Schilling  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
222 South Main Street, Suite 2200  
Salt Lake City, UT 84101  
Tel: (801) 799-5800  
Fax: (801) 799-5700  
ecschilling@hollandhart.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Basin Electric Power  
Cooperative*

/s/ Aaron D. Lindstrom  
Bill Schuette  
ATTORNEY GENERAL FOR THE PEOPLE  
OF MICHIGAN  
Aaron D. Lindstrom  
Michigan Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 30212  
Lansing, MI 48909  
Tel: (515) 373-1124  
Fax: (517) 373-3042  
lindstroma@michigan.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner People of the State of  
Michigan*

/s/ Harold E. Pizzetta, III  
Jim Hood  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF  
MISSISSIPPI  
Harold E. Pizzetta  
Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Litigation Division  
Office of the Attorney General  
Post Office Box 220  
Jackson, MS 39205  
Tel: (601) 359-3816  
Fax: (601) 359-2003  
hpizz@ago.state.ms.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Mississippi*



/s/ Stacey Turner  
Stacey Turner  
SOUTHERN COMPANY SERVICES, INC.  
600 18<sup>th</sup> Street North  
BIN 14N-8195  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 257-2823  
staturne@southernco.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Alabama Power Company, Georgia Power Company, Gulf Power Company, and Mississippi Power Company*

/s/ C. Grady Moore, III  
C. Grady Moore, III  
Steven G. McKinney  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 Sixth Avenue North, Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35303-4642  
Tel: (205) 251-8100  
Fax: (205) 488-5704  
gmoore@balch.com  
smckinney@balch.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Alabama Power Company*

/s/ Margaret Claiborne Campbell  
Margaret Claiborne Campbell  
Angela J. Levin  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
600 Peachtree Street, NE, Suite 5200  
Atlanta, GA 30308-2216  
Tel: (404) 885-3000  
margaret.campbell@troutmansanders.com  
angela.levin@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Georgia Power Company*

/s/ Donna J. Hodges  
Donna J. Hodges  
Senior Counsel  
MISSISSIPPI DEPARTMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY  
P.O. Box 2261  
Jackson, MS 39225-2261  
Tel: (601) 961-5369  
Fax: (601) 961-5349  
donna\_hodges@deq.state.ms.us

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Department of Environmental Quality*

/s/ Todd E. Palmer  
Todd E. Palmer  
Valerie L. Green  
MICHAEL, BEST & FRIEDRICH LLP  
601 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20004-2601  
Tel: (202) 747-9560  
Fax: (202) 347-1819  
tepalmer@michaelbest.com  
vlgreen@michaelbest.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Public Service Commission*

/s/ Terese T. Wyly

Terese T. Wyly  
Ben H. Stone  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1310 Twenty Fifth Avenue  
Gulfport, MS 39501-1931  
Tel: (228) 214-0413  
twyly@balch.com  
bstone@balch.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Power  
Company*

/s/ Jeffrey A. Stone

Jeffrey A. Stone  
BEGGS & LANE, RLLP  
501 Commendencia Street  
Pensacola, FL 32502  
Tel: (850) 432-2451  
JAS@beggslane.com

James S. Alves  
2110 Trescott Drive  
Tallahassee, FL 32308  
Tel: (850) 566-7607  
jim.s.alves@outlook.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Gulf Power Company*

/s/ James R. Layton

Chris Koster  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MISSOURI  
James R. Layton  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 899  
207 W. High Street  
Jefferson City, MO 65102  
Tel: (573) 751-1800  
Fax: (573) 751-0774  
james.layton@ago.mo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Missouri*

/s/ Dale Schowengerdt

Timothy C. Fox  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MONTANA  
Alan Joscelyn  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
Dale Schowengerdt  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
215 North Sanders  
Helena, MT 59620-1401  
Tel: (406) 444-7008  
dales@mt.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Montana*

/s/ James S. Alves  
James S. Alves  
2110 Trescott Drive  
Tallahassee, FL 32308  
Tel: (850) 566-7607  
jim.s.alves@outlook.com

*Counsel for Petitioner CO<sub>2</sub> Task Force of the  
Florida Electric Power Coordinating Group, Inc.*

/s/ John J. McMackin  
John J. McMackin  
WILLIAMS & JENSEN  
701 8th Street, N.W., Suite 500  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 659-8201  
jjmcmackin@wms-jen.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Energy-Intensive  
Manufacturers Working Group on Greenhouse  
Gas Regulation*

/s/ William M. Bumpers  
William M. Bumpers  
Megan H. Berge  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
william.bumpers@bakerbotts.com  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

Kelly McQueen  
ENTERGY SERVICES, INC.  
425 W. Capitol Avenue, 27th Floor  
Little Rock, AR 72201  
Tel: (501) 377-5760  
kmcque1@entergy.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Entergy Corporation*

/s/ Justin D. Lavene  
Doug Peterson  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEBRASKA  
Dave Bydlaek  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
Justin D. Lavene  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
2115 State Capitol  
Lincoln, NE 68509  
Tel: (402) 471-2834  
justin.lavene@nebraska.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Nebraska*

/s/ Robert J. Kinney  
John J. Hoffman  
ACTING ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEW  
JERSEY  
David C. Apy  
Assistant Attorney General  
Robert J. Kinney  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Division of Law  
R.J. Hughes Justice Complex  
P.O. Box 093  
25 Market Street  
Trenton, NJ 08625-0093  
Tel: (609) 292-6945  
Fax: (609) 341-5030  
robert.kinney@dol.lps.state.nj.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of New Jersey*

/s/ Paul J. Zidlicky  
 Paul J. Zidlicky  
 SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP  
 1501 K Street, N.W.  
 Washington, D.C. 20005  
 Tel: (202) 736-8000  
 pzidlicky@sidley.com

*Counsel for Petitioners GenOn Mid-Atlantic, LLC; Indian River Power LLC; Louisiana Generating LLC; Midwest Generation, LLC; NRG Chalk Point LLC; NRG Power Midwest LP; NRG Rema LLC; NRG Texas Power LLC; NRG Wholesale Generation LP; and Vienna Power LLC*

/s/ David M. Flannery  
 David M. Flannery  
 Kathy G. Beckett  
 Edward L. Kropp  
 STEPTOE & JOHNSON, PLLC  
 505 Virginia Street East  
 Charleston, WV 25326  
 Tel: (304) 353-8000  
 dave.flannery@steptoe-johnson.com  
 kathy.beckett@steptoe-johnson.com  
 skipp.kropp@steptoe-johnson.com

Stephen L. Miller  
 STEPTOE & JOHNSON, PLLC  
 700 N. Hurstbourne Parkway, Suite 115  
 Louisville, KY 40222  
 Tel: (502) 423-2000  
 steve.miller@steptoe-johnson.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Indiana Utility Group*

/s/ Paul M. Seby  
 Wayne Stenehjem  
 ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NORTH  
 DAKOTA  
 Margaret Olson  
 Assistant Attorney General  
 North Dakota Attorney General's Office  
 600 E. Boulevard Avenue #125  
 Bismarck, ND 58505  
 Tel: (701) 328-3640  
 maiolson@nd.gov

Paul M. Seby  
 Special Assistant Attorney General  
 State of North Dakota  
 GREENBERG TRAUERIG, LLP  
 1200 17th Street, Suite 2400  
 Denver, CO 80202  
 Tel: (303) 572-6500  
 Fax: (303) 572-6540  
 seby@gtlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of North Dakota*

/s/ Eric E. Murphy  
 Michael DeWine  
 ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO  
 Eric E. Murphy  
 State Solicitor  
*Counsel of Record*  
 30 E. Broad Street, 17th Floor  
 Columbus, OH 43215  
 Tel: (614) 466-8980  
 eric.murphy@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Ohio*

/s/ F. William Brownell  
F. William Brownell  
Eric J. Murdock  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
bbrownell@hunton.com  
emurdock@hunton.com

Nash E. Long III  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
Bank of America Plaza, Suite 3500  
101 South Tryon Street  
Charlotte, NC 28280  
Tel: (704) 378-4700  
nlong@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioner LG&E and KU Energy  
LLC*

/s/ David B. Rivkin, Jr.  
E. Scott Pruitt  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OKLAHOMA  
Patrick R. Wyrick  
Solicitor General of Oklahoma  
313 N.E. 21st Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73105  
Tel: (405) 521-4396  
Fax: (405) 522-0669  
fc.docket@oag.state.ok.us  
scott.pruitt@oag.ok.gov

David B. Rivkin, Jr.  
*Counsel of Record*  
Mark W. DeLaquil  
Andrew M. Grossman  
BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP  
Washington Square, Suite 1100  
1050 Connecticut Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
Tel: (202) 861-1731  
Fax: (202) 861-1783  
drivkin@bakerlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioners State of Oklahoma and  
Oklahoma Department of Environmental  
Quality*

/s/ P. Stephen Gidiere III  
P. Stephen Gidiere III  
Thomas L. Casey III  
Julia B. Barber  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 6th Ave. N., Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 251-8100  
sgidiere@balch.com

Stephanie Z. Moore  
Vice President and General Counsel  
LUMINANT GENERATION COMPANY LLC  
1601 Bryan Street, 22nd Floor  
Dallas, TX 75201

Daniel J. Kelly  
Vice President and Associate General  
Counsel  
ENERGY FUTURE HOLDINGS CORP.  
1601 Bryan Street, 43rd Floor  
Dallas, TX 75201

*Counsel for Petitioners Luminant Generation  
Company LLC; Oak Grove Management  
Company LLC; Big Brown Power Company  
LLC; Sandow Power Company LLC; Big  
Brown Lignite Company LLC; Luminant  
Mining Company LLC; and Luminant Big  
Brown Mining Company LLC*

/s/ James Emory Smith, Jr.  
Alan Wilson  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
CAROLINA  
Robert D. Cook  
Solicitor General  
James Emory Smith, Jr.  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 11549  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Tel: (803) 734-3680  
Fax: (803) 734-3677  
esmith@scag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Carolina*

/s/ Steven R. Blair  
Marty J. Jackley  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
DAKOTA  
Steven R. Blair  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
1302 E. Highway 14, Suite 1  
Pierre, SD 57501  
Tel: (605) 773-3215  
steven.blair@state.sd.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Dakota*

/s/ Ronald J. Tenpas  
Ronald J. Tenpas  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS  
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 739-3000  
rtenpas@morganlewis.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Minnesota Power (an  
operating division of ALLETE, Inc.)*

/s/ Allison D. Wood  
Allison D. Wood  
Tauna M. Szymanski  
Andrew D. Knudsen  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
awood@hunton.com  
tszymanski@hunton.com  
aknudsen@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Montana-Dakota Utilities  
Co., a Division of MDU Resources Group, Inc.*

/s/ Tyler R. Green  
Sean Reyes  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF UTAH  
Tyler R. Green  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Parker Douglas  
Federal Solicitor  
Utah State Capitol Complex  
350 North State Street, Suite 230  
Salt Lake City, UT 84114-2320  
pdouglas@utah.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Utah*

/s/ Misha Tseytlin  
Brad Schimel  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WISCONSIN  
Misha Tseytlin  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Andrew Cook  
Deputy Attorney General  
Delanie M. Breuer  
Assistant Deputy Attorney General  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
17 West Main Street  
Madison, WI 53707  
Tel: (608) 267-9323  
tseytlinm@doj.state.wi.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wisconsin*



/s/ William M. Bumpers

William M. Bumpers  
Megan H. Berge  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
william.bumpers@bakerbotts.com  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner NorthWestern  
Corporation d/b/a NorthWestern Energy*

/s/ Joshua R. More

Joshua R. More  
Jane E. Montgomery  
Amy Antonioli  
Raghav Murali  
SCHIFF HARDIN LLP  
233 South Wacker Drive  
Suite 6600  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Tel: (312) 258-5500  
jmore@schiffhardin.com  
jmontgomery@schiffhardin.com  
aantonioli@schiffhardin.com  
rmurali@schiffhardin.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Prairie State Generating  
Company, LLC*

/s/ James Kaste

Peter K. Michael  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WYOMING  
James Kaste  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Michael J. McGrady  
Erik Petersen  
Senior Assistant Attorneys General  
Elizabeth Morrisseau  
Assistant Attorney General  
2320 Capitol Avenue  
Cheyenne, WY 82002  
Tel: (307) 777-6946  
Fax: (307) 777-3542  
james.kaste@wyo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wyoming*

/s/ Sam M. Hayes

Sam M. Hayes  
General Counsel  
*Counsel of Record*  
Craig Bromby  
Deputy General Counsel  
Andrew Norton  
Deputy General Counsel  
NORTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY  
1601 Mail Service Center  
Raleigh, NC 27699-1601  
Tel: (919) 707-8616  
sam.hayes@ncdenr.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner North Carolina  
Department of Environmental Quality*



/s/ Allison D. Wood

Allison D. Wood  
Tauna M. Szymanski  
Andrew D. Knudsen  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
awood@hunton.com  
tszymanski@hunton.com  
aknudsen@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Tri-State Generation and  
Transmission Association, Inc.*

/s/ William M. Bumpers

William M. Bumpers  
Megan H. Berge  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
william.bumpers@bakerbotts.com  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Westar Energy, Inc.*

/s/ Jeffrey R. Holmstead

Jeffrey R. Holmstead  
Sandra Y. Snyder  
BRACEWELL & GIULIANI LLP  
2000 K Street, N.W., Suite 500  
Washington, D.C. 20006-1872  
Tel: (202) 828-5852  
Fax: (202) 857-4812  
jeff.holmstead@bgllp.com

*Counsel for Petitioner American Coalition for  
Clean Coal Electricity*

/s/ Dennis Lane

Dennis Lane  
STINSON LEONARD STREET LLP  
1775 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 800  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 785-9100  
Fax: (202) 785-9163  
dennis.lane@stinson.com

Parthenia B. Evans  
STINSON LEONARD STREET LLP  
1201 Walnut Street, Suite 2900  
Kansas City, MO 64106  
Tel: (816) 842-8600  
Fax: (816) 691-3495  
parthy.evans@stinson.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Kansas City Board of  
Public Utilities – Unified Government of  
Wyandotte County/ Kansas City, Kansas*

/s/ Geoffrey K. Barnes  
Geoffrey K. Barnes  
J. Van Carson  
Wendlene M. Lavey  
John D. Lazzaretti  
Robert D. Cheren  
SQUIRE PATTON BOGGS (US) LLP  
4900 Key Tower  
127 Public Square  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
Tel: (216) 479-8646  
geoffrey.barnes@squirepb.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Murray Energy  
Corporation*

/s/ Andrew C. Emrich  
Andrew C. Emrich  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
6380 South Fiddlers Green Circle  
Suite 500  
Greenwood Village, CO 80111  
Tel: (303) 290-1621  
Fax: (866) 711-8046  
acemrich@hollandhart.com

Emily C. Schilling  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
222 South Main Street, Suite 2200  
Salt Lake City, UT 84101  
Tel: (801) 799-5753  
Fax: (202) 747-6574  
ecschilling@hollandhart.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Newmont Nevada  
Energy Investment, LLC and Newmont USA  
Limited*

/s/ Charles T. Wehland

Charles T. Wehland

*Counsel of Record*

Brian J. Murray

JONES DAY

77 West Wacker Drive, Suite 3500

Chicago, IL 60601-1692

Tel: (312) 782-3939

Fax: (312) 782-8585

ctwehland@jonesday.com

bjmurray@jonesday.com

*Counsel for Petitioners The North American Coal Corporation; The Coteau Properties Company; Coyote Creek Mining Company, LLC; The Falkirk Mining Company; Mississippi Lignite Mining Company; North American Coal Royalty Company; NODAK Energy Services, LLC; Otter Creek Mining Company, LLC; and The Sabine Mining Company*

/s/ Robert G. McLusky

Robert G. McLusky

JACKSON KELLY, PLLC

1600 Laidley Tower

P.O. Box 553

Charleston, WV 25322

Tel: (304) 340-1000

rmclusky@jacksonkelly.com

*Counsel for Petitioner West Virginia Coal Association*

/s/ Eugene M. Trisko

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
Tel: (301) 639-5238 (cell)  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner International Brotherhood  
of Boilermakers, Iron Ship Builders,  
Blacksmiths, Forgers & Helpers*

/s/ Eugene M. Trisko

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
Tel: (301) 639-5238 (cell)  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner International Brotherhood  
of Electrical Workers, AFL-CIO*

/s/ Grant F. Crandall

Grant F. Crandall  
General Counsel  
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA  
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive  
Triangle, VA 22172  
Tel: (703) 291-2429  
gcrandall@umwa.org

Arthur Traynor, III  
Staff Counsel  
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA  
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive  
Triangle, VA 22172  
Tel: (703) 291-2457  
atraynor@umwa.org

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner United Mine Workers of  
America*

/s/ Steven P. Lehotsky

Steven P. Lehotsky  
Sheldon B. Gilbert  
U.S. Chamber Litigation Center, Inc.  
1615 H Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20062  
Tel: (202) 463-5337  
slehotsky@uschamber.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Chamber of Commerce of  
the United States of America*

/s/ Quentin Riegel

Linda E. Kelly  
Quentin Riegel  
MANUFACTURERS' CENTER FOR LEGAL  
ACTION  
733 10th Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 637-3000  
qriegel@nam.org

*Counsel for Petitioner National Association of  
Manufacturers*

/s/ Richard S. Moskowitz

Richard S. Moskowitz  
AMERICAN FUEL & PETROCHEMICAL  
MANUFACTURERS  
1667 K Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 457-0480  
rmoskowitz@afpm.org

*Counsel for Petitioner American Fuel &  
Petrochemical Manufacturers*

/s/ Karen R. Harned

Karen R. Harned  
Executive Director  
Elizabeth A. Gaudio  
Senior Executive Counsel  
NATIONAL FEDERATION OF  
INDEPENDENT BUSINESS  
SMALL BUSINESS LEGAL CENTER  
1201 F Street, N.W., Suite 200  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 314-2061  
karen.harned@nfib.org  
elizabeth.milito@nfib.org

*Counsel for Petitioner National Federation of  
Independent Business*

/s/ Megan H. Berge

Megan H. Berge  
William M. Bumpers  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com  
william.bumpers@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner National Association of  
Home Builders*

/s/ Kathryn D. Kirmayer  
Kathryn D. Kirmayer  
General Counsel  
Evelyn R. Nackman  
Associate General Counsel  
ASSOCIATION OF AMERICAN RAILROADS  
425 3rd Street, S.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20024  
Tel: (202) 639-2100  
kkirmayer@aar.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Association of American Railroads*

/s/ Chaim Mandelbaum  
Chaim Mandelbaum  
Litigation Manager  
FREE MARKET ENVIRONMENTAL LAW  
CLINIC  
726 N. Nelson Street, Suite 9  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Tel: (703) 577-9973  
chaim12@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Energy and Environment Legal Institute*

/s/ Catherine E. Stetson  
Catherine E. Stetson  
Eugene A. Sokoloff  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
555 Thirteenth Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004-1109  
Tel: (202) 637-5600  
Fax: (202) 637-5910  
cate.stetson@hoganlovells.com  
eugene.sokoloff@hoganlovells.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Denbury Onshore, LLC*



/s/ Adam R.F. Gustafson

C. Boyden Gray

Adam R.F. Gustafson

*Counsel of Record*

Derek S. Lyons

James R. Conde

BOYDEN GRAY & ASSOCIATES, PLLC

1627 I Street, N.W., Suite 950

Washington, D.C. 20006

Tel: (202) 955-0620

gustafson@boydengrayassociates.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Competitive Enterprise  
Institute; Buckeye Institute for Public Policy  
Solutions; Independence Institute; Rio Grande  
Foundation; Sutherland Institute; Klaus J.  
Christoph; Samuel R. Damewood; Catherine C.  
Dellin; Joseph W. Luquire; Lisa R. Markham;  
Patrick T. Peterson; and Kristi Rosenquist*

Sam Kazman

Hans Bader

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE

1899 L Street, N.W., 12th Floor

Washington, D.C. 20036

Tel: (202) 331-1010

*Counsel for Petitioner Competitive Enterprise  
Institute*

Robert Alt

BUCKEYE INSTITUTE FOR PUBLIC POLICY  
SOLUTIONS

88 E. Broad Street, Suite 1120

Columbus, OH 43215

Tel: (614) 224-4422

robert@buckeyeinstitute.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Buckeye Institute for  
Public Policy Solutions*

**CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE**

Pursuant to Rule 32(a)(7)(C) of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure and Circuit Rules 32(a)(1) and 32(a)(2)(C), I hereby certify that the foregoing Opening Brief of Petitioners on Core Legal Issues contains 21,745 words, as counted by a word processing system that includes headings, footnotes, quotations, and citations in the count, and therefore is within the word limit set by the Court.

Dated: February 19, 2016

/s/ Elbert Lin  
Elbert Lin

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that, on this 19th day of February 2016, a copy of the foregoing Opening Brief of Petitioners on Core Legal Issues was served electronically through the Court's CM/ECF system on all ECF-registered counsel.

/s/ Elbert Lin  
Elbert Lin

**ADDENDUM PURSUANT TO FEDERAL RULE OF APPELLATE  
PROCEDURE 32.1 AND CIRCUIT RULE 32.1(b)(3)**

(ORDER LIST: 577 U.S.)

TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 9, 2016

ORDER IN PENDING CASE

15A773 WEST VIRGINIA, ET AL. V EPA, ET AL.

The application for a stay submitted to The Chief Justice and by him referred to the Court is granted. The Environmental Protection Agency's "Carbon Pollution Emission Guidelines for Existing Stationary Sources: Electric Utility Generating Units," 80 Fed. Reg. 64,662 (October 23, 2015), is stayed pending disposition of the applicants' petitions for review in the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit and disposition of the applicants' petition for a writ of certiorari, if such writ is sought. If a writ of certiorari is sought and the Court denies the petition, this order shall terminate automatically. If the Court grants the petition for a writ of certiorari, this order shall terminate when the Court enters its judgment.

Justice Ginsburg, Justice Breyer, Justice Sotomayor, and Justice Kagan would deny the application.

(ORDER LIST: 577 U.S.)

TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 9, 2016

ORDER IN PENDING CASE

15A776 BASIN ELEC. POWER COOP., ET AL. V. EPA, ET AL.

The application for a stay submitted to The Chief Justice and by him referred to the Court is granted. The Environmental Protection Agency's "Carbon Pollution Emission Guidelines for Existing Stationary Sources: Electric Utility Generating Units," 80 Fed. Reg. 64,662 (October 23, 2015), is stayed pending disposition of the applicants' petitions for review in the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit and disposition of the applicants' petition for a writ of certiorari, if such writ is sought. If a writ of certiorari is sought and the Court denies the petition, this order shall terminate automatically. If the Court grants the petition for a writ of certiorari, this order shall terminate when the Court enters its judgment.

Justice Ginsburg, Justice Breyer, Justice Sotomayor, and Justice Kagan would deny the application.

(ORDER LIST: 577 U.S.)

TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 9, 2016

ORDER IN PENDING CASE

15A778 MURRAY ENERGY CORP., ET AL. V. EPA, ET AL.

The application for a stay submitted to The Chief Justice and by him referred to the Court is granted. The Environmental Protection Agency's "Carbon Pollution Emission Guidelines for Existing Stationary Sources: Electric Utility Generating Units," 80 Fed. Reg. 64,662 (October 23, 2015), is stayed pending disposition of the applicants' petitions for review in the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit and disposition of the applicants' petition for a writ of certiorari, if such writ is sought. If a writ of certiorari is sought and the Court denies the petition, this order shall terminate automatically. If the Court grants the petition for a writ of certiorari, this order shall terminate when the Court enters its judgment.

Justice Ginsburg, Justice Breyer, Justice Sotomayor, and Justice Kagan would deny the application.

(ORDER LIST: 577 U.S.)

TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 9, 2016

ORDER IN PENDING CASE

15A787 CHAMBER OF COMMERCE, ET AL. V. EPA, ET AL.

The application for a stay submitted to The Chief Justice and by him referred to the Court is granted. The Environmental Protection Agency's "Carbon Pollution Emission Guidelines for Existing Stationary Sources: Electric Utility Generating Units," 80 Fed. Reg. 64,662 (October 23, 2015), is stayed pending disposition of the applicants' petitions for review in the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit and disposition of the applicants' petition for a writ of certiorari, if such writ is sought. If a writ of certiorari is sought and the Court denies the petition, this order shall terminate automatically. If the Court grants the petition for a writ of certiorari, this order shall terminate when the Court enters its judgment.

Justice Ginsburg, Justice Breyer, Justice Sotomayor, and Justice Kagan would deny the application.



(ORDER LIST: 577 U.S.)

TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 9, 2016

ORDER IN PENDING CASE

15A793 NORTH DAKOTA V. EPA, ET AL.

The application for a stay submitted to The Chief Justice and by him referred to the Court is granted. The Environmental Protection Agency's "Carbon Pollution Emission Guidelines for Existing Stationary Sources: Electric Utility Generating Units," 80 Fed. Reg. 64,662 (October 23, 2015), is stayed pending disposition of the applicant's petition for review in the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit and disposition of the applicant's petition for a writ of certiorari, if such writ is sought. If a writ of certiorari is sought and the Court denies the petition, this order shall terminate automatically. If the Court grants the petition for a writ of certiorari, this order shall terminate when the Court enters its judgment.

Justice Ginsburg, Justice Breyer, Justice Sotomayor, and Justice Kagan would deny the application.

**ORAL ARGUMENT SCHEDULED FOR JUNE 2, 2016**

---

No. 15-1363 (and consolidated cases)

---

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT**

---

STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA, *et al.*,

*Petitioners,*

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY, *et al.*,

*Respondents.*

---

**On Petition for Review of Final Agency Action of the  
United States Environmental Protection Agency  
80 Fed. Reg. 64,662 (Oct. 23, 2015)**

---

**ADDENDUM PURSUANT TO CIRCUIT RULE 28(a)(5) TO  
OPENING BRIEF OF PETITIONERS ON CORE LEGAL ISSUES**

---

Ken Paxton  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
Charles E. Roy  
First Assistant Attorney General  
Scott A. Keller  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 12548  
Austin, TX 78711-2548  
Tel: (512) 936-1700  
scott.keller@texasattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Texas*

Patrick Morrissey  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WEST  
VIRGINIA  
Elbert Lin  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
J. Zak Ritchie  
Assistant Attorney General  
State Capitol Building 1, Room 26-E  
Charleston, WV 25305  
Tel: (304) 558-2021  
Fax: (304) 558-0140  
elbert.lin@wvago.gov

**DATED: February 19, 2016**

*Counsel for Petitioner State of West Virginia*

*Additional counsel listed on Opening Brief of Petitioners on Core Legal Issues filed concurrently*

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
<b><u>Statutes:</u></b>	
1 U.S.C. § 204(a) .....	ADD-001
2 U.S.C. §§ 285a-285g.....	ADD-003
16 U.S.C. § 824(a).....	ADD-008
16 U.S.C. § 824(b)(1) .....	ADD-008
16 U.S.C. § 824o(i)(2) .....	ADD-012
33 U.S.C. § 1316 .....	ADD-013
Clean Air Act § 111(d), 42 U.S.C. § 7411(d) (1989).....	ADD-016
Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7401, <i>et seq.</i> (2014)	
CAA § 108, 42 U.S.C. § 7408 .....	ADD-021
CAA § 109, 42 U.S.C. § 7409 .....	ADD-023
CAA § 110, 42 U.S.C. § 7410 .....	ADD-025
CAA § 111, 42 U.S.C. § 7411 .....	ADD-033
CAA § 112, 42 U.S.C. § 7412 .....	ADD-039
CAA § 165(a)(4), 42 U.S.C. § 7475(a)(4).....	ADD-069
CAA § 302(k), 42 U.S.C. § 7602(k).....	ADD-073
CAA § 307(b)(1), 42 U.S.C. § 7607(b)(1).....	ADD-077
CAA § 307(d)(9), 42 U.S.C. § 7607(d)(9).....	ADD-079
CAA § 403(a), 42 U.S.C. § 7651b(a) .....	ADD-085
CAA § 403(b), 42 U.S.C. § 7651b(b) .....	ADD-086

CAA § 403(d), 42 U.S.C. § 7651b(d) ..... ADD-086

CAA § 404, 42 U.S.C. § 7651c..... ADD-088

CAA § 405, 42 U.S.C. § 7651d ..... ADD-094

CAA § 406, 42 U.S.C. § 7651e..... ADD-099

**Regulations:**

40 C.F.R. § 60.15 ..... ADD-100

40 C.F.R. Part 60, Subpart B ..... ADD-102

    40 C.F.R. § 60.21 ..... ADD-102

    40 C.F.R. § 60.22..... ADD-103

    40 C.F.R. § 60.24..... ADD-105

40 C.F.R. § 60.32c(a)..... ADD-109

40 C.F.R. Part 60, Subpart UUUU ..... ADD-112

    40 C.F.R. § 60.5720 ..... ADD-113

    40 C.F.R. § 60.5740(a)(2)(i) ..... ADD-114

    40 C.F.R. § 60.5745(a)(7) ..... ADD-117

    40 C.F.R. § 60.5780(a)(5)(iii) ..... ADD-119

    40 C.F.R. § 60.5790(c)..... ADD-120

    40 C.F.R. § 60.5855 ..... ADD-124

    40 C.F.R. § 60.5880 ..... ADD-130

    40 C.F.R. Part 60, Subpart UUUU, Table1 ..... ADD-132

ity of section 1301(d) of Pub. L. 113-235, set out as a note under section 301 of Title 44, Public Printing and Documents.

EFFECTIVE DATE OF 1984 AMENDMENT

Amendment by Pub. L. 98-497 effective Apr. 1, 1985, see section 301 of Pub. L. 98-497, set out as a note under section 2102 of Title 44, Public Printing and Documents.

**§ 202. Preparation and publication of Codes and Supplements**

There shall be prepared and published under the supervision of the Committee on the Judiciary of the House of Representatives—

(a) Cumulative Supplements to Code of Laws of United States for each session of Congress.—A supplement for each session of the Congress to the then current edition of the Code of Laws of the United States, cumulatively embracing the legislation of the then current supplement, and correcting errors in such edition and supplement;

(b) Cumulative Supplement to District of Columbia Code for each session of Congress.—A supplement for each session of the Congress to the then current edition of the Code of the District of Columbia, cumulatively embracing the legislation of the then current supplement, and correcting errors in such edition and supplement;

(c) New editions of Codes and Supplements.—New editions of the Code of Laws of the United States and of the Code of the District of Columbia, correcting errors and incorporating the then current supplement. In the case of each code new editions shall not be published oftener than once in each five years. Copies of each such edition shall be distributed in the same manner as provided in the case of supplements to the code of which it is a new edition. Supplements published after any new edition shall not contain the legislation of supplements published before such new edition.

(July 30, 1947, ch. 388, 61 Stat. 637.)

CROSS REFERENCES

Council of the District of Columbia, functions respecting, see section 2 of Pub. L. 94-386, Aug. 14, 1976, 90 Stat. 1170, set out as a note under section 285b of Title 2, The Congress.

Office of the Law Revision Counsel, functions respecting preparation, revision, publication, etc., see section 285b of Title 2.

**§ 203. District of Columbia Code; preparation and publication; cumulative supplements**

The Committee on the Judiciary of the House of Representatives is authorized to print bills to codify, revise, and reenact the general and permanent laws relating to the District of Columbia and cumulative supplements thereto, similar in style, respectively, to the Code of Laws of the United States, and supplements thereto, and to so continue until final enactment thereof in both Houses of the Congress of the United States.

(July 30, 1947, ch. 388, 61 Stat. 638.)

COMMISSION ON REVISION OF THE CRIMINAL LAWS OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

Pub. L. 90-226, title X, Dec. 27, 1967, 81 Stat. 742, provided for creation and operation of a commission to

study and make recommendations with reference to a revised code of criminal law and procedure for the District of Columbia, prior to repeal by Pub. L. 91-358, title VI, §601, July 29, 1970, 84 Stat. 667, as amended by Pub. L. 91-530, §2(b)(1), Dec. 7, 1970, 84 Stat. 1390.

CROSS REFERENCES

Council of the District of Columbia, functions respecting, see section 2 of Pub. L. 94-386, Aug. 14, 1976, 90 Stat. 1170, set out as a note under section 285b of Title 2, The Congress.

Office of the Law Revision Counsel, functions respecting, see section 285b of Title 2.

**§ 204. Codes and Supplements as evidence of the laws of United States and District of Columbia; citation of Codes and Supplements**

In all courts, tribunals, and public offices of the United States, at home or abroad, of the District of Columbia, and of each State, Territory, or insular possession of the United States—

(a) United States Code.—The matter set forth in the edition of the Code of Laws of the United States current at any time shall, together with the then current supplement, if any, establish prima facie the laws of the United States, general and permanent in their nature, in force on the day preceding the commencement of the session following the last session of the legislation of which is included: *Provided, however,* That whenever titles of such Code shall have been enacted into positive law the text thereof shall be legal evidence of the laws therein contained, in all the courts of the United States, the several States, and the Territories and insular possessions of the United States.

(b) District of Columbia Code.—The matter set forth in the edition of the Code of the District of Columbia current at any time shall, together with the then current supplement, if any, establish prima facie the laws, general and permanent in their nature, relating to or in force in the District of Columbia on the day preceding the commencement of the session following the last session the legislation of which is included, except such laws as are of application in the District of Columbia by reason of being laws of the United States general and permanent in their nature.

(c) District of Columbia Code; citation.—The Code of the District of Columbia may be cited as “D.C. Code”.

(d) Supplements to Codes; citation.—Supplements to the Code of Laws of the United States and to the Code of the District of Columbia may be cited, respectively, as “U.S.C., Sup. ”, and “D.C. Code, Sup. ”, the blank in each case being filled with Roman figures denoting the number of the supplement.

(e) New edition of Codes; citation.—New editions of each of such codes may be cited, respectively, as “U.S.C., ed.”, and “D.C. Code, ed.”, the blank in each case being filled with figures denoting the last year the legislation of which is included in whole or in part.

(July 30, 1947, ch. 388, 61 Stat. 638.)

UNITED STATES CODE TITLES AS POSITIVE LAW

The following titles of the United States Code were enacted into positive law by the acts enumerated below:

Title 1, General Provisions—Act July 30, 1947, ch. 388, §1, 61 Stat. 633.

Title 3, The President—Act June 25, 1948, ch. 644, §1, 62 Stat. 672.

Title 4, Flag and Seal, Seat of Government, and the States—Act July 30, 1947, ch. 389, §1, 61 Stat. 641.

Title 5, Government Organization and Employees—Pub. L. 89-554, §1, Sept. 6, 1966, 80 Stat. 378.

Title 9, Arbitration—Act July 30, 1947, ch. 392, §1, 61 Stat. 669.

Title 10, Armed Forces—Act Aug. 10, 1956, ch. 1041, §1, 70A Stat. 1.

Title 11, Bankruptcy—Pub. L. 95-598, title I, §101, Nov. 6, 1978, 92 Stat. 2549.

Title 13, Census—Act Aug. 31, 1954, ch. 1158, 68 Stat. 1012.

Title 14, Coast Guard—Act Aug. 4, 1949, ch. 393, §1, 63 Stat. 495.

Title 17, Copyrights—Act July 30, 1947, ch. 391, §1, 61 Stat. 652, as amended Oct. 19, 1976, Pub. L. 94-553, title I, §101, 90 Stat. 2541.

Title 18, Crimes and Criminal Procedure—Act June 25, 1948, ch. 645, §1, 62 Stat. 683.

Title 23, Highways—Pub. L. 85-767, §1, Aug. 27, 1958, 72 Stat. 885.

Title 28, Judiciary and Judicial Procedure—Act June 25, 1948, ch. 646, §1, 62 Stat. 869.

Title 31, Money and Finance—Pub. L. 97-258, §1, Sept. 13, 1982, 96 Stat. 877.

Title 32, National Guard—Act Aug. 10, 1956, ch. 1041, §2, 70A Stat. 596.

Title 34, Navy—See Title 10, Armed Forces.

Title 35, Patents—Act July 19, 1952, ch. 950, §1, 66 Stat. 792.

Title 36, Patriotic and National Observances, Ceremonies, and Organizations—Pub. L. 105-225, §1, Aug. 12, 1998, 112 Stat. 1253.

Title 37, Pay and Allowances of the Uniformed Services—Pub. L. 87-649, §1, Sept. 7, 1962, 76 Stat. 451.

Title 38, Veterans' Benefits—Pub. L. 85-857, §1, Sept. 2, 1958, 72 Stat. 1105.

Title 39, Postal Service—Pub. L. 86-682, §1, Sept. 2, 1960, 74 Stat. 578, as revised Pub. L. 91-375, §2, Aug. 12, 1970, 84 Stat. 719.

Title 40, Public Buildings, Property, and Works—Pub. L. 107-217, §1, Aug. 21, 2002, 116 Stat. 1062.

Title 41, Public Contracts—Pub. L. 111-350, §3, Jan. 4, 2011, 124 Stat. 3677.

Title 44, Public Printing and Documents—Pub. L. 90-620, §1, Oct. 22, 1968, 82 Stat. 1238.

Title 46, Shipping—Pub. L. 98-89, §1, Aug. 26, 1983, 97 Stat. 500; Pub. L. 99-509, title V, subtitle B, §5101, Oct. 21, 1986, 100 Stat. 1913; Pub. L. 100-424, §6, Sept. 9, 1988, 102 Stat. 1591; Pub. L. 100-710, title I, §102, Nov. 23, 1988, 102 Stat. 4738; Pub. L. 109-304, Oct. 6, 2006, 120 Stat. 1485.

Title 49, Transportation—Pub. L. 95-473, §1, Oct. 17, 1978, 92 Stat. 1337; Pub. L. 97-449, §1, Jan. 12, 1983, 96 Stat. 2413; Pub. L. 103-272, §1, July 5, 1994, 108 Stat. 745.

Title 51, National and Commercial Space Programs—Pub. L. 111-314, §3, Dec. 18, 2010, 124 Stat. 3328.

Title 54, National Park Service and Related Programs—Pub. L. 113-287, §3, Dec. 19, 2014, 128 Stat. 3094.

#### TITLE 26, INTERNAL REVENUE CODE

The Internal Revenue Code of 1954 was enacted in the form of a separate code by act Aug. 16, 1954, ch. 736, 68A Stat. 1. Pub. L. 99-514, §2(a), Oct. 22, 1986, 100 Stat. 2095, provided that the Internal Revenue Title enacted Aug. 16, 1954, as heretofore, hereby, or hereafter amended, may be cited as the "Internal Revenue Code of 1986". The sections of Title 26, United States Code, are identical to the sections of the Internal Revenue Code.

#### § 205. Codes and Supplement; where printed; form and style; ancillaries

The publications provided for in sections 202, 203 of this title shall be printed at the Government Publishing Office and shall be in such form and style and with such ancillaries as may be prescribed by the Committee on the Judiciary of

the House of Representatives. The Librarian of Congress is directed to cooperate with such committee in the preparation of such ancillaries. Such publications shall be furnished with such thumb insets and other devices to distinguish parts, with such facilities for the insertion of additional matter, and with such explanatory and advertising slips, and shall be printed on such paper and bound in such material, as may be prescribed by such committee.

(July 30, 1947, ch. 388, 61 Stat. 639; Pub. L. 113-235, div. H, title I, §1301(b), Dec. 16, 2014, 128 Stat. 2537.)

#### CHANGE OF NAME

"Government Publishing Office" substituted for "Government Printing Office" in text on authority of section 1301(b) of Pub. L. 113-235, set out as a note preceding section 301 of Title 44, Public Printing and Documents.

#### § 206. Bills and resolutions of Committee on the Judiciary of House of Representatives; form and style; ancillaries; curtailment of copies

All bills and resolutions relating to the revision of the laws referred to or reported by the Committee on the Judiciary of the House of Representatives shall be printed in such form and style, and with such ancillaries, as such committee may prescribe as being economical and suitable, to so continue until final enactment thereof in both Houses of Congress; and such committee may also curtail the number of copies of such bills to be printed in the various parliamentary stages in the House of Representatives.

(July 30, 1947, ch. 388, 61 Stat. 639.)

#### § 207. Copies of acts and resolutions in slip form; additional number printed for Committee on the Judiciary of House of Representatives

The Director of the Government Publishing Office is directed to print, in addition to the number provided by existing law, and, as soon as printed, to distribute in such manner as the Committee on the Judiciary of the House of Representatives shall determine, twenty copies in slip form of each public act and joint resolution.

(July 30, 1947, ch. 388, 61 Stat. 639; Pub. L. 113-235, div. H, title I, §1301(d), Dec. 16, 2014, 128 Stat. 2537.)

#### CHANGE OF NAME

"Director of the Government Publishing Office" substituted for "Public Printer" in text on authority of section 1301(d) of Pub. L. 113-235, set out as a note under section 301 of Title 44, Public Printing and Documents.

#### § 208. Delegation of function of Committee on the Judiciary to other agencies; printing, and so forth, under direction of Joint Committee on Printing

The functions vested by sections 201, 202, 204-207 of this title in the Committee on the Judiciary of the House of Representatives may from time to time be vested in such other agency as the Congress may by concurrent resolution provide: *Provided*, That the printing, binding,



AMENDMENTS

1971—Pub. L. 92-51 substituted provision for Legislative Counsel to send official mail matter of the Office as franked mail under section 3210 of title 39, for former provision granting the Office the same privilege of free transmission of official mail matter as other offices of the United States Government.

**§ 282e. Authorization of appropriations**

There are authorized to be appropriated, for the fiscal year ending June 30, 1971, and for each fiscal year thereafter, such sums as may be necessary to carry out this subchapter and to increase the efficiency of the Office and the quality of the services which it provides.

(Pub. L. 91-510, title V, § 526, Oct. 26, 1970, 84 Stat. 1203.)

**CHAPTER 9A—OFFICE OF LAW REVISION  
COUNSEL**

Sec.	
285.	Establishment.
285a.	Purpose and policy.
285b.	Functions.
285c.	Law Revision Counsel.
285d.	Staff; Deputy Law Revision Counsel; delegation of functions.
285e.	Compensation.
285f.	Expenditures.
285g.	Availability of applicable accounts of House.

**§ 285. Establishment**

There is established in the House of Representatives an office to be known as the Office of the Law Revision Counsel, referred to hereinafter in this chapter as the "Office".

(Pub. L. 93-554, title I, ch. III, § 101, Dec. 27, 1974, 88 Stat. 1777.)

CODIFICATION

Section is based on section 205(a) of House Resolution No. 988, Ninety-third Congress, Oct. 8, 1974, which was enacted into permanent law by Pub. L. 93-554.

EFFECTIVE DATE

Pub. L. 93-554, title I, ch. III, Dec. 27, 1974, 88 Stat. 1777, provided that the enactment of House Resolution No. 988, Ninety-third Congress, Oct. 8, 1974, into permanent law is effective on Jan. 2, 1975. This chapter is derived from enactment into permanent law of section 205 of House Resolution No. 988.

**§ 285a. Purpose and policy**

The principal purpose of the Office shall be to develop and keep current an official and positive codification of the laws of the United States. The Office shall maintain impartiality as to issues of legislative policy to be determined by the House.

(Pub. L. 93-554, title I, ch. III, § 101, Dec. 27, 1974, 88 Stat. 1777.)

CODIFICATION

Section is based on section 205(b) of House Resolution No. 988, Ninety-third Congress, Oct. 8, 1974, which was enacted into permanent law by Pub. L. 93-554.

**§ 285b. Functions**

The functions of the Office shall be as follows:

(1) To prepare, and submit to the Committee on the Judiciary one title at a time, a com-

plete compilation, restatement, and revision of the general and permanent laws of the United States which conforms to the understood policy, intent, and purpose of the Congress in the original enactments, with such amendments and corrections as will remove ambiguities, contradictions, and other imperfections both of substance and of form, separately stated, with a view to the enactment of each title as positive law.

(2) To examine periodically all of the public laws enacted by the Congress and submit to the Committee on the Judiciary recommendations for the repeal of obsolete, superfluous, and superseded provisions contained therein.

(3) To prepare and publish periodically a new edition of the United States Code (including those titles which are not yet enacted into positive law as well as those titles which have been so enacted), with annual cumulative supplements reflecting newly enacted laws.

(4) To classify newly enacted provisions of law to their proper positions in the Code where the titles involved have not yet been enacted into positive law.

(5) To prepare and submit periodically such revisions in the titles of the Code which have been enacted into positive law as may be necessary to keep such titles current.

(6) To prepare and publish periodically new editions of the District of Columbia Code, with annual cumulative supplements reflecting newly enacted laws, through publication of the fifth annual cumulative supplement to the 1973 edition of such Code.

(7) To provide the Committee on the Judiciary with such advice and assistance as the committee may request in carrying out its functions with respect to the revision and codification of the Federal statutes.

(Pub. L. 93-554, title I, ch. III, § 101, Dec. 27, 1974, 88 Stat. 1777; Pub. L. 94-386, § 1, Aug. 14, 1976, 90 Stat. 1170.)

CODIFICATION

Section is based on section 205(c) of House Resolution No. 988, Ninety-third Congress, Oct. 8, 1974, which was enacted into permanent law by Pub. L. 93-554.

AMENDMENTS

1976—Par. (6). Pub. L. 94-386 substituted "through publication of the fifth annual cumulative supplement to the 1973 edition of such Code" for "until such time as the District of Columbia Self-Government and Governmental Reorganization Act becomes effective".

PREPARATION AND PUBLICATION OF DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CODE UNDER DIRECTION OF COUNCIL OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

Pub. L. 94-386, § 2, Aug. 14, 1976, 90 Stat. 1170, provided that:

"(a) After publication by the Law Revision Counsel of the fifth annual cumulative supplement to the 1973 edition of the District of Columbia Code, new editions of the District of Columbia Code (and annual cumulative supplements thereto) shall be prepared and published under the direction of the Council of the District of Columbia and shall set forth the general and permanent laws relating to or in force in the District of Columbia, whether enacted by the Congress or by the Council of the District of Columbia, except such laws as are of application in the District of Columbia by reason of being laws of the United States general and permanent in nature.

“(b) After completion of the printing of the fifth annual cumulative supplement to the 1973 edition of the District of Columbia Code, the Public Printer [now Director of the Government Publishing Office] shall, as the Council of the District of Columbia may request, either—

“(1) furnish to the Council of the District of Columbia, on such terms as the Public Printer [now Director of the Government Publishing Office] (in consultation with the Joint Committee on Printing) deems appropriate, the type used in preparing the 1973 edition of the District of Columbia Code and the fifth annual cumulative supplement to such edition; or

“(2) make such arrangements with the Council of the District of Columbia as the Public Printer [now Director of the Government Publishing Office] (in consultation with the Joint Committee on Printing) deems appropriate for the printing by the Government Printing Office [now Government Publishing Office] of future editions of the District of Columbia Code, and annual cumulative supplements thereto, prepared under the direction of the Council of the District of Columbia.”

#### § 285c. Law Revision Counsel

The management, supervision, and administration of the Office are vested in the Law Revision Counsel, who shall be appointed by the Speaker without regard to political affiliation and solely on the basis of fitness to perform the duties of the position. Any person so appointed shall serve at the pleasure of the Speaker.

(Pub. L. 93-554, title I, ch. III, §101, Dec. 27, 1974, 88 Stat. 1777.)

#### CODIFICATION

Section is based on section 205(d) of House Resolution No. 988, Ninety-third Congress, Oct. 8, 1974, which was enacted into permanent law by Pub. L. 93-554.

#### § 285d. Staff; Deputy Law Revision Counsel; delegation of functions

(1) With the approval of the Speaker, or in accordance with policies and procedures approved by the Speaker, the Law Revision Counsel shall appoint such employees as may be necessary for the prompt and efficient performance of the functions of the Office. Any such appointment shall be made without regard to political affiliation and solely on the basis of fitness to perform the duties of the position. Any person so appointed may be removed by the Law Revision Counsel with the approval of the Speaker, or in accordance with policies and procedures approved by the Speaker.

(2)(A) One of the employees appointed under paragraph (1) shall be designated by the Law Revision Counsel as Deputy Law Revision Counsel. During the absence or disability of the Law Revision Counsel, or when the office is vacant, the Deputy Law Revision Counsel shall perform the functions of the Law Revision Counsel.

(B) The Law Revision Counsel may delegate to the Deputy Law Revision Counsel and to other employees appointed under paragraph (1) such of his or her functions as he or she considers necessary or appropriate.

(Pub. L. 93-554, title I, ch. III, §101, Dec. 27, 1974, 88 Stat. 1777.)

#### CODIFICATION

Section is based on section 205(e) of House Resolution No. 988, Ninety-third Congress, Oct. 8, 1974, which was enacted into permanent law by Pub. L. 93-554.

#### § 285e. Compensation

The Law Revision Counsel shall be paid at a per annum gross rate not to exceed level IV of the Executive Schedule of section 5315 of title 5; and members of the staff of the Office other than the Law Revision Counsel shall be paid at per annum gross rates fixed by the Law Revision Counsel with the approval of the Speaker or in accordance with policies approved by the Speaker, but not in excess of a per annum gross rate equal to level V of such schedule.

(Pub. L. 93-554, title I, ch. III, §101, Dec. 27, 1974, 88 Stat. 1777.)

#### CODIFICATION

Section is based on section 205(f) of House Resolution No. 988, Ninety-third Congress, Oct. 8, 1974, which was enacted into permanent law by Pub. L. 93-554.

#### INCREASES IN COMPENSATION

Increases in compensation for House officers and employees under authority of Federal Salary Act of 1967 (Pub. L. 90-206), Federal Pay Comparability Act of 1970 (Pub. L. 91-656), and Legislative Branch Appropriations Act, 1988 (Pub. L. 100-202), see sections 4531 and 4532 of this title, and Salary Directives of Speaker of the House, set out as notes under those sections.

#### § 285f. Expenditures

In accordance with policies and procedures approved by the Speaker, the Law Revision Counsel is authorized to make such expenditures as may be necessary or appropriate for the functioning of the Office.

(Pub. L. 93-554, title I, ch. III, §101, Dec. 27, 1974, 88 Stat. 1777.)

#### CODIFICATION

Section is based on section 205(g) of House Resolution No. 988, Ninety-third Congress, Oct. 8, 1974, which was enacted into permanent law by Pub. L. 93-554.

#### § 285g. Availability of applicable accounts of House

Until such time as funds are appropriated by law to carry out the purpose of this chapter, the applicable accounts of the House of Representatives shall be available for such purpose.

(Pub. L. 93-554, title I, ch. III, §101, Dec. 27, 1974, 88 Stat. 1777; Pub. L. 104-186, title II, §207, Aug. 20, 1996, 110 Stat. 1742.)

#### CODIFICATION

Section is based on section 205(h) of House Resolution No. 988, Ninety-third Congress, Oct. 8, 1974, which was enacted into permanent law by Pub. L. 93-554.

#### AMENDMENTS

1996—Pub. L. 104-186 substituted “applicable accounts of the House of Representatives” for “contingent fund of the House”.

#### CHAPTER 9B—LEGISLATIVE CLASSIFICATION OFFICE

#### §§ 286 to 286g. Repealed. Pub. L. 104-186, title II, § 208, Aug. 20, 1996, 110 Stat. 1742

Section 286, based on H. Res. No. 988, §203(a), Ninety-third Congress, Oct. 8, 1974, enacted into permanent law by Pub. L. 93-554, title I, ch. III, §101, Dec. 27, 1974, 88 Stat. 1777, established Legislative Classification Office in House of Representatives.



(Aug. 15, 1914, ch. 253, § 3, 38 Stat. 692.)

**§ 784. Jurisdiction of prosecutions**

Any violation of the provisions of this chapter shall be prosecuted in the district court of the United States of the district wherein the offender is found or into which he is first brought.

(Aug. 15, 1914, ch. 253, § 4, 38 Stat. 692.)

**§ 785. Enforcement of law prohibiting taking of sponges of specified sizes; employment of Coast Guard vessels and Customs Service employees**

The Secretary of Commerce shall enforce the provisions of this chapter, and he is authorized to empower such officers and employees of the Department of Commerce as he may designate, or such officers and employees of other departments as may be detailed for the purpose, to make arrests and seize vessels and sponges, and upon his request the Secretary of the Treasury may employ the vessels of the Coast Guard or the employees of the Customs Service to that end.

(Aug. 15, 1914, ch. 253, § 5, 38 Stat. 692; Jan. 28, 1915, ch. 20, § 1, 38 Stat. 800; 1939 Reorg. Plan No. II, § 4(e), eff. July 1, 1939, 4 F.R. 2731, 53 Stat. 1431; Aug. 4, 1949, ch. 393, §§ 1, 20, 63 Stat. 495, 561; 1970 Reorg. Plan No. 4, eff. Oct. 3, 1970, 35 F.R. 15627, 84 Stat. 2090.)

TRANSFER OF FUNCTIONS

For transfer of authorities, functions, personnel, and assets of the Coast Guard, including the authorities and functions of the Secretary of Transportation relating thereto, to the Department of Homeland Security, and for treatment of related references, see sections 468(b), 551(d), 552(d), and 557 of Title 6, Domestic Security, and the Department of Homeland Security Reorganization Plan of November 25, 2002, as modified, set out as a note under section 542 of Title 6.

For transfer of functions, personnel, assets, and liabilities of the United States Customs Service of the Department of the Treasury, including functions of the Secretary of the Treasury relating thereto, to the Secretary of Homeland Security, and for treatment of related references, see sections 203(l), 551(d), 552(d), and 557 of Title 6, Domestic Security, and the Department of Homeland Security Reorganization Plan of November 25, 2002, as modified, set out as a note under section 542 of Title 6.

“Secretary of Commerce” and “Department of Commerce” substituted in text for “Secretary of the Interior” and “Department of the Interior” in view of: creation of National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration in Department of Commerce and Office of Administrator of such Administration; abolition of Bureau of Commercial Fisheries in Department of the Interior and Office of Director of such Bureau; transfers of functions, including functions formerly vested by law in Secretary of the Interior or Department of the Interior which were administered through Bureau of Commercial Fisheries or were primarily related to such Bureau, exclusive of certain enumerated functions with respect to Great Lakes fishery research, Missouri River Reservoir research, Gulf Breeze Biological Laboratory, and Trans-Alaska pipeline investigations; and transfer of marine sport fish program of Bureau of Sport Fisheries and Wildlife by Reorg. Plan No. 4 of 1970, eff. Oct. 3, 1970, 35 F.R. 15627, 84 Stat. 2090, set out in the Appendix to Title 5, Government Organization and Employees.

For transfer of functions of other officers, employees, and agencies of Department of the Interior, with cer-

tain exceptions, to Secretary of the Interior, with power to delegate, see Reorg. Plan No. 3 of 1950, §§ 1, 2, eff. May 24, 1950, 15 F.R. 3174, 64 Stat. 1262, set out in the Appendix to Title 5.

“Coast Guard” substituted in text for “Revenue Cutter Service” on authority of act Jan. 28, 1915, which combined Revenue Cutter Service and Life-Saving Service to form Coast Guard. That act was repealed by section 20 of act Aug. 4, 1949, section 1 of which reestablished Coast Guard by enacting Title 14, Coast Guard.

Coast Guard transferred to Department of Transportation and all functions, powers, and duties, relating to Coast Guard, of Secretary of the Treasury and of other offices and officers of Department of the Treasury transferred to Secretary of Transportation by section 6(b)(1) of Pub. L. 89-670, Oct. 15, 1966, 80 Stat. 938. See section 108 of Title 49, Transportation.

Functions of all officers of Department of the Treasury, and functions of all agencies and employees of such Department, transferred, with certain exceptions, to Secretary of the Treasury, with power vested in him to authorize their performance or performance of any of his functions, by any of such officers, agencies, and employees, by Reorg. Plan No. 26 of 1950, §§ 1, 2, eff. July 31, 1950, 15 F.R. 4935, 64 Stat. 1280, 1281, set out in the Appendix to Title 5. Customs Service, referred to in this section, was a service under Department of the Treasury, and Coast Guard, also referred to in this section, was generally a service under such Department, but such Plan excepted, from transfer, functions of Coast Guard, and of Commandant thereof, when Coast Guard was operating as a part of the Navy under sections 1 and 3 of Title 14, Coast Guard.

Reorg. Plan No. III of 1940, § 3, eff. June 30, 1940, 5 F.R. 2108, 54 Stat. 1232, set out in the Appendix to Title 5, Government Organization and Employees, consolidated Bureau of Fisheries and Bureau of Biological Survey with their respective functions into one agency in Department of the Interior to be known as Fish and Wildlife Service, and provided that functions of the consolidated agency shall be administered under direction and supervision of Secretary of the Interior.

Reorg. Plan No. II of 1930, set out in the Appendix to Title 5, transferred Bureau of Fisheries in Department of Commerce and its functions to Department of the Interior, to be administered under direction and supervision of Secretary of the Interior.

**CHAPTER 12—FEDERAL REGULATION AND DEVELOPMENT OF POWER**

**SUBCHAPTER I—REGULATION OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF WATER POWER AND RESOURCES**

Sec.	
791.	Repealed.
791a.	Short title.
792.	Federal Power Commission; creation; number; appointment; term; qualifications; vacancies; quorum; chairman; salary; place of holding sessions.
793.	Appointment of officers and employees of Commission; duties, and salaries; detail of officers and employees from other departments; expenditures authorized.
793a to 795.	Repealed or Omitted.
796.	Definitions.
797.	General powers of Commission.
797a.	Congressional authorization for permits, licenses, leases, or authorizations for dams, conduits, reservoirs, etc., within national parks or monuments.
797b.	Duty to keep Congress fully and currently informed.
797c.	Dams in National Park System units.
797d.	Third party contracting by FERC.
798.	Purpose and scope of preliminary permits; transfer and cancellation.
799.	License; duration, conditions, revocation, alteration, or surrender.

Sec.		Sec.	
800.	Issuance of preliminary permits or licenses.	824k.	Orders requiring interconnection or wheeling.
801.	Transfer of license; obligations of transferee.	824l.	Information requirements.
802.	Information to accompany application for license; landowner notification.	824m.	Sales by exempt wholesale generators.
803.	Conditions of license generally.	824n.	Repealed.
804.	Project works affecting navigable waters; requirements insertable in license.	824o.	Electric reliability.
805.	Participation by Government in costs of locks, etc.	824p.	Siting of interstate electric transmission facilities.
806.	Time limit for construction of project works; extension of time; termination or revocation of licenses for delay.	824q.	Native load service obligation.
807.	Right of Government to take over project works.	824r.	Protection of transmission contracts in the Pacific Northwest.
808.	New licenses and renewals.	824s.	Transmission infrastructure investment.
809.	Temporary use by Government of project works for national safety; compensation for use.	824t.	Electricity market transparency rules.
810.	Disposition of charges arising from licenses.	824u.	Prohibition on filing false information.
811.	Operation of navigation facilities; rules and regulations; penalties.	824v.	Prohibition of energy market manipulation.
812.	Public-service licensee; regulations by State or by commission as to service, rates, charges, etc.	824w.	Joint boards on economic dispatch.
813.	Power entering into interstate commerce; regulation of rates, charges, etc.	SUBCHAPTER III—LICENSEES AND PUBLIC UTILITIES; PROCEDURAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE PROVISIONS	
814.	Exercise by licensee of power of eminent domain.	825.	Accounts and records.
815.	Contract to furnish power extending beyond period of license; obligations of new licensee.	825a.	Rates of depreciation; notice to State authorities before fixing.
816.	Preservation of rights vested prior to June 10, 1920.	825b.	Requirements applicable to agencies of United States.
817.	Projects not affecting navigable waters; necessity for Federal license, permit or right-of-way; unauthorized activities.	825c.	Periodic and special reports; obstructing filing reports or keeping accounts, etc.
818.	Public lands included in project; reservation of lands from entry.	825d.	Officials dealing in securities.
819.	Repealed.	825e.	Complaints.
820.	Proceedings for revocation of license or to prevent violations of license.	825f.	Investigations by Commission.
821.	State laws and water rights unaffected.	825g.	Hearings; rules of procedure.
822.	Reservation of right to alter or repeal chapter.	825h.	Administrative powers of Commission; rules, regulations, and orders.
823.	Repeal of inconsistent laws.	825i.	Appointment of officers and employees; compensation.
823a.	Conduit hydroelectric facilities.	825j.	Investigations relating to electric energy; reports to Congress.
823b.	Enforcement.	825k.	Publication and sale of reports.
823c.	Alaska State jurisdiction over small hydroelectric projects.	825l.	Review of orders.
823d.	Alternative conditions and prescriptions.	825m.	Enforcement provisions.
SUBCHAPTER II—REGULATION OF ELECTRIC UTILITY COMPANIES ENGAGED IN INTERSTATE COMMERCE		825n.	Forfeiture for violations; recovery; applicability.
824.	Declaration of policy; application of subchapter.	825o.	Penalties for violations; applicability of section.
824a.	Interconnection and coordination of facilities; emergencies; transmission to foreign countries.	825o-1.	Enforcement of certain provisions.
824a-1.	Pooling.	825p.	Jurisdiction of offenses; enforcement of liabilities and duties.
824a-2.	Reliability.	825q.	Repealed.
824a-3.	Cogeneration and small power production.	825q-1.	Office of Public Participation.
824a-4.	Seasonal diversity electricity exchange.	825r.	Separability.
824b.	Disposition of property; consolidations; purchase of securities.	825s.	Sale of electric power from reservoir projects; rate schedules; preference in sale; construction of transmission lines; disposition of moneys.
824c.	Issuance of securities; assumption of liabilities.	825s-1.	Southwestern area sale and transmission of electric power; disposition of receipts; creation of continuing fund; use of fund.
824d.	Rates and charges; schedules; suspension of new rates; automatic adjustment clauses.	825s-2.	Southeastern area sale and transmission of electric power; disposition of receipts; creation of continuing fund; use of fund.
824e.	Power of Commission to fix rates and charges; determination of cost of production or transmission.	825s-3.	Southwestern area sale at uniform system-wide rates of electric power over transmission lines constructed with appropriated funds or used under contractual arrangements.
824f.	Ordering furnishing of adequate service.	825s-4.	Southwestern Power Administration; deposit and availability of advance payments.
824g.	Ascertainment of cost of property and depreciation.	825s-5.	Southeastern Power Administration; deposit and availability of advance payments.
824h.	References to State boards by Commission.	825s-6.	Southeastern Power Administration; deposit and availability of discretionary offsetting collections.
824i.	Interconnection authority.	825s-7.	Southwestern Power Administration; deposit and availability of discretionary offsetting collections.
824j.	Wheeling authority.	825t.	Utilization of power revenues.
824j-1.	Open access by unregulated transmitting utilities.	825u.	Interest rate on power bonds held by Administrator of General Services.
		SUBCHAPTER IV—STATE AND MUNICIPAL WATER CONSERVATION FACILITIES	
		828.	Facilitation of development and construction of water conservation facilities; exemption from certain Federal requirements.

- Sec.  
828a. Definitions.  
828b. Exemption from formula, books and records, and project cost statement requirements; annual charges.  
828c. Applicability of this subchapter.

## FINDINGS

Pub. L. 113–23, § 2, Aug. 9, 2013, 127 Stat. 493, provided that: “Congress finds that—

“(1) the hydropower industry currently employs approximately 300,000 workers across the United States;“(2) hydropower is the largest source of clean, renewable electricity in the United States;

“(3) as of the date of enactment of this Act [Aug. 9, 2013], hydropower resources, including pumped storage facilities, provide—

“(A) nearly 7 percent of the electricity generated in the United States; and

“(B) approximately 100,000 megawatts of electric capacity in the United States;

“(4) only 3 percent of the 80,000 dams in the United States generate electricity, so there is substantial potential for adding hydropower generation to non-powered dams; and

“(5) according to one study, by utilizing currently untapped resources, the United States could add approximately 60,000 megawatts of new hydropower capacity by 2025, which could create 700,000 new jobs over the next 13 years.”

## SUBCHAPTER I—REGULATION OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF WATER POWER AND RESOURCES

## CODIFICATION

Section 212 of act of Aug. 26, 1935, ch. 687, 49 Stat. 847, provided that sections 1 to 29 of the Federal Water Power Act, as amended (sections 792, 793, 794 to 797, 798 to 818, 819, and 820 to 823 of this title) shall constitute part I of the act. Said section 212 also repealed sections 25 and 30 of the act (sections 819, 791 of this title). It also contained a proviso as follows: “That nothing in that Act, as amended, shall be construed to repeal or amend the provisions of the amendment to the Federal Water Power Act approved March 3, 1921 (41 Stat. 1353 [section 797a of this title]), or the provisions of any other Act relating to national parks and national monuments.”

**§ 791. Repealed. Aug. 26, 1935, ch. 687, title II, § 212, 49 Stat. 847**

Section, act June 10, 1920, ch. 285, § 30, 41 Stat. 1077, designated the act as The Federal Water Power Act.

**§ 791a. Short title**

This chapter may be cited as the “Federal Power Act”.

(June 10, 1920, ch. 285, pt. III, § 321, formerly § 320, as added Aug. 26, 1935, ch. 687, title II, § 213, 49 Stat. 863; renumbered Pub. L. 95–617, title II, § 212, Nov. 9, 1978, 92 Stat. 3148.)

## CODIFICATION

Section was enacted as part of part III of the Federal Power Act, and not as part of part I of that Act which comprises this subchapter.

## SHORT TITLE OF 2013 AMENDMENT

Pub. L. 113–23, § 1(a), Aug. 9, 2013, 127 Stat. 493, provided that: “This Act [amending sections 798, 823a, and 2705 of this title and enacting provisions set out as notes preceding section 791 and under section 797 of this title] may be cited as the ‘Hydropower Regulatory Efficiency Act of 2013.’”

## SHORT TITLE OF 1990 AMENDMENT

Pub. L. 101–575, § 1, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2834, provided that: “This Act [enacting section 2243 of Title 42,

The Public Health and Welfare, amending sections 796 and 824a–3 of this title and sections 2014, 2061, 2201, and 2284 of Title 42, and enacting provisions set out as a note under section 796 of this title] may be cited as the ‘Solar, Wind, Waste, and Geothermal Power Production Incentives Act of 1990.’”

## SHORT TITLE OF 1988 AMENDMENT

Pub. L. 100–473, § 1, Oct. 6, 1988, 102 Stat. 2299, provided that: “This Act [amending section 824e of this title and enacting provisions set out as notes under section 824e of this title] may be cited as the ‘Regulatory Fairness Act.’”

## SHORT TITLE OF 1986 AMENDMENT

Pub. L. 99–495, § 1(a), Oct. 16, 1986, 100 Stat. 1243, provided that: “This Act [enacting sections 797b and 823b of this title, amending sections 797, 800, 802, 803, 807, 808, 817, 823a, 824a–3, and 824j of this title, and enacting provisions set out as notes under sections 797, 803, 823a, 824a–3, and 825h of this title] may be cited as the ‘Electric Consumers Protection Act of 1986.’”

**§ 792. Federal Power Commission; creation; number; appointment; term; qualifications; vacancies; quorum; chairman; salary; place of holding sessions**

A commission is created and established to be known as the Federal Power Commission (hereinafter referred to as the “commission”) which shall be composed of five commissioners who shall be appointed by the President, by and with the advice and consent of the Senate, one of whom shall be designated by the President as chairman and shall be the principal executive officer of the commission. Each chairman, when so designated, shall act as such until the expiration of his term of office.

The commissioners first appointed under this section, as amended, shall continue in office for terms of one, two, three, four, and five years, respectively, from June 23, 1930, the term of each to be designated by the President at the time of nomination. Their successors shall be appointed each for a term of five years from the date of the expiration of the term for which his predecessor was appointed and until his successor is appointed and has qualified, except that he shall not so continue to serve beyond the expiration of the next session of Congress subsequent to the expiration of said fixed term of office, and except that any person appointed to fill a vacancy occurring prior to the expiration of the term for which his predecessor was appointed shall be appointed only for the unexpired term. Not more than three of the commissioners shall be appointed from the same political party. No person in the employ of or holding any official relation to any licensee or to any person, firm, association, or corporation engaged in the generation, transmission, distribution, or sale of power, or owning stock or bonds thereof, or who is in any manner pecuniarily interested therein, shall enter upon the duties of or hold the office of commissioner. Said commissioners shall not engage in any other business, vocation, or employment. No vacancy in the commission shall impair the right of the remaining commissioners to exercise all the powers of the commission. Three members of the commission shall constitute a quorum for the transaction of business, and the commission shall have an official seal of which judicial notice shall be taken. The



as may be available to the Secretary, including information voluntarily provided in a timely manner by the applicant and others. The Secretary shall also submit, together with the aforementioned written statement, all studies, data, and other factual information available to the Secretary and relevant to the Secretary's decision.

(5) If the Commission finds that the Secretary's final prescription would be inconsistent with the purposes of this subchapter, or other applicable law, the Commission may refer the dispute to the Commission's Dispute Resolution Service. The Dispute Resolution Service shall consult with the Secretary and the Commission and issue a non-binding advisory within 90 days. The Secretary may accept the Dispute Resolution Service advisory unless the Secretary finds that the recommendation will not adequately protect the fish resources. The Secretary shall submit the advisory and the Secretary's final written determination into the record of the Commission's proceeding.

(June 10, 1920, ch. 285, pt. I, § 33, as added Pub. L. 109-58, title II, § 241(c), Aug. 8, 2005, 119 Stat. 675.)

#### SUBCHAPTER II—REGULATION OF ELECTRIC UTILITY COMPANIES ENGAGED IN INTERSTATE COMMERCE

##### § 824. Declaration of policy; application of subchapter

###### (a) Federal regulation of transmission and sale of electric energy

It is declared that the business of transmitting and selling electric energy for ultimate distribution to the public is affected with a public interest, and that Federal regulation of matters relating to generation to the extent provided in this subchapter and subchapter III of this chapter and of that part of such business which consists of the transmission of electric energy in interstate commerce and the sale of such energy at wholesale in interstate commerce is necessary in the public interest, such Federal regulation, however, to extend only to those matters which are not subject to regulation by the States.

###### (b) Use or sale of electric energy in interstate commerce

(1) The provisions of this subchapter shall apply to the transmission of electric energy in interstate commerce and to the sale of electric energy at wholesale in interstate commerce, but except as provided in paragraph (2) shall not apply to any other sale of electric energy or deprive a State or State commission of its lawful authority now exercised over the exportation of hydroelectric energy which is transmitted across a State line. The Commission shall have jurisdiction over all facilities for such transmission or sale of electric energy, but shall not have jurisdiction, except as specifically provided in this subchapter and subchapter III of this chapter, over facilities used for the generation of electric energy or over facilities used in local distribution or only for the transmission of electric energy in intrastate commerce, or over facilities for the transmission of electric energy consumed wholly by the transmitter.

(2) Notwithstanding subsection (f) of this section, the provisions of sections 824b(a)(2), 824e(e), 824i, 824j, 824j-1, 824k, 824o, 824p, 824q, 824r, 824s, 824t, 824u, and 824v of this title shall apply to the entities described in such provisions, and such entities shall be subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission for purposes of carrying out such provisions and for purposes of applying the enforcement authorities of this chapter with respect to such provisions. Compliance with any order or rule of the Commission under the provisions of section 824b(a)(2), 824e(e), 824i, 824j, 824j-1, 824k, 824o, 824p, 824q, 824r, 824s, 824t, 824u, or 824v of this title, shall not make an electric utility or other entity subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission for any purposes other than the purposes specified in the preceding sentence.

###### (c) Electric energy in interstate commerce

For the purpose of this subchapter, electric energy shall be held to be transmitted in interstate commerce if transmitted from a State and consumed at any point outside thereof; but only insofar as such transmission takes place within the United States.

###### (d) "Sale of electric energy at wholesale" defined

The term "sale of electric energy at wholesale" when used in this subchapter, means a sale of electric energy to any person for resale.

###### (e) "Public utility" defined

The term "public utility" when used in this subchapter and subchapter III of this chapter means any person who owns or operates facilities subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission under this subchapter (other than facilities subject to such jurisdiction solely by reason of section 824e(e), 824e(f),<sup>1</sup> 824i, 824j, 824j-1, 824k, 824o, 824p, 824q, 824r, 824s, 824t, 824u, or 824v of this title).

###### (f) United States, State, political subdivision of a State, or agency or instrumentality thereof exempt

No provision in this subchapter shall apply to, or be deemed to include, the United States, a State or any political subdivision of a State, an electric cooperative that receives financing under the Rural Electrification Act of 1936 (7 U.S.C. 901 et seq.) or that sells less than 4,000,000 megawatt hours of electricity per year, or any agency, authority, or instrumentality of any one or more of the foregoing, or any corporation which is wholly owned, directly or indirectly, by any one or more of the foregoing, or any officer, agent, or employee of any of the foregoing acting as such in the course of his official duty, unless such provision makes specific reference thereto.

###### (g) Books and records

(1) Upon written order of a State commission, a State commission may examine the books, accounts, memoranda, contracts, and records of—

(A) an electric utility company subject to its regulatory authority under State law,

(B) any exempt wholesale generator selling energy at wholesale to such electric utility, and

<sup>1</sup> So in original. Section 824e of this title does not contain a subsec. (f).

(C) any electric utility company, or holding company thereof, which is an associate company or affiliate of an exempt wholesale generator which sells electric energy to an electric utility company referred to in subparagraph (A),

wherever located, if such examination is required for the effective discharge of the State commission's regulatory responsibilities affecting the provision of electric service.

(2) Where a State commission issues an order pursuant to paragraph (1), the State commission shall not publicly disclose trade secrets or sensitive commercial information.

(3) Any United States district court located in the State in which the State commission referred to in paragraph (1) is located shall have jurisdiction to enforce compliance with this subsection.

(4) Nothing in this section shall—

(A) preempt applicable State law concerning the provision of records and other information; or

(B) in any way limit rights to obtain records and other information under Federal law, contracts, or otherwise.

(5) As used in this subsection the terms “affiliate”, “associate company”, “electric utility company”, “holding company”, “subsidiary company”, and “exempt wholesale generator” shall have the same meaning as when used in the Public Utility Holding Company Act of 2005 [42 U.S.C. 16451 et seq.].

(June 10, 1920, ch. 285, pt. II, §201, as added Aug. 26, 1935, ch. 687, title II, §213, 49 Stat. 847; amended Pub. L. 95-617, title II, §204(b), Nov. 9, 1978, 92 Stat. 3140; Pub. L. 102-486, title VII, §714, Oct. 24, 1992, 106 Stat. 2911; Pub. L. 109-58, title XII, §§1277(b)(1), 1291(c), 1295(a), Aug. 8, 2005, 119 Stat. 978, 985.)

#### REFERENCES IN TEXT

The Rural Electrification Act of 1936, referred to in subsec. (f), is act May 20, 1936, ch. 432, 49 Stat. 1363, as amended, which is classified generally to chapter 31 (§901 et seq.) of Title 7, Agriculture. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see section 901 of Title 7 and Tables.

The Public Utility Holding Company Act of 2005, referred to in subsec. (g)(5), is subtitle F of title XII of Pub. L. 109-58, Aug. 8, 2005, 119 Stat. 972, which is classified principally to part D (§16451 et seq.) of subchapter XII of chapter 149 of Title 42, The Public Health and Welfare. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 15801 of Title 42 and Tables.

#### AMENDMENTS

2005—Subsec. (b)(2). Pub. L. 109-58, §1295(a)(1), substituted “Notwithstanding subsection (f) of this section, the provisions of sections 824b(a)(2), 824e(e), 824i, 824j, 824j-1, 824k, 824o, 824p, 824q, 824r, 824s, 824t, 824u, and 824v of this title” for “The provisions of sections 824i, 824j, and 824k of this title” and “Compliance with any order or rule of the Commission under the provisions of section 824b(a)(2), 824e(e), 824i, 824j, 824j-1, 824k, 824o, 824p, 824q, 824r, 824s, 824t, 824u, or 824v of this title” for “Compliance with any order of the Commission under the provisions of section 824i or 824j of this title”.

Subsec. (e). Pub. L. 109-58, §1295(a)(2), substituted “section 824e(e), 824e(f), 824i, 824j, 824j-1, 824k, 824o, 824p, 824q, 824r, 824s, 824t, 824u, or 824v of this title” for “section 824i, 824j, or 824k of this title”.

Subsec. (f). Pub. L. 109-58, §1291(c), which directed amendment of subsec. (f) by substituting “political subdivision of a State, an electric cooperative that receives financing under the Rural Electrification Act of 1936 (7 U.S.C. 901 et seq.) or that sells less than 4,000,000 megawatt hours of electricity per year,” for “political subdivision of a state,” was executed by making the substitution for “political subdivision of a State,” to reflect the probable intent of Congress.

Subsec. (g)(5). Pub. L. 109-58, §1277(b)(1), substituted “2005” for “1935”.

1992—Subsec. (g). Pub. L. 102-486 added subsec. (g).

1978—Subsec. (b). Pub. L. 95-617, §204(b)(1), designated existing provisions as par. (1), inserted “except as provided in paragraph (2)” after “in interstate commerce, but”, and added par. (2).

Subsec. (e). Pub. L. 95-617, §204(b)(2), inserted “(other than facilities subject to such jurisdiction solely by reason of section 824i, 824j, or 824k of this title)” after “under this subchapter”.

#### EFFECTIVE DATE OF 2005 AMENDMENT

Amendment by section 1277(b)(1) of Pub. L. 109-58 effective 6 months after Aug. 8, 2005, with provisions relating to effect of compliance with certain regulations approved and made effective prior to such date, see section 1274 of Pub. L. 109-58, set out as an Effective Date note under section 16451 of Title 42, The Public Health and Welfare.

#### STATE AUTHORITIES; CONSTRUCTION

Nothing in amendment by Pub. L. 102-486 to be construed as affecting or intending to affect, or in any way to interfere with, authority of any State or local government relating to environmental protection or siting of facilities, see section 731 of Pub. L. 102-486, set out as a note under section 796 of this title.

#### PRIOR ACTIONS; EFFECT ON OTHER AUTHORITIES

Pub. L. 95-617, title II, §214, Nov. 9, 1978, 92 Stat. 3149, provided that:

“(a) PRIOR ACTIONS.—No provision of this title [enacting sections 823a, 824i to 824k, 824a-1 to 824a-3 and 825q-1 of this title, amending sections 796, 824, 824a, 824d, and 825d of this title and enacting provisions set out as notes under sections 824a, 824d, and 825d of this title] or of any amendment made by this title shall apply to, or affect, any action taken by the Commission [Federal Energy Regulatory Commission] before the date of the enactment of this Act [Nov. 9, 1978].

“(b) OTHER AUTHORITIES.—No provision of this title [enacting sections 823a, 824i to 824k, 824a-1 to 824a-3 and 825q-1 of this title, amending sections 796, 824, 824a, 824d, and 825d of this title and enacting provisions set out as notes under sections 824a, 824d, and 825d of this title] or of any amendment made by this title shall limit, impair or otherwise affect any authority of the Commission or any other agency or instrumentality of the United States under any other provision of law except as specifically provided in this title.”

#### § 824a. Interconnection and coordination of facilities; emergencies; transmission to foreign countries

##### (a) Regional districts; establishment; notice to State commissions

For the purpose of assuring an abundant supply of electric energy throughout the United States with the greatest possible economy and with regard to the proper utilization and conservation of natural resources, the Commission is empowered and directed to divide the country into regional districts for the voluntary interconnection and coordination of facilities for the generation, transmission, and sale of electric energy, and it may at any time thereafter, upon

garding formation and operation of regional transmission organizations.

#### § 824o. Electric reliability

##### (a) Definitions

For purposes of this section:

(1) The term “bulk-power system” means—

(A) facilities and control systems necessary for operating an interconnected electric energy transmission network (or any portion thereof); and

(B) electric energy from generation facilities needed to maintain transmission system reliability.

The term does not include facilities used in the local distribution of electric energy.

(2) The terms “Electric Reliability Organization” and “ERO” mean the organization certified by the Commission under subsection (c) of this section the purpose of which is to establish and enforce reliability standards for the bulk-power system, subject to Commission review.

(3) The term “reliability standard” means a requirement, approved by the Commission under this section, to provide for reliable operation of the bulk-power system. The term includes requirements for the operation of existing bulk-power system facilities, including cybersecurity protection, and the design of planned additions or modifications to such facilities to the extent necessary to provide for reliable operation of the bulk-power system, but the term does not include any requirement to enlarge such facilities or to construct new transmission capacity or generation capacity.

(4) The term “reliable operation” means operating the elements of the bulk-power system within equipment and electric system thermal, voltage, and stability limits so that instability, uncontrolled separation, or cascading failures of such system will not occur as a result of a sudden disturbance, including a cybersecurity incident, or unanticipated failure of system elements.

(5) The term “Interconnection” means a geographic area in which the operation of bulk-power system components is synchronized such that the failure of one or more of such components may adversely affect the ability of the operators of other components within the system to maintain reliable operation of the facilities within their control.

(6) The term “transmission organization” means a Regional Transmission Organization, Independent System Operator, independent transmission provider, or other transmission organization finally approved by the Commission for the operation of transmission facilities.

(7) The term “regional entity” means an entity having enforcement authority pursuant to subsection (e)(4) of this section.

(8) The term “cybersecurity incident” means a malicious act or suspicious event that disrupts, or was an attempt to disrupt, the operation of those programmable electronic devices and communication networks including hardware, software and data that are essential to the reliable operation of the bulk power system.

##### (b) Jurisdiction and applicability

(1) The Commission shall have jurisdiction, within the United States, over the ERO certified by the Commission under subsection (c) of this section, any regional entities, and all users, owners and operators of the bulk-power system, including but not limited to the entities described in section 824(f) of this title, for purposes of approving reliability standards established under this section and enforcing compliance with this section. All users, owners and operators of the bulk-power system shall comply with reliability standards that take effect under this section.

(2) The Commission shall issue a final rule to implement the requirements of this section not later than 180 days after August 8, 2005.

##### (c) Certification

Following the issuance of a Commission rule under subsection (b)(2) of this section, any person may submit an application to the Commission for certification as the Electric Reliability Organization. The Commission may certify one such ERO if the Commission determines that such ERO—

(1) has the ability to develop and enforce, subject to subsection (e)(2) of this section, reliability standards that provide for an adequate level of reliability of the bulk-power system; and

(2) has established rules that—

(A) assure its independence of the users and owners and operators of the bulk-power system, while assuring fair stakeholder representation in the selection of its directors and balanced decisionmaking in any ERO committee or subordinate organizational structure;

(B) allocate equitably reasonable dues, fees, and other charges among end users for all activities under this section;

(C) provide fair and impartial procedures for enforcement of reliability standards through the imposition of penalties in accordance with subsection (e) of this section (including limitations on activities, functions, or operations, or other appropriate sanctions);

(D) provide for reasonable notice and opportunity for public comment, due process, openness, and balance of interests in developing reliability standards and otherwise exercising its duties; and

(E) provide for taking, after certification, appropriate steps to gain recognition in Canada and Mexico.

##### (d) Reliability standards

(1) The Electric Reliability Organization shall file each reliability standard or modification to a reliability standard that it proposes to be made effective under this section with the Commission.

(2) The Commission may approve, by rule or order, a proposed reliability standard or modification to a reliability standard if it determines that the standard is just, reasonable, not unduly discriminatory or preferential, and in the public interest. The Commission shall give due weight to the technical expertise of the Electric Reli-



ability Organization with respect to the content of a proposed standard or modification to a reliability standard and to the technical expertise of a regional entity organized on an Interconnection-wide basis with respect to a reliability standard to be applicable within that Interconnection, but shall not defer with respect to the effect of a standard on competition. A proposed standard or modification shall take effect upon approval by the Commission.

(3) The Electric Reliability Organization shall rebuttably presume that a proposal from a regional entity organized on an Interconnection-wide basis for a reliability standard or modification to a reliability standard to be applicable on an Interconnection-wide basis is just, reasonable, and not unduly discriminatory or preferential, and in the public interest.

(4) The Commission shall remand to the Electric Reliability Organization for further consideration a proposed reliability standard or a modification to a reliability standard that the Commission disapproves in whole or in part.

(5) The Commission, upon its own motion or upon complaint, may order the Electric Reliability Organization to submit to the Commission a proposed reliability standard or a modification to a reliability standard that addresses a specific matter if the Commission considers such a new or modified reliability standard appropriate to carry out this section.

(6) The final rule adopted under subsection (b)(2) of this section shall include fair processes for the identification and timely resolution of any conflict between a reliability standard and any function, rule, order, tariff, rate schedule, or agreement accepted, approved, or ordered by the Commission applicable to a transmission organization. Such transmission organization shall continue to comply with such function, rule, order, tariff, rate schedule or agreement accepted, approved, or ordered by the Commission until—

(A) the Commission finds a conflict exists between a reliability standard and any such provision;

(B) the Commission orders a change to such provision pursuant to section 824e of this title; and

(C) the ordered change becomes effective under this subchapter.

If the Commission determines that a reliability standard needs to be changed as a result of such a conflict, it shall order the ERO to develop and file with the Commission a modified reliability standard under paragraph (4) or (5) of this subsection.

#### (e) Enforcement

(1) The ERO may impose, subject to paragraph (2), a penalty on a user or owner or operator of the bulk-power system for a violation of a reliability standard approved by the Commission under subsection (d) of this section if the ERO, after notice and an opportunity for a hearing—

(A) finds that the user or owner or operator has violated a reliability standard approved by the Commission under subsection (d) of this section; and

(B) files notice and the record of the proceeding with the Commission.

(2) A penalty imposed under paragraph (1) may take effect not earlier than the 31st day after the ERO files with the Commission notice of the penalty and the record of proceedings. Such penalty shall be subject to review by the Commission, on its own motion or upon application by the user, owner or operator that is the subject of the penalty filed within 30 days after the date such notice is filed with the Commission. Application to the Commission for review, or the initiation of review by the Commission on its own motion, shall not operate as a stay of such penalty unless the Commission otherwise orders upon its own motion or upon application by the user, owner or operator that is the subject of such penalty. In any proceeding to review a penalty imposed under paragraph (1), the Commission, after notice and opportunity for hearing (which hearing may consist solely of the record before the ERO and opportunity for the presentation of supporting reasons to affirm, modify, or set aside the penalty), shall by order affirm, set aside, reinstate, or modify the penalty, and, if appropriate, remand to the ERO for further proceedings. The Commission shall implement expedited procedures for such hearings.

(3) On its own motion or upon complaint, the Commission may order compliance with a reliability standard and may impose a penalty against a user or owner or operator of the bulk-power system if the Commission finds, after notice and opportunity for a hearing, that the user or owner or operator of the bulk-power system has engaged or is about to engage in any acts or practices that constitute or will constitute a violation of a reliability standard.

(4) The Commission shall issue regulations authorizing the ERO to enter into an agreement to delegate authority to a regional entity for the purpose of proposing reliability standards to the ERO and enforcing reliability standards under paragraph (1) if—

(A) the regional entity is governed by—

(i) an independent board;

(ii) a balanced stakeholder board; or

(iii) a combination independent and balanced stakeholder board.

(B) the regional entity otherwise satisfies the provisions of subsection (c)(1) and (2) of this section; and

(C) the agreement promotes effective and efficient administration of bulk-power system reliability.

The Commission may modify such delegation. The ERO and the Commission shall rebuttably presume that a proposal for delegation to a regional entity organized on an Interconnection-wide basis promotes effective and efficient administration of bulk-power system reliability and should be approved. Such regulation may provide that the Commission may assign the ERO's authority to enforce reliability standards under paragraph (1) directly to a regional entity consistent with the requirements of this paragraph.

(5) The Commission may take such action as is necessary or appropriate against the ERO or a regional entity to ensure compliance with a reliability standard or any Commission order affecting the ERO or a regional entity.

(6) Any penalty imposed under this section shall bear a reasonable relation to the seriousness of the violation and shall take into consideration the efforts of such user, owner, or operator to remedy the violation in a timely manner.

**(f) Changes in Electric Reliability Organization rules**

The Electric Reliability Organization shall file with the Commission for approval any proposed rule or proposed rule change, accompanied by an explanation of its basis and purpose. The Commission, upon its own motion or complaint, may propose a change to the rules of the ERO. A proposed rule or proposed rule change shall take effect upon a finding by the Commission, after notice and opportunity for comment, that the change is just, reasonable, not unduly discriminatory or preferential, is in the public interest, and satisfies the requirements of subsection (c) of this section.

**(g) Reliability reports**

The ERO shall conduct periodic assessments of the reliability and adequacy of the bulk-power system in North America.

**(h) Coordination with Canada and Mexico**

The President is urged to negotiate international agreements with the governments of Canada and Mexico to provide for effective compliance with reliability standards and the effectiveness of the ERO in the United States and Canada or Mexico.

**(i) Savings provisions**

(1) The ERO shall have authority to develop and enforce compliance with reliability standards for only the bulk-power system.

(2) This section does not authorize the ERO or the Commission to order the construction of additional generation or transmission capacity or to set and enforce compliance with standards for adequacy or safety of electric facilities or services.

(3) Nothing in this section shall be construed to preempt any authority of any State to take action to ensure the safety, adequacy, and reliability of electric service within that State, as long as such action is not inconsistent with any reliability standard, except that the State of New York may establish rules that result in greater reliability within that State, as long as such action does not result in lesser reliability outside the State than that provided by the reliability standards.

(4) Within 90 days of the application of the Electric Reliability Organization or other affected party, and after notice and opportunity for comment, the Commission shall issue a final order determining whether a State action is inconsistent with a reliability standard, taking into consideration any recommendation of the ERO.

(5) The Commission, after consultation with the ERO and the State taking action, may stay the effectiveness of any State action, pending the Commission's issuance of a final order.

**(j) Regional advisory bodies**

The Commission shall establish a regional advisory body on the petition of at least two-thirds of the States within a region that have

more than one-half of their electric load served within the region. A regional advisory body shall be composed of one member from each participating State in the region, appointed by the Governor of each State, and may include representatives of agencies, States, and provinces outside the United States. A regional advisory body may provide advice to the Electric Reliability Organization, a regional entity, or the Commission regarding the governance of an existing or proposed regional entity within the same region, whether a standard proposed to apply within the region is just, reasonable, not unduly discriminatory or preferential, and in the public interest, whether fees proposed to be assessed within the region are just, reasonable, not unduly discriminatory or preferential, and in the public interest and any other responsibilities requested by the Commission. The Commission may give deference to the advice of any such regional advisory body if that body is organized on an Interconnection-wide basis.

**(k) Alaska and Hawaii**

The provisions of this section do not apply to Alaska or Hawaii.

(June 10, 1920, ch. 285, pt. II, §215, as added Pub. L. 109-58, title XII, §1211(a), Aug. 8, 2005, 119 Stat. 941.)

STATUS OF ERO

Pub. L. 109-58, title XII, §1211(b), Aug. 8, 2005, 119 Stat. 946, provided that: "The Electric Reliability Organization certified by the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission under section 215(c) of the Federal Power Act [16 U.S.C. 824o(c)] and any regional entity delegated enforcement authority pursuant to section 215(e)(4) of that Act [16 U.S.C. 824o(e)(4)] are not departments, agencies, or instrumentalities of the United States Government."

ACCESS APPROVALS BY FEDERAL AGENCIES

Pub. L. 109-58, title XII, §1211(c), Aug. 8, 2005, 119 Stat. 946, provided that: "Federal agencies responsible for approving access to electric transmission or distribution facilities located on lands within the United States shall, in accordance with applicable law, expedite any Federal agency approvals that are necessary to allow the owners or operators of such facilities to comply with any reliability standard, approved by the [Federal Energy Regulatory] Commission under section 215 of the Federal Power Act [16 U.S.C. 824o], that pertains to vegetation management, electric service restoration, or resolution of situations that imminently endanger the reliability or safety of the facilities."

**§ 824p. Siting of interstate electric transmission facilities**

**(a) Designation of national interest electric transmission corridors**

(1) Not later than 1 year after August 8, 2005, and every 3 years thereafter, the Secretary of Energy (referred to in this section as the "Secretary"), in consultation with affected States, shall conduct a study of electric transmission congestion.

(2) After considering alternatives and recommendations from interested parties (including an opportunity for comment from affected States), the Secretary shall issue a report, based on the study, which may designate any geographic area experiencing electric energy transmission capacity constraints or congestion that



(2) The Administrator shall transmit such State reports, together with an analysis thereof, to Congress on or before October 1, 1975, and October 1, 1976, and biennially thereafter.

(June 30, 1948, ch. 758, title III, §305, as added Pub. L. 92-500, §2, Oct. 18, 1972, 86 Stat. 853; amended Pub. L. 95-217, §52, Dec. 27, 1977, 91 Stat. 1589.)

CODIFICATION

Subsec. (a) authorized the Administrator, in cooperation with the States and Federal agencies, to prepare a report describing the specific quality, during 1973, of all navigable waters and waters of the contiguous zone, including an inventory of all point sources of discharge of pollutants into these waters, and identifying those navigable waters capable of supporting fish and wildlife populations and allowing recreational activities, those which could reasonably be expected to attain this level by 1977 or 1983, and those which could attain this level sooner, and submit this report to Congress on or before Jan. 1, 1974.

AMENDMENTS

1977—Subsec. (b)(1). Pub. L. 95-217, §52(1), substituted “April 1, 1975, and shall bring up to date by April 1, 1976, and biennially thereafter” for “January 1, 1975, and shall bring up to date each year thereafter” in provisions preceding subpar. (A).

Subsec. (b)(2). Pub. L. 95-217, §52(2), substituted “on or before October 1, 1975, and October 1, 1976, and biennially thereafter” for “on or before October 1, 1975, and annually thereafter”.

§ 1316. National standards of performance

(a) Definitions

For purposes of this section:

(1) The term “standard of performance” means a standard for the control of the discharge of pollutants which reflects the greatest degree of effluent reduction which the Administrator determines to be achievable through application of the best available demonstrated control technology, processes, operating methods, or other alternatives, including, where practicable, a standard permitting no discharge of pollutants.

(2) The term “new source” means any source, the construction of which is commenced after the publication of proposed regulations prescribing a standard of performance under this section which will be applicable to such source, if such standard is thereafter promulgated in accordance with this section.

(3) The term “source” means any building, structure, facility, or installation from which there is or may be the discharge of pollutants.

(4) The term “owner or operator” means any person who owns, leases, operates, controls, or supervises a source.

(5) The term “construction” means any placement, assembly, or installation of facilities or equipment (including contractual obligations to purchase such facilities or equipment) at the premises where such equipment will be used, including preparation work at such premises.

(b) Categories of sources; Federal standards of performance for new sources

(1)(A) The Administrator shall, within ninety days after October 18, 1972, publish (and from time to time thereafter shall revise) a list of categories of sources, which shall, at the minimum, include:

pulp and paper mills;  
paperboard, builders paper and board mills;  
meat product and rendering processing;  
dairy product processing;  
grain mills;  
canned and preserved fruits and vegetables processing;  
canned and preserved seafood processing;  
sugar processing;  
textile mills;  
cement manufacturing;  
feedlots;  
electroplating;  
organic chemicals manufacturing;  
inorganic chemicals manufacturing;  
plastic and synthetic materials manufacturing;  
soap and detergent manufacturing;  
fertilizer manufacturing;  
petroleum refining;  
iron and steel manufacturing;  
nonferrous metals manufacturing;  
phosphate manufacturing;  
steam electric powerplants;  
ferroalloy manufacturing;  
leather tanning and finishing;  
glass and asbestos manufacturing;  
rubber processing; and  
timber products processing.

(B) As soon as practicable, but in no case more than one year, after a category of sources is included in a list under subparagraph (A) of this paragraph, the Administrator shall propose and publish regulations establishing Federal standards of performance for new sources within such category. The Administrator shall afford interested persons an opportunity for written comment on such proposed regulations. After considering such comments, he shall promulgate, within one hundred and twenty days after publication of such proposed regulations, such standards with such adjustments as he deems appropriate. The Administrator shall, from time to time, as technology and alternatives change, revise such standards following the procedure required by this subsection for promulgation of such standards. Standards of performance, or revisions thereof, shall become effective upon promulgation. In establishing or revising Federal standards of performance for new sources under this section, the Administrator shall take into consideration the cost of achieving such effluent reduction, and any non-water quality, environmental impact and energy requirements.

(2) The Administrator may distinguish among classes, types, and sizes within categories of new sources for the purpose of establishing such standards and shall consider the type of process employed (including whether batch or continuous).

(3) The provisions of this section shall apply to any new source owned or operated by the United States.

(c) State enforcement of standards of performance

Each State may develop and submit to the Administrator a procedure under State law for applying and enforcing standards of performance for new sources located in such State. If the Administrator finds that the procedure and the law

of any State require the application and enforcement of standards of performance to at least the same extent as required by this section, such State is authorized to apply and enforce such standards of performance (except with respect to new sources owned or operated by the United States).

**(d) Protection from more stringent standards**

Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, any point source the construction of which is commenced after October 18, 1972, and which is so constructed as to meet all applicable standards of performance shall not be subject to any more stringent standard of performance during a ten-year period beginning on the date of completion of such construction or during the period of depreciation or amortization of such facility for the purposes of section 167 or 169 (or both) of title 26 whichever period ends first.

**(e) Illegality of operation of new sources in violation of applicable standards of performance**

After the effective date of standards of performance promulgated under this section, it shall be unlawful for any owner or operator of any new source to operate such source in violation of any standard of performance applicable to such source.

(June 30, 1948, ch. 758, title III, §306, as added Pub. L. 92-500, §2, Oct. 18, 1972, 86 Stat. 854.)

DISCHARGES FROM POINT SOURCES IN UNITED STATES  
VIRGIN ISLANDS ATTRIBUTABLE TO MANUFACTURE OF  
RUM; EXEMPTION; CONDITIONS

Discharges from point sources in the United States Virgin Islands in existence on Aug. 5, 1983, attributable to the manufacture of rum not to be subject to the requirements of this section under certain conditions, see section 214(g) of Pub. L. 98-67, set out as a note under section 1311 of this title.

**§ 1317. Toxic and pretreatment effluent standards**

**(a) Toxic pollutant list; revision; hearing; promulgation of standards; effective date; consultation**

(1) On and after December 27, 1977, the list of toxic pollutants or combination of pollutants subject to this chapter shall consist of those toxic pollutants listed in table 1 of Committee Print Numbered 95-30 of the Committee on Public Works and Transportation of the House of Representatives, and the Administrator shall publish, not later than the thirtieth day after December 27, 1977, that list. From time to time thereafter, the Administrator may revise such list and the Administrator is authorized to add to or remove from such list any pollutant. The Administrator in publishing any revised list, including the addition or removal of any pollutant from such list, shall take into account toxicity of the pollutant, its persistence, degradability, the usual or potential presence of the affected organisms in any waters, the importance of the affected organisms, and the nature and extent of the effect of the toxic pollutant on such organisms. A determination of the Administrator under this paragraph shall be final except that if, on judicial review, such determination was based on arbitrary and capricious action of the

Administrator, the Administrator shall make a redetermination.

(2) Each toxic pollutant listed in accordance with paragraph (1) of this subsection shall be subject to effluent limitations resulting from the application of the best available technology economically achievable for the applicable category or class of point sources established in accordance with sections 1311(b)(2)(A) and 1314(b)(2) of this title. The Administrator, in his discretion, may publish in the Federal Register a proposed effluent standard (which may include a prohibition) establishing requirements for a toxic pollutant which, if an effluent limitation is applicable to a class or category of point sources, shall be applicable to such category or class only if such standard imposes more stringent requirements. Such published effluent standard (or prohibition) shall take into account the toxicity of the pollutant, its persistence, degradability, the usual or potential presence of the affected organisms in any waters, the importance of the affected organisms and the nature and extent of the effect of the toxic pollutant on such organisms, and the extent to which effective control is being or may be achieved under other regulatory authority. The Administrator shall allow a period of not less than sixty days following publication of any such proposed effluent standard (or prohibition) for written comment by interested persons on such proposed standard. In addition, if within thirty days of publication of any such proposed effluent standard (or prohibition) any interested person so requests, the Administrator shall hold a public hearing in connection therewith. Such a public hearing shall provide an opportunity for oral and written presentations, such cross-examination as the Administrator determines is appropriate on disputed issues of material fact, and the transcription of a verbatim record which shall be available to the public. After consideration of such comments and any information and material presented at any public hearing held on such proposed standard or prohibition, the Administrator shall promulgate such standard (or prohibition) with such modification as the Administrator finds are justified. Such promulgation by the Administrator shall be made within two hundred and seventy days after publication of proposed standard (or prohibition). Such standard (or prohibition) shall be final except that if, on judicial review, such standard was not based on substantial evidence, the Administrator shall promulgate a revised standard. Effluent limitations shall be established in accordance with sections 1311(b)(2)(A) and 1314(b)(2) of this title for every toxic pollutant referred to in table 1 of Committee Print Numbered 95-30 of the Committee on Public Works and Transportation of the House of Representatives as soon as practicable after December 27, 1977, but no later than July 1, 1980. Such effluent limitations or effluent standards (or prohibitions) shall be established for every other toxic pollutant listed under paragraph (1) of this subsection as soon as practicable after it is so listed.

(3) Each such effluent standard (or prohibition) shall be reviewed and, if appropriate, revised at least every three years.

**SAVINGS PROVISION**

Section 16 of Pub. L. 91-604 provided that:

“(a)(1) Any implementation plan adopted by any State and submitted to the Secretary of Health, Education, and Welfare, or to the Administrator pursuant to the Clean Air Act [this chapter] prior to enactment of this Act [Dec. 31, 1970] may be approved under section 110 of the Clean Air Act [this section] (as amended by this Act) [Pub. L. 91-604] and shall remain in effect, unless the Administrator determines that such implementation plan, or any portion thereof, is not consistent with applicable requirements of the Clean Air Act [this chapter] (as amended by this Act) and will not provide for the attainment of national primary ambient air quality standards in the time required by such Act. If the Administrator so determines, he shall, within 90 days after promulgation of any national ambient air quality standards pursuant to section 109(a) of the Clean Air Act [section 7409(a) of this title], notify the State and specify in what respects changes are needed to meet the additional requirements of such Act, including requirements to implement national secondary ambient air quality standards. If such changes are not adopted by the State after public hearings and within six months after such notification, the Administrator shall promulgate such changes pursuant to section 110(c) of such Act [subsec. (c) of this section].

“(2) The amendments made by section 4(b) [amending sections 7403 and 7415 of this title] shall not be construed as repealing or modifying the powers of the Administrator with respect to any conference convened under section 108(d) of the Clean Air Act [section 7415 of this title] before the date of enactment of this Act [Dec. 31, 1970].

“(b) Regulations or standards issued under this title II of the Clean Air Act [subchapter II of this chapter] prior to the enactment of this Act [Dec. 31, 1970] shall continue in effect until revised by the Administrator consistent with the purposes of such Act [this chapter].”

**FEDERAL ENERGY ADMINISTRATOR**

The “Federal Energy Administrator”, for purposes of this chapter, to mean the Administrator of the Federal Energy Administration established by Pub. L. 93-275, May 7, 1974, 88 Stat. 97, which is classified to section 761 et seq. of Title 15, Commerce and Trade, but with the term to mean any officer of the United States designated as such by the President until the Federal Energy Administrator takes office and after the Federal Energy Administration ceases to exist, see section 798 of Title 15, Commerce and Trade.

The Federal Energy Administration was terminated and functions vested by law in the Administrator thereof were transferred to the Secretary of Energy (unless otherwise specifically provided) by sections 7151(a) and 7293 of this title.

**SECTION REFERRED TO IN OTHER SECTIONS**

This section is referred to in sections 6211, 6215, 7405, 7407, 7411, 7413, 7414, 7415, 7419, 7420, 7425, 7426, 7475, 7476, 7491, 7501, 7502, 7504, 7506, 7545, 7607, 7613, 7619, 7625-1, 8374, 9601 of this title.

§ 7411. Standards of performance for new stationary sources

**(a) Definitions**

For purposes of this section:

(1) The term “standard of performance” means—

(A) with respect to any air pollutant emitted from a category of fossil fuel fired stationary sources to which subsection (b) of this section applies, a standard—

(i) establishing allowable emission limitations for such category of sources, and

(ii) requiring the achievement of a percentage reduction in the emissions from such category of sources from the emissions which would have resulted from the use of fuels which are not subject to treatment prior to combustion,

(B) with respect to any air pollutant emitted from a category of stationary sources (other than fossil fuel fired sources) to which subsection (b) of this section applies, a standard such as that referred to in subparagraph (A)(i); and

(C) with respect to any air pollutant emitted from a particular source to which subsection (d) of this section applies, a standard which the State (or the Administrator under the conditions specified in subsection (d)(2) of this section) determines is applicable to that source and which reflects the degree of emission reduction achievable through the application of the best system of continuous emission reduction which (taking into consideration the cost of achieving such emission reduction, and any nonair quality health and environmental impact and energy requirements) the Administrator determines has been adequately demonstrated for that category of sources.

For the purpose of subparagraphs (A)(i) and (ii) and (B), a standard of performance shall reflect the degree of emission limitation and the percentage reduction achievable through application of the best technological system of continuous emission reduction which (taking into consideration the cost of achieving such emission reduction, any nonair quality health and environmental impact and energy requirements) the Administrator determines has been adequately demonstrated. For the purpose of subparagraph (1)(A)(ii), any cleaning of the fuel or reduction in the pollution characteristics of the fuel after extraction and prior to combustion may be credited, as determined under regulations promulgated by the Administrator, to a source which burns such fuel.

(2) The term “new source” means any stationary source, the construction or modification of which is commenced after the publication of regulations (or, if earlier, proposed regulations) prescribing a standard of performance under this section which will be applicable to such source.

(3) The term “stationary source” means any building, structure, facility, or installation which emits or may emit any air pollutant.

(4) The term “modification” means any physical change in, or change in the method of operation of, a stationary source which increases the amount of any air pollutant emitted by such source or which results in the emission of any air pollutant not previously emitted.

(5) The term “owner or operator” means any person who owns, leases, operates, controls, or supervises a stationary source.

(6) The term “existing source” means any stationary source other than a new source.



(7) The term "technological system of continuous emission reduction" means—

(A) a technological process for production or operation by any source which is inherently low-polluting or nonpolluting, or

(B) a technological system for continuous reduction of the pollution generated by a source before such pollution is emitted into the ambient air, including precombustion cleaning or treatment of fuels.

(8) A conversion to coal (A) by reason of an order under section 2(a) of the Energy Supply and Environmental Coordination Act of 1974 [15 U.S.C. 792(a)] or any amendment thereto, or any subsequent enactment which supercedes such Act [15 U.S.C. 791 et seq.], or (B) which qualifies under section 7413(d)(5)(A)(ii) of this title, shall not be deemed to be a modification for purposes of paragraphs (2) and (4) of this subsection.

(b) List of categories of stationary sources; standards of performance; information on pollution control techniques; sources owned or operated by United States; particular systems; revised standards

(1)(A) The Administrator shall, within 90 days after December 31, 1970, publish (and from time to time thereafter shall revise) a list of categories of stationary sources. He shall include a category of sources in such list if in his judgment it causes, or contributes significantly to, air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to endanger public health or welfare.

(B) Within 120 days after the inclusion of a category of stationary sources in a list under subparagraph (A), the Administrator shall publish proposed regulations, establishing Federal standards of performance for new sources within such category. The Administrator shall afford interested persons an opportunity for written comment on such proposed regulations. After considering such comments, he shall promulgate, within 90 days after such publication, such standards with such modifications as he deems appropriate. The Administrator shall, at least every four years, review and, if appropriate, revise such standards following the procedure required by this subsection for promulgation of such standards. Standards of performance or revisions thereof shall become effective upon promulgation.

(2) The Administrator may distinguish among classes, types, and sizes within categories of new sources for the purpose of establishing such standards.

(3) The Administrator shall, from time to time, issue information on pollution control techniques for categories of new sources and air pollutants subject to the provisions of this section.

(4) The provisions of this section shall apply to any new source owned or operated by the United States.

(5) Except as otherwise authorized under subsection (h) of this section, nothing in this section shall be construed to require, or to authorize the Administrator to require, any new or modified source to install and operate any particular technological system of continuous emission reduction to comply with any new source standard of performance.

(6) The revised standards of performance required by enactment of subsection (a)(1)(A)(i) and (ii) of this section shall be promulgated not later than one year after August 7, 1977. Any new or modified fossil fuel fired stationary source which commences construction prior to the date of publication of the proposed revised standards shall not be required to comply with such revised standards.

(c) State implementation and enforcement of standards of performance

(1) Each State may develop and submit to the Administrator a procedure for implementing and enforcing standards of performance for new sources located in such State. If the Administrator finds the State procedure is adequate, he shall delegate to such State any authority he has under this chapter to implement and enforce such standards.

(2) Nothing in this subsection shall prohibit the Administrator from enforcing any applicable standard of performance under this section.

(d) Standards of performance for existing sources; remaining useful life of source

(1) The Administrator shall prescribe regulations which shall establish a procedure similar to that provided by section 7410 of this title under which each State shall submit to the Administrator a plan which (A) establishes standards of performance for any existing source for any air pollutant (i) for which air quality criteria have not been issued or which is not included on a list published under section 7408(a) or 7412(b)(1)(A) of this title but (ii) to which a standard of performance under this section would apply if such existing source were a new source, and (B) provides for the implementation and enforcement of such standards of performance. Regulations of the Administrator under this paragraph shall permit the State in applying a standard of performance to any particular source under a plan submitted under this paragraph to take into consideration, among other factors, the remaining useful life of the existing source to which such standard applies.

(2) The Administrator shall have the same authority—

(A) to prescribe a plan for a State in cases where the State fails to submit a satisfactory plan as he would have under section 7410(c) of this title in the case of failure to submit an implementation plan, and

(B) to enforce the provisions of such plan in cases where the State fails to enforce them as he would have under sections 7413 and 7414 of this title with respect to an implementation plan.

In promulgating a standard of performance under a plan prescribed under this paragraph, the Administrator shall take into consideration, among other factors, remaining useful lives of the sources in the category of sources to which such standard applies.

(e) Prohibited acts

After the effective date of standards of performance promulgated under this section, it shall be unlawful for any owner or operator of

any new source to operate such source in violation of any standard of performance applicable to such source.

**(f) New source standards of performance**

(1) Not later than one year after August 7, 1977, the Administrator shall promulgate regulations listing under subsection (b)(1)(A) of this section the categories of major stationary sources which are not on August 7, 1977, included on the list required under subsection (b)(1)(A) of this section. The Administrator shall promulgate regulations establishing standards of performance for the percentage of such categories of sources set forth in the following table before the expiration of the corresponding period set forth in such table:

Percentage of source categories required to be listed for which standards must be established:	Period by which standards must be promulgated after date list is required to be promulgated:
25 .....	2 years.
75 .....	3 years.
100 .....	4 years.

(2) In determining priorities for promulgating standards for categories of major stationary sources for the purpose of paragraph (1), the Administrator shall consider—

(A) the quantity of air pollutant emissions which each such category will emit, or will be designed to emit;

(B) the extent to which each such pollutant may reasonably be anticipated to endanger public health or welfare; and

(C) the mobility and competitive nature of each such category of sources and the consequent need for nationally applicable new source standards of performance.

(3) Before promulgating any regulations under this subsection or listing any category of major stationary sources as required under this subsection, the Administrator shall consult with appropriate representatives of the Governors and of State air pollution control agencies.

**(g) Revision of regulations**

(1) Upon application by the Governor of a State showing that the Administrator has failed to specify in regulations under subsection (f)(1) of this section any category of major stationary sources required to be specified under such regulations, the Administrator shall revise such regulations to specify any such category.

(2) Upon application of the Governor of a State, showing that any category of stationary sources which is not included in the list under subsection (b)(1)(A) of this section contributes significantly to air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to endanger public health or welfare (notwithstanding that such category is not a category of major stationary sources), the Administrator shall revise such regulations to specify such category of stationary sources.

(3) Upon application of the Governor of a State showing that the Administrator has failed to apply properly the criteria required to be considered under subsection (f)(2) of this section, the Administrator shall revise the list under subsection (b)(1)(A) of this section to apply properly such criteria.

(4) Upon application of the Governor of a State showing that—

(A) a new, innovative, or improved technology or process which achieves greater continuous emission reduction has been adequately demonstrated for any category of stationary sources, and

(B) as a result of such technology or process, the new source standard of performance in effect under this section for such category no longer reflects the greatest degree of emission limitation achievable through application of the best technological system of continuous emission reduction which (taking into consideration the cost of achieving such emission reduction, and any non-air quality health and environmental impact and energy requirements) has been adequately demonstrated,

the Administrator shall revise such standard of performance for such category accordingly.

(5) Upon application by the Governor of a State showing that the Administrator has failed to list any air pollutant which causes, or contributes to, air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to result in an increase in mortality or an increase in serious irreversible, or incapacitating reversible, illness as a hazardous air pollutant under section 7412 of this title the Administrator shall revise the list of hazardous air pollutants under such section to include such pollutant.

(6) Upon application by the Governor of a State showing that any category of stationary sources of a hazardous air pollutant listed under section 7412 of this title is not subject to emission standards under such section, the Administrator shall propose and promulgate such emission standards applicable to such category of sources.

(7) Unless later deadlines for action of the Administrator are otherwise prescribed under this section or section 7412 of this title, the Administrator shall, not later than three months following the date of receipt of any application by a Governor of a State, either—

(A) find that such application does not contain the requisite showing and deny such application, or

(B) grant such application and take the action required under this subsection.

(8) Before taking any action required by subsection (f) of this section or by this subsection, the Administrator shall provide notice and opportunity for public hearing.

**(h) Design, equipment, work practice, or operational standard; alternative emission limitation**

(1) For purposes of this section, if in the judgment of the Administrator, it is not feasible to prescribe or enforce a standard of performance, he may instead promulgate a design, equipment, work practice, or operational standard, or combination thereof, which reflects the best technological system of continuous emission reduction which (taking into consideration the cost of achieving such emission reduction, and any non-air quality health and environmental impact and energy requirements) the Administrator determines has been adequately demon-

strated. In the event the Administrator promulgates a design or equipment standard under this subsection, he shall include as part of such standard such requirements as will assure the proper operation and maintenance of any such element of design or equipment.

(2) For the purpose of this subsection, the phrase "not feasible to prescribe or enforce a standard of performance" means any situation in which the Administrator determines that (A) a pollutant or pollutants cannot be emitted through a conveyance designed and constructed to emit or capture such pollutant, or that any requirement for, or use of, such a conveyance would be inconsistent with any Federal, State, or local law, or (B) the application of measurement methodology to a particular class of sources is not practicable due to technological or economic limitations.

(3) If after notice and opportunity for public hearing, any person establishes to the satisfaction of the Administrator that an alternative means of emission limitation will achieve a reduction in emissions of any air pollutant at least equivalent to the reduction in emissions of such air pollutant achieved under the requirements of paragraph (1), the Administrator shall permit the use of such alternative by the source for purposes of compliance with this section with respect to such pollutant.

(4) Any standard promulgated under paragraph (1) shall be promulgated in terms of standard of performance whenever it becomes feasible to promulgate and enforce such standard in such terms.

(5) Any design, equipment, work practice, or operational standard, or any combination thereof, described in this subsection shall be treated as a standard of performance for purposes of the provisions of this chapter (other than the provisions of subsection (a) of this section and this subsection).

(i) Country elevators

Any regulations promulgated by the Administrator under this section applicable to grain elevators shall not apply to country elevators (as defined by the Administrator) which have a storage capacity of less than two million five hundred thousand bushels.

(j) Innovative technological systems of continuous emission reduction

(1)(A) Any person proposing to own or operate a new source may request the Administrator for one or more waivers from the requirements of this section for such source or any portion thereof with respect to any air pollutant to encourage the use of an innovative technological system or systems of continuous emission reduction. The Administrator may, with the consent of the Governor of the State in which the source is to be located, grant a waiver under this paragraph, if the Administrator determines after notice and opportunity for public hearing, that—

(i) the proposed system or systems have not been adequately demonstrated,

(ii) the proposed system or systems will operate effectively and there is a substantial likelihood that such system or systems will achieve greater continuous emission reduc-

tion than that required to be achieved under the standards of performance which would otherwise apply, or achieve at least an equivalent reduction at lower cost in terms of energy, economic, or nonair quality environmental impact,

(iii) the owner or operator of the proposed source has demonstrated to the satisfaction of the Administrator that the proposed system will not cause or contribute to an unreasonable risk to public health, welfare, or safety in its operation, function, or malfunction, and

(iv) the granting of such waiver is consistent with the requirements of subparagraph (C).

In making any determination under clause (ii), the Administrator shall take into account any previous failure of such system or systems to operate effectively or to meet any requirement of the new source performance standards. In determining whether an unreasonable risk exists under clause (iii), the Administrator shall consider, among other factors, whether and to what extent the use of the proposed technological system will cause, increase, reduce, or eliminate emissions of any unregulated pollutants; available methods for reducing or eliminating any risk to public health, welfare, or safety which may be associated with the use of such system; and the availability of other technological systems which may be used to conform to standards under this section without causing or contributing to such unreasonable risk. The Administrator may conduct such tests and may require the owner or operator of the proposed source to conduct such tests and provide such information as is necessary to carry out clause (iii) of this subparagraph. Such requirements shall include a requirement for prompt reporting of the emission of any unregulated pollutant from a system if such pollutant was not emitted, or was emitted in significantly lesser amounts without use of such system.

(B) A waiver under this paragraph shall be granted on such terms and conditions as the Administrator determines to be necessary to assure—

(i) emissions from the source will not prevent attainment and maintenance of any national ambient air quality standards, and

(ii) proper functioning of the technological system or systems authorized.

Any such term or condition shall be treated as a standard of performance for the purposes of subsection (e) of this section and section 7413 of this title.

(C) The number of waivers granted under this paragraph with respect to a proposed technological system of continuous emission reduction shall not exceed such number as the Administrator finds necessary to ascertain whether or not such system will achieve the conditions specified in clauses (ii) and (iii) of subparagraph (A).

(D) A waiver under this paragraph shall extend to the sooner of—

(i) the date determined by the Administrator, after consultation with the owner or op-



erator of the source, taking into consideration the design, installation, and capital cost of the technological system or systems being used, or

(ii) the date on which the Administrator determines that such system has failed to—

(I) achieve at least an equivalent continuous emission reduction to that required to be achieved under the standards of performance which would otherwise apply, or

(II) comply with the condition specified in paragraph (1)(A)(iii),

and that such failure cannot be corrected.

(E) In carrying out subparagraph (D)(i), the Administrator shall not permit any waiver for a source or portion thereof to extend beyond the date—

(i) seven years after the date on which any waiver is granted to such source or portion thereof, or

(ii) four years after the date on which such source or portion thereof commences operation,

whichever is earlier.

(F) No waiver under this subsection shall apply to any portion of a source other than the portion on which the innovative technological system or systems of continuous emission reduction is used.

(2)(A) If a waiver under paragraph (1) is terminated under clause (ii) of paragraph (1)(D), the Administrator shall grant an extension of the requirements of this section for such source for such minimum period as may be necessary to comply with the applicable standard of performance under this section. Such period shall not extend beyond the date three years from the time such waiver is terminated.

(B) An extension granted under this paragraph shall set forth emission limits and a compliance schedule containing increments of progress which require compliance with the applicable standards of performance as expeditiously as practicable and include such measures as are necessary and practicable in the interim to minimize emissions. Such schedule shall be treated as a standard of performance for purposes of subsection (e) of this section and section 7413 of this title.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, § 111, as added Dec. 31, 1970, Pub. L. 91-604, § 4(a), 84 Stat. 1683, and amended Nov. 18, 1971, Pub. L. 92-157, title III, § 302(f), 85 Stat. 464; Aug. 7, 1977, Pub. L. 95-95, title I, § 109(a)-(d)(1), (e), (f), title IV, § 401(b), 91 Stat. 697-703, 791; Nov. 16, 1977, Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(7)-(9), 91 Stat. 1399; Nov. 9, 1978, Pub. L. 95-623, § 13(a), 92 Stat. 3457.)

#### REFERENCES IN TEXT

Such Act, referred to in subsec. (a)(8), means Pub. L. 93-319, June 22, 1974, 88 Stat. 246, as amended, known as the Energy Supply and Environmental Coordination Act of 1974, which is classified principally to chapter 16C (§ 791 et seq.) of Title 15, Commerce and Trade. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 791 of Title 15 and Tables.

#### CODIFICATION

Section was formerly classified to section 1857c-6 of this title.

#### PRIOR PROVISIONS

A prior section 111 of act July 14, 1955, was renumbered section 118 by Pub. L. 91-604, and is classified to section 7418 of this title.

#### AMENDMENTS

1978—Subsecs. (d)(1)(A)(ii), (g)(4)(B). Pub. L. 95-623, § 13(a)(2), substituted “under this section” for “under subsection (b) of this section”.

Subsec. (h)(5). Pub. L. 95-623, § 13(a)(1), added par. (5).

Subsec. (j). Pub. L. 95-623, § 13(a)(3), substituted in pars. (1)(A) and (2)(A) “standards under this section” and “under this section” for “standards under subsection (b) of this section” and “under subsection (b) of this section”, respectively.

1977—Subsec. (a)(1). Pub. L. 95-95, § 109(c)(1)(A), added subpars. (A), (B), and (C), substituted “For the purpose of subparagraphs (A)(i) and (ii) and (B), a standard of performance shall reflect” for “a standard for emissions of air pollutants which reflects”, “and the percentage reduction achievable” for “achievable”, and “technological system of continuous emission reduction which (taking into consideration the cost of achieving such emission reduction, and any nonair quality health and environment impact and energy requirements)” for “system of emission reduction which (taking into account the cost of achieving such reduction)” in existing provisions, and inserted provision that, for the purpose of subparagraph (1)(A)(ii), any cleaning of the fuel or reduction in the pollution characteristics of the fuel after extraction and prior to combustion may be credited, as determined under regulations promulgated by the Administrator, to a source which burns such fuel.

Subsec. (a)(7). Pub. L. 95-95, § 109(c)(1)(B), added par. (7) defining “technological system of continuous emission reduction”.

Pub. L. 95-95, § 109(f), added par. (7) directing that under certain circumstances a conversion to coal not be deemed a modification for purposes of pars. (2) and (4).

Subsec. (a)(7), (8). Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(7), redesignated second par. (7) as (8).

Subsec. (b)(1)(A). Pub. L. 95-95, § 401(b), substituted “such list if in his judgment it causes, or contributes significantly to, air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to endanger” for “such list if he determines it may contribute significantly to air pollution which causes or contributes to the endangerment of”.

Subsec. (b)(1)(B). Pub. L. 95-95, § 109(c)(2), substituted “shall, at least every four years, review and, if appropriate,” for “may, from time to time,”.

Subsec. (b)(5), (6). Pub. L. 95-95, § 109(c)(3), added pars. (5) and (6).

Subsec. (c)(1). Pub. L. 95-95, § 109(d)(1), struck out “(except with respect to new sources owned or operated by the United States)” after “implement and enforce such standards”.

Subsec. (d)(1). Pub. L. 95-95, § 109(b)(1), substituted “standards of performance” for “emission standards” and inserted provisions directing that regulations of the Administrator permit the State, in applying a standard of performance to any particular source under a submitted plan, to take into consideration, among other factors, the remaining useful life of the existing source to which the standard applies.

Subsec. (d)(2). Pub. L. 95-95, § 109(b)(2), provided that, in promulgating a standard of performance under a plan, the Administrator take into consideration, among other factors, the remaining useful lives of the sources in the category of sources to which the standard applies.

Subsecs. (f) to (i). Pub. L. 95-95, § 109(a), added subsecs. (f) to (i).

Subsecs. (j), (k). Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(8), (9), redesignated subsec. (k) as (j) and, as so redesignated, substituted "(B)" for "(8)" as designation for second subpar. in par. (2). Former subsec. (j), added by Pub. L. 95-95, § 109(e), which related to compliance with applicable standards of performance, was struck out.

Pub. L. 95-95, § 109(e), added subsec. (k).

1971—Subsec. (b)(1)(B). Pub. L. 92-157 substituted in first sentence "publish proposed" for "propose".

#### EFFECTIVE DATE OF 1977 AMENDMENT

Amendment by Pub. L. 95-95 effective Aug. 7, 1977, except as otherwise expressly provided, see section 406(d) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as a note under section 7401 of this title.

#### PENDING ACTIONS AND PROCEEDINGS

Suits, actions, and other proceedings lawfully commenced by or against the Administrator or any other officer or employee of the United States in his official capacity or in relation to the discharge of his official duties under act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977], not to abate by reason of the taking effect of Pub. L. 95-95, see section 406(a) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

#### MODIFICATION OR RESCISSION OF RULES, REGULATIONS, ORDERS, DETERMINATIONS, CONTRACTS, CERTIFICATIONS, AUTHORIZATIONS, DELEGATIONS, AND OTHER ACTIONS

All rules, regulations, orders, determinations, contracts, certifications, authorizations, delegations, or other actions duly issued, made, or taken by or pursuant to act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the date of enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977] to continue in full force and effect until modified or rescinded in accordance with act July 14, 1955, as amended by Pub. L. 95-95 (this chapter), see section 406(b) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

#### TRANSFER OF FUNCTIONS

Enforcement functions of Administrator or other official in the Environmental Protection Agency related to compliance with new source performance standards under this section with respect to pre-construction, construction, and initial operation of transportation system for Canadian and Alaskan natural gas were transferred to the Federal Inspector, Office of Federal Inspector for the Alaska Natural Gas Transportation System, until the first anniversary of date of initial operation of the Alaska Natural Gas Transportation System, see Reorg. Plan No. 1 of 1979, eff. July 1, 1979, §§ 102(a), 203(a), 44 F.R. 33663, 33666, 93 Stat. 1373, 1376, set out in the Appendix to Title 5, Government Organization and Employees.

#### SECTION REFERRED TO IN OTHER SECTIONS

This section is referred to in sections 7410, 7412, 7413, 7414, 7416, 7417, 7418, 7420, 7422, 7425, 7475, 7479, 7501, 7604, 7607, 7608, 7616, 7617, 7618, 7625-1, 9601 of this title.

§ 7412. National emission standards for hazardous air pollutants

#### (a) Definitions

For purposes of this section—

(1) The term "hazardous air pollutant" means an air pollutant to which no ambient air quality standard is applicable and which in the judgment of the Administrator causes, or contributes to, air pollution which may

reasonably be anticipated to result in an increase in mortality or an increase in serious irreversible, or incapacitating reversible, illness.

(2) The term "new source" means a stationary source the construction or modification of which is commenced after the Administrator proposes regulations under this section establishing an emission standard which will be applicable to such source.

(3) The terms "stationary source", "modification", "owner or operator" and "existing source" shall have the same meaning as such terms have under section 7411(a) of this title.

#### (b) List of hazardous air pollutants; emission standards; pollution control techniques

(1)(A) The Administrator shall, within 90 days after December 31, 1970, publish (and shall from time to time thereafter revise) a list which includes each hazardous air pollutant for which he intends to establish an emission standard under this section.

(B) Within 180 days after the inclusion of any air pollutant in such list, the Administrator shall publish proposed regulations establishing emission standards for such pollutant together with a notice of a public hearing within thirty days. Not later than 180 days after such publication, the Administrator shall prescribe an emission standard for such pollutant, unless he finds, on the basis of information presented at such hearings, that such pollutant clearly is not a hazardous air pollutant. The Administrator shall establish any such standard at the level which in his judgment provides an ample margin of safety to protect the public health from such hazardous air pollutant.

(C) Any emission standard established pursuant to this section shall become effective upon promulgation.

(2) The Administrator shall, from time to time, issue information on pollution control techniques for air pollutant subject to the provisions of this section.

#### (c) Prohibited acts; exemption

(1) After the effective date of any emission standard under this section—

(A) no person may construct any new source or modify any existing source which in the Administrator's judgment, will emit an air pollutant to which such standard applies unless the Administrator finds that such source if properly operated will not cause emissions in violation of such standard, and

(B) no air pollutant to which such standard applies may be emitted from any stationary source in violation of such standard, except that in the case of an existing source—

(i) such standard shall not apply until 90 days after its effective date, and

(ii) the Administrator may grant a waiver permitting such source a period of up to two years after the effective date of a standard to comply with the standard, if he finds that such period is necessary for the installation of controls and that steps will be taken during the period of the waiver to assure that the health of persons will be protected from imminent endangerment.



“(4) submit a report on the study and responsibilities of the Administrator under paragraphs (1) through (3) to—

“(A) the Committee on Energy and Commerce of the House of Representatives; and

“(B) the Committee on Environment and Public Works of the Senate.

“SEC. 6103. OZONE DESIGNATION REQUIREMENTS.

“(a) The Governors shall be required to submit the designations referred to in section 107(d)(1) of the Clean Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7407(d)(1)] within 2 years following the promulgation of the July 1997 ozone national ambient air quality standards.

“(b) The Administrator shall promulgate final designations no later than 1 year after the designations required under subsection (a) are required to be submitted.

“SEC. 6104. ADDITIONAL PROVISIONS.

“Nothing in sections 6101 through 6103 shall be construed by the Administrator of Environmental Protection Agency or any court, State, or person to affect any pending litigation or to be a ratification of the ozone or PM<sub>2.5</sub> standards.”

PENDING ACTIONS AND PROCEEDINGS

Suits, actions, and other proceedings lawfully commenced by or against the Administrator or any other officer or employee of the United States in his official capacity or in relation to the discharge of his official duties under act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977], not to abate by reason of the taking effect of Pub. L. 95-95, see section 406(a) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

MODIFICATION OR RESCISSION OF RULES, REGULATIONS, ORDERS, DETERMINATIONS, CONTRACTS, CERTIFICATIONS, AUTHORIZATIONS, DELEGATIONS, AND OTHER ACTIONS

All rules, regulations, orders, determinations, contracts, certifications, authorizations, delegations, or other actions duly issued, made, or taken by or pursuant to act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the date of enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977] to continue in full force and effect until modified or rescinded in accordance with act July 14, 1955, as amended by Pub. L. 95-95 [this chapter], see section 406(b) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

§ 7408. Air quality criteria and control techniques

(a) Air pollutant list; publication and revision by Administrator; issuance of air quality criteria for air pollutants

(1) For the purpose of establishing national primary and secondary ambient air quality standards, the Administrator shall within 30 days after December 31, 1970, publish, and shall from time to time thereafter revise, a list which includes each air pollutant—

(A) emissions of which, in his judgment, cause or contribute to air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to endanger public health or welfare;

(B) the presence of which in the ambient air results from numerous or diverse mobile or stationary sources; and

(C) for which air quality criteria had not been issued before December 31, 1970 but for which he plans to issue air quality criteria under this section.

(2) The Administrator shall issue air quality criteria for an air pollutant within 12 months after he has included such pollutant in a list under paragraph (1). Air quality criteria for an air pollutant shall accurately reflect the latest scientific knowledge useful in indicating the kind and extent of all identifiable effects on public health or welfare which may be expected from the presence of such pollutant in the ambient air, in varying quantities. The criteria for an air pollutant, to the extent practicable, shall include information on—

(A) those variable factors (including atmospheric conditions) which of themselves or in combination with other factors may alter the effects on public health or welfare of such air pollutant;

(B) the types of air pollutants which, when present in the atmosphere, may interact with such pollutant to produce an adverse effect on public health or welfare; and

(C) any known or anticipated adverse effects on welfare.

(b) Issuance by Administrator of information on air pollution control techniques; standing consulting committees for air pollutants; establishment; membership

(1) Simultaneously with the issuance of criteria under subsection (a) of this section, the Administrator shall, after consultation with appropriate advisory committees and Federal departments and agencies, issue to the States and appropriate air pollution control agencies information on air pollution control techniques, which information shall include data relating to the cost of installation and operation, energy requirements, emission reduction benefits, and environmental impact of the emission control technology. Such information shall include such data as are available on available technology and alternative methods of prevention and control of air pollution. Such information shall also include data on alternative fuels, processes, and operating methods which will result in elimination or significant reduction of emissions.

(2) In order to assist in the development of information on pollution control techniques, the Administrator may establish a standing consulting committee for each air pollutant included in a list published pursuant to subsection (a)(1) of this section, which shall be comprised of technically qualified individuals representative of State and local governments, industry, and the academic community. Each such committee shall submit, as appropriate, to the Administrator information related to that required by paragraph (1).

(c) Review, modification, and reissuance of criteria or information

The Administrator shall from time to time review, and, as appropriate, modify, and reissue any criteria or information on control techniques issued pursuant to this section. Not later than six months after August 7, 1977, the Administrator shall revise and reissue criteria relating to concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub> over such period (not more than three hours) as he deems appropriate. Such criteria shall include a discussion of nitric and nitrous acids, nitrites, nitrates, nitrosamines, and other carcinogenic and potentially carcinogenic derivatives of oxides of nitrogen.

**(d) Publication in Federal Register; availability of copies for general public**

The issuance of air quality criteria and information on air pollution control techniques shall be announced in the Federal Register and copies shall be made available to the general public.

**(e) Transportation planning and guidelines**

The Administrator shall, after consultation with the Secretary of Transportation, and after providing public notice and opportunity for comment, and with State and local officials, within nine months after November 15, 1990,<sup>1</sup> and periodically thereafter as necessary to maintain a continuous transportation-air quality planning process, update the June 1978 Transportation-Air Quality Planning Guidelines and publish guidance on the development and implementation of transportation and other measures necessary to demonstrate and maintain attainment of national ambient air quality standards. Such guidelines shall include information on—

- (1) methods to identify and evaluate alternative planning and control activities;
- (2) methods of reviewing plans on a regular basis as conditions change or new information is presented;
- (3) identification of funds and other resources necessary to implement the plan, including interagency agreements on providing such funds and resources;
- (4) methods to assure participation by the public in all phases of the planning process; and
- (5) such other methods as the Administrator determines necessary to carry out a continuous planning process.

**(f) Information regarding processes, procedures, and methods to reduce or control pollutants in transportation; reduction of mobile source related pollutants; reduction of impact on public health**

(1) The Administrator shall publish and make available to appropriate Federal, State, and local environmental and transportation agencies not later than one year after November 15, 1990, and from time to time thereafter—

- (A) information prepared, as appropriate, in consultation with the Secretary of Transportation, and after providing public notice and opportunity for comment, regarding the formulation and emission reduction potential of transportation control measures related to criteria pollutants and their precursors, including, but not limited to—
- (i) programs for improved public transit;
  - (ii) restriction of certain roads or lanes to, or construction of such roads or lanes for use by, passenger buses or high occupancy vehicles;
  - (iii) employer-based transportation management plans, including incentives;
  - (iv) trip-reduction ordinances;
  - (v) traffic flow improvement programs that achieve emission reductions;
  - (vi) fringe and transportation corridor parking facilities serving multiple occupancy vehicle programs or transit service;

(vii) programs to limit or restrict vehicle use in downtown areas or other areas of emission concentration particularly during periods of peak use;

(viii) programs for the provision of all forms of high-occupancy, shared-ride services;

(ix) programs to limit portions of road surfaces or certain sections of the metropolitan area to the use of non-motorized vehicles or pedestrian use, both as to time and place;

(x) programs for secure bicycle storage facilities and other facilities, including bicycle lanes, for the convenience and protection of bicyclists, in both public and private areas;

(xi) programs to control extended idling of vehicles;

(xii) programs to reduce motor vehicle emissions, consistent with subchapter II of this chapter, which are caused by extreme cold start conditions;

(xiii) employer-sponsored programs to permit flexible work schedules;

(xiv) programs and ordinances to facilitate non-automobile travel, provision and utilization of mass transit, and to generally reduce the need for single-occupant vehicle travel, as part of transportation planning and development efforts of a locality, including programs and ordinances applicable to new shopping centers, special events, and other centers of vehicle activity;

(xv) programs for new construction and major reconstructions of paths, tracks or areas solely for the use by pedestrian or other non-motorized means of transportation when economically feasible and in the public interest. For purposes of this clause, the Administrator shall also consult with the Secretary of the Interior; and

(xvi) program to encourage the voluntary removal from use and the marketplace of pre-1980 model year light duty vehicles and pre-1980 model light duty trucks.<sup>2</sup>

(B) information on additional methods or strategies that will contribute to the reduction of mobile source related pollutants during periods in which any primary ambient air quality standard will be exceeded and during episodes for which an air pollution alert, warning, or emergency has been declared;

(C) information on other measures which may be employed to reduce the impact on public health or protect the health of sensitive or susceptible individuals or groups; and

(D) information on the extent to which any process, procedure, or method to reduce or control such air pollutant may cause an increase in the emissions or formation of any other pollutant.

(2) In publishing such information the Administrator shall also include an assessment of—

(A) the relative effectiveness of such processes, procedures, and methods;

(B) the potential effect of such processes, procedures, and methods on transportation systems and the provision of transportation services; and

<sup>1</sup> See Codification note below.

<sup>2</sup> So in original. The period probably should be a semicolon.

(C) the environmental, energy, and economic impact of such processes, procedures, and methods.

**(g) Assessment of risks to ecosystems**

The Administrator may assess the risks to ecosystems from exposure to criteria air pollutants (as identified by the Administrator in the Administrator's sole discretion).

**(h) RACT/BACT/LAER clearinghouse**

The Administrator shall make information regarding emission control technology available to the States and to the general public through a central database. Such information shall include all control technology information received pursuant to State plan provisions requiring permits for sources, including operating permits for existing sources.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, § 108, as added Pub. L. 91-604, § 4(a), Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1678; amended Pub. L. 95-95, title I, §§ 104, 105, title IV, § 401(a), Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 689, 790; Pub. L. 101-549, title I, §§ 108(a)-(c), (o), 111, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2465, 2466, 2469, 2470; Pub. L. 105-362, title XV, § 1501(b), Nov. 10, 1998, 112 Stat. 3294.)

**CODIFICATION**

November 15, 1990, referred to in subsec. (e), was in the original "enactment of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1989", and was translated as meaning the date of the enactment of Pub. L. 101-549, popularly known as the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990, to reflect the probable intent of Congress.

Section was formerly classified to section 1857c-3 of this title.

**PRIOR PROVISIONS**

A prior section 108 of act July 14, 1955, was renumbered section 115 by Pub. L. 91-604 and is classified to section 7415 of this title.

**AMENDMENTS**

1998—Subsec. (f)(3), (4). Pub. L. 105-362 struck out par. (3), which required reports by the Secretary of Transportation and the Administrator to be submitted to Congress by Jan. 1, 1993, and every 3 years thereafter, reviewing and analyzing existing State and local air quality related transportation programs, evaluating achievement of goals, and recommending changes to existing programs, and par. (4), which required that in each report after the first report the Secretary of Transportation include a description of the actions taken to implement the changes recommended in the preceding report.

1990—Subsec. (e). Pub. L. 101-549, § 108(a), inserted first sentence and struck out former first sentence which read as follows: "The Administrator shall, after consultation with the Secretary of Transportation and the Secretary of Housing and Urban Development and State and local officials and within 180 days after August 7, 1977, and from time to time thereafter, publish guidelines on the basic program elements for the planning process assisted under section 7505 of this title."

Subsec. (f)(1). Pub. L. 101-549, § 108(b), in introductory provisions, substituted present provisions for provisions relating to Federal agencies, States, and air pollution control agencies within either 6 months or one year after Aug. 7, 1977.

Subsec. (f)(1)(A). Pub. L. 101-549, § 108(b), substituted present provisions for provisions relating to information prepared in cooperation with Secretary of Transportation, regarding processes, procedures, and methods to reduce certain pollutants.

Subsec. (f)(3), (4). Pub. L. 101-549, § 111, added pars. (3) and (4).

Subsec. (g). Pub. L. 101-549, § 108(o), added subsec. (g).  
Subsec. (h). Pub. L. 101-549, § 108(c), added subsec. (h).  
1977—Subsec. (a)(1)(A). Pub. L. 95-95, § 401(a), substituted "emissions of which, in his judgment, cause or contribute to air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to endanger public health or welfare" for "which in his judgment has an adverse effect on public health or welfare".

Subsec. (b)(1). Pub. L. 95-95, § 104(a), substituted "cost of installation and operation, energy requirements, emission reduction benefits, and environmental impact of the emission control technology" for "technology and costs of emission control".

Subsec. (c). Pub. L. 95-95, § 104(b), inserted provision directing the Administrator, not later than six months after Aug. 7, 1977, to revise and reissue criteria relating to concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub> over such period (not more than three hours) as he deems appropriate, with the criteria to include a discussion of nitric and nitrous acids, nitrites, nitrates, nitrosamines, and other carcinogenic and potentially carcinogenic derivatives of oxides of nitrogen.

Subsecs. (e), (f). Pub. L. 95-95, § 105, added subsecs. (e) and (f).

**EFFECTIVE DATE OF 1977 AMENDMENT**

Amendment by Pub. L. 95-95 effective Aug. 7, 1977, except as otherwise expressly provided, see section 406(d) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as a note under section 7401 of this title.

**MODIFICATION OR RESCISSION OF RULES, REGULATIONS, ORDERS, DETERMINATIONS, CONTRACTS, CERTIFICATIONS, AUTHORIZATIONS, DELEGATIONS, AND OTHER ACTIONS**

All rules, regulations, orders, determinations, contracts, certifications, authorizations, delegations, or other actions duly issued, made, or taken by or pursuant to act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the date of enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977] to continue in full force and effect until modified or rescinded in accordance with act July 14, 1955, as amended by Pub. L. 95-95 [this chapter], see section 406(b) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

**§ 7409. National primary and secondary ambient air quality standards**

**(a) Promulgation**

(1) The Administrator—

(A) within 30 days after December 31, 1970, shall publish proposed regulations prescribing a national primary ambient air quality standard and a national secondary ambient air quality standard for each air pollutant for which air quality criteria have been issued prior to such date; and

(B) after a reasonable time for interested persons to submit written comments thereon (but no later than 90 days after the initial publication of such proposed standards) shall by regulation promulgate such proposed national primary and secondary ambient air quality standards with such modifications as he deems appropriate.

(2) With respect to any air pollutant for which air quality criteria are issued after December 31, 1970, the Administrator shall publish, simultaneously with the issuance of such criteria and information, proposed national primary and secondary ambient air quality standards for any such pollutant. The procedure provided for in paragraph (1)(B) of this subsection shall apply to the promulgation of such standards.



**(b) Protection of public health and welfare**

(1) National primary ambient air quality standards, prescribed under subsection (a) of this section shall be ambient air quality standards the attainment and maintenance of which in the judgment of the Administrator, based on such criteria and allowing an adequate margin of safety, are requisite to protect the public health. Such primary standards may be revised in the same manner as promulgated.

(2) Any national secondary ambient air quality standard prescribed under subsection (a) of this section shall specify a level of air quality the attainment and maintenance of which in the judgment of the Administrator, based on such criteria, is requisite to protect the public welfare from any known or anticipated adverse effects associated with the presence of such air pollutant in the ambient air. Such secondary standards may be revised in the same manner as promulgated.

**(c) National primary ambient air quality standard for nitrogen dioxide**

The Administrator shall, not later than one year after August 7, 1977, promulgate a national primary ambient air quality standard for NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations over a period of not more than 3 hours unless, based on the criteria issued under section 7408(c) of this title, he finds that there is no significant evidence that such a standard for such a period is requisite to protect public health.

**(d) Review and revision of criteria and standards; independent scientific review committee; appointment; advisory functions**

(1) Not later than December 31, 1980, and at five-year intervals thereafter, the Administrator shall complete a thorough review of the criteria published under section 7408 of this title and the national ambient air quality standards promulgated under this section and shall make such revisions in such criteria and standards and promulgate such new standards as may be appropriate in accordance with section 7408 of this title and subsection (b) of this section. The Administrator may review and revise criteria or promulgate new standards earlier or more frequently than required under this paragraph.

(2)(A) The Administrator shall appoint an independent scientific review committee composed of seven members including at least one member of the National Academy of Sciences, one physician, and one person representing State air pollution control agencies.

(B) Not later than January 1, 1980, and at five-year intervals thereafter, the committee referred to in subparagraph (A) shall complete a review of the criteria published under section 7408 of this title and the national primary and secondary ambient air quality standards promulgated under this section and shall recommend to the Administrator any new national ambient air quality standards and revisions of existing criteria and standards as may be appropriate under section 7408 of this title and subsection (b) of this section.

(C) Such committee shall also (i) advise the Administrator of areas in which additional knowledge is required to appraise the adequacy

and basis of existing, new, or revised national ambient air quality standards, (ii) describe the research efforts necessary to provide the required information, (iii) advise the Administrator on the relative contribution to air pollution concentrations of natural as well as anthropogenic activity, and (iv) advise the Administrator of any adverse public health, welfare, social, economic, or energy effects which may result from various strategies for attainment and maintenance of such national ambient air quality standards.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, §109, as added Pub. L. 91-604, §4(a), Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1679; amended Pub. L. 95-95, title I, §106, Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 691.)

## CODIFICATION

Section was formerly classified to section 1857c-4 of this title.

## PRIOR PROVISIONS

A prior section 109 of act July 14, 1955, was renumbered section 116 by Pub. L. 91-604 and is classified to section 7416 of this title.

## AMENDMENTS

1977—Subsec. (c). Pub. L. 95-95, §106(b), added subsec. (c).

Subsec. (d). Pub. L. 95-95, §106(a), added subsec. (d).

## EFFECTIVE DATE OF 1977 AMENDMENT

Amendment by Pub. L. 95-95 effective Aug. 7, 1977, except as otherwise expressly provided, see section 406(d) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as a note under section 7401 of this title.

## MODIFICATION OR RESCISSION OF RULES, REGULATIONS, ORDERS, DETERMINATIONS, CONTRACTS, CERTIFICATIONS, AUTHORIZATIONS, DELEGATIONS, AND OTHER ACTIONS

All rules, regulations, orders, determinations, contracts, certifications, authorizations, delegations, or other actions duly issued, made, or taken by or pursuant to act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the date of enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977] to continue in full force and effect until modified or rescinded in accordance with act July 14, 1955, as amended by Pub. L. 95-95 [this chapter], see section 406(b) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

## TERMINATION OF ADVISORY COMMITTEES

Advisory committees established after Jan. 5, 1973, to terminate not later than the expiration of the 2-year period beginning on the date of their establishment, unless, in the case of a committee established by the President or an officer of the Federal Government, such committee is renewed by appropriate action prior to the expiration of such 2-year period, or in the case of a committee established by the Congress, its duration is otherwise provided for by law. See section 14 of Pub. L. 92-463, Oct. 6, 1972, 86 Stat. 776, set out in the Appendix to Title 5, Government Organization and Employees.

## ROLE OF SECONDARY STANDARDS

Pub. L. 101-549, title VIII, §817, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2697, provided that:

“(a) REPORT.—The Administrator shall request the National Academy of Sciences to prepare a report to the Congress on the role of national secondary ambient air quality standards in protecting welfare and the environment. The report shall:

“(1) include information on the effects on welfare and the environment which are caused by ambient

concentrations of pollutants listed pursuant to section 108 [42 U.S.C. 7408] and other pollutants which may be listed;

“(2) estimate welfare and environmental costs incurred as a result of such effects;

“(3) examine the role of secondary standards and the State implementation planning process in preventing such effects;

“(4) determine ambient concentrations of each such pollutant which would be adequate to protect welfare and the environment from such effects;

“(5) estimate the costs and other impacts of meeting secondary standards; and

“(6) consider other means consistent with the goals and objectives of the Clean Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7401 et seq.] which may be more effective than secondary standards in preventing or mitigating such effects.

“(b) SUBMISSION TO CONGRESS; COMMENTS; AUTHORIZATION.—(1) The report shall be transmitted to the Congress not later than 3 years after the date of enactment of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 [Nov. 15, 1990].

“(2) At least 90 days before issuing a report the Administrator shall provide an opportunity for public comment on the proposed report. The Administrator shall include in the final report a summary of the comments received on the proposed report.

“(3) There are authorized to be appropriated such sums as are necessary to carry out this section.”

**§ 7410. State implementation plans for national primary and secondary ambient air quality standards**

**(a) Adoption of plan by State; submission to Administrator; content of plan; revision; new sources; indirect source review program; supplemental or intermittent control systems**

(1) Each State shall, after reasonable notice and public hearings, adopt and submit to the Administrator, within 3 years (or such shorter period as the Administrator may prescribe) after the promulgation of a national primary ambient air quality standard (or any revision thereof) under section 7409 of this title for any air pollutant, a plan which provides for implementation, maintenance, and enforcement of such primary standard in each air quality control region (or portion thereof) within such State. In addition, such State shall adopt and submit to the Administrator (either as a part of a plan submitted under the preceding sentence or separately) within 3 years (or such shorter period as the Administrator may prescribe) after the promulgation of a national ambient air quality secondary standard (or revision thereof), a plan which provides for implementation, maintenance, and enforcement of such secondary standard in each air quality control region (or portion thereof) within such State. Unless a separate public hearing is provided, each State shall consider its plan implementing such secondary standard at the hearing required by the first sentence of this paragraph.

(2) Each implementation plan submitted by a State under this chapter shall be adopted by the State after reasonable notice and public hearing. Each such plan shall—

(A) include enforceable emission limitations and other control measures, means, or techniques (including economic incentives such as fees, marketable permits, and auctions of emissions rights), as well as schedules and timetables for compliance, as may be necessary or appropriate to meet the applicable requirements of this chapter;

(B) provide for establishment and operation of appropriate devices, methods, systems, and procedures necessary to—

(i) monitor, compile, and analyze data on ambient air quality, and

(ii) upon request, make such data available to the Administrator;

(C) include a program to provide for the enforcement of the measures described in subparagraph (A), and regulation of the modification and construction of any stationary source within the areas covered by the plan as necessary to assure that national ambient air quality standards are achieved, including a permit program as required in parts C and D of this subchapter;

(D) contain adequate provisions—

(i) prohibiting, consistent with the provisions of this subchapter, any source or other type of emissions activity within the State from emitting any air pollutant in amounts which will—

(I) contribute significantly to nonattainment in, or interfere with maintenance by, any other State with respect to any such national primary or secondary ambient air quality standard, or

(II) interfere with measures required to be included in the applicable implementation plan for any other State under part C of this subchapter to prevent significant deterioration of air quality or to protect visibility,

(ii) insuring compliance with the applicable requirements of sections 7426 and 7415 of this title (relating to interstate and international pollution abatement);

(E) provide (i) necessary assurances that the State (or, except where the Administrator deems inappropriate, the general purpose local government or governments, or a regional agency designated by the State or general purpose local governments for such purpose) will have adequate personnel, funding, and authority under State (and, as appropriate, local) law to carry out such implementation plan (and is not prohibited by any provision of Federal or State law from carrying out such implementation plan or portion thereof), (ii) requirements that the State comply with the requirements respecting State boards under section 7428 of this title, and (iii) necessary assurances that, where the State has relied on a local or regional government, agency, or instrumentality for the implementation of any plan provision, the State has responsibility for ensuring adequate implementation of such plan provision;

(F) require, as may be prescribed by the Administrator—

(i) the installation, maintenance, and replacement of equipment, and the implementation of other necessary steps, by owners or operators of stationary sources to monitor emissions from such sources,

(ii) periodic reports on the nature and amounts of emissions and emissions-related data from such sources, and

(iii) correlation of such reports by the State agency with any emission limitations

or standards established pursuant to this chapter, which reports shall be available at reasonable times for public inspection;

(G) provide for authority comparable to that in section 7603 of this title and adequate contingency plans to implement such authority;

(H) provide for revision of such plan—

(i) from time to time as may be necessary to take account of revisions of such national primary or secondary ambient air quality standard or the availability of improved or more expeditious methods of attaining such standard, and

(ii) except as provided in paragraph (3)(C), whenever the Administrator finds on the basis of information available to the Administrator that the plan is substantially inadequate to attain the national ambient air quality standard which it implements or to otherwise comply with any additional requirements established under this chapter;

(I) in the case of a plan or plan revision for an area designated as a nonattainment area, meet the applicable requirements of part D of this subchapter (relating to nonattainment areas);

(J) meet the applicable requirements of section 7421 of this title (relating to consultation), section 7427 of this title (relating to public notification), and part C of this subchapter (relating to prevention of significant deterioration of air quality and visibility protection);

(K) provide for—

(i) the performance of such air quality modeling as the Administrator may prescribe for the purpose of predicting the effect on ambient air quality of any emissions of any air pollutant for which the Administrator has established a national ambient air quality standard, and

(ii) the submission, upon request, of data related to such air quality modeling to the Administrator;

(L) require the owner or operator of each major stationary source to pay to the permitting authority, as a condition of any permit required under this chapter, a fee sufficient to cover—

(i) the reasonable costs of reviewing and acting upon any application for such a permit, and

(ii) if the owner or operator receives a permit for such source, the reasonable costs of implementing and enforcing the terms and conditions of any such permit (not including any court costs or other costs associated with any enforcement action),

until such fee requirement is superseded with respect to such sources by the Administrator's approval of a fee program under subchapter V of this chapter; and

(M) provide for consultation and participation by local political subdivisions affected by the plan.

(3)(A) Repealed. Pub. L. 101-549, title I, § 101(d)(1), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2409.

(B) As soon as practicable, the Administrator shall, consistent with the purposes of this chapter and the Energy Supply and Environmental

Coordination Act of 1974 [15 U.S.C. 791 et seq.], review each State's applicable implementation plans and report to the State on whether such plans can be revised in relation to fuel burning stationary sources (or persons supplying fuel to such sources) without interfering with the attainment and maintenance of any national ambient air quality standard within the period permitted in this section. If the Administrator determines that any such plan can be revised, he shall notify the State that a plan revision may be submitted by the State. Any plan revision which is submitted by the State shall, after public notice and opportunity for public hearing, be approved by the Administrator if the revision relates only to fuel burning stationary sources (or persons supplying fuel to such sources), and the plan as revised complies with paragraph (2) of this subsection. The Administrator shall approve or disapprove any revision no later than three months after its submission.

(C) Neither the State, in the case of a plan (or portion thereof) approved under this subsection, nor the Administrator, in the case of a plan (or portion thereof) promulgated under subsection (c) of this section, shall be required to revise an applicable implementation plan because one or more exemptions under section 7418 of this title (relating to Federal facilities), enforcement orders under section 7413(d)<sup>1</sup> of this title, suspensions under subsection (f) or (g) of this section (relating to temporary energy or economic authority), orders under section 7419 of this title (relating to primary nonferrous smelters), or extensions of compliance in decrees entered under section 7413(e)<sup>1</sup> of this title (relating to iron- and steel-producing operations) have been granted, if such plan would have met the requirements of this section if no such exemptions, orders, or extensions had been granted.

(4) Repealed. Pub. L. 101-549, title I, § 101(d)(2), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2409.

(5)(A)(i) Any State may include in a State implementation plan, but the Administrator may not require as a condition of approval of such plan under this section, any indirect source review program. The Administrator may approve and enforce, as part of an applicable implementation plan, an indirect source review program which the State chooses to adopt and submit as part of its plan.

(ii) Except as provided in subparagraph (B), no plan promulgated by the Administrator shall include any indirect source review program for any air quality control region, or portion thereof.

(iii) Any State may revise an applicable implementation plan approved under this subsection to suspend or revoke any such program included in such plan, provided that such plan meets the requirements of this section.

(B) The Administrator shall have the authority to promulgate, implement and enforce regulations under subsection (c) of this section respecting indirect source review programs which apply only to federally assisted highways, airports, and other major federally assisted indirect sources and federally owned or operated indirect sources.

<sup>1</sup> See References in Text note below.



(C) For purposes of this paragraph, the term “indirect source” means a facility, building, structure, installation, real property, road, or highway which attracts, or may attract, mobile sources of pollution. Such term includes parking lots, parking garages, and other facilities subject to any measure for management of parking supply (within the meaning of subsection (c)(2)(D)(ii) of this section), including regulation of existing off-street parking but such term does not include new or existing on-street parking. Direct emissions sources or facilities at, within, or associated with, any indirect source shall not be deemed indirect sources for the purpose of this paragraph.

(D) For purposes of this paragraph the term “indirect source review program” means the facility-by-facility review of indirect sources of air pollution, including such measures as are necessary to assure, or assist in assuring, that a new or modified indirect source will not attract mobile sources of air pollution, the emissions from which would cause or contribute to air pollution concentrations—

(i) exceeding any national primary ambient air quality standard for a mobile source-related air pollutant after the primary standard attainment date, or

(ii) preventing maintenance of any such standard after such date.

(E) For purposes of this paragraph and paragraph (2)(B), the term “transportation control measure” does not include any measure which is an “indirect source review program”.

(6) No State plan shall be treated as meeting the requirements of this section unless such plan provides that in the case of any source which uses a supplemental, or intermittent control system for purposes of meeting the requirements of an order under section 7413(d)<sup>1</sup> of this title or section 7419 of this title (relating to primary nonferrous smelter orders), the owner or operator of such source may not temporarily reduce the pay of any employee by reason of the use of such supplemental or intermittent or other dispersion dependent control system.

**(b) Extension of period for submission of plans**

The Administrator may, wherever he determines necessary, extend the period for submission of any plan or portion thereof which implements a national secondary ambient air quality standard for a period not to exceed 18 months from the date otherwise required for submission of such plan.

**(c) Preparation and publication by Administrator of proposed regulations setting forth implementation plan; transportation regulations study and report; parking surcharge; suspension authority; plan implementation**

(1) The Administrator shall promulgate a Federal implementation plan at any time within 2 years after the Administrator—

(A) finds that a State has failed to make a required submission or finds that the plan or plan revision submitted by the State does not satisfy the minimum criteria established under subsection (k)(1)(A) of this section, or

(B) disapproves a State implementation plan submission in whole or in part,

unless the State corrects the deficiency, and the Administrator approves the plan or plan revision, before the Administrator promulgates such Federal implementation plan.

(2)(A) Repealed. Pub. L. 101-549, title I, §101(d)(3)(A), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2409.

(B) No parking surcharge regulation may be required by the Administrator under paragraph (1) of this subsection as a part of an applicable implementation plan. All parking surcharge regulations previously required by the Administrator shall be void upon June 22, 1974. This subparagraph shall not prevent the Administrator from approving parking surcharges if they are adopted and submitted by a State as part of an applicable implementation plan. The Administrator may not condition approval of any implementation plan submitted by a State on such plan's including a parking surcharge regulation.

(C) Repealed. Pub. L. 101-549, title I, §101(d)(3)(B), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2409.

(D) For purposes of this paragraph—

(i) The term “parking surcharge regulation” means a regulation imposing or requiring the imposition of any tax, surcharge, fee, or other charge on parking spaces, or any other area used for the temporary storage of motor vehicles.

(ii) The term “management of parking supply” shall include any requirement providing that any new facility containing a given number of parking spaces shall receive a permit or other prior approval, issuance of which is to be conditioned on air quality considerations.

(iii) The term “preferential bus/carpool lane” shall include any requirement for the setting aside of one or more lanes of a street or highway on a permanent or temporary basis for the exclusive use of buses or carpools, or both.

(E) No standard, plan, or requirement, relating to management of parking supply or preferential bus/carpool lanes shall be promulgated after June 22, 1974, by the Administrator pursuant to this section, unless such promulgation has been subjected to at least one public hearing which has been held in the area affected and for which reasonable notice has been given in such area. If substantial changes are made following public hearings, one or more additional hearings shall be held in such area after such notice.

(3) Upon application of the chief executive officer of any general purpose unit of local government, if the Administrator determines that such unit has adequate authority under State or local law, the Administrator may delegate to such unit the authority to implement and enforce within the jurisdiction of such unit any part of a plan promulgated under this subsection. Nothing in this paragraph shall prevent the Administrator from implementing or enforcing any applicable provision of a plan promulgated under this subsection.

(4) Repealed. Pub. L. 101-549, title I, §101(d)(3)(C), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2409.

(5)(A) Any measure in an applicable implementation plan which requires a toll or other charge for the use of a bridge located entirely within one city shall be eliminated from such plan by the Administrator upon application by the Governor of the State, which application shall in-



clude a certification by the Governor that he will revise such plan in accordance with subparagraph (B).

(B) In the case of any applicable implementation plan with respect to which a measure has been eliminated under subparagraph (A), such plan shall, not later than one year after August 7, 1977, be revised to include comprehensive measures to:

- (i) establish, expand, or improve public transportation measures to meet basic transportation needs, as expeditiously as is practicable; and
- (ii) implement transportation control measures necessary to attain and maintain national ambient air quality standards,

and such revised plan shall, for the purpose of implementing such comprehensive public transportation measures, include requirements to use (insofar as is necessary) Federal grants, State or local funds, or any combination of such grants and funds as may be consistent with the terms of the legislation providing such grants and funds. Such measures shall, as a substitute for the tolls or charges eliminated under subparagraph (A), provide for emissions reductions equivalent to the reductions which may reasonably be expected to be achieved through the use of the tolls or charges eliminated.

(C) Any revision of an implementation plan for purposes of meeting the requirements of subparagraph (B) shall be submitted in coordination with any plan revision required under part D of this subchapter.

**(d), (e) Repealed. Pub. L. 101-549, title I, § 101(d)(4), (5), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2409**

**(f) National or regional energy emergencies; determination by President**

(1) Upon application by the owner or operator of a fuel burning stationary source, and after notice and opportunity for public hearing, the Governor of the State in which such source is located may petition the President to determine that a national or regional energy emergency exists of such severity that—

- (A) a temporary suspension of any part of the applicable implementation plan or of any requirement under section 7651j of this title (concerning excess emissions penalties or offsets) may be necessary, and

(B) other means of responding to the energy emergency may be inadequate.

Such determination shall not be delegable by the President to any other person. If the President determines that a national or regional energy emergency of such severity exists, a temporary emergency suspension of any part of an applicable implementation plan or of any requirement under section 7651j of this title (concerning excess emissions penalties or offsets) adopted by the State may be issued by the Governor of any State covered by the President's determination under the condition specified in paragraph (2) and may take effect immediately.

(2) A temporary emergency suspension under this subsection shall be issued to a source only if the Governor of such State finds that—

- (A) there exists in the vicinity of such source a temporary energy emergency involv-

ing high levels of unemployment or loss of necessary energy supplies for residential dwellings; and

(B) such unemployment or loss can be totally or partially alleviated by such emergency suspension.

Not more than one such suspension may be issued for any source on the basis of the same set of circumstances or on the basis of the same emergency.

(3) A temporary emergency suspension issued by a Governor under this subsection shall remain in effect for a maximum of four months or such lesser period as may be specified in a disapproval order of the Administrator, if any. The Administrator may disapprove such suspension if he determines that it does not meet the requirements of paragraph (2).

(4) This subsection shall not apply in the case of a plan provision or requirement promulgated by the Administrator under subsection (c) of this section, but in any such case the President may grant a temporary emergency suspension for a four month period of any such provision or requirement if he makes the determinations and findings specified in paragraphs (1) and (2).

(5) The Governor may include in any temporary emergency suspension issued under this subsection a provision delaying for a period identical to the period of such suspension any compliance schedule (or increment of progress) to which such source is subject under section 1857c-10<sup>2</sup> of this title, as in effect before August 7, 1977, or section 7413(d)<sup>2</sup> of this title, upon a finding that such source is unable to comply with such schedule (or increment) solely because of the conditions on the basis of which a suspension was issued under this subsection.

**(g) Governor's authority to issue temporary emergency suspensions**

(1) In the case of any State which has adopted and submitted to the Administrator a proposed plan revision which the State determines—

- (A) meets the requirements of this section, and

(B) is necessary (i) to prevent the closing for one year or more of any source of air pollution, and (ii) to prevent substantial increases in unemployment which would result from such closing, and

which the Administrator has not approved or disapproved under this section within 12 months of submission of the proposed plan revision, the Governor may issue a temporary emergency suspension of the part of the applicable implementation plan for such State which is proposed to be revised with respect to such source. The determination under subparagraph (B) may not be made with respect to a source which would close without regard to whether or not the proposed plan revision is approved.

(2) A temporary emergency suspension issued by a Governor under this subsection shall remain in effect for a maximum of four months or such lesser period as may be specified in a disapproval order of the Administrator. The Administrator may disapprove such suspension if

<sup>2</sup> See References in Text note below.

he determines that it does not meet the requirements of this subsection.

(3) The Governor may include in any temporary emergency suspension issued under this subsection a provision delaying for a period identical to the period of such suspension any compliance schedule (or increment of progress) to which such source is subject under section 1857c-10<sup>2</sup> of this title as in effect before August 7, 1977, or under section 7413(d)<sup>2</sup> of this title upon a finding that such source is unable to comply with such schedule (or increment) solely because of the conditions on the basis of which a suspension was issued under this subsection.

**(h) Publication of comprehensive document for each State setting forth requirements of applicable implementation plan**

(1) Not later than 5 years after November 15, 1990, and every 3 years thereafter, the Administrator shall assemble and publish a comprehensive document for each State setting forth all requirements of the applicable implementation plan for such State and shall publish notice in the Federal Register of the availability of such documents.

(2) The Administrator may promulgate such regulations as may be reasonably necessary to carry out the purpose of this subsection.

**(i) Modification of requirements prohibited**

Except for a primary nonferrous smelter order under section 7419 of this title, a suspension under subsection (f) or (g) of this section (relating to emergency suspensions), an exemption under section 7418 of this title (relating to certain Federal facilities), an order under section 7413(d)<sup>2</sup> of this title (relating to compliance orders), a plan promulgation under subsection (c) of this section, or a plan revision under subsection (a)(3) of this section; no order, suspension, plan revision, or other action modifying any requirement of an applicable implementation plan may be taken with respect to any stationary source by the State or by the Administrator.

**(j) Technological systems of continuous emission reduction on new or modified stationary sources; compliance with performance standards**

As a condition for issuance of any permit required under this subchapter, the owner or operator of each new or modified stationary source which is required to obtain such a permit must show to the satisfaction of the permitting authority that the technological system of continuous emission reduction which is to be used at such source will enable it to comply with the standards of performance which are to apply to such source and that the construction or modification and operation of such source will be in compliance with all other requirements of this chapter.

**(k) Environmental Protection Agency action on plan submissions**

**(1) Completeness of plan submissions**

**(A) Completeness criteria**

Within 9 months after November 15, 1990, the Administrator shall promulgate minimum criteria that any plan submission must

meet before the Administrator is required to act on such submission under this subsection. The criteria shall be limited to the information necessary to enable the Administrator to determine whether the plan submission complies with the provisions of this chapter.

**(B) Completeness finding**

Within 60 days of the Administrator's receipt of a plan or plan revision, but no later than 6 months after the date, if any, by which a State is required to submit the plan or revision, the Administrator shall determine whether the minimum criteria established pursuant to subparagraph (A) have been met. Any plan or plan revision that a State submits to the Administrator, and that has not been determined by the Administrator (by the date 6 months after receipt of the submission) to have failed to meet the minimum criteria established pursuant to subparagraph (A), shall on that date be deemed by operation of law to meet such minimum criteria.

**(C) Effect of finding of incompleteness**

Where the Administrator determines that a plan submission (or part thereof) does not meet the minimum criteria established pursuant to subparagraph (A), the State shall be treated as not having made the submission (or, in the Administrator's discretion, part thereof).

**(2) Deadline for action**

Within 12 months of a determination by the Administrator (or a determination deemed by operation of law) under paragraph (1) that a State has submitted a plan or plan revision (or, in the Administrator's discretion, part thereof) that meets the minimum criteria established pursuant to paragraph (1), if applicable (or, if those criteria are not applicable, within 12 months of submission of the plan or revision), the Administrator shall act on the submission in accordance with paragraph (3).

**(3) Full and partial approval and disapproval**

In the case of any submittal on which the Administrator is required to act under paragraph (2), the Administrator shall approve such submittal as a whole if it meets all of the applicable requirements of this chapter. If a portion of the plan revision meets all the applicable requirements of this chapter, the Administrator may approve the plan revision in part and disapprove the plan revision in part. The plan revision shall not be treated as meeting the requirements of this chapter until the Administrator approves the entire plan revision as complying with the applicable requirements of this chapter.

**(4) Conditional approval**

The Administrator may approve a plan revision based on a commitment of the State to adopt specific enforceable measures by a date certain, but not later than 1 year after the date of approval of the plan revision. Any such conditional approval shall be treated as a disapproval if the State fails to comply with such commitment.

**(5) Calls for plan revisions**

Whenever the Administrator finds that the applicable implementation plan for any area is substantially inadequate to attain or maintain the relevant national ambient air quality standard, to mitigate adequately the interstate pollutant transport described in section 7506a of this title or section 7511c of this title, or to otherwise comply with any requirement of this chapter, the Administrator shall require the State to revise the plan as necessary to correct such inadequacies. The Administrator shall notify the State of the inadequacies, and may establish reasonable deadlines (not to exceed 18 months after the date of such notice) for the submission of such plan revisions. Such findings and notice shall be public. Any finding under this paragraph shall, to the extent the Administrator deems appropriate, subject the State to the requirements of this chapter to which the State was subject when it developed and submitted the plan for which such finding was made, except that the Administrator may adjust any dates applicable under such requirements as appropriate (except that the Administrator may not adjust any attainment date prescribed under part D of this subchapter, unless such date has elapsed).

**(6) Corrections**

Whenever the Administrator determines that the Administrator's action approving, disapproving, or promulgating any plan or plan revision (or part thereof), area designation, redesignation, classification, or reclassification was in error, the Administrator may in the same manner as the approval, disapproval, or promulgation revise such action as appropriate without requiring any further submission from the State. Such determination and the basis thereof shall be provided to the State and public.

**(l) Plan revisions**

Each revision to an implementation plan submitted by a State under this chapter shall be adopted by such State after reasonable notice and public hearing. The Administrator shall not approve a revision of a plan if the revision would interfere with any applicable requirement concerning attainment and reasonable further progress (as defined in section 7501 of this title), or any other applicable requirement of this chapter.

**(m) Sanctions**

The Administrator may apply any of the sanctions listed in section 7509(b) of this title at any time (or at any time after) the Administrator makes a finding, disapproval, or determination under paragraphs (1) through (4), respectively, of section 7509(a) of this title in relation to any plan or plan item (as that term is defined by the Administrator) required under this chapter, with respect to any portion of the State the Administrator determines reasonable and appropriate, for the purpose of ensuring that the requirements of this chapter relating to such plan or plan item are met. The Administrator shall, by rule, establish criteria for exercising his authority under the previous sentence with respect

to any deficiency referred to in section 7509(a) of this title to ensure that, during the 24-month period following the finding, disapproval, or determination referred to in section 7509(a) of this title, such sanctions are not applied on a statewide basis where one or more political subdivisions covered by the applicable implementation plan are principally responsible for such deficiency.

**(n) Savings clauses****(1) Existing plan provisions**

Any provision of any applicable implementation plan that was approved or promulgated by the Administrator pursuant to this section as in effect before November 15, 1990, shall remain in effect as part of such applicable implementation plan, except to the extent that a revision to such provision is approved or promulgated by the Administrator pursuant to this chapter.

**(2) Attainment dates**

For any area not designated nonattainment, any plan or plan revision submitted or required to be submitted by a State—

(A) in response to the promulgation or revision of a national primary ambient air quality standard in effect on November 15, 1990, or

(B) in response to a finding of substantial inadequacy under subsection (a)(2) of this section (as in effect immediately before November 15, 1990),

shall provide for attainment of the national primary ambient air quality standards within 3 years of November 15, 1990, or within 5 years of issuance of such finding of substantial inadequacy, whichever is later.

**(3) Retention of construction moratorium in certain areas**

In the case of an area to which, immediately before November 15, 1990, the prohibition on construction or modification of major stationary sources prescribed in subsection (a)(2)(I) of this section (as in effect immediately before November 15, 1990) applied by virtue of a finding of the Administrator that the State containing such area had not submitted an implementation plan meeting the requirements of section 7502(b)(6) of this title (relating to establishment of a permit program) (as in effect immediately before November 15, 1990) or 7502(a)(1) of this title (to the extent such requirements relate to provision for attainment of the primary national ambient air quality standard for sulfur oxides by December 31, 1982) as in effect immediately before November 15, 1990, no major stationary source of the relevant air pollutant or pollutants shall be constructed or modified in such area until the Administrator finds that the plan for such area meets the applicable requirements of section 7502(c)(5) of this title (relating to permit programs) or subpart 5 of part D of this subchapter (relating to attainment of the primary national ambient air quality standard for sulfur dioxide), respectively.

**(o) Indian tribes**

If an Indian tribe submits an implementation plan to the Administrator pursuant to section



7601(d) of this title, the plan shall be reviewed in accordance with the provisions for review set forth in this section for State plans, except as otherwise provided by regulation promulgated pursuant to section 7601(d)(2) of this title. When such plan becomes effective in accordance with the regulations promulgated under section 7601(d) of this title, the plan shall become applicable to all areas (except as expressly provided otherwise in the plan) located within the exterior boundaries of the reservation, notwithstanding the issuance of any patent and including rights-of-way running through the reservation.

**(p) Reports**

Any State shall submit, according to such schedule as the Administrator may prescribe, such reports as the Administrator may require relating to emission reductions, vehicle miles traveled, congestion levels, and any other information the Administrator may deem necessary to assess the development<sup>3</sup> effectiveness, need for revision, or implementation of any plan or plan revision required under this chapter.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, § 110, as added Pub. L. 91-604, § 4(a), Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1680; amended Pub. L. 93-319, § 4, June 22, 1974, 88 Stat. 256; Pub. L. 95-95, title I, §§ 107, 108, Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 691, 693; Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(1)-(6), Nov. 16, 1977, 91 Stat. 1399; Pub. L. 97-23, § 3, July 17, 1981, 95 Stat. 142; Pub. L. 101-549, title I, §§ 101(b)-(d), 102(h), 107(c), 108(d), title IV, § 412, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2404-2408, 2422, 2464, 2466, 2634.)

REFERENCES IN TEXT

The Energy Supply and Environmental Coordination Act of 1974, referred to in subsec. (a)(3)(B), is Pub. L. 93-319, June 22, 1974, 88 Stat. 246, as amended, which is classified principally to chapter 16C (§ 791 et seq.) of Title 15, Commerce and Trade. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 791 of Title 15 and Tables.

Section 7413 of this title, referred to in subsecs. (a)(3)(C), (6), (f)(5), (g)(3), and (i), was amended generally by Pub. L. 101-549, title VII, § 701, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2672, and, as so amended, subsecs. (d) and (e) of section 7413 no longer relates to final compliance orders and steel industry compliance extension, respectively.

Section 1857c-10 of this title, as in effect before August 7, 1977, referred to in subsecs. (f)(5) and (g)(3), was in the original "section 119, as in effect before the date of the enactment of this paragraph", meaning section 119 of act July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, as added June 22, 1974, Pub. L. 93-319, § 3, 88 Stat. 248, (which was classified to section 1857c-10 of this title) as in effect prior to the enactment of subsecs. (f)(5) and (g)(3) of this section by Pub. L. 95-95, § 107, Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 691, effective Aug. 7, 1977. Section 112(b)(1) of Pub. L. 95-95 repealed section 119 of act July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, as added by Pub. L. 93-319, and provided that all references to such section 119 in any subsequent enactment which supersedes Pub. L. 93-319 shall be construed to refer to section 113(d) of the Clean Air Act and to paragraph (5) thereof in particular which is classified to section 7413(d)(5) of this title. Section 7413 of this title was subsequently amended generally by Pub. L. 101-549, title VII, § 701, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2672, see note above. Section 117(b) of Pub. L. 95-95 added a new section 119 of act July 14, 1955, which is classified to section 7419 of this title.

<sup>3</sup> So in original. Probably should be followed by a comma.

CODIFICATION

Section was formerly classified to section 1857c-5 of this title.

PRIOR PROVISIONS

A prior section 110 of act July 14, 1955, was renumbered section 117 by Pub. L. 91-604 and is classified to section 7417 of this title.

AMENDMENTS

1990—Subsec. (a)(1). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(d)(8), substituted "3 years (or such shorter period as the Administrator may prescribe)" for "nine months" in two places.

Subsec. (a)(2). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(b), amended par. (2) generally, substituting present provisions for provisions setting the time within which the Administrator was to approve or disapprove a plan or portion thereof and listing the conditions under which the plan or portion thereof was to be approved after reasonable notice and hearing.

Subsec. (a)(3)(A). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(d)(1), struck out subpar. (A) which directed Administrator to approve any revision of an implementation plan if it met certain requirements and had been adopted by the State after reasonable notice and public hearings.

Subsec. (a)(3)(D). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(d)(1), struck out subpar. (D) which directed that certain implementation plans be revised to include comprehensive measures and requirements.

Subsec. (a)(4). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(d)(2), struck out par. (4) which set forth requirements for review procedure.

Subsec. (c)(1). Pub. L. 101-549, § 102(h), amended par. (1) generally, substituting present provisions for provisions relating to preparation and publication of regulations setting forth an implementation plan, after opportunity for a hearing, upon failure of a State to make required submission or revision.

Subsec. (c)(2)(A). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(d)(3)(A), struck out subpar. (A) which required a study and report on necessity of parking surcharge, management of parking supply, and preferential bus/carpool lane regulations to achieve and maintain national primary ambient air quality standards.

Subsec. (c)(2)(C). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(d)(3)(B), struck out subpar. (C) which authorized suspension of certain regulations and requirements relating to management of parking supply.

Subsec. (c)(4). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(d)(3)(C), struck out par. (4) which permitted Governors to temporarily suspend measures in implementation plans relating to retrofits, gas rationing, and reduction of on-street parking.

Subsec. (c)(5)(B). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(d)(3)(D), struck out "(including the written evidence required by part D)," after "include comprehensive measures".

Subsec. (d). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(d)(4), struck out subsec. (d) which defined an applicable implementation plan for purposes of this chapter.

Subsec. (e). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(d)(5), struck out subsec. (e) which permitted an extension of time for attainment of a national primary ambient air quality standard.

Subsec. (f)(1). Pub. L. 101-549, § 412, inserted "or of any requirement under section 7651j of this title (concerning excess emissions penalties or offsets)" in subpar. (A) and in last sentence.

Subsec. (g)(1). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(d)(6), substituted "12 months of submission of the proposed plan revision" for "the required four month period" in closing provisions.

Subsec. (h)(1). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(d)(7), substituted "5 years after November 15, 1990, and every three years thereafter" for "one year after August 7, 1977, and annually thereafter" and struck out at end "Each such document shall be revised as frequently as practicable but not less often than annually."

Subsecs. (k) to (n). Pub. L. 101-549, § 101(c), added subsecs. (k) to (n).

Subsec. (o). Pub. L. 101-549, §107(c), added subsec. (o).  
Subsec. (p). Pub. L. 101-549, §108(d), added subsec. (p).  
1981—Subsec. (a)(3)(C). Pub. L. 97-23 inserted reference to extensions of compliance in decrees entered under section 7413(e) of this title (relating to iron- and steel-producing operations).

1977—Subsec. (a)(2)(A). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(a)(1), substituted “(A) except as may be provided in subparagraph (I)(i) in the case of a plan” for “(A)(i) in the case of a plan”.

Subsec. (a)(2)(B). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(a)(2), substituted “transportation controls, air quality maintenance plans, and preconstruction review of direct sources of air pollution as provided in subparagraph (D)” for “land use and transportation controls”.

Subsec. (a)(2)(D). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(a)(3), substituted “it includes a program to provide for the enforcement of emission limitations and regulation of the modification, construction, and operation of any stationary source, including a permit program as required in parts C and D and a permit or equivalent program for any major emitting facility, within such region as necessary to assure (i) that national ambient air quality standards are achieved and maintained, and (ii) a procedure” for “it includes a procedure”.

Subsec. (a)(2)(E). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(a)(4), substituted “it contains adequate provisions (i) prohibiting any stationary source within the State from emitting any air pollutant in amounts which will (I) prevent attainment or maintenance by any other State of any such national primary or secondary ambient air quality standard, or (II) interfere with measures required to be included in the applicable implementation plan for any other State under part C to prevent significant deterioration of air quality or to protect visibility, and (ii) insuring compliance with the requirements of section 7426 of this title, relating to interstate pollution abatement” for “it contains adequate provisions for intergovernmental cooperation, including measures necessary to insure that emissions of air pollutants from sources located in any air quality control region will not interfere with the attainment or maintenance of such primary or secondary standard in any portion of such region outside of such State or in any other air quality control region”.

Subsec. (a)(2)(F). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(a)(5), added cl. (vi).

Subsec. (a)(2)(H). Pub. L. 95-190, §14(a)(1), substituted “1977;” for “1977”.

Pub. L. 95-95, §108(a)(6), inserted “except as provided in paragraph (3)(C),” after “or (ii)” and “or to otherwise comply with any additional requirements established under the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1977” after “to achieve the national ambient air quality primary or secondary standard which it implements”.

Subsec. (a)(2)(I). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(b), added subpar. (I).

Subsec. (a)(2)(J). Pub. L. 95-190, §14(a)(2), substituted “; and” for “, and”.

Pub. L. 95-95, §108(b), added subpar. (J).

Subsec. (a)(2)(K). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(b) added subpar. (K).

Subsec. (a)(3)(C). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(c), added subpar. (C).

Subsec. (a)(3)(D). Pub. L. 95-190, §14(a)(4), added subpar. (D).

Subsec. (a)(5). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(e), added par. (5).

Subsec. (a)(5)(D). Pub. L. 95-190, §14(a)(3), struck out “preconstruction or premodification” before “review”.

Subsec. (a)(6). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(e), added par. (6).

Subsec. (c)(1). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(d)(1), (2), substituted “plan which meets the requirements of this section” for “plan for any national ambient air quality primary or secondary standard within the time prescribed” in subpar. (A) and, in provisions following subpar. (C), directed that any portion of a plan relating to any measure described in first sentence of 7421 of this title (relating to consultation) or the consultation process required under such section 7421 of this title not be required to be promulgated before the date eight months after such date required for submission.

Subsec. (c)(3) to (5). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(d)(3), added pars. (3) to (5).

Subsec. (d). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(f), substituted “and which implements the requirements of this section” for “and which implements a national primary or secondary ambient air quality standard in a State”.

Subsec. (f). Pub. L. 95-95, §107(a), substituted provisions relating to the handling of national or regional energy emergencies for provisions relating to the postponement of compliance by stationary sources or classes of moving sources with any requirement of applicable implementation plans.

Subsec. (g). Pub. L. 95-95, §108(g), added subsec. (g) relating to publication of comprehensive document.

Pub. L. 95-95, §107(b), added subsec. (g) relating to Governor’s authority to issue temporary emergency suspensions.

Subsec. (h). Pub. L. 95-190, §14(a)(5), redesignated subsec. (g), added by Pub. L. 95-95, §108(g), as (h). Former subsec. (h) redesignated (i).

Subsec. (i). Pub. L. 95-190, §14(a)(5), redesignated subsec. (h), added by Pub. L. 95-95, §108(g), as (i). Former subsec. (i) redesignated (j) and amended.

Subsec. (j). Pub. L. 95-190 §14(a)(5), (6), redesignated subsec. (i), added by Pub. L. 95-95, §108(g), as (j) and in subsec. (j) as so redesignated, substituted “will enable such source” for “at such source will enable it”.

1974—Subsec. (a)(3). Pub. L. 93-319, §4(a), designated existing provisions as subpar. (A) and added subpar. (B).

Subsec. (c). Pub. L. 93-319, §4(b), designated existing provisions as par. (1) and existing pars. (1), (2), and (3) as subpars. (A), (B), and (C), respectively, of such redesignated par. (1), and added par. (2).

#### EFFECTIVE DATE OF 1977 AMENDMENT

Amendment by Pub. L. 95-95 effective Aug. 7, 1977, except as otherwise expressly provided, see section 406(d) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as a note under section 7401 of this title.

#### PENDING ACTIONS AND PROCEEDINGS

Suits, actions, and other proceedings lawfully commenced by or against the Administrator or any other officer or employee of the United States in his official capacity or in relation to the discharge of his official duties under act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977], not to abate by reason of the taking effect of Pub. L. 95-95, see section 406(a) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

#### MODIFICATION OR RESCISSION OF RULES, REGULATIONS, ORDERS, DETERMINATIONS, CONTRACTS, CERTIFICATIONS, AUTHORIZATIONS, DELEGATIONS, AND OTHER ACTIONS

All rules, regulations, orders, determinations, contracts, certifications, authorizations, delegations, or other actions duly issued, made, or taken by or pursuant to act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the date of enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977] to continue in full force and effect until modified or rescinded in accordance with act July 14, 1955, as amended by Pub. L. 95-95 [this chapter], see section 406(b) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

#### MODIFICATION OR RESCISSION OF IMPLEMENTATION PLANS APPROVED AND IN EFFECT PRIOR TO AUG. 7, 1977

Nothing in the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1977 [Pub. L. 95-95] to affect any requirement of an approved implementation plan under this section or any other provision in effect under this chapter before Aug. 7, 1977, until modified or rescinded in accordance with this chapter as amended by the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1977, see section 406(c) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

## SAVINGS PROVISION

Pub. L. 91-604, §16, Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1713, provided that:

“(a)(1) Any implementation plan adopted by any State and submitted to the Secretary of Health, Education, and Welfare, or to the Administrator pursuant to the Clean Air Act [this chapter] prior to enactment of this Act [Dec. 31, 1970] may be approved under section 110 of the Clean Air Act [this section] (as amended by this Act) [Pub. L. 91-604] and shall remain in effect, unless the Administrator determines that such implementation plan, or any portion thereof, is not consistent with applicable requirements of the Clean Air Act [this chapter] (as amended by this Act) and will not provide for the attainment of national primary ambient air quality standards in the time required by such Act. If the Administrator so determines, he shall, within 90 days after promulgation of any national ambient air quality standards pursuant to section 109(a) of the Clean Air Act [section 7409(a) of this title], notify the State and specify in what respects changes are needed to meet the additional requirements of such Act, including requirements to implement national secondary ambient air quality standards. If such changes are not adopted by the State after public hearings and within six months after such notification, the Administrator shall promulgate such changes pursuant to section 110(c) of such Act [subsec. (c) of this section].

“(2) The amendments made by section 4(b) [amending sections 7403 and 7415 of this title] shall not be construed as repealing or modifying the powers of the Administrator with respect to any conference convened under section 108(d) of the Clean Air Act [section 7415 of this title] before the date of enactment of this Act [Dec. 31, 1970].

“(b) Regulations or standards issued under this title II of the Clean Air Act [subchapter II of this chapter] prior to the enactment of this Act [Dec. 31, 1970] shall continue in effect until revised by the Administrator consistent with the purposes of such Act [this chapter].”

## FEDERAL ENERGY ADMINISTRATOR

“Federal Energy Administrator”, for purposes of this chapter, to mean Administrator of Federal Energy Administration established by Pub. L. 93-275, May 7, 1974, 88 Stat. 97, which is classified to section 761 et seq. of Title 15, Commerce and Trade, but with the term to mean any officer of the United States designated as such by the President until Federal Energy Administrator takes office and after Federal Energy Administration ceases to exist, see section 798 of Title 15, Commerce and Trade.

Federal Energy Administration terminated and functions vested by law in Administrator thereof transferred to Secretary of Energy (unless otherwise specifically provided) by sections 7151(a) and 7293 of this title.

**§ 7411. Standards of performance for new stationary sources****(a) Definitions**

For purposes of this section:

(1) The term “standard of performance” means a standard for emissions of air pollutants which reflects the degree of emission limitation achievable through the application of the best system of emission reduction which (taking into account the cost of achieving such reduction and any nonair quality health and environmental impact and energy requirements) the Administrator determines has been adequately demonstrated.

(2) The term “new source” means any stationary source, the construction or modification of which is commenced after the publication of regulations (or, if earlier, proposed reg-

ulations) prescribing a standard of performance under this section which will be applicable to such source.

(3) The term “stationary source” means any building, structure, facility, or installation which emits or may emit any air pollutant. Nothing in subchapter II of this chapter relating to nonroad engines shall be construed to apply to stationary internal combustion engines.

(4) The term “modification” means any physical change in, or change in the method of operation of, a stationary source which increases the amount of any air pollutant emitted by such source or which results in the emission of any air pollutant not previously emitted.

(5) The term “owner or operator” means any person who owns, leases, operates, controls, or supervises a stationary source.

(6) The term “existing source” means any stationary source other than a new source.

(7) The term “technological system of continuous emission reduction” means—

(A) a technological process for production or operation by any source which is inherently low-polluting or nonpolluting, or

(B) a technological system for continuous reduction of the pollution generated by a source before such pollution is emitted into the ambient air, including precombustion cleaning or treatment of fuels.

(8) A conversion to coal (A) by reason of an order under section 2(a) of the Energy Supply and Environmental Coordination Act of 1974 [15 U.S.C. 792(a)] or any amendment thereto, or any subsequent enactment which supercedes such Act [15 U.S.C. 791 et seq.], or (B) which qualifies under section 7413(d)(5)(A)(ii)<sup>1</sup> of this title, shall not be deemed to be a modification for purposes of paragraphs (2) and (4) of this subsection.

**(b) List of categories of stationary sources; standards of performance; information on pollution control techniques; sources owned or operated by United States; particular systems; revised standards**

(1)(A) The Administrator shall, within 90 days after December 31, 1970, publish (and from time to time thereafter shall revise) a list of categories of stationary sources. He shall include a category of sources in such list if in his judgment it causes, or contributes significantly to, air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to endanger public health or welfare.

(B) Within one year after the inclusion of a category of stationary sources in a list under subparagraph (A), the Administrator shall publish proposed regulations, establishing Federal standards of performance for new sources within such category. The Administrator shall afford interested persons an opportunity for written comment on such proposed regulations. After considering such comments, he shall promulgate, within one year after such publication, such standards with such modifications as he deems appropriate. The Administrator shall, at least every 8 years, review and, if appropriate,

<sup>1</sup> See References in Text note below.



revise such standards following the procedure required by this subsection for promulgation of such standards. Notwithstanding the requirements of the previous sentence, the Administrator need not review any such standard if the Administrator determines that such review is not appropriate in light of readily available information on the efficacy of such standard. Standards of performance or revisions thereof shall become effective upon promulgation. When implementation and enforcement of any requirement of this chapter indicate that emission limitations and percent reductions beyond those required by the standards promulgated under this section are achieved in practice, the Administrator shall, when revising standards promulgated under this section, consider the emission limitations and percent reductions achieved in practice.

(2) The Administrator may distinguish among classes, types, and sizes within categories of new sources for the purpose of establishing such standards.

(3) The Administrator shall, from time to time, issue information on pollution control techniques for categories of new sources and air pollutants subject to the provisions of this section.

(4) The provisions of this section shall apply to any new source owned or operated by the United States.

(5) Except as otherwise authorized under subsection (h) of this section, nothing in this section shall be construed to require, or to authorize the Administrator to require, any new or modified source to install and operate any particular technological system of continuous emission reduction to comply with any new source standard of performance.

(6) The revised standards of performance required by enactment of subsection (a)(1)(A)(i) and (ii)<sup>1</sup> of this section shall be promulgated not later than one year after August 7, 1977. Any new or modified fossil fuel fired stationary source which commences construction prior to the date of publication of the proposed revised standards shall not be required to comply with such revised standards.

**(c) State implementation and enforcement of standards of performance**

(1) Each State may develop and submit to the Administrator a procedure for implementing and enforcing standards of performance for new sources located in such State. If the Administrator finds the State procedure is adequate, he shall delegate to such State any authority he has under this chapter to implement and enforce such standards.

(2) Nothing in this subsection shall prohibit the Administrator from enforcing any applicable standard of performance under this section.

**(d) Standards of performance for existing sources; remaining useful life of source**

(1) The Administrator shall prescribe regulations which shall establish a procedure similar to that provided by section 7410 of this title under which each State shall submit to the Administrator a plan which (A) establishes standards of performance for any existing source for any air pollutant (i) for which air quality cri-

teria have not been issued or which is not included on a list published under section 7408(a) of this title or emitted from a source category which is regulated under section 7412 of this title but (ii) to which a standard of performance under this section would apply if such existing source were a new source, and (B) provides for the implementation and enforcement of such standards of performance. Regulations of the Administrator under this paragraph shall permit the State in applying a standard of performance to any particular source under a plan submitted under this paragraph to take into consideration, among other factors, the remaining useful life of the existing source to which such standard applies.

(2) The Administrator shall have the same authority—

(A) to prescribe a plan for a State in cases where the State fails to submit a satisfactory plan as he would have under section 7410(c) of this title in the case of failure to submit an implementation plan, and

(B) to enforce the provisions of such plan in cases where the State fails to enforce them as he would have under sections 7413 and 7414 of this title with respect to an implementation plan.

In promulgating a standard of performance under a plan prescribed under this paragraph, the Administrator shall take into consideration, among other factors, remaining useful lives of the sources in the category of sources to which such standard applies.

**(e) Prohibited acts**

After the effective date of standards of performance promulgated under this section, it shall be unlawful for any owner or operator of any new source to operate such source in violation of any standard of performance applicable to such source.

**(f) New source standards of performance**

(1) For those categories of major stationary sources that the Administrator listed under subsection (b)(1)(A) of this section before November 15, 1990, and for which regulations had not been proposed by the Administrator by November 15, 1990, the Administrator shall—

(A) propose regulations establishing standards of performance for at least 25 percent of such categories of sources within 2 years after November 15, 1990;

(B) propose regulations establishing standards of performance for at least 50 percent of such categories of sources within 4 years after November 15, 1990; and

(C) propose regulations for the remaining categories of sources within 6 years after November 15, 1990.

(2) In determining priorities for promulgating standards for categories of major stationary sources for the purpose of paragraph (1), the Administrator shall consider—

(A) the quantity of air pollutant emissions which each such category will emit, or will be designed to emit;

(B) the extent to which each such pollutant may reasonably be anticipated to endanger public health or welfare; and



(C) the mobility and competitive nature of each such category of sources and the consequent need for nationally applicable new source standards of performance.

(3) Before promulgating any regulations under this subsection or listing any category of major stationary sources as required under this subsection, the Administrator shall consult with appropriate representatives of the Governors and of State air pollution control agencies.

**(g) Revision of regulations**

(1) Upon application by the Governor of a State showing that the Administrator has failed to specify in regulations under subsection (f)(1) of this section any category of major stationary sources required to be specified under such regulations, the Administrator shall revise such regulations to specify any such category.

(2) Upon application of the Governor of a State, showing that any category of stationary sources which is not included in the list under subsection (b)(1)(A) of this section contributes significantly to air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to endanger public health or welfare (notwithstanding that such category is not a category of major stationary sources), the Administrator shall revise such regulations to specify such category of stationary sources.

(3) Upon application of the Governor of a State showing that the Administrator has failed to apply properly the criteria required to be considered under subsection (f)(2) of this section, the Administrator shall revise the list under subsection (b)(1)(A) of this section to apply properly such criteria.

(4) Upon application of the Governor of a State showing that—

(A) a new, innovative, or improved technology or process which achieves greater continuous emission reduction has been adequately demonstrated for any category of stationary sources, and

(B) as a result of such technology or process, the new source standard of performance in effect under this section for such category no longer reflects the greatest degree of emission limitation achievable through application of the best technological system of continuous emission reduction which (taking into consideration the cost of achieving such emission reduction, and any non-air quality health and environmental impact and energy requirements) has been adequately demonstrated,

the Administrator shall revise such standard of performance for such category accordingly.

(5) Unless later deadlines for action of the Administrator are otherwise prescribed under this section, the Administrator shall, not later than three months following the date of receipt of any application by a Governor of a State, either—

(A) find that such application does not contain the requisite showing and deny such application, or

(B) grant such application and take the action required under this subsection.

(6) Before taking any action required by subsection (f) of this section or by this subsection, the Administrator shall provide notice and opportunity for public hearing.

**(h) Design, equipment, work practice, or operational standard; alternative emission limitation**

(1) For purposes of this section, if in the judgment of the Administrator, it is not feasible to prescribe or enforce a standard of performance, he may instead promulgate a design, equipment, work practice, or operational standard, or combination thereof, which reflects the best technological system of continuous emission reduction which (taking into consideration the cost of achieving such emission reduction, and any non-air quality health and environmental impact and energy requirements) the Administrator determines has been adequately demonstrated. In the event the Administrator promulgates a design or equipment standard under this subsection, he shall include as part of such standard such requirements as will assure the proper operation and maintenance of any such element of design or equipment.

(2) For the purpose of this subsection, the phrase “not feasible to prescribe or enforce a standard of performance” means any situation in which the Administrator determines that (A) a pollutant or pollutants cannot be emitted through a conveyance designed and constructed to emit or capture such pollutant, or that any requirement for, or use of, such a conveyance would be inconsistent with any Federal, State, or local law, or (B) the application of measurement methodology to a particular class of sources is not practicable due to technological or economic limitations.

(3) If after notice and opportunity for public hearing, any person establishes to the satisfaction of the Administrator that an alternative means of emission limitation will achieve a reduction in emissions of any air pollutant at least equivalent to the reduction in emissions of such air pollutant achieved under the requirements of paragraph (1), the Administrator shall permit the use of such alternative by the source for purposes of compliance with this section with respect to such pollutant.

(4) Any standard promulgated under paragraph (1) shall be promulgated in terms of standard of performance whenever it becomes feasible to promulgate and enforce such standard in such terms.

(5) Any design, equipment, work practice, or operational standard, or any combination thereof, described in this subsection shall be treated as a standard of performance for purposes of the provisions of this chapter (other than the provisions of subsection (a) of this section and this subsection).

**(i) Country elevators**

Any regulations promulgated by the Administrator under this section applicable to grain elevators shall not apply to country elevators (as defined by the Administrator) which have a storage capacity of less than two million five hundred thousand bushels.

**(j) Innovative technological systems of continuous emission reduction**

(1)(A) Any person proposing to own or operate a new source may request the Administrator for one or more waivers from the requirements of

this section for such source or any portion thereof with respect to any air pollutant to encourage the use of an innovative technological system or systems of continuous emission reduction. The Administrator may, with the consent of the Governor of the State in which the source is to be located, grant a waiver under this paragraph, if the Administrator determines after notice and opportunity for public hearing, that—

(i) the proposed system or systems have not been adequately demonstrated,

(ii) the proposed system or systems will operate effectively and there is a substantial likelihood that such system or systems will achieve greater continuous emission reduction than that required to be achieved under the standards of performance which would otherwise apply, or achieve at least an equivalent reduction at lower cost in terms of energy, economic, or nonair quality environmental impact,

(iii) the owner or operator of the proposed source has demonstrated to the satisfaction of the Administrator that the proposed system will not cause or contribute to an unreasonable risk to public health, welfare, or safety in its operation, function, or malfunction, and

(iv) the granting of such waiver is consistent with the requirements of subparagraph (C).

In making any determination under clause (ii), the Administrator shall take into account any previous failure of such system or systems to operate effectively or to meet any requirement of the new source performance standards. In determining whether an unreasonable risk exists under clause (iii), the Administrator shall consider, among other factors, whether and to what extent the use of the proposed technological system will cause, increase, reduce, or eliminate emissions of any unregulated pollutants; available methods for reducing or eliminating any risk to public health, welfare, or safety which may be associated with the use of such system; and the availability of other technological systems which may be used to conform to standards under this section without causing or contributing to such unreasonable risk. The Administrator may conduct such tests and may require the owner or operator of the proposed source to conduct such tests and provide such information as is necessary to carry out clause (iii) of this subparagraph. Such requirements shall include a requirement for prompt reporting of the emission of any unregulated pollutant from a system if such pollutant was not emitted, or was emitted in significantly lesser amounts without use of such system.

(B) A waiver under this paragraph shall be granted on such terms and conditions as the Administrator determines to be necessary to assure—

(i) emissions from the source will not prevent attainment and maintenance of any national ambient air quality standards, and

(ii) proper functioning of the technological system or systems authorized.

Any such term or condition shall be treated as a standard of performance for the purposes of subsection (e) of this section and section 7413 of this title.

(C) The number of waivers granted under this paragraph with respect to a proposed technological system of continuous emission reduction shall not exceed such number as the Administrator finds necessary to ascertain whether or not such system will achieve the conditions specified in clauses (ii) and (iii) of subparagraph (A).

(D) A waiver under this paragraph shall extend to the sooner of—

(i) the date determined by the Administrator, after consultation with the owner or operator of the source, taking into consideration the design, installation, and capital cost of the technological system or systems being used, or

(ii) the date on which the Administrator determines that such system has failed to—

(I) achieve at least an equivalent continuous emission reduction to that required to be achieved under the standards of performance which would otherwise apply, or

(II) comply with the condition specified in paragraph (1)(A)(iii),

and that such failure cannot be corrected.

(E) In carrying out subparagraph (D)(i), the Administrator shall not permit any waiver for a source or portion thereof to extend beyond the date—

(i) seven years after the date on which any waiver is granted to such source or portion thereof, or

(ii) four years after the date on which such source or portion thereof commences operation,

whichever is earlier.

(F) No waiver under this subsection shall apply to any portion of a source other than the portion on which the innovative technological system or systems of continuous emission reduction is used.

(2)(A) If a waiver under paragraph (1) is terminated under clause (ii) of paragraph (1)(D), the Administrator shall grant an extension of the requirements of this section for such source for such minimum period as may be necessary to comply with the applicable standard of performance under this section. Such period shall not extend beyond the date three years from the time such waiver is terminated.

(B) An extension granted under this paragraph shall set forth emission limits and a compliance schedule containing increments of progress which require compliance with the applicable standards of performance as expeditiously as practicable and include such measures as are necessary and practicable in the interim to minimize emissions. Such schedule shall be treated as a standard of performance for purposes of subsection (e) of this section and section 7413 of this title.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, § 111, as added Pub. L. 91-604, § 4(a), Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1683; amended Pub. L. 92-157, title III, § 302(f), Nov. 18, 1971, 85 Stat. 464; Pub. L. 95-95, title I, § 109(a)-(d)(1), (e), (f), title IV, § 401(b), Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 697-703, 791; Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(7)-(9), Nov. 16, 1977, 91 Stat. 1399; Pub. L. 95-623, § 13(a), Nov. 9, 1978, 92 Stat. 3457; Pub. L.

101-549, title I, §108(e)-(g), title III, §302(a), (b), title IV, §403(a), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2467, 2574, 2631.)

## REFERENCES IN TEXT

Such Act, referred to in subsec. (a)(8), means Pub. L. 93-319, June 22, 1974, 88 Stat. 246, as amended, known as the Energy Supply and Environmental Coordination Act of 1974, which is classified principally to chapter 16C (§791 et seq.) of Title 15, Commerce and Trade. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 791 of Title 15 and Tables.

Section 7413 of this title, referred to in subsec. (a)(8), was amended generally by Pub. L. 101-549, title VII, §701, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2672, and, as so amended, subsec. (d) of section 7413 no longer relates to final compliance orders.

Subsection (a)(1) of this section, referred to in subsec. (b)(6), was amended generally by Pub. L. 101-549, title VII, §403(a), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2631, and, as so amended, no longer contains subpars.

## CODIFICATION

Section was formerly classified to section 1857c-6 of this title.

## PRIOR PROVISIONS

A prior section 111 of act July 14, 1955, was renumbered section 118 by Pub. L. 91-604 and is classified to section 7418 of this title.

## AMENDMENTS

1990—Subsec. (a)(1), Pub. L. 101-549, §403(a), amended par. (1) generally, substituting provisions defining “standard of performance” with respect to any air pollutant for provisions defining such term with respect to subsec. (b) fossil fuel fired and other stationary sources and subsec. (d) particular sources.

Subsec. (a)(3), Pub. L. 101-549, §108(f), inserted at end “Nothing in subchapter II of this chapter relating to nonroad engines shall be construed to apply to stationary internal combustion engines.”

Subsec. (b)(1)(B), Pub. L. 101-549, §108(e)(1), substituted “Within one year” for “Within 120 days”, “within one year” for “within 90 days”, and “every 8 years” for “every four years”, inserted before last sentence “Notwithstanding the requirements of the previous sentence, the Administrator need not review any such standard if the Administrator determines that such review is not appropriate in light of readily available information on the efficacy of such standard.”, and inserted at end “When implementation and enforcement of any requirement of this chapter indicate that emission limitations and percent reductions beyond those required by the standards promulgated under this section are achieved in practice, the Administrator shall, when revising standards promulgated under this section, consider the emission limitations and percent reductions achieved in practice.”

Subsec. (d)(1)(A)(i), Pub. L. 101-549, §302(a), which directed the substitution of “7412(b)” for “7412(b)(1)(A)”, could not be executed, because of the prior amendment by Pub. L. 101-549, §108(g), see below.

Pub. L. 101-549, §108(g), substituted “or emitted from a source category which is regulated under section 7412 of this title” for “or 7412(b)(1)(A)”.

Subsec. (f)(1), Pub. L. 101-549, §108(e)(2), amended par. (1) generally, substituting present provisions for provisions requiring the Administrator to promulgate regulations listing the categories of major stationary sources not on the required list by Aug. 7, 1977, and regulations establishing standards of performance for such categories.

Subsec. (g)(5) to (8), Pub. L. 101-549, §302(b), redesignated par. (7) as (5) and struck out “or section 7412 of this title” after “this section”, redesignated par. (8) as (6), and struck out former pars. (5) and (6) which read as follows:

“(5) Upon application by the Governor of a State showing that the Administrator has failed to list any air pollutant which causes, or contributes to, air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to result in an increase in mortality or an increase in serious irreversible, or incapacitating reversible, illness as a hazardous air pollutant under section 7412 of this title the Administrator shall revise the list of hazardous air pollutants under such section to include such pollutant.

“(6) Upon application by the Governor of a State showing that any category of stationary sources of a hazardous air pollutant listed under section 7412 of this title is not subject to emission standards under such section, the Administrator shall propose and promulgate such emission standards applicable to such category of sources.”

1978—Subsecs. (d)(1)(A)(ii), (g)(4)(B), Pub. L. 95-623, §13(a)(2), substituted “under this section” for “under subsection (b) of this section”.

Subsec. (h)(5), Pub. L. 95-623, §13(a)(1), added par. (5).

Subsec. (j), Pub. L. 95-623, §13(a)(3), substituted in pars. (1)(A) and (2)(A) “standards under this section” and “under this section” for “standards under subsection (b) of this section” and “under subsection (b) of this section”, respectively.

1977—Subsec. (a)(1), Pub. L. 95-95, §109(c)(1)(A), added subpars. (A), (B), and (C), substituted “For the purpose of subparagraphs (A)(i) and (ii) and (B), a standard of performance shall reflect” for “a standard for emissions of air pollutants which reflects”, “and the percentage reduction achievable” for “achievable”, and “technological system of continuous emission reduction which (taking into consideration the cost of achieving such emission reduction, and any nonair quality health and environment impact and energy requirements)” for “system of emission reduction which (taking into account the cost of achieving such reduction)” in existing provisions, and inserted provision that, for the purpose of subparagraph (1)(A)(ii), any cleaning of the fuel or reduction in the pollution characteristics of the fuel after extraction and prior to combustion may be credited, as determined under regulations promulgated by the Administrator, to a source which burns such fuel.

Subsec. (a)(7), Pub. L. 95-95, §109(c)(1)(B), added par. (7) defining “technological system of continuous emission reduction”.

Pub. L. 95-95, §109(f), added par. (7) directing that under certain circumstances a conversion to coal not be deemed a modification for purposes of pars. (2) and (4).

Subsec. (a)(7), (8), Pub. L. 95-190, §14(a)(7), redesignated second par. (7) as (8).

Subsec. (b)(1)(A), Pub. L. 95-95, §401(b), substituted “such list if in his judgment it causes, or contributes significantly to, air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to endanger” for “such list if he determines it may contribute significantly to air pollution which causes or contributes to the endangerment of”.

Subsec. (b)(1)(B), Pub. L. 95-95, §109(c)(2), substituted “shall, at least every four years, review and, if appropriate,” for “may, from time to time.”.

Subsec. (b)(5), (6), Pub. L. 95-95, §109(c)(3), added pars. (5) and (6).

Subsec. (c)(1), Pub. L. 95-95, §109(d)(1), struck out “(except with respect to new sources owned or operated by the United States)” after “implement and enforce such standards”.

Subsec. (d)(1), Pub. L. 95-95, §109(b)(1), substituted “standards of performance” for “emission standards” and inserted provisions directing that regulations of the Administrator permit the State, in applying a standard of performance to any particular source under a submitted plan, to take into consideration, among other factors, the remaining useful life of the existing source to which the standard applies.

Subsec. (d)(2), Pub. L. 95-95, §109(b)(2), provided that, in promulgating a standard of performance under a plan, the Administrator take into consideration, among other factors, the remaining useful lives of the



sources in the category of sources to which the standard applies.

Subsecs. (f) to (i). Pub. L. 95-95, §109(a), added subsecs. (f) to (i).

Subsecs. (j), (k). Pub. L. 95-190, §14(a)(8), (9), redesignated subsec. (k) as (j) and, as so redesignated, substituted “(B)” for “(8)” as designation for second subpar. in par. (2). Former subsec. (j), added by Pub. L. 95-95, §109(e), which related to compliance with applicable standards of performance, was struck out.

Pub. L. 95-95, §109(e), added subsec. (k).

1971—Subsec. (b)(1)(B). Pub. L. 92-157 substituted in first sentence “publish proposed” for “propose”.

#### EFFECTIVE DATE OF 1977 AMENDMENT

Amendment by Pub. L. 95-95 effective Aug. 7, 1977, except as otherwise expressly provided, see section 406(d) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as a note under section 7401 of this title.

#### REGULATIONS

Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §403(b), (c), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2631, provided that:

“(b) REVISED REGULATIONS.—Not later than three years after the date of enactment of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 [Nov. 15, 1990], the Administrator shall promulgate revised regulations for standards of performance for new fossil fuel fired electric utility units commencing construction after the date on which such regulations are proposed that, at a minimum, require any source subject to such revised standards to emit sulfur dioxide at a rate not greater than would have resulted from compliance by such source with the applicable standards of performance under this section [amending sections 7411 and 7479 of this title] prior to such revision.

“(c) APPLICABILITY.—The provisions of subsections (a) [amending this section] and (b) apply only so long as the provisions of section 403(e) of the Clean Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7651b(e)] remain in effect.”

#### TRANSFER OF FUNCTIONS

Enforcement functions of Administrator or other official in Environmental Protection Agency related to compliance with new source performance standards under this section with respect to pre-construction, construction, and initial operation of transportation system for Canadian and Alaskan natural gas transferred to Federal Inspector, Office of Federal Inspector for the Alaska Natural Gas Transportation System, until first anniversary of date of initial operation of Alaska Natural Gas Transportation System, see Reorg. Plan No. 1 of 1979, eff. July 1, 1979, §§102(a), 203(a), 44 F.R. 33663, 33666, 93 Stat. 1373, 1376, set out in the Appendix to Title 5, Government Organization and Employees. Office of Federal Inspector for the Alaska Natural Gas Transportation System abolished and functions and authority vested in Inspector transferred to Secretary of Energy by section 3012(b) of Pub. L. 102-486, set out as an Abolition of Office of Federal Inspector note under section 719e of Title 15, Commerce and Trade. Functions and authority vested in Secretary of Energy subsequently transferred to Federal Coordinator for Alaska Natural Gas Transportation Projects by section 720d(f) of Title 15.

#### PENDING ACTIONS AND PROCEEDINGS

Suits, actions, and other proceedings lawfully commenced by or against the Administrator or any other officer or employee of the United States in his official capacity or in relation to the discharge of his official duties under act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977], not to abate by reason of the taking effect of Pub. L. 95-95, see section 406(a) of Pub. L.

95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

#### MODIFICATION OR RESCISSION OF RULES, REGULATIONS, ORDERS, DETERMINATIONS, CONTRACTS, CERTIFICATIONS, AUTHORIZATIONS, DELEGATIONS, AND OTHER ACTIONS

All rules, regulations, orders, determinations, contracts, certifications, authorizations, delegations, or other actions duly issued, made, or taken by or pursuant to act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the date of enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977] to continue in full force and effect until modified or rescinded in accordance with act July 14, 1955, as amended by Pub. L. 95-95 [this chapter], see section 406(b) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

#### POWER SECTOR CARBON POLLUTION STANDARDS

Memorandum of President of the United States, June 25, 2013, 78 F.R. 39535, provided:

Memorandum for the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency

With every passing day, the urgency of addressing climate change intensifies. I made clear in my State of the Union address that my Administration is committed to reducing carbon pollution that causes climate change, preparing our communities for the consequences of climate change, and speeding the transition to more sustainable sources of energy.

The Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) has already undertaken such action with regard to carbon pollution from the transportation sector, issuing Clean Air Act standards limiting the greenhouse gas emissions of new cars and light trucks through 2025 and heavy duty trucks through 2018. The EPA standards were promulgated in conjunction with the Department of Transportation, which, at the same time, established fuel efficiency standards for cars and trucks as part of a harmonized national program. Both agencies engaged constructively with auto manufacturers, labor unions, States, and other stakeholders, and the resulting standards have received broad support. These standards will reduce the Nation's carbon pollution and dependence on oil, and also lead to greater innovation, economic growth, and cost savings for American families.

The United States now has the opportunity to address carbon pollution from the power sector, which produces nearly 40 percent of such pollution. As a country, we can continue our progress in reducing power plant pollution, thereby improving public health and protecting the environment, while supplying the reliable, affordable power needed for economic growth and advancing cleaner energy technologies, such as efficient natural gas, nuclear power, renewables such as wind and solar energy, and clean coal technology.

Investments in these technologies will also strengthen our economy, as the clean and efficient production and use of electricity will ensure that it remains reliable and affordable for American businesses and families.

By the authority vested in me as President by the Constitution and the laws of the United States of America, and in order to reduce power plant carbon pollution, building on actions already underway in States and the power sector, I hereby direct the following:

SECTION 1. *Flexible Carbon Pollution Standards for Power Plants.* (a) Carbon Pollution Standards for Future Power Plants. On April 13, 2012, the EPA published a Notice of Proposed Rulemaking entitled “Standards of Performance for Greenhouse Gas Emissions for New Stationary Sources: Electric Utility Generating Units,” 77 Fed. Reg. 22392. In light of the information conveyed in more than two million comments on that proposal and ongoing developments in the industry, you have indicated EPA's intention to issue a new proposal. I therefore direct you to issue a new proposal by

no later than September 20, 2013. I further direct you to issue a final rule in a timely fashion after considering all public comments, as appropriate.

(b) *Carbon Pollution Regulation for Modified, Reconstructed, and Existing Power Plants.* To ensure continued progress in reducing harmful carbon pollution, I direct you to use your authority under sections 111(b) and 111(d) of the Clean Air Act to issue standards, regulations, or guidelines, as appropriate, that address carbon pollution from modified, reconstructed, and existing power plants and build on State efforts to move toward a cleaner power sector. In addition, I request that you:

(i) issue proposed carbon pollution standards, regulations, or guidelines, as appropriate, for modified, reconstructed, and existing power plants by no later than June 1, 2014;

(ii) issue final standards, regulations, or guidelines, as appropriate, for modified, reconstructed, and existing power plants by no later than June 1, 2015; and

(iii) include in the guidelines addressing existing power plants a requirement that States submit to EPA the implementation plans required under section 111(d) of the Clean Air Act and its implementing regulations by no later than June 30, 2016.

(c) *Development of Standards, Regulations, or Guidelines for Power Plants.* In developing standards, regulations, or guidelines pursuant to subsection (b) of this section, and consistent with Executive Orders 12866 of September 30, 1993, as amended, and 13563 of January 18, 2011, you shall ensure, to the greatest extent possible, that you:

(i) launch this effort through direct engagement with States, as they will play a central role in establishing and implementing standards for existing power plants, and, at the same time, with leaders in the power sector, labor leaders, non-governmental organizations, other experts, tribal officials, other stakeholders, and members of the public, on issues informing the design of the program;

(ii) consistent with achieving regulatory objectives and taking into account other relevant environmental regulations and policies that affect the power sector, tailor regulations and guidelines to reduce costs;

(iii) develop approaches that allow the use of market-based instruments, performance standards, and other regulatory flexibilities;

(iv) ensure that the standards enable continued reliance on a range of energy sources and technologies;

(v) ensure that the standards are developed and implemented in a manner consistent with the continued provision of reliable and affordable electric power for consumers and businesses; and

(vi) work with the Department of Energy and other Federal and State agencies to promote the reliable and affordable provision of electric power through the continued development and deployment of cleaner technologies and by increasing energy efficiency, including through stronger appliance efficiency standards and other measures.

**SEC. 2. General Provisions.** (a) This memorandum shall be implemented consistent with applicable law, including international trade obligations, and subject to the availability of appropriations.

(b) Nothing in this memorandum shall be construed to impair or otherwise affect:

(i) the authority granted by law to a department, agency, or the head thereof; or

(ii) the functions of the Director of the Office of Management and Budget relating to budgetary, administrative, or legislative proposals.

(c) This memorandum is not intended to, and does not, create any right or benefit, substantive or procedural, enforceable at law or in equity by any party against the United States, its departments, agencies, or entities, its officers, employees, or agents, or any other person.

(d) You are hereby authorized and directed to publish this memorandum in the Federal Register.

BARACK OBAMA.

## § 7412. Hazardous air pollutants

### (a) Definitions

For purposes of this section, except subsection (r) of this section—

#### (1) Major source

The term “major source” means any stationary source or group of stationary sources located within a contiguous area and under common control that emits or has the potential to emit considering controls, in the aggregate, 10 tons per year or more of any hazardous air pollutant or 25 tons per year or more of any combination of hazardous air pollutants. The Administrator may establish a lesser quantity, or in the case of radionuclides different criteria, for a major source than that specified in the previous sentence, on the basis of the potency of the air pollutant, persistence, potential for bioaccumulation, other characteristics of the air pollutant, or other relevant factors.

#### (2) Area source

The term “area source” means any stationary source of hazardous air pollutants that is not a major source. For purposes of this section, the term “area source” shall not include motor vehicles or nonroad vehicles subject to regulation under subchapter II of this chapter.

#### (3) Stationary source

The term “stationary source” shall have the same meaning as such term has under section 7411(a) of this title.

#### (4) New source

The term “new source” means a stationary source the construction or reconstruction of which is commenced after the Administrator first proposes regulations under this section establishing an emission standard applicable to such source.

#### (5) Modification

The term “modification” means any physical change in, or change in the method of operation of, a major source which increases the actual emissions of any hazardous air pollutant emitted by such source by more than a de minimis amount or which results in the emission of any hazardous air pollutant not previously emitted by more than a de minimis amount.

#### (6) Hazardous air pollutant

The term “hazardous air pollutant” means any air pollutant listed pursuant to subsection (b) of this section.

#### (7) Adverse environmental effect

The term “adverse environmental effect” means any significant and widespread adverse effect, which may reasonably be anticipated, to wildlife, aquatic life, or other natural resources, including adverse impacts on populations of endangered or threatened species or significant degradation of environmental quality over broad areas.

#### (8) Electric utility steam generating unit

The term “electric utility steam generating unit” means any fossil fuel fired combustion

unit of more than 25 megawatts that serves a generator that produces electricity for sale. A unit that cogenerates steam and electricity and supplies more than one-third of its potential electric output capacity and more than 25 megawatts electrical output to any utility power distribution system for sale shall be considered an electric utility steam generating unit.

**(9) Owner or operator**

The term “owner or operator” means any person who owns, leases, operates, controls, or supervises a stationary source.

**(10) Existing source**

The term “existing source” means any stationary source other than a new source.

**(11) Carcinogenic effect**

Unless revised, the term “carcinogenic effect” shall have the meaning provided by the Administrator under Guidelines for Carcinogenic Risk Assessment as of the date of enactment.<sup>1</sup> Any revisions in the existing Guidelines shall be subject to notice and opportunity for comment.

**(b) List of pollutants**

**(1) Initial list**

The Congress establishes for purposes of this section a list of hazardous air pollutants as follows:

CAS number	Chemical name
75070	Acetaldehyde
60355	Acetamide
75058	Acetonitrile
98862	Acetophenone
53963	2-Acetylaminofluorene
107028	Acrolein
79061	Acrylamide
79107	Acrylic acid
107131	Acrylonitrile
107051	Allyl chloride
92671	4-Aminobiphenyl
62533	Aniline
90040	o-Anisidine
1332214	Asbestos
71432	Benzene (including benzene from gasoline)
92875	Benzidine
98077	Benzotrichloride
100447	Benzyl chloride
92524	Biphenyl
117817	Bis(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate (DEHP)
542881	Bis(chloromethyl)ether
75252	Bromoform
106990	1,3-Butadiene
156627	Calcium cyanamide
105602	Caprolactam
133062	Captan
63252	Carbaryl
75150	Carbon disulfide
56235	Carbon tetrachloride
463581	Carbonyl sulfide
120809	Catechol
133904	Chloramben
57749	Chlordane
7782505	Chlorine
79118	Chloroacetic acid
532274	2-Chloroacetophenone
108907	Chlorobenzene
510156	Chlorobenzilate

<sup>1</sup> See References in Text note below.

CAS number	Chemical name
67663	Chloroform
107302	Chloromethyl methyl ether
126998	Chloroprene
1319773	Cresols/Cresylic acid (isomers and mixture)
95487	o-Cresol
108394	m-Cresol
106445	p-Cresol
98828	Cumene
94757	2,4-D, salts and esters
3547044	DDE
334883	Diazomethane
132649	Dibenzofurans
96128	1,2-Dibromo-3-chloropropane
84742	Dibutylphthalate
106467	1,4-Dichlorobenzene(p)
91941	3,3-Dichlorobenzidene
111444	Dichloroethyl ether (Bis(2-chloroethyl)ether)
542756	1,3-Dichloropropene
62737	Dichlorvos
111422	Diethanolamine
121697	N,N-Diethyl aniline (N,N-Dimethylaniline)
64675	Diethyl sulfate
119904	3,3-Dimethoxybenzidine
60117	Dimethyl aminoazobenzene
119937	3,3'-Dimethyl benzidine
79447	Dimethyl carbamoyl chloride
68122	Dimethyl formamide
57147	1,1-Dimethyl hydrazine
131113	Dimethyl phthalate
77781	Dimethyl sulfate
534521	4,6-Dinitro-o-cresol, and salts
51285	2,4-Dinitrophenol
121142	2,4-Dinitrotoluene
123911	1,4-Dioxane (1,4-Diethyleneoxide)
122667	1,2-Diphenylhydrazine
106898	Epichlorohydrin (1-Chloro-2,3-epoxypropane)
106887	1,2-Epoxybutane
140885	Ethyl acrylate
100414	Ethyl benzene
51796	Ethyl carbamate (Urethane)
75003	Ethyl chloride (Chloroethane)
106934	Ethylene dibromide (Dibromoethane)
107062	Ethylene dichloride (1,2-Dichloroethane)
107211	Ethylene glycol
151564	Ethylene imine (Aziridine)
75218	Ethylene oxide
96457	Ethylene thiourea
75343	Ethylidene dichloride (1,1-Dichloroethane)
50000	Formaldehyde
76448	Heptachlor
118741	Hexachlorobenzene
87683	Hexachlorobutadiene
77474	Hexachlorocyclopentadiene
67721	Hexachloroethane
822060	Hexamethylene-1,6-diisocyanate
680319	Hexamethylphosphoramide
110543	Hexane
302012	Hydrazine
7647010	Hydrochloric acid
7664393	Hydrogen fluoride (Hydrofluoric acid)
123319	Hydroquinone
78591	Isophorone
58899	Lindane (all isomers)
108316	Maleic anhydride
67561	Methanol
72435	Methoxychlor
74839	Methyl bromide (Bromomethane)
74873	Methyl chloride (Chloromethane)
71556	Methyl chloroform (1,1,1-Trichloroethane)
78933	Methyl ethyl ketone (2-Butanone)
60344	Methyl hydrazine
74884	Methyl iodide (Iodomethane)
108101	Methyl isobutyl ketone (Hexone)
624839	Methyl isocyanate
80626	Methyl methacrylate
1634044	Methyl tert butyl ether
101144	4,4-Methylene bis(2-chloroaniline)



CAS number	Chemical name
75092	Methylene chloride (Dichloromethane)
101688	Methylene diphenyl diisocyanate (MDI)
101779	4,4'-Methylenedianiline
91203	Naphthalene
98953	Nitrobenzene
92933	4-Nitrobiphenyl
100027	4-Nitrophenol
79469	2-Nitropropane
684935	N-Nitroso-N-methylurea
62759	N-Nitrosodimethylamine
59892	N-Nitrosomorpholine
56382	Parathion
82688	Pentachloronitrobenzene (Quintobenzene)
87865	Pentachlorophenol
108952	Phenol
106503	p-Phenylenediamine
75445	Phosgene
7803512	Phosphine
7723140	Phosphorus
85449	Phthalic anhydride
1336363	Polychlorinated biphenyls (Aroclors)
1120714	1,3-Propane sultone
57578	beta-Propiolactone
123386	Propionaldehyde
114261	Propoxur (Baygon)
78875	Propylene dichloride (1,2-Dichloropropane)
75569	Propylene oxide
75558	1,2-Propylenimine (2-Methyl aziridine)
91225	Quinoline
106514	Quinone
100425	Styrene
96093	Styrene oxide
1746016	2,3,7,8-Tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin
79345	1,1,2,2-Tetrachloroethane
127184	Tetrachloroethylene (Perchloroethylene)
7550450	Titanium tetrachloride
108883	Toluene
95807	2,4-Toluene diamine
584849	2,4-Toluene diisocyanate
95534	o-Toluidine
8001352	Toxaphene (chlorinated camphene)
120821	1,2,4-Trichlorobenzene
79005	1,1,2-Trichloroethane
79016	Trichloroethylene
95954	2,4,5-Trichlorophenol
88062	2,4,6-Trichlorophenol
121448	Triethylamine
1582098	Trifluralin
540841	2,2,4-Trimethylpentane
108054	Vinyl acetate
593602	Vinyl bromide
75014	Vinyl chloride
75354	Vinylidene chloride (1,1-Dichloroethylene)
1330207	Xylenes (isomers and mixture)
95476	o-Xylenes
108383	m-Xylenes
106423	p-Xylenes
0	Antimony Compounds
0	Arsenic Compounds (inorganic including arsine)
0	Beryllium Compounds
0	Cadmium Compounds
0	Chromium Compounds
0	Cobalt Compounds
0	Coke Oven Emissions
0	Cyanide Compounds <sup>1</sup>
0	Glycol ethers <sup>2</sup>
0	Lead Compounds
0	Manganese Compounds
0	Mercury Compounds
0	Fine mineral fibers <sup>3</sup>
0	Nickel Compounds
0	Polycyclic Organic Matter <sup>4</sup>
0	Radionuclides (including radon) <sup>5</sup>

0 Selenium Compounds

NOTE: For all listings above which contain the word "compounds" and for glycol ethers, the following applies: Unless otherwise specified, these listings are defined as including any unique chemical substance that contains the named chemical (i.e., antimony, arsenic, etc.) as part of that chemical's infrastructure.

<sup>1</sup>X'CN where X = H' or any other group where a formal dissociation may occur. For example KCN or Ca(CN)<sub>2</sub>.

<sup>2</sup>Includes mono- and di- ethers of ethylene glycol, diethylene glycol, and triethylene glycol R-(OCH<sub>2</sub>CH<sub>2</sub>)<sub>n</sub>-OR' where n = 1, 2, or 3  
R = alkyl or aryl groups  
R' = R, H, or groups which, when removed, yield glycol ethers with the structure: R-(OCH<sub>2</sub>CH<sub>2</sub>)<sub>n</sub>-OH. Polymers are excluded from the glycol category.

<sup>3</sup>Includes mineral fiber emissions from facilities manufacturing or processing glass, rock, or slag fibers (or other mineral derived fibers) of average diameter 1 micrometer or less.

<sup>4</sup>Includes organic compounds with more than one benzene ring, and which have a boiling point greater than or equal to 100°C.

<sup>5</sup>A type of atom which spontaneously undergoes radioactive decay.

**(2) Revision of the list**

The Administrator shall periodically review the list established by this subsection and publish the results thereof and, where appropriate, revise such list by rule, adding pollutants which present, or may present, through inhalation or other routes of exposure, a threat of adverse human health effects (including, but not limited to, substances which are known to be, or may reasonably be anticipated to be, carcinogenic, mutagenic, teratogenic, neurotoxic, which cause reproductive dysfunction, or which are acutely or chronically toxic) or adverse environmental effects whether through ambient concentrations, bioaccumulation, deposition, or otherwise, but not including releases subject to regulation under subsection (r) of this section as a result of emissions to the air. No air pollutant which is listed under section 7408(a) of this title may be added to the list under this section, except that the prohibition of this sentence shall not apply to any pollutant which independently meets the listing criteria of this paragraph and is a precursor to a pollutant which is listed under section 7408(a) of this title or to any pollutant which is in a class of pollutants listed under such section. No substance, practice, process or activity regulated under subchapter VI of this chapter shall be subject to regulation under this section solely due to its adverse effects on the environment.

**(3) Petitions to modify the list**

(A) Beginning at any time after 6 months after November 15, 1990, any person may petition the Administrator to modify the list of hazardous air pollutants under this subsection by adding or deleting a substance or, in case of listed pollutants without CAS numbers (other than coke oven emissions, mineral fibers, or polycyclic organic matter) removing certain unique substances. Within 18 months after receipt of a petition, the Administrator shall either grant or deny the petition by publishing a written explanation of the reasons for the Administrator's decision. Any such petition



shall include a showing by the petitioner that there is adequate data on the health or environmental defects<sup>2</sup> of the pollutant or other evidence adequate to support the petition. The Administrator may not deny a petition solely on the basis of inadequate resources or time for review.

(B) The Administrator shall add a substance to the list upon a showing by the petitioner or on the Administrator's own determination that the substance is an air pollutant and that emissions, ambient concentrations, bioaccumulation or deposition of the substance are known to cause or may reasonably be anticipated to cause adverse effects to human health or adverse environmental effects.

(C) The Administrator shall delete a substance from the list upon a showing by the petitioner or on the Administrator's own determination that there is adequate data on the health and environmental effects of the substance to determine that emissions, ambient concentrations, bioaccumulation or deposition of the substance may not reasonably be anticipated to cause any adverse effects to the human health or adverse environmental effects.

(D) The Administrator shall delete one or more unique chemical substances that contain a listed hazardous air pollutant not having a CAS number (other than coke oven emissions, mineral fibers, or polycyclic organic matter) upon a showing by the petitioner or on the Administrator's own determination that such unique chemical substances that contain the named chemical of such listed hazardous air pollutant meet the deletion requirements of subparagraph (C). The Administrator must grant or deny a deletion petition prior to promulgating any emission standards pursuant to subsection (d) of this section applicable to any source category or subcategory of a listed hazardous air pollutant without a CAS number listed under subsection (b) of this section for which a deletion petition has been filed within 12 months of November 15, 1990.

#### **(4) Further information**

If the Administrator determines that information on the health or environmental effects of a substance is not sufficient to make a determination required by this subsection, the Administrator may use any authority available to the Administrator to acquire such information.

#### **(5) Test methods**

The Administrator may establish, by rule, test measures and other analytic procedures for monitoring and measuring emissions, ambient concentrations, deposition, and bioaccumulation of hazardous air pollutants.

#### **(6) Prevention of significant deterioration**

The provisions of part C of this subchapter (prevention of significant deterioration) shall not apply to pollutants listed under this section.

#### **(7) Lead**

The Administrator may not list elemental lead as a hazardous air pollutant under this subsection.

#### **(c) List of source categories**

##### **(1) In general**

Not later than 12 months after November 15, 1990, the Administrator shall publish, and shall from time to time, but no less often than every 8 years, revise, if appropriate, in response to public comment or new information, a list of all categories and subcategories of major sources and area sources (listed under paragraph (3)) of the air pollutants listed pursuant to subsection (b) of this section. To the extent practicable, the categories and subcategories listed under this subsection shall be consistent with the list of source categories established pursuant to section 7411 of this title and part C of this subchapter. Nothing in the preceding sentence limits the Administrator's authority to establish subcategories under this section, as appropriate.

##### **(2) Requirement for emissions standards**

For the categories and subcategories the Administrator lists, the Administrator shall establish emissions standards under subsection (d) of this section, according to the schedule in this subsection and subsection (e) of this section.

##### **(3) Area sources**

The Administrator shall list under this subsection each category or subcategory of area sources which the Administrator finds presents a threat of adverse effects to human health or the environment (by such sources individually or in the aggregate) warranting regulation under this section. The Administrator shall, not later than 5 years after November 15, 1990, and pursuant to subsection (k)(3)(B) of this section, list, based on actual or estimated aggregate emissions of a listed pollutant or pollutants, sufficient categories or subcategories of area sources to ensure that area sources representing 90 percent of the area source emissions of the 30 hazardous air pollutants that present the greatest threat to public health in the largest number of urban areas are subject to regulation under this section. Such regulations shall be promulgated not later than 10 years after November 15, 1990.

##### **(4) Previously regulated categories**

The Administrator may, in the Administrator's discretion, list any category or subcategory of sources previously regulated under this section as in effect before November 15, 1990.

##### **(5) Additional categories**

In addition to those categories and subcategories of sources listed for regulation pursuant to paragraphs (1) and (3), the Administrator may at any time list additional categories and subcategories of sources of hazardous air pollutants according to the same criteria for listing applicable under such paragraphs. In the case of source categories and subcategories listed after publication of the

<sup>2</sup>So in original. Probably should be "effects".

initial list required under paragraph (1) or (3), emission standards under subsection (d) of this section for the category or subcategory shall be promulgated within 10 years after November 15, 1990, or within 2 years after the date on which such category or subcategory is listed, whichever is later.

#### **(6) Specific pollutants**

With respect to alkylated lead compounds, polycyclic organic matter, hexachlorobenzene, mercury, polychlorinated biphenyls, 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzofurans and 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin, the Administrator shall, not later than 5 years after November 15, 1990, list categories and subcategories of sources assuring that sources accounting for not less than 90 per centum of the aggregate emissions of each such pollutant are subject to standards under subsection (d)(2) or (d)(4) of this section. Such standards shall be promulgated not later than 10 years after November 15, 1990. This paragraph shall not be construed to require the Administrator to promulgate standards for such pollutants emitted by electric utility steam generating units.

#### **(7) Research facilities**

The Administrator shall establish a separate category covering research or laboratory facilities, as necessary to assure the equitable treatment of such facilities. For purposes of this section, "research or laboratory facility" means any stationary source whose primary purpose is to conduct research and development into new processes and products, where such source is operated under the close supervision of technically trained personnel and is not engaged in the manufacture of products for commercial sale in commerce, except in a de minimis manner.

#### **(8) Boat manufacturing**

When establishing emissions standards for styrene, the Administrator shall list boat manufacturing as a separate subcategory unless the Administrator finds that such listing would be inconsistent with the goals and requirements of this chapter.

#### **(9) Deletions from the list**

(A) Where the sole reason for the inclusion of a source category on the list required under this subsection is the emission of a unique chemical substance, the Administrator shall delete the source category from the list if it is appropriate because of action taken under either subparagraphs (C) or (D) of subsection (b)(3) of this section.

(B) The Administrator may delete any source category from the list under this subsection, on petition of any person or on the Administrator's own motion, whenever the Administrator makes the following determination or determinations, as applicable:

(i) In the case of hazardous air pollutants emitted by sources in the category that may result in cancer in humans, a determination that no source in the category (or group of sources in the case of area sources) emits such hazardous air pollutants in quantities which may cause a lifetime risk of cancer

greater than one in one million to the individual in the population who is most exposed to emissions of such pollutants from the source (or group of sources in the case of area sources).

(ii) In the case of hazardous air pollutants that may result in adverse health effects in humans other than cancer or adverse environmental effects, a determination that emissions from no source in the category or subcategory concerned (or group of sources in the case of area sources) exceed a level which is adequate to protect public health with an ample margin of safety and no adverse environmental effect will result from emissions from any source (or from a group of sources in the case of area sources).

The Administrator shall grant or deny a petition under this paragraph within 1 year after the petition is filed.

#### **(d) Emission standards**

##### **(1) In general**

The Administrator shall promulgate regulations establishing emission standards for each category or subcategory of major sources and area sources of hazardous air pollutants listed for regulation pursuant to subsection (c) of this section in accordance with the schedules provided in subsections (c) and (e) of this section. The Administrator may distinguish among classes, types, and sizes of sources within a category or subcategory in establishing such standards except that, there shall be no delay in the compliance date for any standard applicable to any source under subsection (i) of this section as the result of the authority provided by this sentence.

##### **(2) Standards and methods**

Emissions standards promulgated under this subsection and applicable to new or existing sources of hazardous air pollutants shall require the maximum degree of reduction in emissions of the hazardous air pollutants subject to this section (including a prohibition on such emissions, where achievable) that the Administrator, taking into consideration the cost of achieving such emission reduction, and any non-air quality health and environmental impacts and energy requirements, determines is achievable for new or existing sources in the category or subcategory to which such emission standard applies, through application of measures, processes, methods, systems or techniques including, but not limited to, measures which—

(A) reduce the volume of, or eliminate emissions of, such pollutants through process changes, substitution of materials or other modifications,

(B) enclose systems or processes to eliminate emissions,

(C) collect, capture or treat such pollutants when released from a process, stack, storage or fugitive emissions point,

(D) are design, equipment, work practice, or operational standards (including requirements for operator training or certification) as provided in subsection (h) of this section, or

(E) are a combination of the above.

None of the measures described in subparagraphs (A) through (D) shall, consistent with the provisions of section 7414(c) of this title, in any way compromise any United States patent or United States trademark right, or any confidential business information, or any trade secret or any other intellectual property right.

### (3) New and existing sources

The maximum degree of reduction in emissions that is deemed achievable for new sources in a category or subcategory shall not be less stringent than the emission control that is achieved in practice by the best controlled similar source, as determined by the Administrator. Emission standards promulgated under this subsection for existing sources in a category or subcategory may be less stringent than standards for new sources in the same category or subcategory but shall not be less stringent, and may be more stringent than—

(A) the average emission limitation achieved by the best performing 12 percent of the existing sources (for which the Administrator has emissions information), excluding those sources that have, within 18 months before the emission standard is proposed or within 30 months before such standard is promulgated, whichever is later, first achieved a level of emission rate or emission reduction which complies, or would comply if the source is not subject to such standard, with the lowest achievable emission rate (as defined by section 7501 of this title) applicable to the source category and prevailing at the time, in the category or subcategory for categories and subcategories with 30 or more sources, or

(B) the average emission limitation achieved by the best performing 5 sources (for which the Administrator has or could reasonably obtain emissions information) in the category or subcategory for categories or subcategories with fewer than 30 sources.

### (4) Health threshold

With respect to pollutants for which a health threshold has been established, the Administrator may consider such threshold level, with an ample margin of safety, when establishing emission standards under this subsection.

### (5) Alternative standard for area sources

With respect only to categories and subcategories of area sources listed pursuant to subsection (c) of this section, the Administrator may, in lieu of the authorities provided in paragraph (2) and subsection (f) of this section, elect to promulgate standards or requirements applicable to sources in such categories or subcategories which provide for the use of generally available control technologies or management practices by such sources to reduce emissions of hazardous air pollutants.

### (6) Review and revision

The Administrator shall review, and revise as necessary (taking into account develop-

ments in practices, processes, and control technologies), emission standards promulgated under this section no less often than every 8 years.

### (7) Other requirements preserved

No emission standard or other requirement promulgated under this section shall be interpreted, construed or applied to diminish or replace the requirements of a more stringent emission limitation or other applicable requirement established pursuant to section 7411 of this title, part C or D of this subchapter, or other authority of this chapter or a standard issued under State authority.

### (8) Coke ovens

(A) Not later than December 31, 1992, the Administrator shall promulgate regulations establishing emission standards under paragraphs (2) and (3) of this subsection for coke oven batteries. In establishing such standards, the Administrator shall evaluate—

(i) the use of sodium silicate (or equivalent) luting compounds to prevent door leaks, and other operating practices and technologies for their effectiveness in reducing coke oven emissions, and their suitability for use on new and existing coke oven batteries, taking into account costs and reasonable commercial door warranties; and

(ii) as a basis for emission standards under this subsection for new coke oven batteries that begin construction after the date of proposal of such standards, the Jewell design Thompson non-recovery coke oven batteries and other non-recovery coke oven technologies, and other appropriate emission control and coke production technologies, as to their effectiveness in reducing coke oven emissions and their capability for production of steel quality coke.

Such regulations shall require at a minimum that coke oven batteries will not exceed 8 per centum leaking doors, 1 per centum leaking lids, 5 per centum leaking oftakes, and 16 seconds visible emissions per charge, with no exclusion for emissions during the period after the closing of self-sealing oven doors. Notwithstanding subsection (i) of this section, the compliance date for such emission standards for existing coke oven batteries shall be December 31, 1995.

(B) The Administrator shall promulgate work practice regulations under this subsection for coke oven batteries requiring, as appropriate—

(i) the use of sodium silicate (or equivalent) luting compounds, if the Administrator determines that use of sodium silicate is an effective means of emissions control and is achievable, taking into account costs and reasonable commercial warranties for doors and related equipment; and

(ii) door and jam cleaning practices.

Notwithstanding subsection (i) of this section, the compliance date for such work practice regulations for coke oven batteries shall be not later than the date 3 years after November 15, 1990.



(C) For coke oven batteries electing to qualify for an extension of the compliance date for standards promulgated under subsection (f) of this section in accordance with subsection (i)(8) of this section, the emission standards under this subsection for coke oven batteries shall require that coke oven batteries not exceed 8 per centum leaking doors, 1 per centum leaking lids, 5 per centum leaking offtakes, and 16 seconds visible emissions per charge, with no exclusion for emissions during the period after the closing of self-sealing doors. Notwithstanding subsection (i) of this section, the compliance date for such emission standards for existing coke oven batteries seeking an extension shall be not later than the date 3 years after November 15, 1990.

**(9) Sources licensed by the Nuclear Regulatory Commission**

No standard for radionuclide emissions from any category or subcategory of facilities licensed by the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (or an Agreement State) is required to be promulgated under this section if the Administrator determines, by rule, and after consultation with the Nuclear Regulatory Commission, that the regulatory program established by the Nuclear Regulatory Commission pursuant to the Atomic Energy Act [42 U.S.C. 2011 et seq.] for such category or subcategory provides an ample margin of safety to protect the public health. Nothing in this subsection shall preclude or deny the right of any State or political subdivision thereof to adopt or enforce any standard or limitation respecting emissions of radionuclides which is more stringent than the standard or limitation in effect under section 7411 of this title or this section.

**(10) Effective date**

Emission standards or other regulations promulgated under this subsection shall be effective upon promulgation.

**(e) Schedule for standards and review**

**(1) In general**

The Administrator shall promulgate regulations establishing emission standards for categories and subcategories of sources initially listed for regulation pursuant to subsection (c)(1) of this section as expeditiously as practicable, assuring that—

(A) emission standards for not less than 40 categories and subcategories (not counting coke oven batteries) shall be promulgated not later than 2 years after November 15, 1990;

(B) emission standards for coke oven batteries shall be promulgated not later than December 31, 1992;

(C) emission standards for 25 per centum of the listed categories and subcategories shall be promulgated not later than 4 years after November 15, 1990;

(D) emission standards for an additional 25 per centum of the listed categories and subcategories shall be promulgated not later than 7 years after November 15, 1990; and

(E) emission standards for all categories and subcategories shall be promulgated not later than 10 years after November 15, 1990.

**(2) Priorities**

In determining priorities for promulgating standards under subsection (d) of this section, the Administrator shall consider—

(A) the known or anticipated adverse effects of such pollutants on public health and the environment;

(B) the quantity and location of emissions or reasonably anticipated emissions of hazardous air pollutants that each category or subcategory will emit; and

(C) the efficiency of grouping categories or subcategories according to the pollutants emitted, or the processes or technologies used.

**(3) Published schedule**

Not later than 24 months after November 15, 1990, and after opportunity for comment, the Administrator shall publish a schedule establishing a date for the promulgation of emission standards for each category and subcategory of sources listed pursuant to subsection (c)(1) and (3) of this section which shall be consistent with the requirements of paragraphs (1) and (2). The determination of priorities for the promulgation of standards pursuant to this paragraph is not a rulemaking and shall not be subject to judicial review, except that, failure to promulgate any standard pursuant to the schedule established by this paragraph shall be subject to review under section 7604 of this title.

**(4) Judicial review**

Notwithstanding section 7607 of this title, no action of the Administrator adding a pollutant to the list under subsection (b) of this section or listing a source category or subcategory under subsection (c) of this section shall be a final agency action subject to judicial review, except that any such action may be reviewed under such section 7607 of this title when the Administrator issues emission standards for such pollutant or category.

**(5) Publicly owned treatment works**

The Administrator shall promulgate standards pursuant to subsection (d) of this section applicable to publicly owned treatment works (as defined in title II of the Federal Water Pollution Control Act [33 U.S.C. 1281 et seq.]) not later than 5 years after November 15, 1990.

**(f) Standard to protect health and environment**

**(1) Report**

Not later than 6 years after November 15, 1990, the Administrator shall investigate and report, after consultation with the Surgeon General and after opportunity for public comment, to Congress on—

(A) methods of calculating the risk to public health remaining, or likely to remain, from sources subject to regulation under this section after the application of standards under subsection (d) of this section;

(B) the public health significance of such estimated remaining risk and the technologically and commercially available methods and costs of reducing such risks;

(C) the actual health effects with respect to persons living in the vicinity of sources,

any available epidemiological or other health studies, risks presented by background concentrations of hazardous air pollutants, any uncertainties in risk assessment methodology or other health assessment technique, and any negative health or environmental consequences to the community of efforts to reduce such risks; and

(D) recommendations as to legislation regarding such remaining risk.

## **(2) Emission standards**

(A) If Congress does not act on any recommendation submitted under paragraph (1), the Administrator shall, within 8 years after promulgation of standards for each category or subcategory of sources pursuant to subsection (d) of this section, promulgate standards for such category or subcategory if promulgation of such standards is required in order to provide an ample margin of safety to protect public health in accordance with this section (as in effect before November 15, 1990) or to prevent, taking into consideration costs, energy, safety, and other relevant factors, an adverse environmental effect. Emission standards promulgated under this subsection shall provide an ample margin of safety to protect public health in accordance with this section (as in effect before November 15, 1990), unless the Administrator determines that a more stringent standard is necessary to prevent, taking into consideration costs, energy, safety, and other relevant factors, an adverse environmental effect. If standards promulgated pursuant to subsection (d) of this section and applicable to a category or subcategory of sources emitting a pollutant (or pollutants) classified as a known, probable or possible human carcinogen do not reduce lifetime excess cancer risks to the individual most exposed to emissions from a source in the category or subcategory to less than one in one million, the Administrator shall promulgate standards under this subsection for such source category.

(B) Nothing in subparagraph (A) or in any other provision of this section shall be construed as affecting, or applying to the Administrator's interpretation of this section, as in effect before November 15, 1990, and set forth in the Federal Register of September 14, 1989 (54 Federal Register 38044).

(C) The Administrator shall determine whether or not to promulgate such standards and, if the Administrator decides to promulgate such standards, shall promulgate the standards 8 years after promulgation of the standards under subsection (d) of this section for each source category or subcategory concerned. In the case of categories or subcategories for which standards under subsection (d) of this section are required to be promulgated within 2 years after November 15, 1990, the Administrator shall have 9 years after promulgation of the standards under subsection (d) of this section to make the determination under the preceding sentence and, if required, to promulgate the standards under this paragraph.

## **(3) Effective date**

Any emission standard established pursuant to this subsection shall become effective upon promulgation.

## **(4) Prohibition**

No air pollutant to which a standard under this subsection applies may be emitted from any stationary source in violation of such standard, except that in the case of an existing source—

(A) such standard shall not apply until 90 days after its effective date, and

(B) the Administrator may grant a waiver permitting such source a period of up to 2 years after the effective date of a standard to comply with the standard if the Administrator finds that such period is necessary for the installation of controls and that steps will be taken during the period of the waiver to assure that the health of persons will be protected from imminent endangerment.

## **(5) Area sources**

The Administrator shall not be required to conduct any review under this subsection or promulgate emission limitations under this subsection for any category or subcategory of area sources that is listed pursuant to subsection (c)(3) of this section and for which an emission standard is promulgated pursuant to subsection (d)(5) of this section.

## **(6) Unique chemical substances**

In establishing standards for the control of unique chemical substances of listed pollutants without CAS numbers under this subsection, the Administrator shall establish such standards with respect to the health and environmental effects of the substances actually emitted by sources and direct transformation byproducts of such emissions in the categories and subcategories.

## **(g) Modifications**

### **(1) Offsets**

(A) A physical change in, or change in the method of operation of, a major source which results in a greater than de minimis increase in actual emissions of a hazardous air pollutant shall not be considered a modification, if such increase in the quantity of actual emissions of any hazardous air pollutant from such source will be offset by an equal or greater decrease in the quantity of emissions of another hazardous air pollutant (or pollutants) from such source which is deemed more hazardous, pursuant to guidance issued by the Administrator under subparagraph (B). The owner or operator of such source shall submit a showing to the Administrator (or the State) that such increase has been offset under the preceding sentence.

(B) The Administrator shall, after notice and opportunity for comment and not later than 18 months after November 15, 1990, publish guidance with respect to implementation of this subsection. Such guidance shall include an identification, to the extent practicable, of the relative hazard to human health resulting from emissions to the ambient air of each of the pollutants listed under subsection (b) of

this section sufficient to facilitate the offset showing authorized by subparagraph (A). Such guidance shall not authorize offsets between pollutants where the increased pollutant (or more than one pollutant in a stream of pollutants) causes adverse effects to human health for which no safety threshold for exposure can be determined unless there are corresponding decreases in such types of pollutant(s).

**(2) Construction, reconstruction and modifications**

(A) After the effective date of a permit program under subchapter V of this chapter in any State, no person may modify a major source of hazardous air pollutants in such State, unless the Administrator (or the State) determines that the maximum achievable control technology emission limitation under this section for existing sources will be met. Such determination shall be made on a case-by-case basis where no applicable emissions limitations have been established by the Administrator.

(B) After the effective date of a permit program under subchapter V of this chapter in any State, no person may construct or reconstruct any major source of hazardous air pollutants, unless the Administrator (or the State) determines that the maximum achievable control technology emission limitation under this section for new sources will be met. Such determination shall be made on a case-by-case basis where no applicable emission limitations have been established by the Administrator.

**(3) Procedures for modifications**

The Administrator (or the State) shall establish reasonable procedures for assuring that the requirements applying to modifications under this section are reflected in the permit.

**(h) Work practice standards and other requirements**

**(1) In general**

For purposes of this section, if it is not feasible in the judgment of the Administrator to prescribe or enforce an emission standard for control of a hazardous air pollutant or pollutants, the Administrator may, in lieu thereof, promulgate a design, equipment, work practice, or operational standard, or combination thereof, which in the Administrator's judgment is consistent with the provisions of subsection (d) or (f) of this section. In the event the Administrator promulgates a design or equipment standard under this subsection, the Administrator shall include as part of such standard such requirements as will assure the proper operation and maintenance of any such element of design or equipment.

**(2) Definition**

For the purpose of this subsection, the phrase "not feasible to prescribe or enforce an emission standard" means any situation in which the Administrator determines that—

(A) a hazardous air pollutant or pollutants cannot be emitted through a conveyance designed and constructed to emit or capture

such pollutant, or that any requirement for, or use of, such a conveyance would be inconsistent with any Federal, State or local law, or

(B) the application of measurement methodology to a particular class of sources is not practicable due to technological and economic limitations.

**(3) Alternative standard**

If after notice and opportunity for comment, the owner or operator of any source establishes to the satisfaction of the Administrator that an alternative means of emission limitation will achieve a reduction in emissions of any air pollutant at least equivalent to the reduction in emissions of such pollutant achieved under the requirements of paragraph (1), the Administrator shall permit the use of such alternative by the source for purposes of compliance with this section with respect to such pollutant.

**(4) Numerical standard required**

Any standard promulgated under paragraph (1) shall be promulgated in terms of an emission standard whenever it is feasible to promulgate and enforce a standard in such terms.

**(i) Schedule for compliance**

**(1) Preconstruction and operating requirements**

After the effective date of any emission standard, limitation, or regulation under subsection (d), (f) or (h) of this section, no person may construct any new major source or reconstruct any existing major source subject to such emission standard, regulation or limitation unless the Administrator (or a State with a permit program approved under subchapter V of this chapter) determines that such source, if properly constructed, reconstructed and operated, will comply with the standard, regulation or limitation.

**(2) Special rule**

Notwithstanding the requirements of paragraph (1), a new source which commences construction or reconstruction after a standard, limitation or regulation applicable to such source is proposed and before such standard, limitation or regulation is promulgated shall not be required to comply with such promulgated standard until the date 3 years after the date of promulgation if—

(A) the promulgated standard, limitation or regulation is more stringent than the standard, limitation or regulation proposed; and

(B) the source complies with the standard, limitation, or regulation as proposed during the 3-year period immediately after promulgation.

**(3) Compliance schedule for existing sources**

(A) After the effective date of any emissions standard, limitation or regulation promulgated under this section and applicable to a source, no person may operate such source in violation of such standard, limitation or regulation except, in the case of an existing source, the Administrator shall establish a



compliance date or dates for each category or subcategory of existing sources, which shall provide for compliance as expeditiously as practicable, but in no event later than 3 years after the effective date of such standard, except as provided in subparagraph (B) and paragraphs (4) through (8).

(B) The Administrator (or a State with a program approved under subchapter V of this chapter) may issue a permit that grants an extension permitting an existing source up to 1 additional year to comply with standards under subsection (d) of this section if such additional period is necessary for the installation of controls. An additional extension of up to 3 years may be added for mining waste operations, if the 4-year compliance time is insufficient to dry and cover mining waste in order to reduce emissions of any pollutant listed under subsection (b) of this section.

#### **(4) Presidential exemption**

The President may exempt any stationary source from compliance with any standard or limitation under this section for a period of not more than 2 years if the President determines that the technology to implement such standard is not available and that it is in the national security interests of the United States to do so. An exemption under this paragraph may be extended for 1 or more additional periods, each period not to exceed 2 years. The President shall report to Congress with respect to each exemption (or extension thereof) made under this paragraph.

#### **(5) Early reduction**

(A) The Administrator (or a State acting pursuant to a permit program approved under subchapter V of this chapter) shall issue a permit allowing an existing source, for which the owner or operator demonstrates that the source has achieved a reduction of 90 per centum or more in emissions of hazardous air pollutants (95 per centum in the case of hazardous air pollutants which are particulates) from the source, to meet an alternative emission limitation reflecting such reduction in lieu of an emission limitation promulgated under subsection (d) of this section for a period of 6 years from the compliance date for the otherwise applicable standard, provided that such reduction is achieved before the otherwise applicable standard under subsection (d) of this section is first proposed. Nothing in this paragraph shall preclude a State from requiring reductions in excess of those specified in this subparagraph as a condition of granting the extension authorized by the previous sentence.

(B) An existing source which achieves the reduction referred to in subparagraph (A) after the proposal of an applicable standard but before January 1, 1994, may qualify under subparagraph (A), if the source makes an enforceable commitment to achieve such reduction before the proposal of the standard. Such commitment shall be enforceable to the same extent as a regulation under this section.

(C) The reduction shall be determined with respect to verifiable and actual emissions in a base year not earlier than calendar year 1987, provided that, there is no evidence that emis-

sions in the base year are artificially or substantially greater than emissions in other years prior to implementation of emissions reduction measures. The Administrator may allow a source to use a baseline year of 1985 or 1986 provided that the source can demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Administrator that emissions data for the source reflects verifiable data based on information for such source, received by the Administrator prior to November 15, 1990, pursuant to an information request issued under section 7414 of this title.

(D) For each source granted an alternative emission limitation under this paragraph there shall be established by a permit issued pursuant to subchapter V of this chapter an enforceable emission limitation for hazardous air pollutants reflecting the reduction which qualifies the source for an alternative emission limitation under this paragraph. An alternative emission limitation under this paragraph shall not be available with respect to standards or requirements promulgated pursuant to subsection (f) of this section and the Administrator shall, for the purpose of determining whether a standard under subsection (f) of this section is necessary, review emissions from sources granted an alternative emission limitation under this paragraph at the same time that other sources in the category or subcategory are reviewed.

(E) With respect to pollutants for which high risks of adverse public health effects may be associated with exposure to small quantities including, but not limited to, chlorinated dioxins and furans, the Administrator shall by regulation limit the use of offsetting reductions in emissions of other hazardous air pollutants from the source as counting toward the 90 per centum reduction in such high-risk pollutants qualifying for an alternative emissions limitation under this paragraph.

#### **(6) Other reductions**

Notwithstanding the requirements of this section, no existing source that has installed—

(A) best available control technology (as defined in section 7479(3) of this title), or

(B) technology required to meet a lowest achievable emission rate (as defined in section 7501 of this title),

prior to the promulgation of a standard under this section applicable to such source and the same pollutant (or stream of pollutants) controlled pursuant to an action described in subparagraph (A) or (B) shall be required to comply with such standard under this section until the date 5 years after the date on which such installation or reduction has been achieved, as determined by the Administrator. The Administrator may issue such rules and guidance as are necessary to implement this paragraph.

#### **(7) Extension for new sources**

A source for which construction or reconstruction is commenced after the date an emission standard applicable to such source is proposed pursuant to subsection (d) of this section but before the date an emission standard applicable to such source is proposed pursuant



to subsection (f) of this section shall not be required to comply with the emission standard under subsection (f) of this section until the date 10 years after the date construction or reconstruction is commenced.

**(8) Coke ovens**

(A) Any coke oven battery that complies with the emission limitations established under subsection (d)(8)(C) of this section, subparagraph (B), and subparagraph (C), and complies with the provisions of subparagraph (E), shall not be required to achieve emission limitations promulgated under subsection (f) of this section until January 1, 2020.

(B)(i) Not later than December 31, 1992, the Administrator shall promulgate emission limitations for coke oven emissions from coke oven batteries. Notwithstanding paragraph (3) of this subsection, the compliance date for such emission limitations for existing coke oven batteries shall be January 1, 1998. Such emission limitations shall reflect the lowest achievable emission rate as defined in section 7501 of this title for a coke oven battery that is rebuilt or a replacement at a coke oven plant for an existing battery. Such emission limitations shall be no less stringent than—

- (I) 3 per centum leaking doors (5 per centum leaking doors for six meter batteries);
- (II) 1 per centum leaking lids;
- (III) 4 per centum leaking oftakes; and
- (IV) 16 seconds visible emissions per charge,

with an exclusion for emissions during the period after the closing of self-sealing oven doors (or the total mass emissions equivalent). The rulemaking in which such emission limitations are promulgated shall also establish an appropriate measurement methodology for determining compliance with such emission limitations, and shall establish such emission limitations in terms of an equivalent level of mass emissions reduction from a coke oven battery, unless the Administrator finds that such a mass emissions standard would not be practicable or enforceable. Such measurement methodology, to the extent it measures leaking doors, shall take into consideration alternative test methods that reflect the best technology and practices actually applied in the affected industries, and shall assure that the final test methods are consistent with the performance of such best technology and practices.

(ii) If the Administrator fails to promulgate such emission limitations under this subparagraph prior to the effective date of such emission limitations, the emission limitations applicable to coke oven batteries under this subparagraph shall be—

- (I) 3 per centum leaking doors (5 per centum leaking doors for six meter batteries);
- (II) 1 per centum leaking lids;
- (III) 4 per centum leaking oftakes; and
- (IV) 16 seconds visible emissions per charge,

or the total mass emissions equivalent (if the total mass emissions equivalent is determined to be practicable and enforceable), with no ex-

clusion for emissions during the period after the closing of self-sealing oven doors.

(C) Not later than January 1, 2007, the Administrator shall review the emission limitations promulgated under subparagraph (B) and revise, as necessary, such emission limitations to reflect the lowest achievable emission rate as defined in section 7501 of this title at the time for a coke oven battery that is rebuilt or a replacement at a coke oven plant for an existing battery. Such emission limitations shall be no less stringent than the emission limitation promulgated under subparagraph (B). Notwithstanding paragraph (2) of this subsection, the compliance date for such emission limitations for existing coke oven batteries shall be January 1, 2010.

(D) At any time prior to January 1, 1998, the owner or operator of any coke oven battery may elect to comply with emission limitations promulgated under subsection (f) of this section by the date such emission limitations would otherwise apply to such coke oven battery, in lieu of the emission limitations and the compliance dates provided under subparagraphs (B) and (C) of this paragraph. Any such owner or operator shall be legally bound to comply with such emission limitations promulgated under subsection (f) of this section with respect to such coke oven battery as of January 1, 2003. If no such emission limitations have been promulgated for such coke oven battery, the Administrator shall promulgate such emission limitations in accordance with subsection (f) of this section for such coke oven battery.

(E) Coke oven batteries qualifying for an extension under subparagraph (A) shall make available not later than January 1, 2000, to the surrounding communities the results of any risk assessment performed by the Administrator to determine the appropriate level of any emission standard established by the Administrator pursuant to subsection (f) of this section.

(F) Notwithstanding the provisions of this section, reconstruction of any source of coke oven emissions qualifying for an extension under this paragraph shall not subject such source to emission limitations under subsection (f) of this section more stringent than those established under subparagraphs (B) and (C) until January 1, 2020. For the purposes of this subparagraph, the term “reconstruction” includes the replacement of existing coke oven battery capacity with new coke oven batteries of comparable or lower capacity and lower potential emissions.

**(j) Equivalent emission limitation by permit**

**(1) Effective date**

The requirements of this subsection shall apply in each State beginning on the effective date of a permit program established pursuant to subchapter V of this chapter in such State, but not prior to the date 42 months after November 15, 1990.

**(2) Failure to promulgate a standard**

In the event that the Administrator fails to promulgate a standard for a category or sub-

category of major sources by the date established pursuant to subsection (e)(1) and (3) of this section, and beginning 18 months after such date (but not prior to the effective date of a permit program under subchapter V of this chapter), the owner or operator of any major source in such category or subcategory shall submit a permit application under paragraph (3) and such owner or operator shall also comply with paragraphs (5) and (6).

### (3) Applications

By the date established by paragraph (2), the owner or operator of a major source subject to this subsection shall file an application for a permit. If the owner or operator of a source has submitted a timely and complete application for a permit required by this subsection, any failure to have a permit shall not be a violation of paragraph (2), unless the delay in final action is due to the failure of the applicant to timely submit information required or requested to process the application. The Administrator shall not later than 18 months after November 15, 1990, and after notice and opportunity for comment, establish requirements for applications under this subsection including a standard application form and criteria for determining in a timely manner the completeness of applications.

### (4) Review and approval

Permit applications submitted under this subsection shall be reviewed and approved or disapproved according to the provisions of section 7661d of this title. In the event that the Administrator (or the State) disapproves a permit application submitted under this subsection or determines that the application is incomplete, the applicant shall have up to 6 months to revise the application to meet the objections of the Administrator (or the State).

### (5) Emission limitation

The permit shall be issued pursuant to subchapter V of this chapter and shall contain emission limitations for the hazardous air pollutants subject to regulation under this section and emitted by the source that the Administrator (or the State) determines, on a case-by-case basis, to be equivalent to the limitation that would apply to such source if an emission standard had been promulgated in a timely manner under subsection (d) of this section. In the alternative, if the applicable criteria are met, the permit may contain an emissions limitation established according to the provisions of subsection (i)(5) of this section. For purposes of the preceding sentence, the reduction required by subsection (i)(5)(A) of this section shall be achieved by the date on which the relevant standard should have been promulgated under subsection (d) of this section. No such pollutant may be emitted in amounts exceeding an emission limitation contained in a permit immediately for new sources and, as expeditiously as practicable, but not later than the date 3 years after the permit is issued for existing sources or such other compliance date as would apply under subsection (i) of this section.

### (6) Applicability of subsequent standards

If the Administrator promulgates an emission standard that is applicable to the major source prior to the date on which a permit application is approved, the emission limitation in the permit shall reflect the promulgated standard rather than the emission limitation determined pursuant to paragraph (5), provided that the source shall have the compliance period provided under subsection (i) of this section. If the Administrator promulgates a standard under subsection (d) of this section that would be applicable to the source in lieu of the emission limitation established by permit under this subsection after the date on which the permit has been issued, the Administrator (or the State) shall revise such permit upon the next renewal to reflect the standard promulgated by the Administrator providing such source a reasonable time to comply, but no longer than 8 years after such standard is promulgated or 8 years after the date on which the source is first required to comply with the emissions limitation established by paragraph (5), whichever is earlier.

## (k) Area source program

### (1) Findings and purpose

The Congress finds that emissions of hazardous air pollutants from area sources may individually, or in the aggregate, present significant risks to public health in urban areas. Considering the large number of persons exposed and the risks of carcinogenic and other adverse health effects from hazardous air pollutants, ambient concentrations characteristic of large urban areas should be reduced to levels substantially below those currently experienced. It is the purpose of this subsection to achieve a substantial reduction in emissions of hazardous air pollutants from area sources and an equivalent reduction in the public health risks associated with such sources including a reduction of not less than 75 per centum in the incidence of cancer attributable to emissions from such sources.

### (2) Research program

The Administrator shall, after consultation with State and local air pollution control officials, conduct a program of research with respect to sources of hazardous air pollutants in urban areas and shall include within such program—

(A) ambient monitoring for a broad range of hazardous air pollutants (including, but not limited to, volatile organic compounds, metals, pesticides and products of incomplete combustion) in a representative number of urban locations;

(B) analysis to characterize the sources of such pollution with a focus on area sources and the contribution that such sources make to public health risks from hazardous air pollutants; and

(C) consideration of atmospheric transformation and other factors which can elevate public health risks from such pollutants.

Health effects considered under this program shall include, but not be limited to, carcino-

genicity, mutagenicity, teratogenicity, neurotoxicity, reproductive dysfunction and other acute and chronic effects including the role of such pollutants as precursors of ozone or acid aerosol formation. The Administrator shall report the preliminary results of such research not later than 3 years after November 15, 1990.

### (3) National strategy

(A) Considering information collected pursuant to the monitoring program authorized by paragraph (2), the Administrator shall, not later than 5 years after November 15, 1990, and after notice and opportunity for public comment, prepare and transmit to the Congress a comprehensive strategy to control emissions of hazardous air pollutants from area sources in urban areas.

(B) The strategy shall—

(i) identify not less than 30 hazardous air pollutants which, as the result of emissions from area sources, present the greatest threat to public health in the largest number of urban areas and that are or will be listed pursuant to subsection (b) of this section, and

(ii) identify the source categories or subcategories emitting such pollutants that are or will be listed pursuant to subsection (c) of this section. When identifying categories and subcategories of sources under this subparagraph, the Administrator shall assure that sources accounting for 90 per centum or more of the aggregate emissions of each of the 30 identified hazardous air pollutants are subject to standards pursuant to subsection (d) of this section.

(C) The strategy shall include a schedule of specific actions to substantially reduce the public health risks posed by the release of hazardous air pollutants from area sources that will be implemented by the Administrator under the authority of this or other laws (including, but not limited to, the Toxic Substances Control Act [15 U.S.C. 2601 et seq.], the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide and Rodenticide Act [7 U.S.C. 136 et seq.] and the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act [42 U.S.C. 6901 et seq.]) or by the States. The strategy shall achieve a reduction in the incidence of cancer attributable to exposure to hazardous air pollutants emitted by stationary sources of not less than 75 per centum, considering control of emissions of hazardous air pollutants from all stationary sources and resulting from measures implemented by the Administrator or by the States under this or other laws.

(D) The strategy may also identify research needs in monitoring, analytical methodology, modeling or pollution control techniques and recommendations for changes in law that would further the goals and objectives of this subsection.

(E) Nothing in this subsection shall be interpreted to preclude or delay implementation of actions with respect to area sources of hazardous air pollutants under consideration pursuant to this or any other law and that may be promulgated before the strategy is prepared.

(F) The Administrator shall implement the strategy as expeditiously as practicable assur-

ing that all sources are in compliance with all requirements not later than 9 years after November 15, 1990.

(G) As part of such strategy the Administrator shall provide for ambient monitoring and emissions modeling in urban areas as appropriate to demonstrate that the goals and objectives of the strategy are being met.

### (4) Areawide activities

In addition to the national urban air toxics strategy authorized by paragraph (3), the Administrator shall also encourage and support areawide strategies developed by State or local air pollution control agencies that are intended to reduce risks from emissions by area sources within a particular urban area. From the funds available for grants under this section, the Administrator shall set aside not less than 10 per centum to support areawide strategies addressing hazardous air pollutants emitted by area sources and shall award such funds on a demonstration basis to those States with innovative and effective strategies. At the request of State or local air pollution control officials, the Administrator shall prepare guidelines for control technologies or management practices which may be applicable to various categories or subcategories of area sources.

### (5) Report

The Administrator shall report to the Congress at intervals not later than 8 and 12 years after November 15, 1990, on actions taken under this subsection and other parts of this chapter to reduce the risk to public health posed by the release of hazardous air pollutants from area sources. The reports shall also identify specific metropolitan areas that continue to experience high risks to public health as the result of emissions from area sources.

## (I) State programs

### (1) In general

Each State may develop and submit to the Administrator for approval a program for the implementation and enforcement (including a review of enforcement delegations previously granted) of emission standards and other requirements for air pollutants subject to this section or requirements for the prevention and mitigation of accidental releases pursuant to subsection (r) of this section. A program submitted by a State under this subsection may provide for partial or complete delegation of the Administrator's authorities and responsibilities to implement and enforce emissions standards and prevention requirements but shall not include authority to set standards less stringent than those promulgated by the Administrator under this chapter.

### (2) Guidance

Not later than 12 months after November 15, 1990, the Administrator shall publish guidance that would be useful to the States in developing programs for submittal under this subsection. The guidance shall also provide for the registration of all facilities producing, processing, handling or storing any substance listed pursuant to subsection (r) of this section



in amounts greater than the threshold quantity. The Administrator shall include as an element in such guidance an optional program begun in 1986 for the review of high-risk point sources of air pollutants including, but not limited to, hazardous air pollutants listed pursuant to subsection (b) of this section.

### (3) Technical assistance

The Administrator shall establish and maintain an air toxics clearinghouse and center to provide technical information and assistance to State and local agencies and, on a cost recovery basis, to others on control technology, health and ecological risk assessment, risk analysis, ambient monitoring and modeling, and emissions measurement and monitoring. The Administrator shall use the authority of section 7403 of this title to examine methods for preventing, measuring, and controlling emissions and evaluating associated health and ecological risks. Where appropriate, such activity shall be conducted with not-for-profit organizations. The Administrator may conduct research on methods for preventing, measuring and controlling emissions and evaluating associated health and environment risks. All information collected under this paragraph shall be available to the public.

### (4) Grants

Upon application of a State, the Administrator may make grants, subject to such terms and conditions as the Administrator deems appropriate, to such State for the purpose of assisting the State in developing and implementing a program for submittal and approval under this subsection. Programs assisted under this paragraph may include program elements addressing air pollutants or extremely hazardous substances other than those specifically subject to this section. Grants under this paragraph may include support for high-risk point source review as provided in paragraph (2) and support for the development and implementation of areawide area source programs pursuant to subsection (k) of this section.

### (5) Approval or disapproval

Not later than 180 days after receiving a program submitted by a State, and after notice and opportunity for public comment, the Administrator shall either approve or disapprove such program. The Administrator shall disapprove any program submitted by a State, if the Administrator determines that—

(A) the authorities contained in the program are not adequate to assure compliance by all sources within the State with each applicable standard, regulation or requirement established by the Administrator under this section;

(B) adequate authority does not exist, or adequate resources are not available, to implement the program;

(C) the schedule for implementing the program and assuring compliance by affected sources is not sufficiently expeditious; or

(D) the program is otherwise not in compliance with the guidance issued by the Administrator under paragraph (2) or is not

likely to satisfy, in whole or in part, the objectives of this chapter.

If the Administrator disapproves a State program, the Administrator shall notify the State of any revisions or modifications necessary to obtain approval. The State may revise and resubmit the proposed program for review and approval pursuant to the provisions of this subsection.

### (6) Withdrawal

Whenever the Administrator determines, after public hearing, that a State is not administering and enforcing a program approved pursuant to this subsection in accordance with the guidance published pursuant to paragraph (2) or the requirements of paragraph (5), the Administrator shall so notify the State and, if action which will assure prompt compliance is not taken within 90 days, the Administrator shall withdraw approval of the program. The Administrator shall not withdraw approval of any program unless the State shall have been notified and the reasons for withdrawal shall have been stated in writing and made public.

### (7) Authority to enforce

Nothing in this subsection shall prohibit the Administrator from enforcing any applicable emission standard or requirement under this section.

### (8) Local program

The Administrator may, after notice and opportunity for public comment, approve a program developed and submitted by a local air pollution control agency (after consultation with the State) pursuant to this subsection and any such agency implementing an approved program may take any action authorized to be taken by a State under this section.

### (9) Permit authority

Nothing in this subsection shall affect the authorities and obligations of the Administrator or the State under subchapter V of this chapter.

## (m) Atmospheric deposition to Great Lakes and coastal waters

### (1) Deposition assessment

The Administrator, in cooperation with the Under Secretary of Commerce for Oceans and Atmosphere, shall conduct a program to identify and assess the extent of atmospheric deposition of hazardous air pollutants (and in the discretion of the Administrator, other air pollutants) to the Great Lakes, the Chesapeake Bay, Lake Champlain and coastal waters. As part of such program, the Administrator shall—

(A) monitor the Great Lakes, the Chesapeake Bay, Lake Champlain and coastal waters, including monitoring of the Great Lakes through the monitoring network established pursuant to paragraph (2) of this subsection and designing and deploying an atmospheric monitoring network for coastal waters pursuant to paragraph (4);

(B) investigate the sources and deposition rates of atmospheric deposition of air pollutants (and their atmospheric transformation precursors);

(C) conduct research to develop and improve monitoring methods and to determine the relative contribution of atmospheric pollutants to total pollution loadings to the Great Lakes, the Chesapeake Bay, Lake Champlain, and coastal waters;

(D) evaluate any adverse effects to public health or the environment caused by such deposition (including effects resulting from indirect exposure pathways) and assess the contribution of such deposition to violations of water quality standards established pursuant to the Federal Water Pollution Control Act [33 U.S.C. 1251 et seq.] and drinking water standards established pursuant to the Safe Drinking Water Act [42 U.S.C. 300f et seq.]; and

(E) sample for such pollutants in biota, fish, and wildlife of the Great Lakes, the Chesapeake Bay, Lake Champlain and coastal waters and characterize the sources of such pollutants.

### **(2) Great Lakes monitoring network**

The Administrator shall oversee, in accordance with Annex 15 of the Great Lakes Water Quality Agreement, the establishment and operation of a Great Lakes atmospheric deposition network to monitor atmospheric deposition of hazardous air pollutants (and in the Administrator's discretion, other air pollutants) to the Great Lakes.

(A) As part of the network provided for in this paragraph, and not later than December 31, 1991, the Administrator shall establish in each of the 5 Great Lakes at least 1 facility capable of monitoring the atmospheric deposition of hazardous air pollutants in both dry and wet conditions.

(B) The Administrator shall use the data provided by the network to identify and track the movement of hazardous air pollutants through the Great Lakes, to determine the portion of water pollution loadings attributable to atmospheric deposition of such pollutants, and to support development of remedial action plans and other management plans as required by the Great Lakes Water Quality Agreement.

(C) The Administrator shall assure that the data collected by the Great Lakes atmospheric deposition monitoring network is in a format compatible with databases sponsored by the International Joint Commission, Canada, and the several States of the Great Lakes region.

### **(3) Monitoring for the Chesapeake Bay and Lake Champlain**

The Administrator shall establish at the Chesapeake Bay and Lake Champlain atmospheric deposition stations to monitor deposition of hazardous air pollutants (and in the Administrator's discretion, other air pollutants) within the Chesapeake Bay and Lake Champlain watersheds. The Administrator shall determine the role of air deposition in the pollutant loadings of the Chesapeake Bay and Lake Champlain, investigate the sources of air pollutants deposited in the watersheds, evaluate the health and environmental effects of such pollutant loadings, and shall sample

such pollutants in biota, fish and wildlife within the watersheds, as necessary to characterize such effects.

### **(4) Monitoring for coastal waters**

The Administrator shall design and deploy atmospheric deposition monitoring networks for coastal waters and their watersheds and shall make any information collected through such networks available to the public. As part of this effort, the Administrator shall conduct research to develop and improve deposition monitoring methods, and to determine the relative contribution of atmospheric pollutants to pollutant loadings. For purposes of this subsection, "coastal waters" shall mean estuaries selected pursuant to section 320(a)(2)(A) of the Federal Water Pollution Control Act [33 U.S.C. 1330(a)(2)(A)] or listed pursuant to section 320(a)(2)(B) of such Act [33 U.S.C. 1330(a)(2)(B)] or estuarine research reserves designated pursuant to section 1461 of title 16.

### **(5) Report**

Within 3 years of November 15, 1990, and biennially thereafter, the Administrator, in cooperation with the Under Secretary of Commerce for Oceans and Atmosphere, shall submit to the Congress a report on the results of any monitoring, studies, and investigations conducted pursuant to this subsection. Such report shall include, at a minimum, an assessment of—

(A) the contribution of atmospheric deposition to pollution loadings in the Great Lakes, the Chesapeake Bay, Lake Champlain and coastal waters;

(B) the environmental and public health effects of any pollution which is attributable to atmospheric deposition to the Great Lakes, the Chesapeake Bay, Lake Champlain and coastal waters;

(C) the source or sources of any pollution to the Great Lakes, the Chesapeake Bay, Lake Champlain and coastal waters which is attributable to atmospheric deposition;

(D) whether pollution loadings in the Great Lakes, the Chesapeake Bay, Lake Champlain or coastal waters cause or contribute to exceedances of drinking water standards pursuant to the Safe Drinking Water Act [42 U.S.C. 300f et seq.] or water quality standards pursuant to the Federal Water Pollution Control Act [33 U.S.C. 1251 et seq.] or, with respect to the Great Lakes, exceedances of the specific objectives of the Great Lakes Water Quality Agreement; and

(E) a description of any revisions of the requirements, standards, and limitations pursuant to this chapter and other applicable Federal laws as are necessary to assure protection of human health and the environment.

### **(6) Additional regulation**

As part of the report to Congress, the Administrator shall determine whether the other provisions of this section are adequate to prevent serious adverse effects to public health and serious or widespread environmental effects, including such effects resulting from indirect exposure pathways, associated with at-

mospheric deposition to the Great Lakes, the Chesapeake Bay, Lake Champlain and coastal waters of hazardous air pollutants (and their atmospheric transformation products). The Administrator shall take into consideration the tendency of such pollutants to bioaccumulate. Within 5 years after November 15, 1990, the Administrator shall, based on such report and determination, promulgate, in accordance with this section, such further emission standards or control measures as may be necessary and appropriate to prevent such effects, including effects due to bioaccumulation and indirect exposure pathways. Any requirements promulgated pursuant to this paragraph with respect to coastal waters shall only apply to the coastal waters of the States which are subject to section 7627(a) of this title.

**(n) Other provisions**

**(1) Electric utility steam generating units**

(A) The Administrator shall perform a study of the hazards to public health reasonably anticipated to occur as a result of emissions by electric utility steam generating units of pollutants listed under subsection (b) of this section after imposition of the requirements of this chapter. The Administrator shall report the results of this study to the Congress within 3 years after November 15, 1990. The Administrator shall develop and describe in the Administrator's report to Congress alternative control strategies for emissions which may warrant regulation under this section. The Administrator shall regulate electric utility steam generating units under this section, if the Administrator finds such regulation is appropriate and necessary after considering the results of the study required by this subparagraph.

(B) The Administrator shall conduct, and transmit to the Congress not later than 4 years after November 15, 1990, a study of mercury emissions from electric utility steam generating units, municipal waste combustion units, and other sources, including area sources. Such study shall consider the rate and mass of such emissions, the health and environmental effects of such emissions, technologies which are available to control such emissions, and the costs of such technologies.

(C) The National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences shall conduct, and transmit to the Congress not later than 3 years after November 15, 1990, a study to determine the threshold level of mercury exposure below which adverse human health effects are not expected to occur. Such study shall include a threshold for mercury concentrations in the tissue of fish which may be consumed (including consumption by sensitive populations) without adverse effects to public health.

**(2) Coke oven production technology study**

(A) The Secretary of the Department of Energy and the Administrator shall jointly undertake a 6-year study to assess coke oven production emission control technologies and to assist in the development and commercialization of technically practicable and economically viable control technologies which have

the potential to significantly reduce emissions of hazardous air pollutants from coke oven production facilities. In identifying control technologies, the Secretary and the Administrator shall consider the range of existing coke oven operations and battery design and the availability of sources of materials for such coke ovens as well as alternatives to existing coke oven production design.

(B) The Secretary and the Administrator are authorized to enter into agreements with persons who propose to develop, install and operate coke production emission control technologies which have the potential for significant emissions reductions of hazardous air pollutants provided that Federal funds shall not exceed 50 per centum of the cost of any project assisted pursuant to this paragraph.

(C) On completion of the study, the Secretary shall submit to Congress a report on the results of the study and shall make recommendations to the Administrator identifying practicable and economically viable control technologies for coke oven production facilities to reduce residual risks remaining after implementation of the standard under subsection (d) of this section.

(D) There are authorized to be appropriated \$5,000,000 for each of the fiscal years 1992 through 1997 to carry out the program authorized by this paragraph.

**(3) Publicly owned treatment works**

The Administrator may conduct, in cooperation with the owners and operators of publicly owned treatment works, studies to characterize emissions of hazardous air pollutants emitted by such facilities, to identify industrial, commercial and residential discharges that contribute to such emissions and to demonstrate control measures for such emissions. When promulgating any standard under this section applicable to publicly owned treatment works, the Administrator may provide for control measures that include pretreatment of discharges causing emissions of hazardous air pollutants and process or product substitutions or limitations that may be effective in reducing such emissions. The Administrator may prescribe uniform sampling, modeling and risk assessment methods for use in implementing this subsection.

**(4) Oil and gas wells; pipeline facilities**

(A) Notwithstanding the provisions of subsection (a) of this section, emissions from any oil or gas exploration or production well (with its associated equipment) and emissions from any pipeline compressor or pump station shall not be aggregated with emissions from other similar units, whether or not such units are in a contiguous area or under common control, to determine whether such units or stations are major sources, and in the case of any oil or gas exploration or production well (with its associated equipment), such emissions shall not be aggregated for any purpose under this section.

(B) The Administrator shall not list oil and gas production wells (with its associated equipment) as an area source category under subsection (c) of this section, except that the



Administrator may establish an area source category for oil and gas production wells located in any metropolitan statistical area or consolidated metropolitan statistical area with a population in excess of 1 million, if the Administrator determines that emissions of hazardous air pollutants from such wells present more than a negligible risk of adverse effects to public health.

**(5) Hydrogen sulfide**

The Administrator is directed to assess the hazards to public health and the environment resulting from the emission of hydrogen sulfide associated with the extraction of oil and natural gas resources. To the extent practicable, the assessment shall build upon and not duplicate work conducted for an assessment pursuant to section 8002(m) of the Solid Waste Disposal Act [42 U.S.C. 6982(m)] and shall reflect consultation with the States. The assessment shall include a review of existing State and industry control standards, techniques and enforcement. The Administrator shall report to the Congress within 24 months after November 15, 1990, with the findings of such assessment, together with any recommendations, and shall, as appropriate, develop and implement a control strategy for emissions of hydrogen sulfide to protect human health and the environment, based on the findings of such assessment, using authorities under this chapter including sections<sup>3</sup> 7411 of this title and this section.

**(6) Hydrofluoric acid**

Not later than 2 years after November 15, 1990, the Administrator shall, for those regions of the country which do not have comprehensive health and safety regulations with respect to hydrofluoric acid, complete a study of the potential hazards of hydrofluoric acid and the uses of hydrofluoric acid in industrial and commercial applications to public health and the environment considering a range of events including worst-case accidental releases and shall make recommendations to the Congress for the reduction of such hazards, if appropriate.

**(7) RCRA facilities**

In the case of any category or subcategory of sources the air emissions of which are regulated under subtitle C of the Solid Waste Disposal Act [42 U.S.C. 6921 et seq.], the Administrator shall take into account any regulations of such emissions which are promulgated under such subtitle and shall, to the maximum extent practicable and consistent with the provisions of this section, ensure that the requirements of such subtitle and this section are consistent.

**(o) National Academy of Sciences study**

**(1) Request of the Academy**

Within 3 months of November 15, 1990, the Administrator shall enter into appropriate arrangements with the National Academy of Sciences to conduct a review of—

(A) risk assessment methodology used by the Environmental Protection Agency to de-

termine the carcinogenic risk associated with exposure to hazardous air pollutants from source categories and subcategories subject to the requirements of this section; and

(B) improvements in such methodology.

**(2) Elements to be studied**

In conducting such review, the National Academy of Sciences should consider, but not be limited to, the following—

(A) the techniques used for estimating and describing the carcinogenic potency to humans of hazardous air pollutants; and

(B) the techniques used for estimating exposure to hazardous air pollutants (for hypothetical and actual maximally exposed individuals as well as other exposed individuals).

**(3) Other health effects of concern**

To the extent practicable, the Academy shall evaluate and report on the methodology for assessing the risk of adverse human health effects other than cancer for which safe thresholds of exposure may not exist, including, but not limited to, inheritable genetic mutations, birth defects, and reproductive dysfunctions.

**(4) Report**

A report on the results of such review shall be submitted to the Senate Committee on Environment and Public Works, the House Committee on Energy and Commerce, the Risk Assessment and Management Commission established by section 303 of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 and the Administrator not later than 30 months after November 15, 1990.

**(5) Assistance**

The Administrator shall assist the Academy in gathering any information the Academy deems necessary to carry out this subsection. The Administrator may use any authority under this chapter to obtain information from any person, and to require any person to conduct tests, keep and produce records, and make reports respecting research or other activities conducted by such person as necessary to carry out this subsection.

**(6) Authorization**

Of the funds authorized to be appropriated to the Administrator by this chapter, such amounts as are required shall be available to carry out this subsection.

**(7) Guidelines for carcinogenic risk assessment**

The Administrator shall consider, but need not adopt, the recommendations contained in the report of the National Academy of Sciences prepared pursuant to this subsection and the views of the Science Advisory Board, with respect to such report. Prior to the promulgation of any standard under subsection (f) of this section, and after notice and opportunity for comment, the Administrator shall publish revised Guidelines for Carcinogenic Risk Assessment or a detailed explanation of the reasons that any recommendations contained in the report of the National Academy of Sciences will not be implemented. The publica-

<sup>3</sup>So in original. Probably should be "section".

tion of such revised Guidelines shall be a final Agency action for purposes of section 7607 of this title.

**(p) Mickey Leland National Urban Air Toxics Research Center**

**(1) Establishment**

The Administrator shall oversee the establishment of a National Urban Air Toxics Research Center, to be located at a university, a hospital, or other facility capable of undertaking and maintaining similar research capabilities in the areas of epidemiology, oncology, toxicology, pulmonary medicine, pathology, and biostatistics. The center shall be known as the Mickey Leland National Urban Air Toxics Research Center. The geographic site of the National Urban Air Toxics Research Center should be further directed to Harris County, Texas, in order to take full advantage of the well developed scientific community presence on-site at the Texas Medical Center as well as the extensive data previously compiled for the comprehensive monitoring system currently in place.

**(2) Board of Directors**

The National Urban Air Toxics Research Center shall be governed by a Board of Directors to be comprised of 9 members, the appointment of which shall be allocated pro rata among the Speaker of the House, the Majority Leader of the Senate and the President. The members of the Board of Directors shall be selected based on their respective academic and professional backgrounds and expertise in matters relating to public health, environmental pollution and industrial hygiene. The duties of the Board of Directors shall be to determine policy and research guidelines, submit views from center sponsors and the public and issue periodic reports of center findings and activities.

**(3) Scientific Advisory Panel**

The Board of Directors shall be advised by a Scientific Advisory Panel, the 13 members of which shall be appointed by the Board, and to include eminent members of the scientific and medical communities. The Panel membership may include scientists with relevant experience from the National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences, the Center for Disease Control, the Environmental Protection Agency, the National Cancer Institute, and others, and the Panel shall conduct peer review and evaluate research results. The Panel shall assist the Board in developing the research agenda, reviewing proposals and applications, and advise on the awarding of research grants.

**(4) Funding**

The center shall be established and funded with both Federal and private source funds.

**(q) Savings provision**

**(1) Standards previously promulgated**

Any standard under this section in effect before the date of enactment of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 [November 15, 1990] shall remain in force and effect after such date

unless modified as provided in this section before the date of enactment of such Amendments or under such Amendments. Except as provided in paragraph (4), any standard under this section which has been promulgated, but has not taken effect, before such date shall not be affected by such Amendments unless modified as provided in this section before such date or under such Amendments. Each such standard shall be reviewed and, if appropriate, revised, to comply with the requirements of subsection (d) of this section within 10 years after the date of enactment of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990. If a timely petition for review of any such standard under section 7607 of this title is pending on such date of enactment, the standard shall be upheld if it complies with this section as in effect before that date. If any such standard is remanded to the Administrator, the Administrator may in the Administrator's discretion apply either the requirements of this section, or those of this section as in effect before the date of enactment of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990.

**(2) Special rule**

Notwithstanding paragraph (1), no standard shall be established under this section, as amended by the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990, for radionuclide emissions from (A) elemental phosphorous plants, (B) grate calcination elemental phosphorous plants, (C) phosphogypsum stacks, or (D) any subcategory of the foregoing. This section, as in effect prior to the date of enactment of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 [November 15, 1990], shall remain in effect for radionuclide emissions from such plants and stacks.

**(3) Other categories**

Notwithstanding paragraph (1), this section, as in effect prior to the date of enactment of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 [November 15, 1990], shall remain in effect for radionuclide emissions from non-Department of Energy Federal facilities that are not licensed by the Nuclear Regulatory Commission, coal-fired utility and industrial boilers, underground uranium mines, surface uranium mines, and disposal of uranium mill tailings piles, unless the Administrator, in the Administrator's discretion, applies the requirements of this section as modified by the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 to such sources of radionuclides.

**(4) Medical facilities**

Notwithstanding paragraph (1), no standard promulgated under this section prior to November 15, 1990, with respect to medical research or treatment facilities shall take effect for two years following November 15, 1990, unless the Administrator makes a determination pursuant to a rulemaking under subsection (d)(9) of this section. If the Administrator determines that the regulatory program established by the Nuclear Regulatory Commission for such facilities does not provide an ample margin of safety to protect public health, the requirements of this section shall fully apply to such facilities. If the Administrator deter-

mines that such regulatory program does provide an ample margin of safety to protect the public health, the Administrator is not required to promulgate a standard under this section for such facilities, as provided in subsection (d)(9) of this section.

**(r) Prevention of accidental releases**

**(1) Purpose and general duty**

It shall be the objective of the regulations and programs authorized under this subsection to prevent the accidental release and to minimize the consequences of any such release of any substance listed pursuant to paragraph (3) or any other extremely hazardous substance. The owners and operators of stationary sources producing, processing, handling or storing such substances have a general duty in the same manner and to the same extent as section 654 of title 29 to identify hazards which may result from such releases using appropriate hazard assessment techniques, to design and maintain a safe facility taking such steps as are necessary to prevent releases, and to minimize the consequences of accidental releases which do occur. For purposes of this paragraph, the provisions of section 7604 of this title shall not be available to any person or otherwise be construed to be applicable to this paragraph. Nothing in this section shall be interpreted, construed, implied or applied to create any liability or basis for suit for compensation for bodily injury or any other injury or property damages to any person which may result from accidental releases of such substances.

**(2) Definitions**

(A) The term "accidental release" means an unanticipated emission of a regulated substance or other extremely hazardous substance into the ambient air from a stationary source.

(B) The term "regulated substance" means a substance listed under paragraph (3).

(C) The term "stationary source" means any buildings, structures, equipment, installations or substance emitting stationary activities (i) which belong to the same industrial group, (ii) which are located on one or more contiguous properties, (iii) which are under the control of the same person (or persons under common control), and (iv) from which an accidental release may occur.

(D) The term "retail facility" means a stationary source at which more than one-half of the income is obtained from direct sales to end users or at which more than one-half of the fuel sold, by volume, is sold through a cylinder exchange program.

**(3) List of substances**

The Administrator shall promulgate not later than 24 months after November 15, 1990, an initial list of 100 substances which, in the case of an accidental release, are known to cause or may reasonably be anticipated to cause death, injury, or serious adverse effects to human health or the environment. For purposes of promulgating such list, the Administrator shall use, but is not limited to, the list of extremely hazardous substances published under the Emergency Planning and Commu-

nity Right-to-Know<sup>4</sup> Act of 1986 [42 U.S.C. 11001 et seq.], with such modifications as the Administrator deems appropriate. The initial list shall include chlorine, anhydrous ammonia, methyl chloride, ethylene oxide, vinyl chloride, methyl isocyanate, hydrogen cyanide, ammonia, hydrogen sulfide, toluene diisocyanate, phosgene, bromine, anhydrous hydrogen chloride, hydrogen fluoride, anhydrous sulfur dioxide, and sulfur trioxide. The initial list shall include at least 100 substances which pose the greatest risk of causing death, injury, or serious adverse effects to human health or the environment from accidental releases. Regulations establishing the list shall include an explanation of the basis for establishing the list. The list may be revised from time to time by the Administrator on the Administrator's own motion or by petition and shall be reviewed at least every 5 years. No air pollutant for which a national primary ambient air quality standard has been established shall be included on any such list. No substance, practice, process, or activity regulated under subchapter VI of this chapter shall be subject to regulations under this subsection. The Administrator shall establish procedures for the addition and deletion of substances from the list established under this paragraph consistent with those applicable to the list in subsection (b) of this section.

**(4) Factors to be considered**

In listing substances under paragraph (3), the Administrator—

(A) shall consider—

(i) the severity of any acute adverse health effects associated with accidental releases of the substance;

(ii) the likelihood of accidental releases of the substance; and

(iii) the potential magnitude of human exposure to accidental releases of the substance; and

(B) shall not list a flammable substance when used as a fuel or held for sale as a fuel at a retail facility under this subsection solely because of the explosive or flammable properties of the substance, unless a fire or explosion caused by the substance will result in acute adverse health effects from human exposure to the substance, including the unburned fuel or its combustion byproducts, other than those caused by the heat of the fire or impact of the explosion.

**(5) Threshold quantity**

At the time any substance is listed pursuant to paragraph (3), the Administrator shall establish by rule, a threshold quantity for the substance, taking into account the toxicity, reactivity, volatility, dispersibility, combustibility, or flammability of the substance and the amount of the substance which, as a result of an accidental release, is known to cause or may reasonably be anticipated to cause death, injury or serious adverse effects to human health for which the substance was listed. The Administrator is authorized to establish a

<sup>4</sup>So in original. Probably should be "Right-To-Know".



greater threshold quantity for, or to exempt entirely, any substance that is a nutrient used in agriculture when held by a farmer.

**(6) Chemical Safety Board**

(A) There is hereby established an independent safety board to be known as the Chemical Safety and Hazard Investigation Board.

(B) The Board shall consist of 5 members, including a Chairperson, who shall be appointed by the President, by and with the advice and consent of the Senate. Members of the Board shall be appointed on the basis of technical qualification, professional standing, and demonstrated knowledge in the fields of accident reconstruction, safety engineering, human factors, toxicology, or air pollution regulation. The terms of office of members of the Board shall be 5 years. Any member of the Board, including the Chairperson, may be removed for inefficiency, neglect of duty, or malfeasance in office. The Chairperson shall be the Chief Executive Officer of the Board and shall exercise the executive and administrative functions of the Board.

(C) The Board shall—

(i) investigate (or cause to be investigated), determine and report to the public in writing the facts, conditions, and circumstances and the cause or probable cause of any accidental release resulting in a fatality, serious injury or substantial property damages;

(ii) issue periodic reports to the Congress, Federal, State and local agencies, including the Environmental Protection Agency and the Occupational Safety and Health Administration, concerned with the safety of chemical production, processing, handling and storage, and other interested persons recommending measures to reduce the likelihood or the consequences of accidental releases and proposing corrective steps to make chemical production, processing, handling and storage as safe and free from risk of injury as is possible and may include in such reports proposed rules or orders which should be issued by the Administrator under the authority of this section or the Secretary of Labor under the Occupational Safety and Health Act [29 U.S.C. 651 et seq.] to prevent or minimize the consequences of any release of substances that may cause death, injury or other serious adverse effects on human health or substantial property damage as the result of an accidental release; and

(iii) establish by regulation requirements binding on persons for reporting accidental releases into the ambient air subject to the Board's investigatory jurisdiction. Reporting releases to the National Response Center, in lieu of the Board directly, shall satisfy such regulations. The National Response Center shall promptly notify the Board of any releases which are within the Board's jurisdiction.

(D) The Board may utilize the expertise and experience of other agencies.

(E) The Board shall coordinate its activities with investigations and studies conducted by

other agencies of the United States having a responsibility to protect public health and safety. The Board shall enter into a memorandum of understanding with the National Transportation Safety Board to assure coordination of functions and to limit duplication of activities which shall designate the National Transportation Safety Board as the lead agency for the investigation of releases which are transportation related. The Board shall not be authorized to investigate marine oil spills, which the National Transportation Safety Board is authorized to investigate. The Board shall enter into a memorandum of understanding with the Occupational Safety and Health Administration so as to limit duplication of activities. In no event shall the Board forego an investigation where an accidental release causes a fatality or serious injury among the general public, or had the potential to cause substantial property damage or a number of deaths or injuries among the general public.

(F) The Board is authorized to conduct research and studies with respect to the potential for accidental releases, whether or not an accidental release has occurred, where there is evidence which indicates the presence of a potential hazard or hazards. To the extent practicable, the Board shall conduct such studies in cooperation with other Federal agencies having emergency response authorities, State and local governmental agencies and associations and organizations from the industrial, commercial, and nonprofit sectors.

(G) No part of the conclusions, findings, or recommendations of the Board relating to any accidental release or the investigation thereof shall be admitted as evidence or used in any action or suit for damages arising out of any matter mentioned in such report.

(H) Not later than 18 months after November 15, 1990, the Board shall publish a report accompanied by recommendations to the Administrator on the use of hazard assessments in preventing the occurrence and minimizing the consequences of accidental releases of extremely hazardous substances. The recommendations shall include a list of extremely hazardous substances which are not regulated substances (including threshold quantities for such substances) and categories of stationary sources for which hazard assessments would be an appropriate measure to aid in the prevention of accidental releases and to minimize the consequences of those releases that do occur. The recommendations shall also include a description of the information and analysis which would be appropriate to include in any hazard assessment. The Board shall also make recommendations with respect to the role of risk management plans as required by paragraph (8)(B)<sup>5</sup> in preventing accidental releases. The Board may from time to time review and revise its recommendations under this subparagraph.

(I) Whenever the Board submits a recommendation with respect to accidental releases to the Administrator, the Administrator shall respond to such recommendation formally and

<sup>5</sup> So in original. Probably should be paragraph "(7)(B)".

in writing not later than 180 days after receipt thereof. The response to the Board's recommendation by the Administrator shall indicate whether the Administrator will—

- (i) initiate a rulemaking or issue such orders as are necessary to implement the recommendation in full or in part, pursuant to any timetable contained in the recommendation;<sup>6</sup>
- (ii) decline to initiate a rulemaking or issue orders as recommended.

Any determination by the Administrator not to implement a recommendation of the Board or to implement a recommendation only in part, including any variation from the schedule contained in the recommendation, shall be accompanied by a statement from the Administrator setting forth the reasons for such determination.

(J) The Board may make recommendations with respect to accidental releases to the Secretary of Labor. Whenever the Board submits such recommendation, the Secretary shall respond to such recommendation formally and in writing not later than 180 days after receipt thereof. The response to the Board's recommendation by the Administrator<sup>7</sup> shall indicate whether the Secretary will—

- (i) initiate a rulemaking or issue such orders as are necessary to implement the recommendation in full or in part, pursuant to any timetable contained in the recommendation;<sup>6</sup>
- (ii) decline to initiate a rulemaking or issue orders as recommended.

Any determination by the Secretary not to implement a recommendation or to implement a recommendation only in part, including any variation from the schedule contained in the recommendation, shall be accompanied by a statement from the Secretary setting forth the reasons for such determination.

(K) Within 2 years after November 15, 1990, the Board shall issue a report to the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency and to the Administrator of the Occupational Safety and Health Administration recommending the adoption of regulations for the preparation of risk management plans and general requirements for the prevention of accidental releases of regulated substances into the ambient air (including recommendations for listing substances under paragraph (3)) and for the mitigation of the potential adverse effect on human health or the environment as a result of accidental releases which should be applicable to any stationary source handling any regulated substance in more than threshold amounts. The Board may include proposed rules or orders which should be issued by the Administrator under authority of this subsection or by the Secretary of Labor under the Occupational Safety and Health Act [29 U.S.C. 651 et seq.]. Any such recommendations shall be specific and shall identify the regulated substance or class of regulated substances (or

other substances) to which the recommendations apply. The Administrator shall consider such recommendations before promulgating regulations required by paragraph (7)(B).

(L) The Board, or upon authority of the Board, any member thereof, any administrative law judge employed by or assigned to the Board, or any officer or employee duly designated by the Board, may for the purpose of carrying out duties authorized by subparagraph (C)—

- (i) hold such hearings, sit and act at such times and places, administer such oaths, and require by subpoena or otherwise attendance and testimony of such witnesses and the production of evidence and may require by order that any person engaged in the production, processing, handling, or storage of extremely hazardous substances submit written reports and responses to requests and questions within such time and in such form as the Board may require; and

- (ii) upon presenting appropriate credentials and a written notice of inspection authority, enter any property where an accidental release causing a fatality, serious injury or substantial property damage has occurred and do all things therein necessary for a proper investigation pursuant to subparagraph (C) and inspect at reasonable times records, files, papers, processes, controls, and facilities and take such samples as are relevant to such investigation.

Whenever the Administrator or the Board conducts an inspection of a facility pursuant to this subsection, employees and their representatives shall have the same rights to participate in such inspections as provided in the Occupational Safety and Health Act [29 U.S.C. 651 et seq.].

(M) In addition to that described in subparagraph (L), the Board may use any information gathering authority of the Administrator under this chapter, including the subpoena power provided in section 7607(a)(1) of this title.

(N) The Board is authorized to establish such procedural and administrative rules as are necessary to the exercise of its functions and duties. The Board is authorized without regard to section 6101 of title 41 to enter into contracts, leases, cooperative agreements or other transactions as may be necessary in the conduct of the duties and functions of the Board with any other agency, institution, or person.

(O) After the effective date of any reporting requirement promulgated pursuant to subparagraph (C)(iii) it shall be unlawful for any person to fail to report any release of any extremely hazardous substance as required by such subparagraph. The Administrator is authorized to enforce any regulation or requirements established by the Board pursuant to subparagraph (C)(iii) using the authorities of sections 7413 and 7414 of this title. Any request for information from the owner or operator of a stationary source made by the Board or by the Administrator under this section shall be treated, for purposes of sections 7413, 7414, 7416, 7420, 7603, 7604 and 7607 of this title and any other enforcement provisions of this chap-

<sup>6</sup> So in original. The word "or" probably should appear.

<sup>7</sup> So in original. The word "Administrator" probably should be "Secretary".

ter, as a request made by the Administrator under section 7414 of this title and may be enforced by the Chairperson of the Board or by the Administrator as provided in such section.

(P) The Administrator shall provide to the Board such support and facilities as may be necessary for operation of the Board.

(Q) Consistent with subsection<sup>8</sup> (G) and section 7414(c) of this title any records, reports or information obtained by the Board shall be available to the Administrator, the Secretary of Labor, the Congress and the public, except that upon a showing satisfactory to the Board by any person that records, reports, or information, or particular part thereof (other than release or emissions data) to which the Board has access, if made public, is likely to cause substantial harm to the person's competitive position, the Board shall consider such record, report, or information or particular portion thereof confidential in accordance with section 1905 of title 18, except that such record, report, or information may be disclosed to other officers, employees, and authorized representatives of the United States concerned with carrying out this chapter or when relevant under any proceeding under this chapter. This subparagraph does not constitute authority to withhold records, reports, or information from the Congress.

(R) Whenever the Board submits or transmits any budget estimate, budget request, supplemental budget request, or other budget information, legislative recommendation, prepared testimony for congressional hearings, recommendation or study to the President, the Secretary of Labor, the Administrator, or the Director of the Office of Management and Budget, it shall concurrently transmit a copy thereof to the Congress. No report of the Board shall be subject to review by the Administrator or any Federal agency or to judicial review in any court. No officer or agency of the United States shall have authority to require the Board to submit its budget requests or estimates, legislative recommendations, prepared testimony, comments, recommendations or reports to any officer or agency of the United States for approval or review prior to the submission of such recommendations, testimony, comments or reports to the Congress. In the performance of their functions as established by this chapter, the members, officers and employees of the Board shall not be responsible to or subject to supervision or direction, in carrying out any duties under this subsection, of any officer or employee or agent of the Environmental Protection Agency, the Department of Labor or any other agency of the United States except that the President may remove any member, officer or employee of the Board for inefficiency, neglect of duty or malfeasance in office. Nothing in this section shall affect the application of title 5 to officers or employees of the Board.

(S) The Board shall submit an annual report to the President and to the Congress which shall include, but not be limited to, information on accidental releases which have been

investigated by or reported to the Board during the previous year, recommendations for legislative or administrative action which the Board has made, the actions which have been taken by the Administrator or the Secretary of Labor or the heads of other agencies to implement such recommendations, an identification of priorities for study and investigation in the succeeding year, progress in the development of risk-reduction technologies and the response to and implementation of significant research findings on chemical safety in the public and private sector.

#### (7) Accident prevention

(A) In order to prevent accidental releases of regulated substances, the Administrator is authorized to promulgate release prevention, detection, and correction requirements which may include monitoring, record-keeping, reporting, training, vapor recovery, secondary containment, and other design, equipment, work practice, and operational requirements. Regulations promulgated under this paragraph may make distinctions between various types, classes, and kinds of facilities, devices and systems taking into consideration factors including, but not limited to, the size, location, process, process controls, quantity of substances handled, potency of substances, and response capabilities present at any stationary source. Regulations promulgated pursuant to this subparagraph shall have an effective date, as determined by the Administrator, assuring compliance as expeditiously as practicable.

(B)(i) Within 3 years after November 15, 1990, the Administrator shall promulgate reasonable regulations and appropriate guidance to provide, to the greatest extent practicable, for the prevention and detection of accidental releases of regulated substances and for response to such releases by the owners or operators of the sources of such releases. The Administrator shall utilize the expertise of the Secretaries of Transportation and Labor in promulgating such regulations. As appropriate, such regulations shall cover the use, operation, repair, replacement, and maintenance of equipment to monitor, detect, inspect, and control such releases, including training of persons in the use and maintenance of such equipment and in the conduct of periodic inspections. The regulations shall include procedures and measures for emergency response after an accidental release of a regulated substance in order to protect human health and the environment. The regulations shall cover storage, as well as operations. The regulations shall, as appropriate, recognize differences in size, operations, processes, class and categories of sources and the voluntary actions of such sources to prevent such releases and respond to such releases. The regulations shall be applicable to a stationary source 3 years after the date of promulgation, or 3 years after the date on which a regulated substance present at the source in more than threshold amounts is first listed under paragraph (3), whichever is later.

(ii) The regulations under this subparagraph shall require the owner or operator of station-

<sup>8</sup> So in original. Probably should be "subparagraph".



ary sources at which a regulated substance is present in more than a threshold quantity to prepare and implement a risk management plan to detect and prevent or minimize accidental releases of such substances from the stationary source, and to provide a prompt emergency response to any such releases in order to protect human health and the environment. Such plan shall provide for compliance with the requirements of this subsection and shall also include each of the following:

(I) a hazard assessment to assess the potential effects of an accidental release of any regulated substance. This assessment shall include an estimate of potential release quantities and a determination of downwind effects, including potential exposures to affected populations. Such assessment shall include a previous release history of the past 5 years, including the size, concentration, and duration of releases, and shall include an evaluation of worst case accidental releases;

(II) a program for preventing accidental releases of regulated substances, including safety precautions and maintenance, monitoring and employee training measures to be used at the source; and

(III) a response program providing for specific actions to be taken in response to an accidental release of a regulated substance so as to protect human health and the environment, including procedures for informing the public and local agencies responsible for responding to accidental releases, emergency health care, and employee training measures.

At the time regulations are promulgated under this subparagraph, the Administrator shall promulgate guidelines to assist stationary sources in the preparation of risk management plans. The guidelines shall, to the extent practicable, include model risk management plans.

(iii) The owner or operator of each stationary source covered by clause (ii) shall register a risk management plan prepared under this subparagraph with the Administrator before the effective date of regulations under clause (i) in such form and manner as the Administrator shall, by rule, require. Plans prepared pursuant to this subparagraph shall also be submitted to the Chemical Safety and Hazard Investigation Board, to the State in which the stationary source is located, and to any local agency or entity having responsibility for planning for or responding to accidental releases which may occur at such source, and shall be available to the public under section 7414(c) of this title. The Administrator shall establish, by rule, an auditing system to regularly review and, if necessary, require revision in risk management plans to assure that the plans comply with this subparagraph. Each such plan shall be updated periodically as required by the Administrator, by rule.

(C) Any regulations promulgated pursuant to this subsection shall to the maximum extent practicable, consistent with this subsection, be consistent with the recommendations and standards established by the Amer-

ican Society of Mechanical Engineers (ASME), the American National Standards Institute (ANSI) or the American Society of Testing Materials (ASTM). The Administrator shall take into consideration the concerns of small business in promulgating regulations under this subsection.

(D) In carrying out the authority of this paragraph, the Administrator shall consult with the Secretary of Labor and the Secretary of Transportation and shall coordinate any requirements under this paragraph with any requirements established for comparable purposes by the Occupational Safety and Health Administration or the Department of Transportation. Nothing in this subsection shall be interpreted, construed or applied to impose requirements affecting, or to grant the Administrator, the Chemical Safety and Hazard Investigation Board, or any other agency any authority to regulate (including requirements for hazard assessment), the accidental release of radionuclides arising from the construction and operation of facilities licensed by the Nuclear Regulatory Commission.

(E) After the effective date of any regulation or requirement imposed under this subsection, it shall be unlawful for any person to operate any stationary source subject to such regulation or requirement in violation of such regulation or requirement. Each regulation or requirement under this subsection shall for purposes of sections 7413, 7414, 7416, 7420, 7604, and 7607 of this title and other enforcement provisions of this chapter, be treated as a standard in effect under subsection (d) of this section.

(F) Notwithstanding the provisions of subchapter V of this chapter or this section, no stationary source shall be required to apply for, or operate pursuant to, a permit issued under such subchapter solely because such source is subject to regulations or requirements under this subsection.

(G) In exercising any authority under this subsection, the Administrator shall not, for purposes of section 653(b)(1) of title 29, be deemed to be exercising statutory authority to prescribe or enforce standards or regulations affecting occupational safety and health.

(H) PUBLIC ACCESS TO OFF-SITE CONSEQUENCE ANALYSIS INFORMATION.—

(i) DEFINITIONS.—In this subparagraph:

(I) COVERED PERSON.—The term “covered person” means—

(aa) an officer or employee of the United States;

(bb) an officer or employee of an agent or contractor of the Federal Government;

(cc) an officer or employee of a State or local government;

(dd) an officer or employee of an agent or contractor of a State or local government;

(ee) an individual affiliated with an entity that has been given, by a State or local government, responsibility for preventing, planning for, or responding to accidental releases;

(ff) an officer or employee or an agent or contractor of an entity described in item (ee); and

- (gg) a qualified researcher under clause (vii).
- (II) OFFICIAL USE.—The term “official use” means an action of a Federal, State, or local government agency or an entity referred to in subclause (I)(ee) intended to carry out a function relevant to preventing, planning for, or responding to accidental releases.
- (III) OFF-SITE CONSEQUENCE ANALYSIS INFORMATION.—The term “off-site consequence analysis information” means those portions of a risk management plan, excluding the executive summary of the plan, consisting of an evaluation of 1 or more worst-case release scenarios or alternative release scenarios, and any electronic data base created by the Administrator from those portions.
- (IV) RISK MANAGEMENT PLAN.—The term “risk management plan” means a risk management plan submitted to the Administrator by an owner or operator of a stationary source under subparagraph (B)(iii).
- (ii) REGULATIONS.—Not later than 1 year after August 5, 1999, the President shall—
- (I) assess—
- (aa) the increased risk of terrorist and other criminal activity associated with the posting of off-site consequence analysis information on the Internet; and
- (bb) the incentives created by public disclosure of off-site consequence analysis information for reduction in the risk of accidental releases; and
- (II) based on the assessment under subclause (I), promulgate regulations governing the distribution of off-site consequence analysis information in a manner that, in the opinion of the President, minimizes the likelihood of accidental releases and the risk described in subclause (I)(aa) and the likelihood of harm to public health and welfare, and—
- (aa) allows access by any member of the public to paper copies of off-site consequence analysis information for a limited number of stationary sources located anywhere in the United States, without any geographical restriction;
- (bb) allows other public access to off-site consequence analysis information as appropriate;
- (cc) allows access for official use by a covered person described in any of items (cc) through (ff) of clause (i)(I) (referred to in this subclause as a “State or local covered person”) to off-site consequence analysis information relating to stationary sources located in the person’s State;
- (dd) allows a State or local covered person to provide, for official use, off-site consequence analysis information relating to stationary sources located in the person’s State to a State or local covered person in a contiguous State; and
- (ee) allows a State or local covered person to obtain for official use, by request to the Administrator, off-site consequence analysis information that is not available to the person under item (cc).
- (iii) AVAILABILITY UNDER FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT.—
- (I) FIRST YEAR.—Off-site consequence analysis information, and any ranking of stationary sources derived from the information, shall not be made available under section 552 of title 5 during the 1-year period beginning on August 5, 1999.
- (II) AFTER FIRST YEAR.—If the regulations under clause (ii) are promulgated on or before the end of the period described in subclause (I), off-site consequence analysis information covered by the regulations, and any ranking of stationary sources derived from the information, shall not be made available under section 552 of title 5 after the end of that period.
- (III) APPLICABILITY.—Subclauses (I) and (II) apply to off-site consequence analysis information submitted to the Administrator before, on, or after August 5, 1999.
- (iv) AVAILABILITY OF INFORMATION DURING TRANSITION PERIOD.—The Administrator shall make off-site consequence analysis information available to covered persons for official use in a manner that meets the requirements of items (cc) through (ee) of clause (ii)(II), and to the public in a form that does not make available any information concerning the identity or location of stationary sources, during the period—
- (I) beginning on August 5, 1999; and
- (II) ending on the earlier of the date of promulgation of the regulations under clause (ii) or the date that is 1 year after August 5, 1999.
- (v) PROHIBITION ON UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF INFORMATION BY COVERED PERSONS.—
- (I) IN GENERAL.—Beginning on August 5, 1999, a covered person shall not disclose to the public off-site consequence analysis information in any form, or any statewide or national ranking of identified stationary sources derived from such information, except as authorized by this subparagraph (including the regulations promulgated under clause (ii)). After the end of the 1-year period beginning on August 5, 1999, if regulations have not been promulgated under clause (ii), the preceding sentence shall not apply.
- (II) CRIMINAL PENALTIES.—Notwithstanding section 7413 of this title, a covered person that willfully violates a restriction or prohibition established by this subparagraph (including the regulations promulgated under clause (ii)) shall, upon conviction, be fined for an infraction under section 3571 of title 18 (but shall not be subject to imprisonment) for each unauthorized disclosure of off-site consequence analysis information, except that subsection (d) of such section 3571 shall not apply to a case in which the offense results in pecuniary loss unless the defendant knew that such loss would occur. The dis-

closure of off-site consequence analysis information for each specific stationary source shall be considered a separate offense. The total of all penalties that may be imposed on a single person or organization under this item shall not exceed \$1,000,000 for violations committed during any 1 calendar year.

(III) APPLICABILITY.—If the owner or operator of a stationary source makes off-site consequence analysis information relating to that stationary source available to the public without restriction—

(aa) subclauses (I) and (II) shall not apply with respect to the information; and

(bb) the owner or operator shall notify the Administrator of the public availability of the information.

(IV) LIST.—The Administrator shall maintain and make publicly available a list of all stationary sources that have provided notification under subclause (III)(bb).

(vi) NOTICE.—The Administrator shall provide notice of the definition of official use as provided in clause (i)(III)<sup>9</sup> and examples of actions that would and would not meet that definition, and notice of the restrictions on further dissemination and the penalties established by this chapter to each covered person who receives off-site consequence analysis information under clause (iv) and each covered person who receives off-site consequence analysis information for an official use under the regulations promulgated under clause (ii).

(vii) QUALIFIED RESEARCHERS.—

(I) IN GENERAL.—Not later than 180 days after August 5, 1999, the Administrator, in consultation with the Attorney General, shall develop and implement a system for providing off-site consequence analysis information, including facility identification, to any qualified researcher, including a qualified researcher from industry or any public interest group.

(II) LIMITATION ON DISSEMINATION.—The system shall not allow the researcher to disseminate, or make available on the Internet, the off-site consequence analysis information, or any portion of the off-site consequence analysis information, received under this clause.

(viii) READ-ONLY INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY SYSTEM.—In consultation with the Attorney General and the heads of other appropriate Federal agencies, the Administrator shall establish an information technology system that provides for the availability to the public of off-site consequence analysis information by means of a central data base under the control of the Federal Government that contains information that users may read, but that provides no means by which an electronic or mechanical copy of the information may be made.

(ix) VOLUNTARY INDUSTRY ACCIDENT PREVENTION STANDARDS.—The Environmental

Protection Agency, the Department of Justice, and other appropriate agencies may provide technical assistance to owners and operators of stationary sources and participate in the development of voluntary industry standards that will help achieve the objectives set forth in paragraph (1).

(x) EFFECT ON STATE OR LOCAL LAW.—

(I) IN GENERAL.—Subject to subclause (II), this subparagraph (including the regulations promulgated under this subparagraph) shall supersede any provision of State or local law that is inconsistent with this subparagraph (including the regulations).

(II) AVAILABILITY OF INFORMATION UNDER STATE LAW.—Nothing in this subparagraph precludes a State from making available data on the off-site consequences of chemical releases collected in accordance with State law.

(xi) REPORT.—

(I) IN GENERAL.—Not later than 3 years after August 5, 1999, the Attorney General, in consultation with appropriate State, local, and Federal Government agencies, affected industry, and the public, shall submit to Congress a report that describes the extent to which regulations promulgated under this paragraph have resulted in actions, including the design and maintenance of safe facilities, that are effective in detecting, preventing, and minimizing the consequences of releases of regulated substances that may be caused by criminal activity. As part of this report, the Attorney General, using available data to the extent possible, and a sampling of covered stationary sources selected at the discretion of the Attorney General, and in consultation with appropriate State, local, and Federal governmental agencies, affected industry, and the public, shall review the vulnerability of covered stationary sources to criminal and terrorist activity, current industry practices regarding site security, and security of transportation of regulated substances. The Attorney General shall submit this report, containing the results of the review, together with recommendations, if any, for reducing vulnerability of covered stationary sources to criminal and terrorist activity, to the Committee on Commerce of the United States House of Representatives and the Committee on Environment and Public Works of the United States Senate and other relevant committees of Congress.

(II) INTERIM REPORT.—Not later than 12 months after August 5, 1999, the Attorney General shall submit to the Committee on Commerce of the United States House of Representatives and the Committee on Environment and Public Works of the United States Senate, and other relevant committees of Congress, an interim report that includes, at a minimum—

(aa) the preliminary findings under subclause (I);

(bb) the methods used to develop the findings; and

<sup>9</sup>So in original. Probably should be "(i)(II)".



(cc) an explanation of the activities expected to occur that could cause the findings of the report under subclause (I) to be different than the preliminary findings.

(III) AVAILABILITY OF INFORMATION.—Information that is developed by the Attorney General or requested by the Attorney General and received from a covered stationary source for the purpose of conducting the review under subclauses (I) and (II) shall be exempt from disclosure under section 552 of title 5 if such information would pose a threat to national security.

(xii) SCOPE.—This subparagraph—

(I) applies only to covered persons; and

(II) does not restrict the dissemination of off-site consequence analysis information by any covered person in any manner or form except in the form of a risk management plan or an electronic data base created by the Administrator from off-site consequence analysis information.

(xiii) AUTHORIZATION OF APPROPRIATIONS.—There are authorized to be appropriated to the Administrator and the Attorney General such sums as are necessary to carry out this subparagraph (including the regulations promulgated under clause (ii)), to remain available until expended.

#### **(8) Research on hazard assessments**

The Administrator may collect and publish information on accident scenarios and consequences covering a range of possible events for substances listed under paragraph (3). The Administrator shall establish a program of long-term research to develop and disseminate information on methods and techniques for hazard assessment which may be useful in improving and validating the procedures employed in the preparation of hazard assessments under this subsection.

#### **(9) Order authority**

(A) In addition to any other action taken, when the Administrator determines that there may be an imminent and substantial endangerment to the human health or welfare or the environment because of an actual or threatened accidental release of a regulated substance, the Administrator may secure such relief as may be necessary to abate such danger or threat, and the district court of the United States in the district in which the threat occurs shall have jurisdiction to grant such relief as the public interest and the equities of the case may require. The Administrator may also, after notice to the State in which the stationary source is located, take other action under this paragraph including, but not limited to, issuing such orders as may be necessary to protect human health. The Administrator shall take action under section 7603 of this title rather than this paragraph whenever the authority of such section is adequate to protect human health and the environment.

(B) Orders issued pursuant to this paragraph may be enforced in an action brought in the appropriate United States district court as if

the order were issued under section 7603 of this title.

(C) Within 180 days after November 15, 1990, the Administrator shall publish guidance for using the order authorities established by this paragraph. Such guidance shall provide for the coordinated use of the authorities of this paragraph with other emergency powers authorized by section 9606 of this title, sections 311(c), 308, 309 and 504(a) of the Federal Water Pollution Control Act [33 U.S.C. 1321(c), 1318, 1319, 1364(a)], sections 3007, 3008, 3013, and 7003 of the Solid Waste Disposal Act [42 U.S.C. 6927, 6928, 6934, 6973], sections 1445 and 1431 of the Safe Drinking Water Act [42 U.S.C. 300j-4, 300i], sections 5 and 7 of the Toxic Substances Control Act [15 U.S.C. 2604, 2606], and sections 7413, 7414, and 7603 of this title.

#### **(10) Presidential review**

The President shall conduct a review of release prevention, mitigation and response authorities of the various Federal agencies and shall clarify and coordinate agency responsibilities to assure the most effective and efficient implementation of such authorities and to identify any deficiencies in authority or resources which may exist. The President may utilize the resources and solicit the recommendations of the Chemical Safety and Hazard Investigation Board in conducting such review. At the conclusion of such review, but not later than 24 months after November 15, 1990, the President shall transmit a message to the Congress on the release prevention, mitigation and response activities of the Federal Government making such recommendations for change in law as the President may deem appropriate. Nothing in this paragraph shall be interpreted, construed or applied to authorize the President to modify or reassign release prevention, mitigation or response authorities otherwise established by law.

#### **(11) State authority**

Nothing in this subsection shall preclude, deny or limit any right of a State or political subdivision thereof to adopt or enforce any regulation, requirement, limitation or standard (including any procedural requirement) that is more stringent than a regulation, requirement, limitation or standard in effect under this subsection or that applies to a substance not subject to this subsection.

#### **(s) Periodic report**

Not later than January 15, 1993 and every 3 years thereafter, the Administrator shall prepare and transmit to the Congress a comprehensive report on the measures taken by the Agency and by the States to implement the provisions of this section. The Administrator shall maintain a database on pollutants and sources subject to the provisions of this section and shall include aggregate information from the database in each annual report. The report shall include, but not be limited to—

(1) a status report on standard-setting under subsections (d) and (f) of this section;

(2) information with respect to compliance with such standards including the costs of compliance experienced by sources in various categories and subcategories;

(3) development and implementation of the national urban air toxics program; and

(4) recommendations of the Chemical Safety and Hazard Investigation Board with respect to the prevention and mitigation of accidental releases.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, §112, as added Pub. L. 91-604, §4(a), Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1685; amended Pub. L. 95-95, title I, §§109(d)(2), 110, title IV, §401(c), Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 701, 703, 791; Pub. L. 95-623, §13(b), Nov. 9, 1978, 92 Stat. 3458; Pub. L. 101-549, title III, §301, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2531; Pub. L. 102-187, Dec. 4, 1991, 105 Stat. 1285; Pub. L. 105-362, title IV, §402(b), Nov. 10, 1998, 112 Stat. 3283; Pub. L. 106-40, §§2, 3(a), Aug. 5, 1999, 113 Stat. 207, 208.)

#### REFERENCES IN TEXT

The date of enactment, referred to in subsec. (a)(11), probably means the date of enactment of Pub. L. 101-549, which amended this section generally and was approved Nov. 15, 1990.

The Atomic Energy Act, referred to in subsec. (d)(9), probably means the Atomic Energy Act of 1954, act Aug. 1, 1946, ch. 724, as added by act Aug. 30, 1954, ch. 1073, §1, 68 Stat. 919, which is classified principally to chapter 23 (§2011 et seq.) of this title. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 2011 of this title and Tables.

The Federal Water Pollution Control Act, referred to in subsecs. (e)(5) and (m)(1)(D), (5)(D), is act June 30, 1948, ch. 758, as amended generally by Pub. L. 92-500, §2, Oct. 18, 1972, 86 Stat. 816, which is classified generally to chapter 26 (§1251 et seq.) of Title 33, Navigation and Navigable Waters. Title II of the Act is classified generally to subchapter II (§1281 et seq.) of chapter 26 of Title 33. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 1251 of Title 33 and Tables.

The Toxic Substances Control Act, referred to in subsec. (k)(3)(C), is Pub. L. 94-469, Oct. 11, 1976, 90 Stat. 2003, as amended, which is classified generally to chapter 53 (§2601 et seq.) of Title 15, Commerce and Trade. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 2601 of Title 15 and Tables.

The Federal Insecticide, Fungicide and Rodenticide Act, referred to in subsec. (k)(3)(C), probably means the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act, act June 25, 1947, ch. 125, as amended generally by Pub. L. 92-516, Oct. 21, 1972, 86 Stat. 973, which is classified generally to subchapter II (§136 et seq.) of chapter 6 of Title 7, Agriculture. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 136 of Title 7 and Tables.

The Resource Conservation and Recovery Act, referred to in subsec. (k)(3)(C), probably means the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act of 1976, Pub. L. 94-580, Oct. 21, 1976, 90 Stat. 2796, as amended, which is classified generally to chapter 82 (§6901 et seq.) of this title. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title of 1976 Amendment note set out under section 6901 of this title and Tables.

The Safe Drinking Water Act, referred to in subsec. (m)(1)(D), (5)(D), is title XIV of act July 1, 1944, as added Dec. 16, 1974, Pub. L. 93-523, §2(a), 88 Stat. 1660, as amended, which is classified generally to subchapter XII (§300f et seq.) of chapter 6A of this title. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 201 of this title and Tables.

The Solid Waste Disposal Act, referred to in subsec. (n)(7), is title II of Pub. L. 89-272, Oct. 20, 1965, 79 Stat. 997, as amended generally by Pub. L. 94-580, §2, Oct. 21, 1976, 90 Stat. 2795. Subtitle C of the Act is classified generally to subchapter III (§6921 et seq.) of chapter 82 of this title. For complete classification of this Act to

the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 6901 of this title and Tables.

Section 303 of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990, referred to in subsec. (o)(4), probably means section 303 of Pub. L. 101-549, which is set out below.

The Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990, referred to in subsec. (q)(1)-(3), probably means Pub. L. 101-549, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2399. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 7401 of this title and Tables.

The Emergency Planning and Community Right-To-Know Act of 1986, referred to in subsec. (r)(3), is title III of Pub. L. 99-499, Oct. 17, 1986, 100 Stat. 1728, which is classified generally to chapter 116 (§11001 et seq.) of this title. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 11001 of this title and Tables.

The Occupational Safety and Health Act, referred to in subsec. (r)(6)(C)(ii), (K), (L), probably means the Occupational Safety and Health Act of 1970, Pub. L. 91-596, Dec. 29, 1970, 84 Stat. 1590, as amended, which is classified principally to chapter 15 (§651 et seq.) of Title 29, Labor. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Short Title note set out under section 651 of Title 29 and Tables.

#### CODIFICATION

In subsec. (r)(6)(N), "section 6101 of title 41" substituted for "section 5 of title 41 of the United States Code" on authority of Pub. L. 111-350, §6(c), Jan. 4, 2011, 124 Stat. 3854, which Act enacted Title 41, Public Contracts.

Section was formerly classified to section 1857c-7 of this title.

#### AMENDMENTS

1999—Subsec. (r)(2)(D). Pub. L. 106-40, §2(5), added subpar. (D).

Subsec. (r)(4). Pub. L. 106-40, §2, substituted "Administrator—"

"(A) shall consider—" for "Administrator shall consider each of the following criteria—" in introductory provisions, redesignated subpars. (A) to (C) as cls. (i) to (iii), respectively, of subpar. (A) and added subpar. (B).

Subsec. (r)(7)(H). Pub. L. 106-40, §3(a), added subpar. (H).

1998—Subsec. (n)(2)(C). Pub. L. 105-362 substituted "On completion of the study, the Secretary shall submit to Congress a report on the results of the study and" for "The Secretary shall prepare annual reports to Congress on the status of the research program and at the completion of the study".

1991—Subsec. (b)(1). Pub. L. 102-187 struck out "7783064 Hydrogen sulfide" from list of pollutants.

1990—Pub. L. 101-549 amended section generally, substituting present provisions for provisions which related to: in subsec. (a), definitions; in subsec. (b), list of hazardous air pollutants, emission standards, and pollution control techniques; in subsec. (c), prohibited acts and exemption; in subsec. (d), State implementation and enforcement; and in subsec. (e), design, equipment, work practice, and operational standards.

1978—Subsec. (e)(5). Pub. L. 95-623 added par. (5).

1977—Subsec. (a)(1). Pub. L. 95-95, §401(c), substituted "causes, or contributes to, air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to result in an increase in mortality or an increase in serious irreversible, or incapacitating reversible, illness" for "may cause, or contribute to, an increase in mortality or an increase in serious irreversible, or incapacitating reversible, illness".

Subsec. (d)(1). Pub. L. 95-95, §109(d)(2), struck out "(except with respect to stationary sources owned or operated by the United States)" after "implement and enforce such standards".

Subsec. (e). Pub. L. 95-95, §110, added subsec. (e).

#### CHANGE OF NAME

Committee on Energy and Commerce of House of Representatives treated as referring to Committee on

Commerce of House of Representatives by section 1(a) of Pub. L. 104-14, set out as a note preceding section 21 of Title 2, The Congress. Committee on Commerce of House of Representatives changed to Committee on Energy and Commerce of House of Representatives, and jurisdiction over matters relating to securities and exchanges and insurance generally transferred to Committee on Financial Services of House of Representatives by House Resolution No. 5, One Hundred Seventh Congress, Jan. 3, 2001.

#### EFFECTIVE DATE OF 1977 AMENDMENT

Amendment by Pub. L. 95-95 effective Aug. 7, 1977, except as otherwise expressly provided, see section 406(d) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as a note under section 7401 of this title.

#### TERMINATION OF REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

For termination, effective May 15, 2000, of provisions of law requiring submittal to Congress of any annual, semiannual, or other regular periodic report listed in House Document No. 103-7 (in which reports required under subsecs. (m)(5), (r)(6)(C)(ii), and (s) of this section are listed, respectively, as the 8th item on page 162, the 9th item on page 198, and the 9th item on page 162), see section 3003 of Pub. L. 104-66, as amended, set out as a note under section 1113 of Title 31, Money and Finance.

#### PENDING ACTIONS AND PROCEEDINGS

Suits, actions, and other proceedings lawfully commenced by or against the Administrator or any other officer or employee of the United States in his official capacity or in relation to the discharge of his official duties under act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977], not to abate by reason of the taking effect of Pub. L. 95-95, see section 406(a) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

#### MODIFICATION OR RESCISSION OF RULES, REGULATIONS, ORDERS, DETERMINATIONS, CONTRACTS, CERTIFICATIONS, AUTHORIZATIONS, DELEGATIONS, AND OTHER ACTIONS

All rules, regulations, orders, determinations, contracts, certifications, authorizations, delegations, or other actions duly issued, made, or taken by or pursuant to act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the date of enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977] to continue in full force and effect until modified or rescinded in accordance with act July 14, 1955, as amended by Pub. L. 95-95 [this chapter], see section 406(b) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

#### DELEGATION OF AUTHORITY

Memorandum of President of the United States, Aug. 19, 1993, 58 F.R. 52397, provided:

Memorandum for the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency

WHEREAS, the Environmental Protection Agency, the agencies and departments that are members of the National Response Team (authorized under Executive Order No. 12580, 52 Fed. Reg. 2923 (1987) [42 U.S.C. 9615 note]), and other Federal agencies and departments undertake emergency release prevention, mitigation, and response activities pursuant to various authorities;

By the authority vested in me as President by the Constitution and the laws of the United States of America, including section 112(r)(10) of the Clean Air Act (the "Act") (section 7412(r)(10) of title 42 of the United States Code) and section 301 of title 3 of the United States Code, and in order to provide for the delegation of certain functions under the Act [42 U.S.C. 7401 et seq.], I hereby:

(1) Authorize you, in coordination with agencies and departments that are members of the National Response Team and other appropriate agencies and de-

partments, to conduct a review of release prevention, mitigation, and response authorities of Federal agencies in order to assure the most effective and efficient implementation of such authorities and to identify any deficiencies in authority or resources that may exist, to the extent such review is required by section 112(r)(10) of the Act; and

(2) Authorize you, in coordination with agencies and departments that are members of the National Response Team and other appropriate agencies and departments, to prepare and transmit a message to the Congress concerning the release prevention, mitigation, and response activities of the Federal Government with such recommendations for change in law as you deem appropriate, to the extent such message is required by section 112(r)(10) of the Act.

The authority delegated by this memorandum may be further redelegated within the Environmental Protection Agency.

You are hereby authorized and directed to publish this memorandum in the Federal Register.

WILLIAM J. CLINTON.

Memorandum of President of the United States, Jan. 27, 2000, 65 F.R. 8631, provided:

Memorandum for the Attorney General[ ] the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency[ ] and the Director of the Office of Management and Budget

By the authority vested in me as President by the Constitution and laws of the United States of America, including section 112(r)(7)(H) of the Clean Air Act ("Act") (42 U.S.C. 7412(r)(7)(H)), as added by section 3 of the Chemical Safety Information, Site Security and Fuels Regulatory Relief Act (Public Law 106-40), and section 301 of title 3, United States Code, I hereby delegate to:

(1) the Attorney General the authority vested in the President under section 112(r)(7)(H)(ii)(I)(aa) of the Act to assess the increased risk of terrorist and other criminal activity associated with the posting of off-site consequence analysis information on the Internet;

(2) the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) the authority vested in the President under section 112(r)(7)(H)(ii)(I)(bb) of the Act to assess the incentives created by public disclosure of off-site consequence analysis information for reduction in the risk of accidental releases; and

(3) the Attorney General and the Administrator of EPA, jointly, the authority vested in the President under section 112(r)(7)(H)(ii)(II) of the Act to promulgate regulations, based on these assessments, governing the distribution of off-site consequence analysis information. These regulations, in proposed and final form, shall be subject to review and approval by the Director of the Office of Management and Budget.

The Administrator of EPA is authorized and directed to publish this memorandum in the Federal Register.

WILLIAM J. CLINTON.

#### REPORTS

Pub. L. 106-40, §3(b), Aug. 5, 1999, 113 Stat. 213, provided that:

"(1) DEFINITION OF ACCIDENTAL RELEASE.—In this subsection, the term 'accidental release' has the meaning given the term in section 112(r)(2) of the Clean Air Act (42 U.S.C. 7412(r)(2)).

"(2) REPORT ON STATUS OF CERTAIN AMENDMENTS.—Not later than 2 years after the date of enactment of this Act [Aug. 5, 1999], the Comptroller General of the United States shall submit to Congress a report on the status of the development of amendments to the National Fire Protection Association Code for Liquefied Petroleum Gas that will result in the provision of information to local emergency response personnel concerning the off-site effects of accidental releases of substances exempted from listing under section 112(r)(4)(B) of the Clean Air Act (as added by section 3).

"(3) REPORT ON COMPLIANCE WITH CERTAIN INFORMATION SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS.—Not later than 3 years after the date of enactment of this Act, the Comptrol-



ler General of the United States shall submit to Congress a report that—

“(A) describes the level of compliance with Federal and State requirements relating to the submission to local emergency response personnel of information intended to help the local emergency response personnel respond to chemical accidents or related environmental or public health threats; and

“(B) contains an analysis of the adequacy of the information required to be submitted and the efficacy of the methods for delivering the information to local emergency response personnel.”

#### REEVALUATION OF REGULATIONS

Pub. L. 106-40, §3(c), Aug. 5, 1999, 113 Stat. 213, provided that: “The President shall reevaluate the regulations promulgated under this section within 6 years after the enactment of this Act [Aug. 5, 1999]. If the President determines not to modify such regulations, the President shall publish a notice in the Federal Register stating that such reevaluation has been completed and that a determination has been made not to modify the regulations. Such notice shall include an explanation of the basis of such decision.”

#### PUBLIC MEETING DURING MORATORIUM PERIOD

Pub. L. 106-40, §4, Aug. 5, 1999, 113 Stat. 214, provided that:

“(a) IN GENERAL.—Not later than 180 days after the date of enactment of this Act [Aug. 5, 1999], each owner or operator of a stationary source covered by section 112(r)(7)(B)(ii) of the Clean Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7412(r)(7)(B)(ii)] shall convene a public meeting, after reasonable public notice, in order to describe and discuss the local implications of the risk management plan submitted by the stationary source pursuant to section 112(r)(7)(B)(iii) of the Clean Air Act, including a summary of the off-site consequence analysis portion of the plan. Two or more stationary sources may conduct a joint meeting. In lieu of conducting such a meeting, small business stationary sources as defined in section 507(c)(1) of the Clean Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7661f(c)(1)] may comply with this section by publicly posting a summary of the off-site consequence analysis information for their facility not later than 180 days after the enactment of this Act. Not later than 10 months after the date of enactment of this Act, each such owner or operator shall send a certification to the director of the Federal Bureau of Investigation stating that such meeting has been held, or that such summary has been posted, within 1 year prior to, or within 6 months after, the date of the enactment of this Act. This section shall not apply to sources that employ only Program 1 processes within the meaning of regulations promulgated under section 112(r)(7)(B)(i) of the Clean Air Act.

“(b) ENFORCEMENT.—The Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency may bring an action in the appropriate United States district court against any person who fails or refuses to comply with the requirements of this section, and such court may issue such orders, and take such other actions, as may be necessary to require compliance with such requirements.”

#### RISK ASSESSMENT AND MANAGEMENT COMMISSION

Pub. L. 101-549, title III, §303, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2574, provided that:

“(a) ESTABLISHMENT.—There is hereby established a Risk Assessment and Management Commission (hereafter referred to in this section as the ‘Commission’), which shall commence proceedings not later than 18 months after the date of enactment of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 [Nov. 15, 1990] and which shall make a full investigation of the policy implications and appropriate uses of risk assessment and risk management in regulatory programs under various Federal laws to prevent cancer and other chronic human health effects which may result from exposure to hazardous substances.

“(b) CHARGE.—The Commission shall consider—

“(1) the report of the National Academy of Sciences authorized by section 112(o) of the Clean Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7412(o)], the use and limitations of risk assessment in establishing emission or effluent standards, ambient standards, exposure standards, acceptable concentration levels, tolerances or other environmental criteria for hazardous substances that present a risk of carcinogenic effects or other chronic health effects and the suitability of risk assessment for such purposes;

“(2) the most appropriate methods for measuring and describing cancer risks or risks of other chronic health effects from exposure to hazardous substances considering such alternative approaches as the lifetime risk of cancer or other effects to the individual or individuals most exposed to emissions from a source or sources on both an actual and worst case basis, the range of such risks, the total number of health effects avoided by exposure reductions, effluent standards, ambient standards, exposures standards, acceptable concentration levels, tolerances and other environmental criteria, reductions in the number of persons exposed at various levels of risk, the incidence of cancer, and other public health factors;

“(3) methods to reflect uncertainties in measurement and estimation techniques, the existence of synergistic or antagonistic effects among hazardous substances, the accuracy of extrapolating human health risks from animal exposure data, and the existence of unquantified direct or indirect effects on human health in risk assessment studies;

“(4) risk management policy issues including the use of lifetime cancer risks to individuals most exposed, incidence of cancer, the cost and technical feasibility of exposure reduction measures and the use of site-specific actual exposure information in setting emissions standards and other limitations applicable to sources of exposure to hazardous substances; and

“(5) and comment on the degree to which it is possible or desirable to develop a consistent risk assessment methodology, or a consistent standard of acceptable risk, among various Federal programs.

“(c) MEMBERSHIP.—Such Commission shall be composed of ten members who shall have knowledge or experience in fields of risk assessment or risk management, including three members to be appointed by the President, two members to be appointed by the Speaker of the House of Representatives, one member to be appointed by the Minority Leader of the House of Representatives, two members to be appointed by the Majority Leader of the Senate, one member to be appointed by the Minority Leader of the Senate, and one member to be appointed by the President of the National Academy of Sciences. Appointments shall be made not later than 18 months after the date of enactment of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 [Nov. 15, 1990].

“(d) ASSISTANCE FROM AGENCIES.—The Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency and the heads of all other departments, agencies, and instrumentalities of the executive branch of the Federal Government shall, to the maximum extent practicable, assist the Commission in gathering such information as the Commission deems necessary to carry out this section subject to other provisions of law.

“(e) STAFF AND CONTRACTS.—

“(1) In the conduct of the study required by this section, the Commission is authorized to contract (in accordance with Federal contract law) with non-governmental entities that are competent to perform research or investigations within the Commission’s mandate, and to hold public hearings, forums, and workshops to enable full public participation.

“(2) The Commission may appoint and fix the pay of such staff as it deems necessary in accordance with the provisions of title 5, United States Code. The Commission may request the temporary assignment of personnel from the Environmental Protection Agency or other Federal agencies.

“(3) The members of the Commission who are not officers or employees of the United States, while attending conferences or meetings of the Commission or while otherwise serving at the request of the Chair, shall be entitled to receive compensation at a rate not in excess of the maximum rate of pay for Grade GS-18, as provided in the General Schedule under section 5332 of title 5 of the United States Code, including travel time, and while away from their homes or regular places of business they may be allowed travel expenses, including per diem in lieu of subsistence as authorized by law for persons in the Government service employed intermittently.

“(f) REPORT.—A report containing the results of all Commission studies and investigations under this section, together with any appropriate legislative recommendations or administrative recommendations, shall be made available to the public for comment not later than 42 months after the date of enactment of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 [Nov. 15, 1990] and shall be submitted to the President and to the Congress not later than 48 months after such date of enactment. In the report, the Commission shall make recommendations with respect to the appropriate use of risk assessment and risk management in Federal regulatory programs to prevent cancer or other chronic health effects which may result from exposure to hazardous substances. The Commission shall cease to exist upon the date determined by the Commission, but not later than 9 months after the submission of such report.

“(g) AUTHORIZATION.—There are authorized to be appropriated such sums as are necessary to carry out the activities of the Commission established by this section.”

[References in laws to the rates of pay for GS-16, 17, or 18, or to maximum rates of pay under the General Schedule, to be considered references to rates payable under specified sections of Title 5, Government Organization and Employees, see section 529 [title I, § 101(c)(1)] of Pub. L. 101-509, set out in a note under section 5376 of Title 5.]

#### FLEXIBLE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE MERCURY AND AIR TOXICS STANDARDS RULE

Memorandum of President of the United States, Dec. 21, 2011, 76 F.R. 80727, provided:

Memorandum for the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency

Today’s issuance, by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), of the final Mercury and Air Toxics Standards rule for power plants (the “MATS Rule”) represents a major step forward in my Administration’s efforts to protect public health and the environment.

This rule, issued after careful consideration of public comments, prescribes standards under section 112 of the Clean Air Act to control emissions of mercury and other toxic air pollutants from power plants, which collectively are among the largest sources of such pollution in the United States. The EPA estimates that by substantially reducing emissions of pollutants that contribute to neurological damage, cancer, respiratory illnesses, and other health risks, the MATS Rule will produce major health benefits for millions of Americans—including children, older Americans, and other vulnerable populations. Consistent with Executive Order 13563 (Improving Regulation and Regulatory Review), the estimated benefits of the MATS Rule far exceed the estimated costs.

The MATS Rule can be implemented through the use of demonstrated, existing pollution control technologies. The United States is a global market leader in the design and manufacture of these technologies, and it is anticipated that U.S. firms and workers will provide much of the equipment and labor needed to meet the substantial investments in pollution control that the standards are expected to spur.

These new standards will promote the transition to a cleaner and more efficient U.S. electric power system. This system as a whole is critical infrastructure that plays a key role in the functioning of all facets of the

U.S. economy, and maintaining its stability and reliability is of critical importance. It is therefore crucial that implementation of the MATS Rule proceed in a cost-effective manner that ensures electric reliability.

Analyses conducted by the EPA and the Department of Energy (DOE) indicate that the MATS Rule is not anticipated to compromise electric generating resource adequacy in any region of the country. The Clean Air Act offers a number of implementation flexibilities, and the EPA has a long and successful history of using those flexibilities to ensure a smooth transition to cleaner technologies.

The Clean Air Act provides 3 years from the effective date of the MATS Rule for sources to comply with its requirements. In addition, section 112(i)(3)(B) of the Act allows the issuance of a permit granting a source up to one additional year where necessary for the installation of controls. As you stated in the preamble to the MATS Rule, this additional fourth year should be broadly available to sources, consistent with the requirements of the law.

The EPA has concluded that 4 years should generally be sufficient to install the necessary emission control equipment, and DOE has issued analysis consistent with that conclusion. While more time is generally not expected to be needed, the Clean Air Act offers other important flexibilities as well. For example, section 113(a) of the Act provides the EPA with flexibility to bring sources into compliance over the course of an additional year, should unusual circumstances arise that warrant such flexibility.

To address any concerns with respect to electric reliability while assuring MATS’ public health benefits, I direct you to take the following actions:

1. Building on the information and guidance that you have provided to the public, relevant stakeholders, and permitting authorities in the preamble of the MATS Rule, work with State and local permitting authorities to make the additional year for compliance with the MATS Rule provided under section 112(i)(3)(B) of the Clean Air Act broadly available to sources, consistent with law, and to invoke this flexibility expeditiously where justified.

2. Promote early, coordinated, and orderly planning and execution of the measures needed to implement the MATS Rule while maintaining the reliability of the electric power system. Consistent with Executive Order 13563, this process should be designed to “promote predictability and reduce uncertainty,” and should include engagement and coordination with DOE, the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission, State utility regulators, Regional Transmission Organizations, the North American Electric Reliability Corporation and regional electric reliability organizations, other grid planning authorities, electric utilities, and other stakeholders, as appropriate.

3. Make available to the public, including relevant stakeholders, information concerning any anticipated use of authorities: (a) under section 112(i)(3)(B) of the Clean Air Act in the event that additional time to comply with the MATS Rule is necessary for the installation of technology; and (b) under section 113(a) of the Clean Air Act in the event that additional time to comply with the MATS Rule is necessary to address a specific and documented electric reliability issue. This information should describe the process for working with entities with relevant expertise to identify circumstances where electric reliability concerns might justify allowing additional time to comply.

This memorandum is not intended to, and does not, create any right or benefit, substantive or procedural, enforceable at law or in equity by any party against the United States, its departments, agencies, or entities, its officers, employees, or agents, or any other person.

You are hereby authorized and directed to publish this memorandum in the Federal Register.

BARACK OBAMA.

to be constructed and operated only if the area in question is designated or redesignated as class III.

(2) The Administrator may disapprove the redesignation of any area only if he finds, after notice and opportunity for public hearing, that such redesignation does not meet the procedural requirements of this section or is inconsistent with the requirements of section 7472(a) of this title or of subsection (a) of this section. If any such disapproval occurs, the classification of the area shall be that which was in effect prior to the redesignation which was disapproved.

**(c) Indian reservations**

Lands within the exterior boundaries of reservations of federally recognized Indian tribes may be redesignated only by the appropriate Indian governing body. Such Indian governing body shall be subject in all respect to the provisions of subsection (e) of this section.

**(d) Review of national monuments, primitive areas, and national preserves**

The Federal Land Manager shall review all national monuments, primitive areas, and national preserves, and shall recommend any appropriate areas for redesignation as class I where air quality related values are important attributes of the area. The Federal Land Manager shall report such recommendations, within<sup>2</sup> supporting analysis, to the Congress and the affected States within one year after August 7, 1977. The Federal Land Manager shall consult with the appropriate States before making such recommendations.

**(e) Resolution of disputes between State and Indian tribes**

If any State affected by the redesignation of an area by an Indian tribe or any Indian tribe affected by the redesignation of an area by a State disagrees with such redesignation of any area, or if a permit is proposed to be issued for any new major emitting facility proposed for construction in any State which the Governor of an affected State or governing body of an affected Indian tribe determines will cause or contribute to a cumulative change in air quality in excess of that allowed in this part within the affected State or tribal reservation, the Governor or Indian ruling body may request the Administrator to enter into negotiations with the parties involved to resolve such dispute. If requested by any State or Indian tribe involved, the Administrator shall make a recommendation to resolve the dispute and protect the air quality related values of the lands involved. If the parties involved do not reach agreement, the Administrator shall resolve the dispute and his determination, or the results of agreements reached through other means, shall become part of the applicable plan and shall be enforceable as part of such plan. In resolving such disputes relating to area redesignation, the Administrator shall consider the extent to which the lands involved are of sufficient size to allow effective air quality management or have air quality related values of such an area.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, § 164, as added Pub. L. 95-95, title I, § 127(a), Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 733;

<sup>2</sup> So in original. Probably should be "with".

amended Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(42), (43), Nov. 16, 1977, 91 Stat. 1402; Pub. L. 101-549, title I, § 108(n), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2469.)

AMENDMENTS

1990—Subsec. (a). Pub. L. 101-549, which directed the insertion of "The extent of the areas referred to in paragraph (1) and (2) shall conform to any changes in the boundaries of such areas which have occurred subsequent to August 7, 1977, or which may occur subsequent to November 15, 1990." before "Any area (other than an area referred to in paragraph (1) or (2))", was executed by making the insertion before "Any area (other than an area referred to in paragraph (1) or (2))", to reflect the probable intent of Congress.

1977—Subsec. (b)(2). Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(42), inserted "or is inconsistent with the requirements of section 7472(a) of this title or of subsection (a) of this section" after "this section".

Subsec. (e). Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(43), inserted "an" after "If any State affected by the redesignation of".

**§ 7475. Preconstruction requirements**

**(a) Major emitting facilities on which construction is commenced**

No major emitting facility on which construction is commenced after August 7, 1977, may be constructed in any area to which this part applies unless—

(1) a permit has been issued for such proposed facility in accordance with this part setting forth emission limitations for such facility which conform to the requirements of this part;

(2) the proposed permit has been subject to a review in accordance with this section, the required analysis has been conducted in accordance with regulations promulgated by the Administrator, and a public hearing has been held with opportunity for interested persons including representatives of the Administrator to appear and submit written or oral presentations on the air quality impact of such source, alternatives thereto, control technology requirements, and other appropriate considerations;

(3) the owner or operator of such facility demonstrates, as required pursuant to section 7410(j) of this title, that emissions from construction or operation of such facility will not cause, or contribute to, air pollution in excess of any (A) maximum allowable increase or maximum allowable concentration for any pollutant in any area to which this part applies more than one time per year, (B) national ambient air quality standard in any air quality control region, or (C) any other applicable emission standard or standard of performance under this chapter;

(4) the proposed facility is subject to the best available control technology for each pollutant subject to regulation under this chapter emitted from, or which results from, such facility;

(5) the provisions of subsection (d) of this section with respect to protection of class I areas have been complied with for such facility;

(6) there has been an analysis of any air quality impacts projected for the area as a result of growth associated with such facility;

(7) the person who owns or operates, or proposes to own or operate, a major emitting fa-



cility for which a permit is required under this part agrees to conduct such monitoring as may be necessary to determine the effect which emissions from any such facility may have, or is having, on air quality in any area which may be affected by emissions from such source; and

(8) in the case of a source which proposes to construct in a class III area, emissions from which would cause or contribute to exceeding the maximum allowable increments applicable in a class II area and where no standard under section 7411 of this title has been promulgated subsequent to August 7, 1977, for such source category, the Administrator has approved the determination of best available technology as set forth in the permit.

**(b) Exception**

The demonstration pertaining to maximum allowable increases required under subsection (a)(3) of this section shall not apply to maximum allowable increases for class II areas in the case of an expansion or modification of a major emitting facility which is in existence on August 7, 1977, whose allowable emissions of air pollutants, after compliance with subsection (a)(4) of this section, will be less than fifty tons per year and for which the owner or operator of such facility demonstrates that emissions of particulate matter and sulfur oxides will not cause or contribute to ambient air quality levels in excess of the national secondary ambient air quality standard for either of such pollutants.

**(c) Permit applications**

Any completed permit application under section 7410 of this title for a major emitting facility in any area to which this part applies shall be granted or denied not later than one year after the date of filing of such completed application.

**(d) Action taken on permit applications; notice; adverse impact on air quality related values; variance; emission limitations**

(1) Each State shall transmit to the Administrator a copy of each permit application relating to a major emitting facility received by such State and provide notice to the Administrator of every action related to the consideration of such permit.

(2)(A) The Administrator shall provide notice of the permit application to the Federal Land Manager and the Federal official charged with direct responsibility for management of any lands within a class I area which may be affected by emissions from the proposed facility.

(B) The Federal Land Manager and the Federal official charged with direct responsibility for management of such lands shall have an affirmative responsibility to protect the air quality related values (including visibility) of any such lands within a class I area and to consider, in consultation with the Administrator, whether a proposed major emitting facility will have an adverse impact on such values.

(C)(i) In any case where the Federal official charged with direct responsibility for management of any lands within a class I area or the Federal Land Manager of such lands, or the Administrator, or the Governor of an adjacent

State containing such a class I area files a notice alleging that emissions from a proposed major emitting facility may cause or contribute to a change in the air quality in such area and identifying the potential adverse impact of such change, a permit shall not be issued unless the owner or operator of such facility demonstrates that emissions of particulate matter and sulfur dioxide will not cause or contribute to concentrations which exceed the maximum allowable increases for a class I area.

(ii) In any case where the Federal Land Manager demonstrates to the satisfaction of the State that the emissions from such facility will have an adverse impact on the air quality-related values (including visibility) of such lands, notwithstanding the fact that the change in air quality resulting from emissions from such facility will not cause or contribute to concentrations which exceed the maximum allowable increases for a class I area, a permit shall not be issued.

(iii) In any case where the owner or operator of such facility demonstrates to the satisfaction of the Federal Land Manager, and the Federal Land Manager so certifies, that the emissions from such facility will have no adverse impact on the air quality-related values of such lands (including visibility), notwithstanding the fact that the change in air quality resulting from emissions from such facility will cause or contribute to concentrations which exceed the maximum allowable increases for class I areas, the State may issue a permit.

(iv) In the case of a permit issued pursuant to clause (iii), such facility shall comply with such emission limitations under such permit as may be necessary to assure that emissions of sulfur oxides and particulates from such facility will not cause or contribute to concentrations of such pollutant which exceed the following maximum allowable increases over the baseline concentration for such pollutants:

	Maximum allowable increase (in micrograms per cubic meter)
Particulate matter:	
Annual geometric mean .....	19
Twenty-four-hour maximum .....	37
Sulfur dioxide:	
Annual arithmetic mean .....	20
Twenty-four-hour maximum .....	91
Three-hour maximum .....	325

(D)(i) In any case where the owner or operator of a proposed major emitting facility who has been denied a certification under subparagraph (C)(iii) demonstrates to the satisfaction of the Governor, after notice and public hearing, and the Governor finds, that the facility cannot be constructed by reason of any maximum allowable increase for sulfur dioxide for periods of twenty-four hours or less applicable to any class I area and, in the case of Federal mandatory class I areas, that a variance under this clause will not adversely affect the air quality related values of the area (including visibility), the Governor, after consideration of the Federal Land Manager's recommendation (if any) and subject to his concurrence, may grant a variance from

such maximum allowable increase. If such variance is granted, a permit may be issued to such source pursuant to the requirements of this subparagraph.

(ii) In any case in which the Governor recommends a variance under this subparagraph in which the Federal Land Manager does not concur, the recommendations of the Governor and the Federal Land Manager shall be transmitted to the President. The President may approve the Governor's recommendation if he finds that such variance is in the national interest. No Presidential finding shall be reviewable in any court. The variance shall take effect if the President approves the Governor's recommendations. The President shall approve or disapprove such recommendation within ninety days after his receipt of the recommendations of the Governor and the Federal Land Manager.

(iii) In the case of a permit issued pursuant to this subparagraph, such facility shall comply with such emission limitations under such permit as may be necessary to assure that emissions of sulfur oxides from such facility will not (during any day on which the otherwise applicable maximum allowable increases are exceeded) cause or contribute to concentrations which exceed the following maximum allowable increases for such areas over the baseline concentration for such pollutant and to assure that such emissions will not cause or contribute to concentrations which exceed the otherwise applicable maximum allowable increases for periods of exposure of 24 hours or less on more than 18 days during any annual period:

MAXIMUM ALLOWABLE INCREASE  
(In micrograms per cubic meter)

Period of exposure	Low terrain areas	High terrain areas
24-hr maximum .....	36	62
3-hr maximum .....	130	221

(iv) For purposes of clause (iii), the term "high terrain area" means with respect to any facility, any area having an elevation of 900 feet or more above the base of the stack of such facility, and the term "low terrain area" means any area other than a high terrain area.

**(e) Analysis; continuous air quality monitoring data; regulations; model adjustments**

(1) The review provided for in subsection (a) of this section shall be preceded by an analysis in accordance with regulations of the Administrator, promulgated under this subsection, which may be conducted by the State (or any general purpose unit of local government) or by the major emitting facility applying for such permit, of the ambient air quality at the proposed site and in areas which may be affected by emissions from such facility for each pollutant subject to regulation under this chapter which will be emitted from such facility.

(2) Effective one year after August 7, 1977, the analysis required by this subsection shall include continuous air quality monitoring data gathered for purposes of determining whether emissions from such facility will exceed the maximum allowable increases or the maximum allowable concentration permitted under this

part. Such data shall be gathered over a period of one calendar year preceding the date of application for a permit under this part unless the State, in accordance with regulations promulgated by the Administrator, determines that a complete and adequate analysis for such purposes may be accomplished in a shorter period. The results of such analysis shall be available at the time of the public hearing on the application for such permit.

(3) The Administrator shall within six months after August 7, 1977, promulgate regulations respecting the analysis required under this subsection which regulations—

(A) shall not require the use of any automatic or uniform buffer zone or zones,

(B) shall require an analysis of the ambient air quality, climate and meteorology, terrain, soils and vegetation, and visibility at the site of the proposed major emitting facility and in the area potentially affected by the emissions from such facility for each pollutant regulated under this chapter which will be emitted from, or which results from the construction or operation of, such facility, the size and nature of the proposed facility, the degree of continuous emission reduction which could be achieved by such facility, and such other factors as may be relevant in determining the effect of emissions from a proposed facility on any air quality control region,

(C) shall require the results of such analysis shall be available at the time of the public hearing on the application for such permit, and

(D) shall specify with reasonable particularity each air quality model or models to be used under specified sets of conditions for purposes of this part.

Any model or models designated under such regulations may be adjusted upon a determination, after notice and opportunity for public hearing, by the Administrator that such adjustment is necessary to take into account unique terrain or meteorological characteristics of an area potentially affected by emissions from a source applying for a permit required under this part.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, § 165, as added Pub. L. 95-95, title I, § 127(a), Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 735; amended Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(44)-(51), Nov. 16, 1977, 91 Stat. 1402.)

AMENDMENTS

1977—Subsec. (a)(1). Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(44), substituted "part;" for "part:".

Subsec. (a)(3). Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(45), inserted provision making applicable requirement of section 7410(j) of this title.

Subsec. (b). Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(46), inserted "cause or" before "contribute" and struck out "actual" before "allowable emissions".

Subsec. (d)(2)(C). Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(47)-(49), in cl. (ii) substituted "contribute" for "contribute", in cl. (iii) substituted "quality-related" for "quality related" and "concentrations which" for "concentrations, which", and in cl. (iv) substituted "such facility" for "such sources" and "will not cause or contribute to concentrations of such pollutant which exceed" for "together with all other sources, will not exceed".

Subsec. (d)(2)(D). Pub. L. 95-190, § 14(a)(50), (51), in cl. (iii) substituted provisions relating to determinations of amounts of emissions of sulfur oxides from facilities,

for provisions relating to determinations of amounts of emissions of sulfur oxides from sources operating under permits issued pursuant to this subpar., together with all other sources, and added cl. (iv).

#### § 7476. Other pollutants

##### (a) Hydrocarbons, carbon monoxide, petrochemical oxidants, and nitrogen oxides

In the case of the pollutants hydrocarbons, carbon monoxide, photochemical oxidants, and nitrogen oxides, the Administrator shall conduct a study and not later than two years after August 7, 1977, promulgate regulations to prevent the significant deterioration of air quality which would result from the emissions of such pollutants. In the case of pollutants for which national ambient air quality standards are promulgated after August 7, 1977, he shall promulgate such regulations not more than 2 years after the date of promulgation of such standards.

##### (b) Effective date of regulations

Regulations referred to in subsection (a) of this section shall become effective one year after the date of promulgation. Within 21 months after such date of promulgation such plan revision shall be submitted to the Administrator who shall approve or disapprove the plan within 25 months after such date or<sup>1</sup> promulgation in the same manner as required under section 7410 of this title.

##### (c) Contents of regulations

Such regulations shall provide specific numerical measures against which permit applications may be evaluated, a framework for stimulating improved control technology, protection of air quality values, and fulfill the goals and purposes set forth in section 7401 and section 7470 of this title.

##### (d) Specific measures to fulfill goals and purposes

The regulations of the Administrator under subsection (a) of this section shall provide specific measures at least as effective as the increments established in section 7473 of this title to fulfill such goals and purposes, and may contain air quality increments, emission density requirements, or other measures.

##### (e) Area classification plan not required

With respect to any air pollutant for which a national ambient air quality standard is established other than sulfur oxides or particulate matter, an area classification plan shall not be required under this section if the implementation plan adopted by the State and submitted for the Administrator's approval or promulgated by the Administrator under section 7410(c) of this title contains other provisions which when considered as a whole, the Administrator finds will carry out the purposes in section 7470 of this title at least as effectively as an area classification plan for such pollutant. Such other provisions referred to in the preceding sentence need not require the establishment of maximum allowable increases with respect to such pollutant for any area to which this section applies.

<sup>1</sup> So in original. Probably should be "of".

##### (f) PM-10 increments

The Administrator is authorized to substitute, for the maximum allowable increases in particulate matter specified in section 7473(b) of this title and section 7475(d)(2)(C)(iv) of this title, maximum allowable increases in particulate matter with an aerodynamic diameter smaller than or equal to 10 micrometers. Such substituted maximum allowable increases shall be of equal stringency in effect as those specified in the provisions for which they are substituted. Until the Administrator promulgates regulations under the authority of this subsection, the current maximum allowable increases in concentrations of particulate matter shall remain in effect.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, §166, as added Pub. L. 95-95, title I, §127(a), Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 739; amended Pub. L. 101-549, title I, §105(b), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2462.)

#### AMENDMENTS

1990—Subsec. (f). Pub. L. 101-549 added subsec. (f).

##### § 7477. Enforcement

The Administrator shall, and a State may, take such measures, including issuance of an order, or seeking injunctive relief, as necessary to prevent the construction or modification of a major emitting facility which does not conform to the requirements of this part, or which is proposed to be constructed in any area designated pursuant to section 7407(d) of this title as attainment or unclassifiable and which is not subject to an implementation plan which meets the requirements of this part.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, §167, as added Pub. L. 95-95, title I, §127(a), Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 740; amended Pub. L. 101-549, title I, §110(3), title VII, §708, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2470, 2684.)

#### AMENDMENTS

1990—Pub. L. 101-549, §708, substituted "construction or modification of a major emitting facility" for "construction of a major emitting facility".

Pub. L. 101-549, §110(3), substituted "designated pursuant to section 7407(d) as attainment or unclassifiable" for "included in the list promulgated pursuant to paragraph (1)(D) or (E) of subsection (d) of section 7407 of this title".

##### § 7478. Period before plan approval

###### (a) Existing regulations to remain in effect

Until such time as an applicable implementation plan is in effect for any area, which plan meets the requirements of this part to prevent significant deterioration of air quality with respect to any air pollutant, applicable regulations under this chapter prior to August 7, 1977, shall remain in effect to prevent significant deterioration of air quality in any such area for any such pollutant except as otherwise provided in subsection (b) of this section.

###### (b) Regulations deemed amended; construction commenced after June 1, 1975

If any regulation in effect prior to August 7, 1977, to prevent significant deterioration of air quality would be inconsistent with the requirements of section 7472(a), section 7473(b) or sec-



in the case of a concern which is a publicly traded company at least 51 percent of the stock of the company is owned by, one or more individuals who are members of the following groups:

- “(I) Black Americans.
- “(II) Hispanic Americans.
- “(III) Native Americans.
- “(IV) Asian Americans.
- “(V) Women.
- “(VI) Disabled Americans.

“(ii) The presumption established by clause (i) may be rebutted with respect to a particular business concern if it is reasonably established that the individual or individuals referred to in that clause with respect to that business concern are not experiencing impediments to establishing or developing such concern as a result of the individual’s identification as a member of a group specified in that clause.

“(C) The following institutions are presumed to be disadvantaged business concerns for purposes of subsection (a):

“(i) Historically black colleges and universities, and colleges and universities having a student body in which 40 percent of the students are Hispanic.

“(ii) Minority institutions (as that term is defined by the Secretary of Education pursuant to the General Education Provision Act (20 U.S.C. 1221 et seq.)).

“(iii) Private and voluntary organizations controlled by individuals who are socially and economically disadvantaged.

“(D) A joint venture may be considered to be a disadvantaged business concern under subsection (a), notwithstanding the size of such joint venture, if—

“(i) a party to the joint venture is a disadvantaged business concern; and

“(ii) that party owns at least 51 percent of the joint venture.

A person who is not an economically disadvantaged individual or a disadvantaged business concern, as a party to a joint venture, may not be a party to more than 2 awarded contracts in a fiscal year solely by reason of this subparagraph.

“(E) Nothing in this paragraph shall prohibit any member of a racial or ethnic group that is not listed in subparagraph (B)(i) from establishing that they have been impeded in establishing or developing a business concern as a result of racial or ethnic discrimination.

“SEC. 1002. USE OF QUOTAS PROHIBITED.—Nothing in this title shall permit or require the use of quotas or a requirement that has the effect of a quota in determining eligibility under section 1001.”

**§ 7602. Definitions**

When used in this chapter—

(a) The term “Administrator” means the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency.

(b) The term “air pollution control agency” means any of the following:

(1) A single State agency designated by the Governor of that State as the official State air pollution control agency for purposes of this chapter.

(2) An agency established by two or more States and having substantial powers or duties pertaining to the prevention and control of air pollution.

(3) A city, county, or other local government health authority, or, in the case of any city, county, or other local government in which there is an agency other than the health authority charged with responsibility for enforcing ordinances or laws relating to the prevention and control of air pollution, such other agency.

(4) An agency of two or more municipalities located in the same State or in different States and having substantial powers or duties pertaining to the prevention and control of air pollution.

(5) An agency of an Indian tribe.

(c) The term “interstate air pollution control agency” means—

(1) an air pollution control agency established by two or more States, or

(2) an air pollution control agency of two or more municipalities located in different States.

(d) The term “State” means a State, the District of Columbia, the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico, the Virgin Islands, Guam, and American Samoa and includes the Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands.

(e) The term “person” includes an individual, corporation, partnership, association, State, municipality, political subdivision of a State, and any agency, department, or instrumentality of the United States and any officer, agent, or employee thereof.

(f) The term “municipality” means a city, town, borough, county, parish, district, or other public body created by or pursuant to State law.

(g) The term “air pollutant” means any air pollution agent or combination of such agents, including any physical, chemical, biological, radioactive (including source material, special nuclear material, and byproduct material) substance or matter which is emitted into or otherwise enters the ambient air. Such term includes any precursors to the formation of any air pollutant, to the extent the Administrator has identified such precursor or precursors for the particular purpose for which the term “air pollutant” is used.

(h) All language referring to effects on welfare includes, but is not limited to, effects on soils, water, crops, vegetation, manmade materials, animals, wildlife, weather, visibility, and climate, damage to and deterioration of property, and hazards to transportation, as well as effects on economic values and on personal comfort and well-being, whether caused by transformation, conversion, or combination with other air pollutants.

(i) The term “Federal land manager” means, with respect to any lands in the United States, the Secretary of the department with authority over such lands.

(j) Except as otherwise expressly provided, the terms “major stationary source” and “major emitting facility” mean any stationary facility or source of air pollutants which directly emits, or has the potential to emit, one hundred tons per year or more of any air pollutant (including any major emitting facility or source of fugitive emissions of any such pollutant, as determined by rule by the Administrator).

(k) The terms “emission limitation” and “emission standard” mean a requirement established by the State or the Administrator which limits the quantity, rate, or concentration of emissions of air pollutants on a continuous basis, including any requirement relating to the operation or maintenance of a source to assure continuous emission reduction, and any design,

equipment, work practice or operational standard promulgated under this chapter.<sup>1</sup>

(l) The term “standard of performance” means a requirement of continuous emission reduction, including any requirement relating to the operation or maintenance of a source to assure continuous emission reduction.

(m) The term “means of emission limitation” means a system of continuous emission reduction (including the use of specific technology or fuels with specified pollution characteristics).

(n) The term “primary standard attainment date” means the date specified in the applicable implementation plan for the attainment of a national primary ambient air quality standard for any air pollutant.

(o) The term “delayed compliance order” means an order issued by the State or by the Administrator to an existing stationary source, postponing the date required under an applicable implementation plan for compliance by such source with any requirement of such plan.

(p) The term “schedule and timetable of compliance” means a schedule of required measures including an enforceable sequence of actions or operations leading to compliance with an emission limitation, other limitation, prohibition, or standard.

(q) For purposes of this chapter, the term “applicable implementation plan” means the portion (or portions) of the implementation plan, or most recent revision thereof, which has been approved under section 7410 of this title, or promulgated under section 7410(c) of this title, or promulgated or approved pursuant to regulations promulgated under section 7601(d) of this title and which implements the relevant requirements of this chapter.

(r) INDIAN TRIBE.—The term “Indian tribe” means any Indian tribe, band, nation, or other organized group or community, including any Alaska Native village, which is Federally recognized as eligible for the special programs and services provided by the United States to Indians because of their status as Indians.

(s) VOC.—The term “VOC” means volatile organic compound, as defined by the Administrator.

(t) PM-10.—The term “PM-10” means particulate matter with an aerodynamic diameter less than or equal to a nominal ten micrometers, as measured by such method as the Administrator may determine.

(u) NAAQS AND CTG.—The term “NAAQS” means national ambient air quality standard. The term “CTG” means a Control Technique Guideline published by the Administrator under section 7408 of this title.

(v) NO<sub>x</sub>.—The term “NO<sub>x</sub>” means oxides of nitrogen.

(w) CO.—The term “CO” means carbon monoxide.

(x) SMALL SOURCE.—The term “small source” means a source that emits less than 100 tons of regulated pollutants per year, or any class of persons that the Administrator determines, through regulation, generally lack technical ability or knowledge regarding control of air pollution.

(y) FEDERAL IMPLEMENTATION PLAN.—The term “Federal implementation plan” means a plan (or portion thereof) promulgated by the Administrator to fill all or a portion of a gap or otherwise correct all or a portion of an inadequacy in a State implementation plan, and which includes enforceable emission limitations or other control measures, means or techniques (including economic incentives, such as marketable permits or auctions of emissions allowances), and provides for attainment of the relevant national ambient air quality standard.

(z) STATIONARY SOURCE.—The term “stationary source” means generally any source of an air pollutant except those emissions resulting directly from an internal combustion engine for transportation purposes or from a nonroad engine or nonroad vehicle as defined in section 7550 of this title.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title III, §302, formerly §9, as added Pub. L. 88-206, §1, Dec. 17, 1963, 77 Stat. 400, renumbered Pub. L. 89-272, title I, §101(4), Oct. 20, 1965, 79 Stat. 992; amended Pub. L. 90-148, §2, Nov. 21, 1967, 81 Stat. 504; Pub. L. 91-604, §15(a)(1), (c)(1), Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1710, 1713; Pub. L. 95-95, title II, §218(c), title III, §301, Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 761, 769; Pub. L. 95-190, §14(a)(76), Nov. 16, 1977, 91 Stat. 1404; Pub. L. 101-549, title I, §§101(d)(4), 107(a), (b), 108(j), 109(b), title III, §302(e), title VII, §709, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2409, 2464, 2468, 2470, 2574, 2684.)

#### CODIFICATION

Section was formerly classified to section 1857h of this title.

#### PRIOR PROVISIONS

Provisions similar to those in subsecs. (b) and (d) of this section were contained in a section 1857e of this title, act July 14, 1955, ch. 360, §6, 69 Stat. 323, prior to the general amendment of this chapter by Pub. L. 88-206.

#### AMENDMENTS

1990—Subsec. (b)(1) to (3). Pub. L. 101-549, §107(a)(1), (2), struck out “or” at end of par. (3) and substituted periods for semicolons at end of pars. (1) to (3).

Subsec. (b)(5). Pub. L. 101-549, §107(a)(3), added par. (5).

Subsec. (g). Pub. L. 101-549, §108(j)(2), inserted at end “Such term includes any precursors to the formation of any air pollutant, to the extent the Administrator has identified such precursor or precursors for the particular purpose for which the term ‘air pollutant’ is used.”

Subsec. (h). Pub. L. 101-549, §109(b), inserted before period at end “, whether caused by transformation, conversion, or combination with other air pollutants”.

Subsec. (k). Pub. L. 101-549, §303(e), inserted before period at end “, and any design, equipment, work practice or operational standard promulgated under this chapter.”

Subsec. (q). Pub. L. 101-549, §101(d)(4), added subsec. (q).

Subsec. (r). Pub. L. 101-549, §107(b), added subsec. (r). Subsecs. (s) to (y). Pub. L. 101-549, §108(j)(1), added subsecs. (s) to (y).

Subsec. (z). Pub. L. 101-549, §709, added subsec. (z). 1977—Subsec. (d). Pub. L. 95-95, §218(c), inserted “and includes the Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands” after “American Samoa”.

Subsec. (e). Pub. L. 95-190 substituted “individual, corporation” for “individual corporation”.

Pub. L. 95-95, §301(b), expanded definition of “person” to include agencies, departments, and instrumentalities of the United States and officers, agents, and employees thereof.

<sup>1</sup> So in original.

Subsec. (g). Pub. L. 95-95, §301(c), expanded definition of “air pollutant” so as, expressly, to include physical, chemical, biological, and radioactive substances or matter emitted into or otherwise entering the ambient air.

Subsecs. (i) to (p). Pub. L. 95-95, §301(a), added subsecs. (i) to (p).

1970—Subsec. (a). Pub. L. 91-604, §15(c)(1), substituted definition of “Administrator” as meaning Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency for definition of “Secretary” as meaning Secretary of Health, Education, and Welfare.

Subsecs. (g), (h). Pub. L. 91-604, §15(a)(1), added subsec. (g) defining “air pollutant”, redesignated former subsec. (g) as (h) and substituted references to effects on soil, water, crops, vegetation, manmade materials, animals, wildlife, weather, visibility, and climate for references to injury to agricultural crops and livestock, and inserted references to effects on economic values and on personal comfort and well being.

1967—Pub. L. 90-148 reenacted section without change.

#### EFFECTIVE DATE OF 1977 AMENDMENT

Amendment by Pub. L. 95-95 effective Aug. 7, 1977, except as otherwise expressly provided, see section 406(d) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as a note under section 7401 of this title.

### § 7603. Emergency powers

Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, the Administrator, upon receipt of evidence that a pollution source or combination of sources (including moving sources) is presenting an imminent and substantial endangerment to public health or welfare, or the environment, may bring suit on behalf of the United States in the appropriate United States district court to immediately restrain any person causing or contributing to the alleged pollution to stop the emission of air pollutants causing or contributing to such pollution or to take such other action as may be necessary. If it is not practicable to assure prompt protection of public health or welfare or the environment by commencement of such a civil action, the Administrator may issue such orders as may be necessary to protect public health or welfare or the environment. Prior to taking any action under this section, the Administrator shall consult with appropriate State and local authorities and attempt to confirm the accuracy of the information on which the action proposed to be taken is based. Any order issued by the Administrator under this section shall be effective upon issuance and shall remain in effect for a period of not more than 60 days, unless the Administrator brings an action pursuant to the first sentence of this section before the expiration of that period. Whenever the Administrator brings such an action within the 60-day period, such order shall remain in effect for an additional 14 days or for such longer period as may be authorized by the court in which such action is brought.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title III, §303, as added Pub. L. 91-604, §12(a), Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1705; amended Pub. L. 95-95, title III, §302(a), Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 770; Pub. L. 101-549, title VII, §704, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2681.)

#### CODIFICATION

Section was formerly classified to section 1857h-1 of this title.

#### PRIOR PROVISIONS

A prior section 303 of act July 14, 1955, was renumbered section 310 by Pub. L. 91-604 and is classified to section 7610 of this title.

#### AMENDMENTS

1990—Pub. L. 101-549, §704(2)-(5), struck out subsec. (a) designation before “Notwithstanding any other”, struck out subsec. (b) which related to violation of or failure or refusal to comply with subsec. (a) orders, and substituted new provisions for provisions following first sentence which read as follows: “If it is not practicable to assure prompt protection of the health of persons solely by commencement of such a civil action, the Administrator may issue such orders as may be necessary to protect the health of persons who are, or may be, affected by such pollution source (or sources). Prior to taking any action under this section, the Administrator shall consult with the State and local authorities in order to confirm the correctness of the information on which the action proposed to be taken is based and to ascertain the action which such authorities are, or will be, taking. Such order shall be effective for a period of not more than twenty-four hours unless the Administrator brings an action under the first sentence of this subsection before the expiration of such period. Whenever the Administrator brings such an action within such period, such order shall be effective for a period of forty-eight hours or such longer period as may be authorized by the court pending litigation or thereafter.”

Pub. L. 101-549, §704(1), which directed that “public health or welfare, or the environment” be substituted for “the health of persons and that appropriate State or local authorities have not acted to abate such sources”, was executed by making the substitution for “the health of persons, and that appropriate State or local authorities have not acted to abate such sources” to reflect the probable intent of Congress.

1977—Pub. L. 95-95 designated existing provisions as subsec. (a), inserted provisions that, if it is not practicable to assure prompt protection of the health of persons solely by commencement of a civil action, the Administrator may issue such orders as may be necessary to protect the health of persons who are, or may be, affected by such pollution source (or sources), that, prior to taking any action under this section, the Administrator consult with the State and local authorities in order to confirm the correctness of the information on which the action proposed to be taken is based and to ascertain the action which such authorities are, or will be, taking, that the order be effective for a period of not more than twenty-four hours unless the Administrator brings an action under the first sentence of this subsection before the expiration of such period, and that, whenever the Administrator brings such an action within such period, such order be effective for a period of forty-eight hours or such longer period as may be authorized by the court pending litigation or thereafter, and added subsec. (b).

#### EFFECTIVE DATE OF 1977 AMENDMENT

Amendment by Pub. L. 95-95 effective Aug. 7, 1977, except as otherwise expressly provided, see section 406(d) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as a note under section 7401 of this title.

#### PENDING ACTIONS AND PROCEEDINGS

Suits, actions, and other proceedings lawfully commenced by or against the Administrator or any other officer or employee of the United States in his official capacity or in relation to the discharge of his official duties under act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977], not to abate by reason of the taking effect of Pub. L. 95-95, see section 406(a) of Pub. L.



SEC. 2. *Designation of Facilities.* (a) The Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency (hereinafter referred to as "the Administrator") shall be responsible for the attainment of the purposes and objectives of this Order.

(b) In carrying out his responsibilities under this Order, the Administrator shall, in conformity with all applicable requirements of law, designate facilities which have given rise to a conviction for an offense under section 113(c)(1) of the Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7413(c)(1)] or section 309(c) of the Water Act [33 U.S.C. 1319(c)]. The Administrator shall, from time to time, publish and circulate to all Federal agencies lists of those facilities, together with the names and addresses of the persons who have been convicted of such offenses. Whenever the Administrator determines that the condition which gave rise to a conviction has been corrected, he shall promptly remove the facility and the name and address of the person concerned from the list.

SEC. 3. *Contracts, Grants, or Loans.* (a) Except as provided in section 8 of this Order, no Federal agency shall enter into any contract for the procurement of goods, materials, or services which is to be performed in whole or in part in a facility then designated by the Administrator pursuant to section 2.

(b) Except as provided in section 8 of this Order, no Federal agency authorized to extend Federal assistance by way of grant, loan, or contract shall extend such assistance in any case in which it is to be used to support any activity or program involving the use of a facility then designated by the Administrator pursuant to section 2.

SEC. 4. *Procurement, Grant, and Loan Regulations.* The Federal Procurement Regulations, the Armed Services Procurement Regulations, and to the extent necessary, any supplemental or comparable regulations issued by any agency of the Executive Branch shall, following consultation with the Administrator, be amended to require, as a condition of entering into, renewing, or extending any contract for the procurement of goods, materials, or services or extending any assistance by way of grant, loan, or contract, inclusion of a provision requiring compliance with the Air Act, the Water Act, and standards issued pursuant thereto in the facilities in which the contract is to be performed, or which are involved in the activity or program to receive assistance.

SEC. 5. *Rules and Regulations.* The Administrator shall issue such rules, regulations, standards, and guidelines as he may deem necessary or appropriate to carry out the purposes of this Order.

SEC. 6. *Cooperation and Assistance.* The head of each Federal agency shall take such steps as may be necessary to insure that all officers and employees of this agency whose duties entail compliance or comparable functions with respect to contracts, grants, and loans are familiar with the provisions of this Order. In addition to any other appropriate action, such officers and employees shall report promptly any condition in a facility which may involve noncompliance with the Air Act or the Water Act or any rules, regulations, standards, or guidelines issued pursuant to this Order to the head of the agency, who shall transmit such reports to the Administrator.

SEC. 7. *Enforcement.* The Administrator may recommend to the Department of Justice or other appropriate agency that legal proceedings be brought or other appropriate action be taken whenever he becomes aware of a breach of any provision required, under the amendments issued pursuant to section 4 of this Order, to be included in a contract or other agreement.

SEC. 8. *Exemptions—Reports to Congress.* (a) Upon a determination that the paramount interest of the United States so requires—

(1) The head of a Federal agency may exempt any contract, grant, or loan, and, following consultation with the Administrator, any class of contracts, grants or loans from the provisions of this Order. In any such case, the head of the Federal agency granting such ex-

emption shall (A) promptly notify the Administrator of such exemption and the justification therefor; (B) review the necessity for each such exemption annually; and (C) report to the Administrator annually all such exemptions in effect. Exemptions granted pursuant to this section shall be for a period not to exceed one year. Additional exemptions may be granted for periods not to exceed one year upon the making of a new determination by the head of the Federal agency concerned.

(2) The Administrator may, by rule or regulation, exempt any or all Federal agencies from any or all of the provisions of this Order with respect to any class or classes of contracts, grants, or loans, which (A) involve less than specified dollar amounts, or (B) have a minimal potential impact upon the environment, or (C) involve persons who are not prime contractors or direct recipients of Federal assistance by way of contracts, grants, or loans.

(b) Federal agencies shall reconsider any exemption granted under subsection (a) whenever requested to do so by the Administrator.

(c) The Administrator shall annually notify the President and the Congress of all exemptions granted, or in effect, under this Order during the preceding year.

SEC. 9. *Related Actions.* The imposition of any sanction or penalty under or pursuant to this Order shall not relieve any person of any legal duty to comply with any provisions of the Air Act or the Water Act.

SEC. 10. *Applicability.* This Order shall not apply to contracts, grants, or loans involving the use of facilities located outside the United States.

SEC. 11. *Uniformity.* Rules, regulations, standards, and guidelines issued pursuant to this order and section 508 of the Water Act [33 U.S.C. 1368] shall, to the maximum extent feasible, be uniform with regulations issued pursuant to this order, Executive Order No. 11602 of June 29, 1971 [formerly set out above], and section 306 of the Air Act [this section].

SEC. 12. *Order Superseded.* Executive Order No. 11602 of June 29, 1971, is hereby superseded.

RICHARD NIXON.

**§ 7607. Administrative proceedings and judicial review**

**(a) Administrative subpoenas; confidentiality; witnesses**

In connection with any determination under section 7410(f) of this title, or for purposes of obtaining information under section 7521(b)(4)<sup>1</sup> or 7545(c)(3) of this title, any investigation, monitoring, reporting requirement, entry, compliance inspection, or administrative enforcement proceeding under the<sup>2</sup> chapter (including but not limited to section 7413, section 7414, section 7420, section 7429, section 7477, section 7524, section 7525, section 7542, section 7603, or section 7606 of this title),<sup>3</sup> the Administrator may issue subpoenas for the attendance and testimony of witnesses and the production of relevant papers, books, and documents, and he may administer oaths. Except for emission data, upon a showing satisfactory to the Administrator by such owner or operator that such papers, books, documents, or information or particular part thereof, if made public, would divulge trade secrets or secret processes of such owner or operator, the Administrator shall consider such record, report, or information or particular portion thereof confidential in accordance with the purposes of section 1905 of title 18, except that such paper, book, document, or information may be dis-

<sup>1</sup> See References in Text note below.

<sup>2</sup> So in original. Probably should be "this".

<sup>3</sup> So in original.

closed to other officers, employees, or authorized representatives of the United States concerned with carrying out this chapter, to persons carrying out the National Academy of Sciences' study and investigation provided for in section 7521(c) of this title, or when relevant in any proceeding under this chapter. Witnesses summoned shall be paid the same fees and mileage that are paid witnesses in the courts of the United States. In case of contumacy or refusal to obey a subpoena served upon any person under this subparagraph,<sup>4</sup> the district court of the United States for any district in which such person is found or resides or transacts business, upon application by the United States and after notice to such person, shall have jurisdiction to issue an order requiring such person to appear and give testimony before the Administrator to appear and produce papers, books, and documents before the Administrator, or both, and any failure to obey such order of the court may be punished by such court as a contempt thereof.

**(b) Judicial review**

(1) A petition for review of action of the Administrator in promulgating any national primary or secondary ambient air quality standard, any emission standard or requirement under section 7412 of this title, any standard of performance or requirement under section 7411 of this title,<sup>3</sup> any standard under section 7521 of this title (other than a standard required to be prescribed under section 7521(b)(1) of this title), any determination under section 7521(b)(5)<sup>1</sup> of this title, any control or prohibition under section 7545 of this title, any standard under section 7571 of this title, any rule issued under section 7413, 7419, or under section 7420 of this title, or any other nationally applicable regulations promulgated, or final action taken, by the Administrator under this chapter may be filed only in the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia. A petition for review of the Administrator's action in approving or promulgating any implementation plan under section 7410 of this title or section 7411(d) of this title, any order under section 7411(j) of this title, under section 7412 of this title, under section 7419 of this title, or under section 7420 of this title, or his action under section 1857c-10(c)(2)(A), (B), or (C) of this title (as in effect before August 7, 1977) or under regulations thereunder, or revising regulations for enhanced monitoring and compliance certification programs under section 7414(a)(3) of this title, or any other final action of the Administrator under this chapter (including any denial or disapproval by the Administrator under subchapter I of this chapter) which is locally or regionally applicable may be filed only in the United States Court of Appeals for the appropriate circuit. Notwithstanding the preceding sentence a petition for review of any action referred to in such sentence may be filed only in the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia if such action is based on a determination of nationwide scope or effect and if in taking such action the Administrator finds and pub-

lishes that such action is based on such a determination. Any petition for review under this subsection shall be filed within sixty days from the date notice of such promulgation, approval, or action appears in the Federal Register, except that if such petition is based solely on grounds arising after such sixtieth day, then any petition for review under this subsection shall be filed within sixty days after such grounds arise. The filing of a petition for reconsideration by the Administrator of any otherwise final rule or action shall not affect the finality of such rule or action for purposes of judicial review nor extend the time within which a petition for judicial review of such rule or action under this section may be filed, and shall not postpone the effectiveness of such rule or action.

(2) Action of the Administrator with respect to which review could have been obtained under paragraph (1) shall not be subject to judicial review in civil or criminal proceedings for enforcement. Where a final decision by the Administrator defers performance of any nondiscretionary statutory action to a later time, any person may challenge the deferral pursuant to paragraph (1).

**(c) Additional evidence**

In any judicial proceeding in which review is sought of a determination under this chapter required to be made on the record after notice and opportunity for hearing, if any party applies to the court for leave to adduce additional evidence, and shows to the satisfaction of the court that such additional evidence is material and that there were reasonable grounds for the failure to adduce such evidence in the proceeding before the Administrator, the court may order such additional evidence (and evidence in rebuttal thereof) to be taken before the Administrator, in such manner and upon such terms and conditions as to<sup>5</sup> the court may deem proper. The Administrator may modify his findings as to the facts, or make new findings, by reason of the additional evidence so taken and he shall file such modified or new findings, and his recommendation, if any, for the modification or setting aside of his original determination, with the return of such additional evidence.

**(d) Rulemaking**

(1) This subsection applies to—

(A) the promulgation or revision of any national ambient air quality standard under section 7409 of this title,

(B) the promulgation or revision of an implementation plan by the Administrator under section 7410(c) of this title,

(C) the promulgation or revision of any standard of performance under section 7411 of this title, or emission standard or limitation under section 7412(d) of this title, any standard under section 7412(f) of this title, or any regulation under section 7412(g)(1)(D) and (F) of this title, or any regulation under section 7412(m) or (n) of this title,

(D) the promulgation of any requirement for solid waste combustion under section 7429 of this title,

<sup>4</sup> So in original. Probably should be "subsection,".

<sup>5</sup> So in original. The word "to" probably should not appear.

(E) the promulgation or revision of any regulation pertaining to any fuel or fuel additive under section 7545 of this title,

(F) the promulgation or revision of any aircraft emission standard under section 7571 of this title,

(G) the promulgation or revision of any regulation under subchapter IV–A of this chapter (relating to control of acid deposition),

(H) promulgation or revision of regulations pertaining to primary nonferrous smelter orders under section 7419 of this title (but not including the granting or denying of any such order),

(I) promulgation or revision of regulations under subchapter VI of this chapter (relating to stratosphere and ozone protection),

(J) promulgation or revision of regulations under part C of subchapter I of this chapter (relating to prevention of significant deterioration of air quality and protection of visibility),

(K) promulgation or revision of regulations under section 7521 of this title and test procedures for new motor vehicles or engines under section 7525 of this title, and the revision of a standard under section 7521(a)(3) of this title,

(L) promulgation or revision of regulations for noncompliance penalties under section 7420 of this title,

(M) promulgation or revision of any regulations promulgated under section 7541 of this title (relating to warranties and compliance by vehicles in actual use),

(N) action of the Administrator under section 7426 of this title (relating to interstate pollution abatement),

(O) the promulgation or revision of any regulation pertaining to consumer and commercial products under section 7511b(e) of this title,

(P) the promulgation or revision of any regulation pertaining to field citations under section 7413(d)(3) of this title,

(Q) the promulgation or revision of any regulation pertaining to urban buses or the clean-fuel vehicle, clean-fuel fleet, and clean fuel programs under part C of subchapter II of this chapter,

(R) the promulgation or revision of any regulation pertaining to nonroad engines or nonroad vehicles under section 7547 of this title,

(S) the promulgation or revision of any regulation relating to motor vehicle compliance program fees under section 7552 of this title,

(T) the promulgation or revision of any regulation under subchapter IV–A of this chapter (relating to acid deposition),

(U) the promulgation or revision of any regulation under section 7511b(f) of this title pertaining to marine vessels, and

(V) such other actions as the Administrator may determine.

The provisions of section 553 through 557 and section 706 of title 5 shall not, except as expressly provided in this subsection, apply to actions to which this subsection applies. This subsection shall not apply in the case of any rule or circumstance referred to in subparagraphs (A) or (B) of subsection 553(b) of title 5.

(2) Not later than the date of proposal of any action to which this subsection applies, the Administrator shall establish a rulemaking docket for such action (hereinafter in this subsection referred to as a “rule”). Whenever a rule applies only within a particular State, a second (identical) docket shall be simultaneously established in the appropriate regional office of the Environmental Protection Agency.

(3) In the case of any rule to which this subsection applies, notice of proposed rulemaking shall be published in the Federal Register, as provided under section 553(b) of title 5, shall be accompanied by a statement of its basis and purpose and shall specify the period available for public comment (hereinafter referred to as the “comment period”). The notice of proposed rulemaking shall also state the docket number, the location or locations of the docket, and the times it will be open to public inspection. The statement of basis and purpose shall include a summary of—

(A) the factual data on which the proposed rule is based;

(B) the methodology used in obtaining the data and in analyzing the data; and

(C) the major legal interpretations and policy considerations underlying the proposed rule.

The statement shall also set forth or summarize and provide a reference to any pertinent findings, recommendations, and comments by the Scientific Review Committee established under section 7409(d) of this title and the National Academy of Sciences, and, if the proposal differs in any important respect from any of these recommendations, an explanation of the reasons for such differences. All data, information, and documents referred to in this paragraph on which the proposed rule relies shall be included in the docket on the date of publication of the proposed rule.

(4)(A) The rulemaking docket required under paragraph (2) shall be open for inspection by the public at reasonable times specified in the notice of proposed rulemaking. Any person may copy documents contained in the docket. The Administrator shall provide copying facilities which may be used at the expense of the person seeking copies, but the Administrator may waive or reduce such expenses in such instances as the public interest requires. Any person may request copies by mail if the person pays the expenses, including personnel costs to do the copying.

(B)(i) Promptly upon receipt by the agency, all written comments and documentary information on the proposed rule received from any person for inclusion in the docket during the comment period shall be placed in the docket. The transcript of public hearings, if any, on the proposed rule shall also be included in the docket promptly upon receipt from the person who transcribed such hearings. All documents which become available after the proposed rule has been published and which the Administrator determines are of central relevance to the rulemaking shall be placed in the docket as soon as possible after their availability.

(ii) The drafts of proposed rules submitted by the Administrator to the Office of Management



and Budget for any interagency review process prior to proposal of any such rule, all documents accompanying such drafts, and all written comments thereon by other agencies and all written responses to such written comments by the Administrator shall be placed in the docket no later than the date of proposal of the rule. The drafts of the final rule submitted for such review process prior to promulgation and all such written comments thereon, all documents accompanying such drafts, and written responses thereto shall be placed in the docket no later than the date of promulgation.

(5) In promulgating a rule to which this subsection applies (i) the Administrator shall allow any person to submit written comments, data, or documentary information; (ii) the Administrator shall give interested persons an opportunity for the oral presentation of data, views, or arguments, in addition to an opportunity to make written submissions; (iii) a transcript shall be kept of any oral presentation; and (iv) the Administrator shall keep the record of such proceeding open for thirty days after completion of the proceeding to provide an opportunity for submission of rebuttal and supplementary information.

(6)(A) The promulgated rule shall be accompanied by (i) a statement of basis and purpose like that referred to in paragraph (3) with respect to a proposed rule and (ii) an explanation of the reasons for any major changes in the promulgated rule from the proposed rule.

(B) The promulgated rule shall also be accompanied by a response to each of the significant comments, criticisms, and new data submitted in written or oral presentations during the comment period.

(C) The promulgated rule may not be based (in part or whole) on any information or data which has not been placed in the docket as of the date of such promulgation.

(7)(A) The record for judicial review shall consist exclusively of the material referred to in paragraph (3), clause (i) of paragraph (4)(B), and subparagraphs (A) and (B) of paragraph (6).

(B) Only an objection to a rule or procedure which was raised with reasonable specificity during the period for public comment (including any public hearing) may be raised during judicial review. If the person raising an objection can demonstrate to the Administrator that it was impracticable to raise such objection within such time or if the grounds for such objection arose after the period for public comment (but within the time specified for judicial review) and if such objection is of central relevance to the outcome of the rule, the Administrator shall convene a proceeding for reconsideration of the rule and provide the same procedural rights as would have been afforded had the information been available at the time the rule was proposed. If the Administrator refuses to convene such a proceeding, such person may seek review of such refusal in the United States court of appeals for the appropriate circuit (as provided in subsection (b) of this section). Such reconsideration shall not postpone the effectiveness of the rule. The effectiveness of the rule may be stayed during such reconsideration, however, by the Administrator or the court for a period not to exceed three months.

(8) The sole forum for challenging procedural determinations made by the Administrator under this subsection shall be in the United States court of appeals for the appropriate circuit (as provided in subsection (b) of this section) at the time of the substantive review of the rule. No interlocutory appeals shall be permitted with respect to such procedural determinations. In reviewing alleged procedural errors, the court may invalidate the rule only if the errors were so serious and related to matters of such central relevance to the rule that there is a substantial likelihood that the rule would have been significantly changed if such errors had not been made.

(9) In the case of review of any action of the Administrator to which this subsection applies, the court may reverse any such action found to be—

(A) arbitrary, capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accordance with law;

(B) contrary to constitutional right, power, privilege, or immunity;

(C) in excess of statutory jurisdiction, authority, or limitations, or short of statutory right; or

(D) without observance of procedure required by law, if (i) such failure to observe such procedure is arbitrary or capricious, (ii) the requirement of paragraph (7)(B) has been met, and (iii) the condition of the last sentence of paragraph (8) is met.

(10) Each statutory deadline for promulgation of rules to which this subsection applies which requires promulgation less than six months after date of proposal may be extended to not more than six months after date of proposal by the Administrator upon a determination that such extension is necessary to afford the public, and the agency, adequate opportunity to carry out the purposes of this subsection.

(11) The requirements of this subsection shall take effect with respect to any rule the proposal of which occurs after ninety days after August 7, 1977.

**(e) Other methods of judicial review not authorized**

Nothing in this chapter shall be construed to authorize judicial review of regulations or orders of the Administrator under this chapter, except as provided in this section.

**(f) Costs**

In any judicial proceeding under this section, the court may award costs of litigation (including reasonable attorney and expert witness fees) whenever it determines that such award is appropriate.

**(g) Stay, injunction, or similar relief in proceedings relating to noncompliance penalties**

In any action respecting the promulgation of regulations under section 7420 of this title or the administration or enforcement of section 7420 of this title no court shall grant any stay, injunctive, or similar relief before final judgment by such court in such action.

**(h) Public participation**

It is the intent of Congress that, consistent with the policy of subchapter II of chapter 5 of

title 5, the Administrator in promulgating any regulation under this chapter, including a regulation subject to a deadline, shall ensure a reasonable period for public participation of at least 30 days, except as otherwise expressly provided in section<sup>6</sup> 7407(d), 7502(a), 7511(a) and (b), and 7512(a) and (b) of this title.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title III, §307, as added Pub. L. 91-604, §12(a), Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1707; amended Pub. L. 92-157, title III, §302(a), Nov. 18, 1971, 85 Stat. 464; Pub. L. 93-319, §6(c), June 22, 1974, 88 Stat. 259; Pub. L. 95-95, title III, §§303(d), 305(a), (c), (f)-(h), Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 772, 776, 777; Pub. L. 95-190, §14(a)(79), (80), Nov. 16, 1977, 91 Stat. 1404; Pub. L. 101-549, title I, §§108(p), 110(5), title III, §302(g), (h), title VII, §§702(c), 703, 706, 707(h), 710(b), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2469, 2470, 2574, 2681-2684.)

#### REFERENCES IN TEXT

Section 7521(b)(4) of this title, referred to in subsec. (a), was repealed by Pub. L. 101-549, title II, §230(2), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2529.

Section 7521(b)(5) of this title, referred to in subsec. (b)(1), was repealed by Pub. L. 101-549, title II, §230(3), Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2529.

Section 1857c-10(c)(2)(A), (B), or (C) of this title (as in effect before August 7, 1977), referred to in subsec. (b)(1), was in the original “section 119(c)(2)(A), (B), or (C) (as in effect before the date of enactment of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1977)”, meaning section 119 of act July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, as added June 22, 1974, Pub. L. 93-319, §3, 88 Stat. 248, (which was classified to section 1857c-10 of this title) as in effect prior to the enactment of Pub. L. 95-95, Aug. 7, 1977, 91 Stat. 691, effective Aug. 7, 1977. Section 112(b)(1) of Pub. L. 95-95 repealed section 119 of act July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title I, as added by Pub. L. 93-319, and provided that all references to such section 119 in any subsequent enactment which supersedes Pub. L. 93-319 shall be construed to refer to section 113(d) of the Clean Air Act and to paragraph (5) thereof in particular which is classified to subsec. (d)(5) of section 7413 of this title. Section 7413(d) of this title was subsequently amended generally by Pub. L. 101-549, title VII, §701, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2672, and, as so amended, no longer relates to final compliance orders. Section 117(b) of Pub. L. 95-95 added a new section 119 of act July 14, 1955, which is classified to section 7419 of this title.

Part C of subchapter I of this chapter, referred to in subsec. (d)(1)(J), was in the original “subtitle C of title I”, and was translated as reading “part C of title I” to reflect the probable intent of Congress, because title I does not contain subtitles.

#### CODIFICATION

In subsec. (h), “subchapter II of chapter 5 of title 5” was substituted for “the Administrative Procedures Act” on authority of Pub. L. 89-554, §7(b), Sept. 6, 1966, 80 Stat. 631, the first section of which enacted Title 5, Government Organization and Employees.

Section was formerly classified to section 1857h-5 of this title.

#### PRIOR PROVISIONS

A prior section 307 of act July 14, 1955, was renumbered section 314 by Pub. L. 91-604 and is classified to section 7614 of this title.

Another prior section 307 of act July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title III, formerly §14, as added Dec. 17, 1963, Pub. L. 88-206, §1, 77 Stat. 401, was renumbered section 307 by Pub. L. 89-272, renumbered section 310 by Pub. L. 90-148, and renumbered section 317 by Pub. L. 91-604, and is set out as a Short Title note under section 7401 of this title.

<sup>6</sup> So in original. Probably should be “sections”.

#### AMENDMENTS

1990—Subsec. (a). Pub. L. 101-549, §703, struck out par. (1) designation at beginning, inserted provisions authorizing issuance of subpoenas and administration of oaths for purposes of investigations, monitoring, reporting requirements, entries, compliance inspections, or administrative enforcement proceedings under this chapter, and struck out “or section 7521(b)(5)” after “section 7410(f)”.

Subsec. (b)(1). Pub. L. 101-549, §706(2), which directed amendment of second sentence by striking “under section 7413(d) of this title” immediately before “under section 7419 of this title”, was executed by striking “under section 7413(d) of this title,” before “under section 7419 of this title”, to reflect the probable intent of Congress.

Pub. L. 101-549, §706(1), inserted at end: “The filing of a petition for reconsideration by the Administrator of any otherwise final rule or action shall not affect the finality of such rule or action for purposes of judicial review nor extend the time within which a petition for judicial review of such rule or action under this section may be filed, and shall not postpone the effectiveness of such rule or action.”

Pub. L. 101-549, §702(c), inserted “or revising regulations for enhanced monitoring and compliance certification programs under section 7414(a)(3) of this title,” before “or any other final action of the Administrator”.

Pub. L. 101-549, §302(g), substituted “section 7412” for “section 7412(c)”.

Subsec. (b)(2). Pub. L. 101-549, §707(h), inserted sentence at end authorizing challenge to deferrals of performance of nondiscretionary statutory actions.

Subsec. (d)(1)(C). Pub. L. 101-549, §110(5)(A), amended subpar. (C) generally. Prior to amendment, subpar. (C) read as follows: “the promulgation or revision of any standard of performance under section 7411 of this title or emission standard under section 7412 of this title.”

Subsec. (d)(1)(D), (E). Pub. L. 101-549, §302(h), added subpar. (D) and redesignated former subpar. (D) as (E). Former subpar. (E) redesignated (F).

Subsec. (d)(1)(F). Pub. L. 101-549, §302(h), redesignated subpar. (E) as (F). Former subpar. (F) redesignated (G).

Pub. L. 101-549, §110(5)(B), amended subpar. (F) generally. Prior to amendment, subpar. (F) read as follows: “promulgation or revision of regulations pertaining to orders for coal conversion under section 7413(d)(5) of this title (but not including orders granting or denying any such orders)”.

Subsec. (d)(1)(G), (H). Pub. L. 101-549, §302(h), redesignated subpars. (F) and (G) as (G) and (H), respectively. Former subpar. (H) redesignated (I).

Subsec. (d)(1)(I). Pub. L. 101-549, §710(b), which directed that subpar. (H) be amended by substituting “subchapter VI of this chapter” for “part B of subchapter I of this chapter”, was executed by making the substitution in subpar. (I), to reflect the probable intent of Congress and the intervening redesignation of subpar. (H) as (I) by Pub. L. 101-549, §302(h), see below.

Pub. L. 101-549, §302(h), redesignated subpar. (H) as (I). Former subpar. (I) redesignated (J).

Subsec. (d)(1)(J) to (M). Pub. L. 101-549, §302(h), redesignated subpars. (I) to (L) as (J) to (M), respectively. Former subpar. (M) redesignated (N).

Subsec. (d)(1)(N). Pub. L. 101-549, §302(h), redesignated subpar. (M) as (N). Former subpar. (N) redesignated (O).

Pub. L. 101-549, §110(5)(C), added subpar. (N) and redesignated former subpar. (N) as (U).

Subsec. (d)(1)(O) to (T). Pub. L. 101-549, §302(h), redesignated subpars. (N) to (S) as (O) to (T), respectively. Former subpar. (T) redesignated (U).

Pub. L. 101-549, §110(5)(C), added subpars. (O) to (T).

Subsec. (d)(1)(U). Pub. L. 101-549, §302(h), redesignated subpar. (T) as (U). Former subpar. (U) redesignated (V).

Pub. L. 101-549, §110(5)(C), redesignated former subpar. (N) as (U).

Subsec. (d)(1)(V). Pub. L. 101-549, §302(h), redesignated subpar. (U) as (V).

Subsec. (h). Pub. L. 101-549, §108(p), added subsec. (h). 1977—Subsec. (b)(1). Pub. L. 95-190 in text relating to filing of petitions for review in the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia inserted provision respecting requirements under sections 7411 and 7412 of this title, and substituted provisions authorizing review of any rule issued under section 7413, 7419, or 7420 of this title, for provisions authorizing review of any rule or order issued under section 7420 of this title, relating to noncompliance penalties, and in text relating to filing of petitions for review in the United States Court of Appeals for the appropriate circuit inserted provision respecting review under section 7411(j), 7412(c), 7413(d), or 7419 of this title, provision authorizing review under section 1857c-10(c)(2)(A), (B), or (C) to the period prior to Aug. 7, 1977, and provisions authorizing review of denials or disapprovals by the Administrator under subchapter I of this chapter.

Pub. L. 95-95, §305(c), (h), inserted rules or orders issued under section 7420 of this title (relating to non-compliance penalties) and any other nationally applicable regulations promulgated, or final action taken, by the Administrator under this chapter to the enumeration of actions of the Administrator for which a petition for review may be filed only in the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia, added the approval or promulgation by the Administrator of orders under section 7420 of this title, or any other final action of the Administrator under this chapter which is locally or regionally applicable to the enumeration of actions by the Administrator for which a petition for review may be filed only in the United States Court of Appeals for the appropriate circuit, inserted provision that petitions otherwise capable of being filed in the Court of Appeals for the appropriate circuit may be filed only in the Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia if the action is based on a determination of nationwide scope, and increased from 30 days to 60 days the period during which the petition must be filed.

Subsec. (d). Pub. L. 95-95, §305(a), added subsec. (d).  
Subsec. (e). Pub. L. 95-95, §303(d), added subsec. (e).  
Subsec. (f). Pub. L. 95-95, §305(f), added subsec. (f).  
Subsec. (g). Pub. L. 95-95, §305(g), added subsec. (g).  
1974—Subsec. (b)(1). Pub. L. 93-319 inserted reference to the Administrator's action under section 1857c-10(c)(2)(A), (B), or (C) of this title or under regulations thereunder and substituted reference to the filing of a petition within 30 days from the date of promulgation, approval, or action for reference to the filing of a petition within 30 days from the date of promulgation or approval.

1971—Subsec. (a)(1). Pub. L. 92-157 substituted reference to section "7545(c)(3)" for "7545(c)(4)" of this title.

EFFECTIVE DATE OF 1977 AMENDMENT

Amendment by Pub. L. 95-95 effective Aug. 7, 1977, except as otherwise expressly provided, see section 406(d) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as a note under section 7401 of this title.

TERMINATION OF ADVISORY COMMITTEES

Advisory committees established after Jan. 5, 1973, to terminate not later than the expiration of the 2-year period beginning on the date of their establishment, unless, in the case of a committee established by the President or an officer of the Federal Government, such committee is renewed by appropriate action prior to the expiration of such 2-year period, or in the case of a committee established by the Congress, its duration is otherwise provided for by law. See section 14 of Pub. L. 92-463, Oct. 6, 1972, 86 Stat. 776, set out in the Appendix to Title 5, Government Organization and Employees.

PENDING ACTIONS AND PROCEEDINGS

Suits, actions, and other proceedings lawfully commenced by or against the Administrator or any other

officer or employee of the United States in his official capacity or in relation to the discharge of his official duties under act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977], not to abate by reason of the taking effect of Pub. L. 95-95, see section 406(a) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

MODIFICATION OR RESCISSION OF RULES, REGULATIONS, ORDERS, DETERMINATIONS, CONTRACTS, CERTIFICATIONS, AUTHORIZATIONS, DELEGATIONS, AND OTHER ACTIONS

All rules, regulations, orders, determinations, contracts, certifications, authorizations, delegations, or other actions duly issued, made, or taken by or pursuant to act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect immediately prior to the date of enactment of Pub. L. 95-95 [Aug. 7, 1977] to continue in full force and effect until modified or rescinded in accordance with act July 14, 1955, as amended by Pub. L. 95-95 [this chapter], see section 406(b) of Pub. L. 95-95, set out as an Effective Date of 1977 Amendment note under section 7401 of this title.

§ 7608. Mandatory licensing

Whenever the Attorney General determines, upon application of the Administrator—

(1) that—

(A) in the implementation of the requirements of section 7411, 7412, or 7521 of this title, a right under any United States letters patent, which is being used or intended for public or commercial use and not otherwise reasonably available, is necessary to enable any person required to comply with such limitation to so comply, and

(B) there are no reasonable alternative methods to accomplish such purpose, and

(2) that the unavailability of such right may result in a substantial lessening of competition or tendency to create a monopoly in any line of commerce in any section of the country,

the Attorney General may so certify to a district court of the United States, which may issue an order requiring the person who owns such patent to license it on such reasonable terms and conditions as the court, after hearing, may determine. Such certification may be made to the district court for the district in which the person owning the patent resides, does business, or is found.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title III, §308, as added Pub. L. 91-604, §12(a), Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1708.)

CODIFICATION

Section was formerly classified to section 1857h-6 of this title.

PRIOR PROVISIONS

A prior section 308 of act July 14, 1955, was renumbered section 315 by Pub. L. 91-604 and is classified to section 7615 of this title.

MODIFICATION OR RESCISSION OF RULES, REGULATIONS, ORDERS, DETERMINATIONS, CONTRACTS, CERTIFICATIONS, AUTHORIZATIONS, DELEGATIONS, AND OTHER ACTIONS

All rules, regulations, orders, determinations, contracts, certifications, authorizations, delegations, or other actions duly issued, made, or taken by or pursuant to act July 14, 1955, the Clean Air Act, as in effect



(F) effect of sonic booms on property (including values); and

(G) such other matters as may be of interest in the public welfare.

**(b) Investigation techniques; report and recommendations**

In conducting such investigation, the Administrator shall hold public hearings, conduct research, experiments, demonstrations, and studies. The Administrator shall report the results of such investigation and study, together with his recommendations for legislation or other action, to the President and the Congress not later than one year after December 31, 1970.

**(c) Abatement of noise from Federal activities**

In any case where any Federal department or agency is carrying out or sponsoring any activity resulting in noise which the Administrator determines amounts to a public nuisance or is otherwise objectionable, such department or agency shall consult with the Administrator to determine possible means of abating such noise.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title IV, §402, as added Pub. L. 91-604, §14, Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1709.)

CODIFICATION

Another section 402 of act July 14, 1955, as added by Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §401, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2585, is classified to section 7651a of this title.

Section was formerly classified to section 1858 of this title.

**§ 7642. Authorization of appropriations**

There is authorized to be appropriated such amount, not to exceed \$30,000,000, as may be necessary for the purposes of this subchapter.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title IV, §403, as added Pub. L. 91-604, §14, Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1710.)

CODIFICATION

Another section 403 of act July 14, 1955, as added by Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §401, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2589, is classified to section 7651b of this title.

Section was formerly classified to section 1858a of this title.

SUBCHAPTER IV—A—ACID DEPOSITION CONTROL

CODIFICATION

Another title IV of act July 14, 1955, as added by Pub. L. 91-604, §14, Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1709, is classified principally to subchapter IV (§7641 et seq.) of this chapter.

**§ 7651. Findings and purposes**

**(a) Findings**

The Congress finds that—

(1) the presence of acidic compounds and their precursors in the atmosphere and in deposition from the atmosphere represents a threat to natural resources, ecosystems, materials, visibility, and public health;

(2) the principal sources of the acidic compounds and their precursors in the atmosphere are emissions of sulfur and nitrogen oxides from the combustion of fossil fuels;

(3) the problem of acid deposition is of national and international significance;

(4) strategies and technologies for the control of precursors to acid deposition exist now

that are economically feasible, and improved methods are expected to become increasingly available over the next decade;

(5) current and future generations of Americans will be adversely affected by delaying measures to remedy the problem;

(6) reduction of total atmospheric loading of sulfur dioxide and nitrogen oxides will enhance protection of the public health and welfare and the environment; and

(7) control measures to reduce precursor emissions from steam-electric generating units should be initiated without delay.

**(b) Purposes**

The purpose of this subchapter is to reduce the adverse effects of acid deposition through reductions in annual emissions of sulfur dioxide of ten million tons from 1980 emission levels, and, in combination with other provisions of this chapter, of nitrogen oxides emissions of approximately two million tons from 1980 emission levels, in the forty-eight contiguous States and the District of Columbia. It is the intent of this subchapter to effectuate such reductions by requiring compliance by affected sources with prescribed emission limitations by specified deadlines, which limitations may be met through alternative methods of compliance provided by an emission allocation and transfer system. It is also the purpose of this subchapter to encourage energy conservation, use of renewable and clean alternative technologies, and pollution prevention as a long-range strategy, consistent with the provisions of this subchapter, for reducing air pollution and other adverse impacts of energy production and use.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title IV, §401, as added Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §401, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2584.)

CODIFICATION

Another section 401 of act July 14, 1955, as added by Pub. L. 91-604, §14, Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1709, is set out as a Short Title note under section 7401 of this title.

ACID DEPOSITION STANDARDS

Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §404, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2632, directed Administrator of Environmental Protection Agency, not later than 36 months after Nov. 15, 1990, to transmit to Congress a report on the feasibility and effectiveness of an acid deposition standard or standards to protect sensitive and critically sensitive aquatic and terrestrial resources.

INDUSTRIAL SO<sub>2</sub> EMISSIONS

Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §406, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2632, provided that:

“(a) REPORT.—Not later than January 1, 1995 and every 5 years thereafter, the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency shall transmit to the Congress a report containing an inventory of national annual sulfur dioxide emissions from industrial sources (as defined in title IV of the Act [42 U.S.C. 7651 et seq.]), including units subject to section 405(g)(6) of the Clean Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7651d(g)(6)], for all years for which data are available, as well as the likely trend in such emissions over the following twenty-year period. The reports shall also contain estimates of the actual emission reduction in each year resulting from promulgation of the diesel fuel desulfurization regulations under section 214 [42 U.S.C. 7548].

“(b) 5.60 MILLION TON CAP.—Whenever the inventory required by this section indicates that sulfur dioxide

emissions from industrial sources, including units subject to section 405(g)(5) of the Clean Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7651(d)(5)], may reasonably be expected to reach levels greater than 5.60 million tons per year, the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency shall take such actions under the Clean Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7401 et seq.] as may be appropriate to ensure that such emissions do not exceed 5.60 million tons per year. Such actions may include the promulgation of new and revised standards of performance for new sources, including units subject to section 405(g)(5) of the Clean Air Act, under section 111(b) of the Clean Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7411(b)], as well as promulgation of standards of performance for existing sources, including units subject to section 405(g)(5) of the Clean Air Act, under authority of this section. For an existing source regulated under this section, 'standard of performance' means a standard which the Administrator determines is applicable to that source and which reflects the degree of emission reduction achievable through the application of the best system of continuous emission reduction which (taking into consideration the cost of achieving such emission reduction, and any nonair quality health and environmental impact and energy requirements) the Administrator determines has been adequately demonstrated for that category of sources.

"(c) ELECTION.—Regulations promulgated under section 405(b) of the Clean Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7651(d)(b)] shall not prohibit a source from electing to become an affected unit under section 410 of the Clean Air Act [42 U.S.C. 7651i]."

[For termination, effective May 15, 2000, of reporting provisions in section 406(a) of Pub. L. 101-549, set out above, see section 3003 of Pub. L. 104-66, as amended, set out as a note under section 1113 of Title 31, Money and Finance, and the 10th item on page 162 of House Document No. 103-7.]

#### SENSE OF CONGRESS ON EMISSION REDUCTIONS COSTS

Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §407, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2633, provided that: "It is the sense of the Congress that the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 [Pub. L. 101-549, see Tables for classification], through the allowance program, allocates the costs of achieving the required reductions in emissions of sulfur dioxide and oxides of nitrogen among sources in the United States. Broad based taxes and emissions fees that would provide for payment of the costs of achieving required emissions reductions by any party or parties other than the sources required to achieve the reductions are undesirable."

#### MONITORING OF ACID RAIN PROGRAM IN CANADA

Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §408, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2633, provided that:

"(a) REPORTS TO CONGRESS.—The Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency, in consultation with the Secretary of State, the Secretary of Energy, and other persons the Administrator deems appropriate, shall prepare and submit a report to Congress on January 1, 1994, January 1, 1999, and January 1, 2005.

"(b) CONTENTS.—The report to Congress shall analyze the current emission levels of sulfur dioxide and nitrogen oxides in each of the provinces participating in Canada's acid rain control program, the amount of emission reductions of sulfur dioxide and oxides of nitrogen achieved by each province, the methods utilized by each province in making those reductions, the costs to each province and the employment impacts in each province of making and maintaining those reductions.

"(c) COMPLIANCE.—Beginning on January 1, 1999, the reports shall also assess the degree to which each province is complying with its stated emissions cap."

#### § 7651a. Definitions

As used in this subchapter:

(1) The term "affected source" means a source that includes one or more affected units.

(2) The term "affected unit" means a unit that is subject to emission reduction requirements or limitations under this subchapter.

(3) The term "allowance" means an authorization, allocated to an affected unit by the Administrator under this subchapter, to emit, during or after a specified calendar year, one ton of sulfur dioxide.

(4) The term "baseline" means the annual quantity of fossil fuel consumed by an affected unit, measured in millions of British Thermal Units ("mmBtu's"), calculated as follows:

(A) For each utility unit that was in commercial operation prior to January 1, 1985, the baseline shall be the annual average quantity of mmBtu's consumed in fuel during calendar years 1985, 1986, and 1987, as recorded by the Department of Energy pursuant to Form 767. For any utility unit for which such form was not filed, the baseline shall be the level specified for such unit in the 1985 National Acid Precipitation Assessment Program (NAPAP) Emissions Inventory, Version 2, National Utility Reference File (NURF) or in a corrected data base as established by the Administrator pursuant to paragraph (3).<sup>1</sup> For nonutility units, the baseline is the NAPAP Emissions Inventory, Version 2. The Administrator, in the Administrator's sole discretion, may exclude periods during which a unit is shutdown for a continuous period of four calendar months or longer, and make appropriate adjustments under this paragraph. Upon petition of the owner or operator of any unit, the Administrator may make appropriate baseline adjustments for accidents that caused prolonged outages.

(B) For any other nonutility unit that is not included in the NAPAP Emissions Inventory, Version 2, or a corrected data base as established by the Administrator pursuant to paragraph (3),<sup>1</sup> the baseline shall be the annual average quantity, in mmBtu consumed in fuel by that unit, as calculated pursuant to a method which the administrator shall prescribe by regulation to be promulgated not later than eighteen months after November 15, 1990.

(C) The Administrator shall, upon application or on his own motion, by December 31, 1991, supplement data needed in support of this subchapter and correct any factual errors in data from which affected Phase II units' baselines or actual 1985 emission rates have been calculated. Corrected data shall be used for purposes of issuing allowances under the<sup>2</sup> subchapter. Such corrections shall not be subject to judicial review, nor shall the failure of the Administrator to correct an alleged factual error in such reports be subject to judicial review.

(5) The term "capacity factor" means the ratio between the actual electric output from a unit and the potential electric output from that unit.

<sup>1</sup>So in original. The reference to "paragraph (3)" probably should be to "subparagraph (C)".

<sup>2</sup>So in original. Probably should be "this".

(6) The term “compliance plan” means, for purposes of the requirements of this subchapter, either—

(A) a statement that the source will comply with all applicable requirements under this subchapter, or

(B) where applicable, a schedule and description of the method or methods for compliance and certification by the owner or operator that the source is in compliance with the requirements of this subchapter.

(7) The term “continuous emission monitoring system” (CEMS) means the equipment as required by section 7651k of this title, used to sample, analyze, measure, and provide on a continuous basis a permanent record of emissions and flow (expressed in pounds per million British thermal units (lbs/mmBtu), pounds per hour (lbs/hr) or such other form as the Administrator may prescribe by regulations under section 7651k of this title).

(8) The term “existing unit” means a unit (including units subject to section 7411 of this title) that commenced commercial operation before November 15, 1990. Any unit that commenced commercial operation before November 15, 1990, which is modified, reconstructed, or repowered after November 15, 1990, shall continue to be an existing unit for the purposes of this subchapter. For the purposes of this subchapter, existing units shall not include simple combustion turbines, or units which serve a generator with a nameplate capacity of 25MWe or less.

(9) The term “generator” means a device that produces electricity and which is reported as a generating unit pursuant to Department of Energy Form 860.

(10) The term “new unit” means a unit that commences commercial operation on or after November 15, 1990.

(11) The term “permitting authority” means the Administrator, or the State or local air pollution control agency, with an approved permitting program under part B<sup>3</sup> of title III of the Act.

(12) The term “repowering” means replacement of an existing coal-fired boiler with one of the following clean coal technologies: atmospheric or pressurized fluidized bed combustion, integrated gasification combined cycle, magnetohydrodynamics, direct and indirect coal-fired turbines, integrated gasification fuel cells, or as determined by the Administrator, in consultation with the Secretary of Energy, a derivative of one or more of these technologies, and any other technology capable of controlling multiple combustion emissions simultaneously with improved boiler or generation efficiency and with significantly greater waste reduction relative to the performance of technology in widespread commercial use as of November 15, 1990. Notwithstanding the provisions of section 7651h(a) of this title, for the purpose of this subchapter, the term “repowering” shall also include any oil and/or gas-fired unit which has been awarded clean coal technology demonstration fund-

ing as of January 1, 1991, by the Department of Energy.

(13) The term “reserve” means any bank of allowances established by the Administrator under this subchapter.

(14) The term “State” means one of the 48 contiguous States and the District of Columbia.

(15) The term “unit” means a fossil fuel-fired combustion device.

(16) The term “actual 1985 emission rate”, for electric utility units means the annual sulfur dioxide or nitrogen oxides emission rate in pounds per million Btu as reported in the NAPAP Emissions Inventory, Version 2, National Utility Reference File. For nonutility units, the term “actual 1985 emission rate” means the annual sulfur dioxide or nitrogen oxides emission rate in pounds per million Btu as reported in the NAPAP Emission Inventory, Version 2.

(17)(A) The term “utility unit” means—

(i) a unit that serves a generator in any State that produces electricity for sale, or

(ii) a unit that, during 1985, served a generator in any State that produced electricity for sale.

(B) Notwithstanding subparagraph (A), a unit described in subparagraph (A) that—

(i) was in commercial operation during 1985, but

(ii) did not, during 1985, serve a generator in any State that produced electricity for sale shall not be a utility unit for purposes of this subchapter.

(C) A unit that cogenerates steam and electricity is not a “utility unit” for purposes of this subchapter unless the unit is constructed for the purpose of supplying, or commences construction after November 15, 1990, and supplies, more than one-third of its potential electric output capacity and more than 25 megawatts electrical output to any utility power distribution system for sale.

(18) The term “allowable 1985 emissions rate” means a federally enforceable emissions limitation for sulfur dioxide or oxides of nitrogen, applicable to the unit in 1985 or the limitation applicable in such other subsequent year as determined by the Administrator if such a limitation for 1985 does not exist. Where the emissions limitation for a unit is not expressed in pounds of emissions per million Btu, or the averaging period of that emissions limitation is not expressed on an annual basis, the Administrator shall calculate the annual equivalent of that emissions limitation in pounds per million Btu to establish the allowable 1985 emissions rate.

(19) The term “qualifying phase I technology” means a technological system of continuous emission reduction which achieves a 90 percent reduction in emissions of sulfur dioxide from the emissions that would have resulted from the use of fuels which were not subject to treatment prior to combustion.

(20) The term “alternative method of compliance” means a method of compliance in accordance with one or more of the following authorities:

<sup>3</sup> See References in Text note below.



(A) a substitution plan submitted and approved in accordance with subsections<sup>4</sup> 7651c(b) and (c) of this title;

(B) a Phase I extension plan approved by the Administrator under section 7651c(d) of this title, using qualifying phase I technology as determined by the Administrator in accordance with that section; or

(C) repowering with a qualifying clean coal technology under section 7651h of this title.

(21) The term “commenced” as applied to construction of any new electric utility unit means that an owner or operator has undertaken a continuous program of construction or that an owner or operator has entered into a contractual obligation to undertake and complete, within a reasonable time, a continuous program of construction.

(22) The term “commenced commercial operation” means to have begun to generate electricity for sale.

(23) The term “construction” means fabrication, erection, or installation of an affected unit.

(24) The term “industrial source” means a unit that does not serve a generator that produces electricity, a “nonutility unit” as defined in this section, or a process source as defined in section 7651i(e)<sup>5</sup> of this title.

(25) The term “nonutility unit” means a unit other than a utility unit.

(26) The term “designated representative” means a responsible person or official authorized by the owner or operator of a unit to represent the owner or operator in matters pertaining to the holding, transfer, or disposition of allowances allocated to a unit, and the submission of and compliance with permits, permit applications, and compliance plans for the unit.

(27) The term “life-of-the-unit, firm power contractual arrangement” means a unit participation power sales agreement under which a utility or industrial customer reserves, or is entitled to receive, a specified amount or percentage of capacity and associated energy generated by a specified generating unit (or units) and pays its proportional amount of such unit’s total costs, pursuant to a contract either—

(A) for the life of the unit;

(B) for a cumulative term of no less than 30 years, including contracts that permit an election for early termination; or

(C) for a period equal to or greater than 25 years or 70 percent of the economic useful life of the unit determined as of the time the unit was built, with option rights to purchase or re-lease some portion of the capacity and associated energy generated by the unit (or units) at the end of the period.

(28) The term “basic Phase II allowance allocations” means:

(A) For calendar years 2000 through 2009 inclusive, allocations of allowances made by the Administrator pursuant to section 7651b of this title and subsections (b)(1), (3), and

(4); (c)(1), (2), (3), and (5); (d)(1), (2), (4), and (5); (e); (f); (g)(1), (2), (3), (4), and (5); (h)(1); (i) and (j) of section 7651d of this title.

(B) For each calendar year beginning in 2010, allocations of allowances made by the Administrator pursuant to section 7651b of this title and subsections (b)(1), (3), and (4); (c)(1), (2), (3), and (5); (d)(1), (2), (4) and (5); (e); (f); (g)(1), (2), (3), (4), and (5); (h)(1) and (3); (i) and (j) of section 7651d of this title.

(29) The term “Phase II bonus allowance allocations” means, for calendar year 2000 through 2009, inclusive, and only for such years, allocations made by the Administrator pursuant to section 7651b of this title, subsections (a)(2), (b)(2), (c)(4), (d)(3) (except as otherwise provided therein), and (h)(2) of section 7651d of this title, and section 7651e of this title.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title IV, §402, as added Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §401, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2585.)

#### REFERENCES IN TEXT

Part B of title III of the Act, referred to in par. (11), means title III of the Clean Air Act, act July 14, 1955, ch. 360, as added, which is classified to subchapter III of this chapter, but title III does not contain parts. For provisions of the Clean Air Act relating to permits, see subchapter V (§ 7661 et seq.) of this chapter.

#### CODIFICATION

Another section 402 of act July 14, 1955, as added by Pub. L. 91-604, §14, Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1709, is classified to section 7641 of this title.

### § 7651b. Sulfur dioxide allowance program for existing and new units

#### (a) Allocations of annual allowances for existing and new units

(1)<sup>1</sup> For the emission limitation programs under this subchapter, the Administrator shall allocate annual allowances for the unit, to be held or distributed by the designated representative of the owner or operator of each affected unit at an affected source in accordance with this subchapter, in an amount equal to the annual tonnage emission limitation calculated under section 7651c, 7651d, 7651e, 7651h, or 7651i of this title except as otherwise specifically provided elsewhere in this subchapter. Except as provided in sections 7651d(a)(2), 7651d(a)(3), 7651h and 7651i of this title, beginning January 1, 2000, the Administrator shall not allocate annual allowances to emit sulfur dioxide pursuant to section 7651d of this title in such an amount as would result in total annual emissions of sulfur dioxide from utility units in excess of 8.90 million tons except that the Administrator shall not take into account unused allowances carried forward by owners and operators of affected units or by other persons holding such allowances, following the year for which they were allocated. If necessary to meeting the restrictions imposed in the preceding sentence, the Administrator shall reduce, pro rata, the basic Phase II allowance allocations for each unit subject to the requirements of section 7651d of this title.

<sup>4</sup> So in original. Probably should be “section”.

<sup>5</sup> So in original. Probably should be section “7651i(d)”.

<sup>1</sup> So in original. No pars. (2) and (3) have been enacted.

Subject to the provisions of section 7651o of this title, the Administrator shall allocate allowances for each affected unit at an affected source annually, as provided in paragraphs (2) and (3)<sup>1</sup> and section 7651g of this title. Except as provided in sections 7651h and 7651i of this title, the removal of an existing affected unit or source from commercial operation at any time after November 15, 1990 (whether before or after January 1, 1995, or January 1, 2000) shall not terminate or otherwise affect the allocation of allowances pursuant to section 7651c or 7651d of this title to which the unit is entitled. Allowances shall be allocated by the Administrator without cost to the recipient, except for allowances sold by the Administrator pursuant to section 7651o of this title. Not later than December 31, 1991, the Administrator shall publish a proposed list of the basic Phase II allowance allocations, the Phase II bonus allowance allocations and, if applicable, allocations pursuant to section 7651d(a)(3) of this title for each unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of section 7651d of this title for the year 2000 and the year 2010. After notice and opportunity for public comment, but not later than December 31, 1992, the Administrator shall publish a final list of such allocations, subject to the provisions of section 7651d(a)(2) of this title. Any owner or operator of an existing unit subject to the requirements of section 7651d(b) or (c) of this title who is considering applying for an extension of the emission limitation requirement compliance deadline for that unit from January 1, 2000, until not later than December 31, 2000, pursuant to section 7651h of this title, shall notify the Administrator no later than March 31, 1991. Such notification shall be used as the basis for estimating the basic Phase II allowances under this subsection. Prior to June 1, 1998, the Administrator shall publish a revised final statement of allowance allocations, subject to the provisions of section 7651d(a)(2) of this title and taking into account the effect of any compliance date extensions granted pursuant to section 7651h of this title on such allocations. Any person who may make an election concerning the amount of allowances to be allocated to a unit or units shall make such election and so inform the Administrator not later than March 31, 1991, in the case of an election under section 7651d of this title (or June 30, 1991, in the case of an election under section 7651e of this title). If such person fails to make such election, the Administrator shall set forth for each unit owned or operated by such person, the amount of allowances reflecting the election that would, in the judgment of the Administrator, provide the greatest benefit for the owner or operator of the unit. If such person is a Governor who may make an election under section 7651e of this title and the Governor fails to make an election, the Administrator shall set forth for each unit in the State the amount of allowances reflecting the election that would, in the judgment of the Administrator, provide the greatest benefit for units in the State.

**(b) Allowance transfer system**

Allowances allocated under this subchapter may be transferred among designated representatives of the owners or operators of affected

sources under this subchapter and any other person who holds such allowances, as provided by the allowance system regulations to be promulgated by the Administrator not later than eighteen months after November 15, 1990. Such regulations shall establish the allowance system prescribed under this section, including, but not limited to, requirements for the allocation, transfer, and use of allowances under this subchapter. Such regulations shall prohibit the use of any allowance prior to the calendar year for which the allowance was allocated, and shall provide, consistent with the purposes of this subchapter, for the identification of unused allowances, and for such unused allowances to be carried forward and added to allowances allocated in subsequent years, including allowances allocated to units subject to Phase I requirements (as described in section 7651c of this title) which are applied to emissions limitations requirements in Phase II (as described in section 7651d of this title). Transfers of allowances shall not be effective until written certification of the transfer, signed by a responsible official of each party to the transfer, is received and recorded by the Administrator. Such regulations shall permit the transfer of allowances prior to the issuance of such allowances. Recorded pre-allocation transfers shall be deducted by the Administrator from the number of allowances which would otherwise be allocated to the transferor, and added to those allowances allocated to the transferee. Pre-allocation transfers shall not affect the prohibition contained in this subsection against the use of allowances prior to the year for which they are allocated.

**(c) Interpollutant trading**

Not later than January 1, 1994, the Administrator shall furnish to the Congress a study evaluating the environmental and economic consequences of amending this subchapter to permit trading sulfur dioxide allowances for nitrogen oxides allowances.

**(d) Allowance tracking system**

(1) The Administrator shall promulgate, not later than 18 months after November 15, 1990, a system for issuing, recording, and tracking allowances, which shall specify all necessary procedures and requirements for an orderly and competitive functioning of the allowance system. All allowance allocations and transfers shall, upon recordation by the Administrator, be deemed a part of each unit's permit requirements pursuant to section 7651g of this title, without any further permit review and revision.

(2) In order to insure electric reliability, such regulations shall not prohibit or affect temporary increases and decreases in emissions within utility systems, power pools, or utilities entering into allowance pool agreements, that result from their operations, including emergencies and central dispatch, and such temporary emissions increases and decreases shall not require transfer of allowances among units nor shall it require recordation. The owners or operators of such units shall act through a designated representative. Notwithstanding the preceding sentence, the total tonnage of emissions in any calendar year (calculated at the end thereof) from all units in such a utility system,

power pool, or allowance pool agreements shall not exceed the total allowances for such units for the calendar year concerned.

**(e) New utility units**

After January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for a new utility unit to emit an annual tonnage of sulfur dioxide in excess of the number of allowances to emit held for the unit by the unit's owner or operator. Such new utility units shall not be eligible for an allocation of sulfur dioxide allowances under subsection (a)(1) of this section, unless the unit is subject to the provisions of subsection (g)(2) or (3) of section 7651d of this title. New utility units may obtain allowances from any person, in accordance with this subchapter. The owner or operator of any new utility unit in violation of this subsection shall be liable for fulfilling the obligations specified in section 7651j of this title.

**(f) Nature of allowances**

An allowance allocated under this subchapter is a limited authorization to emit sulfur dioxide in accordance with the provisions of this subchapter. Such allowance does not constitute a property right. Nothing in this subchapter or in any other provision of law shall be construed to limit the authority of the United States to terminate or limit such authorization. Nothing in this section relating to allowances shall be construed as affecting the application of, or compliance with, any other provision of this chapter to an affected unit or source, including the provisions related to applicable National Ambient Air Quality Standards and State implementation plans. Nothing in this section shall be construed as requiring a change of any kind in any State law regulating electric utility rates and charges or affecting any State law regarding such State regulation or as limiting State regulation (including any prudency review) under such a State law. Nothing in this section shall be construed as modifying the Federal Power Act [16 U.S.C. 791a et seq.] or as affecting the authority of the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission under that Act. Nothing in this subchapter shall be construed to interfere with or impair any program for competitive bidding for power supply in a State in which such program is established. Allowances, once allocated to a person by the Administrator, may be received, held, and temporarily or permanently transferred in accordance with this subchapter and the regulations of the Administrator without regard to whether or not a permit is in effect under subchapter V of this chapter or section 7651g of this title with respect to the unit for which such allowance was originally allocated and recorded. Each permit under this subchapter and each permit issued under subchapter V of this chapter for any affected unit shall provide that the affected unit may not emit an annual tonnage of sulfur dioxide in excess of the allowances held for that unit.

**(g) Prohibition**

It shall be unlawful for any person to hold, use, or transfer any allowance allocated under this subchapter, except in accordance with regulations promulgated by the Administrator. It shall be unlawful for any affected unit to emit

sulfur dioxide in excess of the number of allowances held for that unit for that year by the owner or operator of the unit. Upon the allocation of allowances under this subchapter, the prohibition contained in the preceding sentence shall supersede any other emission limitation applicable under this subchapter to the units for which such allowances are allocated. Allowances may not be used prior to the calendar year for which they are allocated. Nothing in this section or in the allowance system regulations shall relieve the Administrator of the Administrator's permitting, monitoring and enforcement obligations under this chapter, nor relieve affected sources of their requirements and liabilities under this chapter.

**(h) Competitive bidding for power supply**

Nothing in this subchapter shall be construed to interfere with or impair any program for competitive bidding for power supply in a State in which such program is established.

**(i) Applicability of antitrust laws**

(1) Nothing in this section affects—

(A) the applicability of the antitrust laws to the transfer, use, or sale of allowances, or

(B) the authority of the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission under any provision of law respecting unfair methods of competition or anticompetitive acts or practices.

(2) As used in this section, "antitrust laws" means those Acts set forth in section 12 of title 15.

**(j) Public Utility Holding Company Act**

The acquisition or disposition of allowances pursuant to this subchapter including the issuance of securities or the undertaking of any other financing transaction in connection with such allowances shall not be subject to the provisions of the Public Utility Holding Company Act of 1935.<sup>2</sup>

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title IV, §403, as added Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §401, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2589.)

REFERENCES IN TEXT

The Federal Power Act, referred to in subsec. (f), is act June 10, 1920, ch. 285, 41 Stat. 1063, as amended, which is classified generally to chapter 12 (§791a et seq.) of Title 16, Conservation. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see section 791a of Title 16 and Tables.

The Public Utility Holding Company Act of 1935, referred to in subsec. (j), is title I of act Aug. 26, 1935, ch. 687, 49 Stat. 803, as amended, which was classified generally to chapter 2C (§79 et seq.) of Title 15, Commerce and Trade, prior to repeal by Pub. L. 109-58, title XII, §1263, Aug. 8, 2005, 119 Stat. 974. For complete classification of this Act to the Code, see Tables.

CODIFICATION

Another section 403 of act July 14, 1955, as added by Pub. L. 91-604, §14, Dec. 31, 1970, 84 Stat. 1710, is classified to section 7642 of this title.

FOSSIL FUEL USE

Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §402, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2631, provided that:

“(a) CONTRACTS FOR HYDROELECTRIC ENERGY.—Any person who, after the date of the enactment of the

<sup>2</sup> See References in Text note below.



Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 [Nov. 15, 1990], enters into a contract under which such person receives hydroelectric energy in return for the provision of electric energy by such person shall use allowances held by such person as necessary to satisfy such person's obligations under such contract.

“(b) FEDERAL POWER MARKETING ADMINISTRATION.—A Federal Power Marketing Administration shall not be subject to the provisions and requirements of this title [enacting this subchapter, amending sections 7410, 7411, and 7479 of this title, and enacting provisions set out as notes under sections 7403, 7411, and 7651 of this title] with respect to electric energy generated by hydroelectric facilities and marketed by such Power Marketing Administration. Any person who sells or provides electric energy to a Federal Power Marketing Administration shall comply with the provisions and requirements of this title.”

#### § 7651c. Phase I sulfur dioxide requirements

##### (a) Emission limitations

(1) After January 1, 1995, each source that includes one or more affected units listed in table A is an affected source under this section. After January 1, 1995, it shall be unlawful for any affected unit (other than an eligible phase I unit under subsection (d)(2) of this section) to emit sulfur dioxide in excess of the tonnage limitation stated as a total number of allowances in table A for phase I, unless (A) the emissions reduction requirements applicable to such unit have been achieved pursuant to subsection (b) or (d) of this section, or (B) the owner or operator of such unit holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions, except that, after January 1, 2000, the emissions limitations established in this section shall be superseded by those established in section 7651d of this title. The owner or operator of any unit in violation of this section shall be fully liable for such violation including, but not limited to, liability for fulfilling the obligations specified in section 7651j of this title.

(2) Not later than December 31, 1991, the Administrator shall determine the total tonnage of reductions in the emissions of sulfur dioxide from all utility units in calendar year 1995 that will occur as a result of compliance with the emissions limitation requirements of this section, and shall establish a reserve of allowances equal in amount to the number of tons determined thereby not to exceed a total of 3.50 million tons. In making such a determination, the Administrator shall compute for each unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of this section the difference between:

(A) the product of its baseline multiplied by the lesser of each unit's allowable 1985 emissions rate and its actual 1985 emissions rate, divided by 2,000, and

(B) the product of each unit's baseline multiplied by 2.50 lbs/mmBtu divided by 2,000,

and sum the computations. The Administrator shall adjust the foregoing calculation to reflect projected calendar year 1995 utilization of the units subject to the emissions limitations of this subchapter that the Administrator finds would have occurred in the absence of the imposition of such requirements. Pursuant to subsection (d) of this section, the Administrator shall allocate allowances from the reserve established hereinunder until the earlier of such time

as all such allowances in the reserve are allocated or December 31, 1999.

(3) In addition to allowances allocated pursuant to paragraph (1), in each calendar year beginning in 1995 and ending in 1999, inclusive, the Administrator shall allocate for each unit on Table A that is located in the States of Illinois, Indiana, or Ohio (other than units at Kyger Creek, Clifty Creek and Joppa Steam), allowances in an amount equal to 200,000 multiplied by the unit's pro rata share of the total number of allowances allocated for all units on Table A in the 3 States (other than units at Kyger Creek, Clifty Creek, and Joppa Steam) pursuant to paragraph (1). Such allowances shall be excluded from the calculation of the reserve under paragraph (2).

##### (b) Substitutions

The owner or operator of an affected unit under subsection (a) of this section may include in its section 7651g of this title permit application and proposed compliance plan a proposal to reassign, in whole or in part, the affected unit's sulfur dioxide reduction requirements to any other unit(s) under the control of such owner or operator. Such proposal shall specify—

(1) the designation of the substitute unit or units to which any part of the reduction obligations of subsection (a) of this section shall be required, in addition to, or in lieu of, any original affected units designated under such subsection;

(2) the original affected unit's baseline, the actual and allowable 1985 emissions rate for sulfur dioxide, and the authorized annual allowance allocation stated in table A;

(3) calculation of the annual average tonnage for calendar years 1985, 1986, and 1987, emitted by the substitute unit or units, based on the baseline for each unit, as defined in section 7651a(d)<sup>1</sup> of this title, multiplied by the lesser of the unit's actual or allowable 1985 emissions rate;

(4) the emissions rates and tonnage limitations that would be applicable to the original and substitute affected units under the substitution proposal;

(5) documentation, to the satisfaction of the Administrator, that the reassigned tonnage limits will, in total, achieve the same or greater emissions reduction than would have been achieved by the original affected unit and the substitute unit or units without such substitution; and

(6) such other information as the Administrator may require.

##### (c) Administrator's action on substitution proposals

(1) The Administrator shall take final action on such substitution proposal in accordance with section 7651g(c) of this title if the substitution proposal fulfills the requirements of this subsection. The Administrator may approve a substitution proposal in whole or in part and with such modifications or conditions as may be consistent with the orderly functioning of the allowance system and which will ensure the emissions reductions contemplated by this sub-

<sup>1</sup> So in original. Probably should be section “7651a(4)”.

chapter. If a proposal does not meet the requirements of subsection (b) of this section, the Administrator shall disapprove it. The owner or operator of a unit listed in table A shall not substitute another unit or units without the prior approval of the Administrator.

(2) Upon approval of a substitution proposal, each substitute unit, and each source with such unit, shall be deemed affected under this subchapter, and the Administrator shall issue a permit to the original and substitute affected source and unit in accordance with the approved substitution plan and section 7651g of this title. The Administrator shall allocate allowances for the original and substitute affected units in accordance with the approved substitution proposal pursuant to section 7651b of this title. It shall be unlawful for any source or unit that is allocated allowances pursuant to this section to emit sulfur dioxide in excess of the emissions limitation provided for in the approved substitution permit and plan unless the owner or operator of each unit governed by the permit and approved substitution plan holds allowances to emit not less than the units<sup>2</sup> total annual emissions. The owner or operator of any original or substitute affected unit operated in violation of this subsection shall be fully liable for such violation, including liability for fulfilling the obligations specified in section 7651j of this title. If a substitution proposal is disapproved, the Administrator shall allocate allowances to the original affected unit or units in accordance with subsection (a) of this section.

**(d) Eligible phase I extension units**

(1) The owner or operator of any affected unit subject to an emissions limitation requirement under this section may petition the Administrator in its permit application under section 7651g of this title for an extension of 2 years of the deadline for meeting such requirement, provided that the owner or operator of any such unit holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions for each of the 2 years of the period of extension. To qualify for such an extension, the affected unit must either employ a qualifying phase I technology, or transfer its phase I emissions reduction obligation to a unit employing a qualifying phase I technology. Such transfer shall be accomplished in accordance with a compliance plan, submitted and approved under section 7651g of this title, that shall govern operations at all units included in the transfer, and that specifies the emissions reduction requirements imposed pursuant to this subchapter.

(2) Such extension proposal shall—

(A) specify the unit or units proposed for designation as an eligible phase I extension unit;

(B) provide a copy of an executed contract, which may be contingent upon the Administrator approving the proposal, for the design engineering, and construction of the qualifying phase I technology for the extension unit, or for the unit or units to which the extension unit's emission reduction obligation is to be transferred;

(C) specify the unit's or units' baseline, actual 1985 emissions rate, allowable 1985 emissions rate, and projected utilization for calendar years 1995 through 1999;

(D) require CEMS on both the eligible phase I extension unit or units and the transfer unit or units beginning no later than January 1, 1995; and

(E) specify the emission limitation and number of allowances expected to be necessary for annual operation after the qualifying phase I technology has been installed.

(3) The Administrator shall review and take final action on each extension proposal in order of receipt, consistent with section 7651g of this title, and for an approved proposal shall designate the unit or units as an eligible phase I extension unit. The Administrator may approve an extension proposal in whole or in part, and with such modifications or conditions as may be necessary, consistent with the orderly functioning of the allowance system, and to ensure the emissions reductions contemplated by the<sup>3</sup> subchapter.

(4) In order to determine the number of proposals eligible for allocations from the reserve under subsection (a)(2) of this section and the number of allowances remaining available after each proposal is acted upon, the Administrator shall reduce the total number of allowances remaining available in the reserve by the number of allowances calculated according to subparagraphs (A), (B) and (C) until either no allowances remain available in the reserve for further allocation or all approved proposals have been acted upon. If no allowances remain available in the reserve for further allocation before all proposals have been acted upon by the Administrator, any pending proposals shall be disapproved. The Administrator shall calculate allowances equal to—

(A) the difference between the lesser of the average annual emissions in calendar years 1988 and 1989 or the projected emissions tonnage for calendar year 1995 of each eligible phase I extension unit, as designated under paragraph (3), and the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by an emission rate of 2.50 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000;

(B) the difference between the lesser of the average annual emissions in calendar years 1988 and 1989 or the projected emissions tonnage for calendar year 1996 of each eligible phase I extension unit, as designated under paragraph (3), and the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by an emission rate of 2.50 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000; and

(C) the amount by which (i) the product of each unit's baseline multiplied by an emission rate of 1.20 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000, exceeds (ii) the tonnage level specified under subparagraph (E) of paragraph (2) of this subsection multiplied by a factor of 3.

(5) Each eligible Phase I extension unit shall receive allowances determined under subsection (a)(1) or (c) of this section. In addition, for calendar year 1995, the Administrator shall allocate to each eligible Phase I extension unit, from the

<sup>2</sup> So in original. Probably should be "unit's".

<sup>3</sup> So in original. Probably should be "this".

allowance reserve created pursuant to subsection (a)(2) of this section, allowances equal to the difference between the lesser of the average annual emissions in calendar years 1988 and 1989 or its projected emissions tonnage for calendar year 1995 and the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by an emission rate of 2.50 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000. In calendar year 1996, the Administrator shall allocate for each eligible unit, from the allowance reserve created pursuant to subsection (a)(2) of this section, allowances equal to the difference between the lesser of the average annual emissions in calendar years 1988 and 1989 or its projected emissions tonnage for calendar year 1996 and the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by an emission rate of 2.50 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000. It shall be unlawful for any source or unit subject to an approved extension plan under this subsection to emit sulfur dioxide in excess of the emissions limitations provided for in the permit and approved extension plan, unless the owner or operator of each unit governed by the permit and approved plan holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

(6) In addition to allowances specified in paragraph (5), the Administrator shall allocate for each eligible Phase I extension unit employing qualifying Phase I technology, for calendar years 1997, 1998, and 1999, additional allowances, from any remaining allowances in the reserve created pursuant to subsection (a)(2) of this section, following the reduction in the reserve provided for in paragraph (4), not to exceed the amount by which (A) the product of each eligible unit's baseline times an emission rate of 1.20 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000, exceeds (B) the tonnage level specified under subparagraph (E) of paragraph (2) of this subsection.

(7) After January 1, 1997, in addition to any liability under this chapter, including under section 7651j of this title, if any eligible phase I extension unit employing qualifying phase I technology or any transfer unit under this subsection emits sulfur dioxide in excess of the annual tonnage limitation specified in the extension plan, as approved in paragraph (3) of this subsection, the Administrator shall, in the calendar year following such excess, deduct allowances equal to the amount of such excess from such unit's annual allowance allocation.

**(e) Allocation of allowances**

(1) In the case of a unit that receives authorization from the Governor of the State in which such unit is located to make reductions in the emissions of sulfur dioxide prior to calendar year 1995 and that is part of a utility system that meets the following requirements: (A) the total coal-fired generation within the utility system as a percentage of total system generation decreased by more than 20 percent between January 1, 1980, and December 31, 1985; and (B) the weighted capacity factor of all coal-fired units within the utility system averaged over the period from January 1, 1985, through December 31, 1987, was below 50 percent, the Administrator shall allocate allowances under this paragraph for the unit pursuant to this subsection. The Administrator shall allocate allowances for a unit that is an affected unit pursuant to sec-

tion 7651d of this title (but is not also an affected unit under this section) and part of a utility system that includes 1 or more affected units under section 7651d of this title for reductions in the emissions of sulfur dioxide made during the period 1995-1999 if the unit meets the requirements of this subsection and the requirements of the preceding sentence, except that for the purposes of applying this subsection to any such unit, the prior year concerned as specified below, shall be any year after January 1, 1995 but prior to January 1, 2000.

(2) In the case of an affected unit under this section described in subparagraph (A),<sup>4</sup> the allowances allocated under this subsection for early reductions in any prior year may not exceed the amount which (A) the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by the unit's 1985 actual sulfur dioxide emission rate (in lbs. per mmBtu), divided by 2,000, exceeds (B) the allowances specified for such unit in Table A. In the case of an affected unit under section 7651d of this title described in subparagraph (A),<sup>4</sup> the allowances awarded under this subsection for early reductions in any prior year may not exceed the amount by which (i) the product of the quantity of fossil fuel consumed by the unit (in mmBtu) in the prior year multiplied by the lesser of 2.50 or the most stringent emission rate (in lbs. per mmBtu) applicable to the unit under the applicable implementation plan, divided by 2,000, exceeds (ii) the unit's actual tonnage of sulfur dioxide emission for the prior year concerned. Allowances allocated under this subsection for units referred to in subparagraph (A)<sup>4</sup> may be allocated only for emission reductions achieved as a result of physical changes or changes in the method of operation made after November 15, 1990, including changes in the type or quality of fossil fuel consumed.

(3) In no event shall the provisions of this paragraph<sup>5</sup> be interpreted as an event of force majeure<sup>6</sup> or a commercial impracticability<sup>7</sup> or in any other way as a basis for excused non-performance by a utility system under a coal sales contract in effect before November 15, 1990.

TABLE A.—AFFECTED SOURCES AND UNITS IN PHASE I AND THEIR SULFUR DIOXIDE ALLOWANCES (TONS)

State	Plant Name	Generator	Phase I Allowances
Alabama	Colbert	1	13,570
		2	15,310
		3	15,400
		4	15,410
		5	37,180
	E.C. Gaston	1	18,100
		2	18,540
		3	18,310
		4	19,280
		5	59,840
Florida	Big Bend	1	28,410
		2	27,100
		3	26,740
	Crist	6	19,200
		7	31,680

<sup>4</sup> So in original. Probably should be "paragraph (1)".

<sup>5</sup> So in original. Probably should be "subsection".

<sup>6</sup> So in original. Probably should be "majeure".

<sup>7</sup> So in original. Probably should be "impracticability".



TABLE A.—AFFECTED SOURCES AND UNITS IN PHASE I AND THEIR SULFUR DIOXIDE ALLOWANCES (TONS)—CONTINUED

State	Plant Name	Generator	Phase I Allowances
Georgia	Bowen	1	56,320
		2	54,770
		3	71,750
		4	71,740
	Hammond	1	8,780
		2	9,220
		3	8,910
		4	37,640
	J. McDonough	1	19,910
		2	20,600
	Wansley	1	70,770
		2	65,430
	Yates	1	7,210
		2	7,040
		3	6,950
		4	8,910
		5	9,410
		6	24,760
		7	21,480
	Illinois	Baldwin	1
2			44,420
3			42,550
Coffeen		1	11,790
		2	35,670
Grand Tower		4	5,910
		2	18,410
Hennepin		2	18,410
		1	12,590
Joppa Steam		2	10,770
		3	12,270
		4	11,360
	5	11,420	
	6	10,620	
	1	31,530	
Kincaid	2	33,810	
	3	13,890	
Meredosia	2	8,880	
	7	11,180	
Indiana	Bailly	8	15,630
		1	18,500
	Breed	1	33,370
		2	34,130
	Cayuga	1	20,150
		2	19,810
		3	20,410
		4	20,080
		5	19,360
		6	20,380
	E. W. Stout	5	3,880
		6	4,770
7		23,610	
F. B. Culley	2	4,290	
	3	16,970	
F. E. Ratts	1	8,330	
	2	8,480	
Gibson	1	40,400	
	2	41,010	
	3	41,080	
	4	40,320	
H. T. Pritchard	6	5,770	
	12	23,310	
Michigan City	1	16,430	
	2	32,380	
Petersburg	1	6,490	
	2	7,280	
	3	6,530	
	4	7,650	
Tanners Creek	4	24,820	
	1	4,000	
Wabash River	2	2,860	
	3	3,750	
	5	3,670	
	6	12,280	

TABLE A.—AFFECTED SOURCES AND UNITS IN PHASE I AND THEIR SULFUR DIOXIDE ALLOWANCES (TONS)—CONTINUED

State	Plant Name	Generator	Phase I Allowances
Iowa	Warrick	4	26,980
		1	10,710
	Burlington	7	2,320
		1	1,290
		2	13,800
	George Neal	4	8,180
		5	3,990
		2	4,220
	Prairie Creek	4	8,180
		5	3,990
Riverside	2	4,220	
	1	11,250	
Quindaro	2	12,840	
	3	12,340	
Kentucky	Coleman	1	7,450
		2	15,320
	Cooper	1	7,110
		2	10,910
	E.W. Brown	3	26,100
		1	6,520
		2	14,410
	Elmer Smith	1	28,410
		4	7,820
	Ghent	4	7,820
1		22,780	
Green River	1	13,340	
	2	12,310	
H.L. Spurlock	3	59,170	
	10	10,170	
Henderson II	1	21,910	
	2	24,330	
Maryland	Chalk Point	1	10,330
		2	9,230
	C. P. Crane	1	35,260
		2	38,480
	Morgantown	1	35,260
		2	38,480
Michigan	J. H. Campbell	1	19,280
		2	23,060
Minnesota	High Bridge	6	4,270
		4	17,910
Mississippi	Jack Watson	5	36,700
		1	16,190
Missouri	Asbury	1	16,190
		5	4,850
	James River	1	40,110
		2	37,710
	Labadie	3	40,310
		4	35,940
	Montrose	1	7,390
		2	8,200
		3	10,090
	New Madrid	1	28,240
2		32,480	
Sibley	3	15,580	
	1	22,570	
Sioux	2	23,690	
	1	10,250	
Thomas Hill	2	19,390	
	1	10,190	
New Hampshire	Merrimack	2	22,000
		1	9,060
New Jersey	B.L. England	2	11,720
		3	12,600
New York	Dunkirk	3	12,600
		4	14,060
	Greenidge	4	7,540
		1	11,170
	Milliken	2	12,410
		1	19,810
Northport	2	24,110	
	3	26,480	
Port Jefferson	3	10,470	
	4	12,330	
Ohio	Ashtabula	5	16,740
		8	11,650
	Avon Lake	9	30,480
		1	34,270
Cardinal	1	34,270	
	2	38,320	

TABLE A.—AFFECTED SOURCES AND UNITS IN PHASE I AND THEIR SULFUR DIOXIDE ALLOWANCES (TONS)—CONTINUED

State	Plant Name	Generator	Phase I Allowances
	Conesville .....	1	4,210
		2	4,890
		3	5,500
		4	48,770
	Eastlake .....	1	7,800
		2	8,640
		3	10,020
		4	14,510
		5	34,070
	Edgewater .....	4	5,050
	Gen. J.M. Gavin ..	1	79,080
		2	80,560
	Kyger Creek .....	1	19,280
		2	18,560
		3	17,910
		4	18,710
		5	18,740
	Miami Fort .....	5	760
		6	11,380
		7	38,510
	Muskingum River	1	14,880
		2	14,170
		3	13,950
		4	11,780
		5	40,470
	Niles .....	1	6,940
		2	9,100
	Picway .....	5	4,930
	R.E. Burger .....	3	6,150
		4	10,780
		5	12,430
	W.H. Sammis .....	5	24,170
		6	39,930
		7	43,220
	W.C. Beckjord .....	5	8,950
		6	23,020
Pennsylvania ...	Armstrong .....	1	14,410
		2	15,430
	Brunner Island ....	1	27,760
		2	31,100
		3	53,820
	Cheswick .....	1	39,170
	Conemaugh .....	1	59,790
		2	66,450
	Hatfield's Ferry ..	1	37,830
		2	37,320
		3	40,270
	Martins Creek .....	1	12,660
		2	12,820
	Portland .....	1	5,940
		2	10,230
	Shawville .....	1	10,320
		2	10,320
		3	14,220
		4	14,070
	Sunbury .....	3	8,760
		4	11,450
Tennessee .....	Allen .....	1	15,320
		2	16,770
		3	15,670
	Cumberland .....	1	86,700
		2	94,840
	Gallatin .....	1	17,870
		2	17,310
		3	20,020
		4	21,260

TABLE A.—AFFECTED SOURCES AND UNITS IN PHASE I AND THEIR SULFUR DIOXIDE ALLOWANCES (TONS)—CONTINUED

State	Plant Name	Generator	Phase I Allowances
	Johnsonville .....	1	7,790
		2	8,040
		3	8,410
		4	7,990
		5	8,240
		6	7,890
		7	8,980
		8	8,700
		9	7,080
		10	7,550
West Virginia ..	Albright .....	3	12,000
	Fort Martin .....	1	41,590
		2	41,200
	Harrison .....	1	48,620
		2	46,150
		3	41,500
	Kammer .....	1	18,740
		2	19,460
		3	17,390
	Mitchell .....	1	43,980
		2	45,510
	Mount Storm .....	1	43,720
		2	35,580
		3	42,430
Wisconsin .....	Edgewater .....	4	24,750
	La Crosse/Genoa ..	3	22,700
	Nelson Dewey .....	1	6,010
		2	6,680
	N. Oak Creek .....	1	5,220
		2	5,140
		3	5,370
		4	6,320
	Pulliam .....	8	7,510
	S. Oak Creek .....	5	9,670
		6	12,040
		7	16,180
		8	15,790

**(f) Energy conservation and renewable energy**

**(1) Definitions**

As used in this subsection:

**(A) Qualified energy conservation measure**

The term “qualified energy conservation measure” means a cost effective measure, as identified by the Administrator in consultation with the Secretary of Energy, that increases the efficiency of the use of electricity provided by an electric utility to its customers.

**(B) Qualified renewable energy**

The term “qualified renewable energy” means energy derived from biomass, solar, geothermal, or wind as identified by the Administrator in consultation with the Secretary of Energy.

**(C) Electric utility**

The term “electric utility” means any person, State agency, or Federal agency, which sells electric energy.

**(2) Allowances for emissions avoided through energy conservation and renewable energy**

**(A) In general**

The regulations under paragraph (4) of this subsection shall provide that for each ton of sulfur dioxide emissions avoided by an elec-

tric utility, during the applicable period, through the use of qualified energy conservation measures or qualified renewable energy, the Administrator shall allocate a single allowance to such electric utility, on a first-come-first-served basis from the Conservation and Renewable Energy Reserve established under subsection (g) of this section, up to a total of 300,000 allowances for allocation from such Reserve.

**(B) Requirements for issuance**

The Administrator shall allocate allowances to an electric utility under this subsection only if all of the following requirements are met:

(i) Such electric utility is paying for the qualified energy conservation measures or qualified renewable energy directly or through purchase from another person.

(ii) The emissions of sulfur dioxide avoided through the use of qualified energy conservation measures or qualified renewable energy are quantified in accordance with regulations promulgated by the Administrator under this subsection.

(iii)(I) Such electric utility has adopted and is implementing a least cost energy conservation and electric power plan which evaluates a range of resources, including new power supplies, energy conservation, and renewable energy resources, in order to meet expected future demand at the lowest system cost.

(II) The qualified energy conservation measures or qualified renewable energy, or both, are consistent with that plan.

(III) Electric utilities subject to the jurisdiction of a State regulatory authority must have such plan approved by such authority. For electric utilities not subject to the jurisdiction of a State regulatory authority such plan shall be approved by the entity with rate-making authority for such utility.

(iv) In the case of qualified energy conservation measures undertaken by a State regulated electric utility, the Secretary of Energy certifies that the State regulatory authority with jurisdiction over the electric rates of such electric utility has established rates and charges which ensure that the net income of such electric utility after implementation of specific cost effective energy conservation measures is at least as high as such net income would have been if the energy conservation measures had not been implemented. Upon the date of any such certification by the Secretary of Energy, all allowances which, but for this paragraph, would have been allocated under subparagraph (A) before such date, shall be allocated to the electric utility. This clause is not a requirement for qualified renewable energy.

(v) Such utility or any subsidiary of the utility's holding company owns or operates at least one affected unit.

**(C) Period of applicability**

Allowances under this subsection shall be allocated only with respect to kilowatt

hours of electric energy saved by qualified energy conservation measures or generated by qualified renewable energy after January 1, 1992 and before the earlier of (i) December 31, 2000, or (ii) the date on which any electric utility steam generating unit owned or operated by the electric utility to which the allowances are allocated becomes subject to this subchapter (including those sources that elect to become affected by this subchapter, pursuant to section 7651i of this title).

**(D) Determination of avoided emissions**

**(i)<sup>8</sup> Application**

In order to receive allowances under this subsection, an electric utility shall make an application which—

(I) designates the qualified energy conservation measures implemented and the qualified renewable energy sources used for purposes of avoiding emissions,<sup>9</sup>

(II) calculates, in accordance with subparagraphs (F) and (G), the number of tons of emissions avoided by reason of the implementation of such measures or the use of such renewable energy sources; and

(III) demonstrates that the requirements of subparagraph (B) have been met.

Such application for allowances by a State-regulated electric utility shall require approval by the State regulatory authority with jurisdiction over such electric utility. The authority shall review the application for accuracy and compliance with this subsection and the rules under this subsection. Electric utilities whose retail rates are not subject to the jurisdiction of a State regulatory authority shall apply directly to the Administrator for such approval.

**(E) Avoided emissions from qualified energy conservation measures**

For the purposes of this subsection, the emission tonnage deemed avoided by reason of the implementation of qualified energy conservation measures for any calendar year shall be a tonnage equal to the product of multiplying—

(i) the kilowatt hours that would otherwise have been supplied by the utility during such year in the absence of such qualified energy conservation measures, by

(ii) 0.004,

and dividing by 2,000.

**(F) Avoided emissions from the use of qualified renewable energy**

The emissions tonnage deemed avoided by reason of the use of qualified renewable energy by an electric utility for any calendar year shall be a tonnage equal to the product of multiplying—

(i) the actual kilowatt hours generated by, or purchased from, qualified renewable energy, by

<sup>8</sup> So in original. There is no cl. (ii).

<sup>9</sup> So in original. The comma probably should be a semicolon.

(ii) 0.004,  
and dividing by 2,000.

### (G) Prohibitions

(i) No allowances shall be allocated under this subsection for the implementation of programs that are exclusively informational or educational in nature.

(ii) No allowances shall be allocated for energy conservation measures or renewable energy that were operational before January 1, 1992.

### (3) Savings provision

Nothing in this subsection precludes a State or State regulatory authority from providing additional incentives to utilities to encourage investment in demand-side resources.

### (4) Regulations

Not later than 18 months after November 15, 1990, and in conjunction with the regulations required to be promulgated under subsections (b) and (c) of this section, the Administrator shall, in consultation with the Secretary of Energy, promulgate regulations under this subsection. Such regulations shall list energy conservation measures and renewable energy sources which may be treated as qualified energy conservation measures and qualified renewable energy for purposes of this subsection. Allowances shall only be allocated if all requirements of this subsection and the rules promulgated to implement this subsection are complied with. The Administrator shall review the determinations of each State regulatory authority under this subsection to encourage consistency from electric utility to electric utility and from State to State in accordance with the Administrator's rules. The Administrator shall publish the findings of this review no less than annually.

### (g) Conservation and Renewable Energy Reserve

The Administrator shall establish a Conservation and Renewable Energy Reserve under this subsection. Beginning on January 1, 1995, the Administrator may allocate from the Conservation and Renewable Energy Reserve an amount equal to a total of 300,000 allowances for emissions of sulfur dioxide pursuant to section 7651b of this title. In order to provide 300,000 allowances for such reserve, in each year beginning in calendar year 2000 and until calendar year 2009, inclusive, the Administrator shall reduce each unit's basic Phase II allowance allocation on the basis of its pro rata share of 30,000 allowances. If allowances remain in the reserve after January 2, 2010, the Administrator shall allocate such allowances for affected units under section 7651d of this title on a pro rata basis. For purposes of this subsection, for any unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of section 7651d of this title, the term "pro rata basis" refers to the ratio which the reductions made in such unit's allowances in order to establish the reserve under this subsection bears to the total of such reductions for all such units.

### (h) Alternative allowance allocation for units in certain utility systems with optional baseline

#### (1) Optional baseline for units in certain systems

In the case of a unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of this section which (as of November 15, 1990)—

(A) has an emission rate below 1.0 lbs/mmBtu,

(B) has decreased its sulfur dioxide emissions rate by 60 percent or greater since 1980, and

(C) is part of a utility system which has a weighted average sulfur dioxide emissions rate for all fossil fueled-fired units below 1.0 lbs/mmBtu,

at the election of the owner or operator of such unit, the unit's baseline may be calculated (i) as provided under section 7651a(d)<sup>10</sup> of this title, or (ii) by utilizing the unit's average annual fuel consumption at a 60 percent capacity factor. Such election shall be made no later than March 1, 1991.

#### (2) Allowance allocation

Whenever a unit referred to in paragraph (1) elects to calculate its baseline as provided in clause (ii) of paragraph (1), the Administrator shall allocate allowances for the unit pursuant to section 7651b(a)(1) of this title, this section, and section 7651d of this title (as basic Phase II allowance allocations) in an amount equal to the baseline selected multiplied by the lower of the average annual emission rate for such unit in 1989, or 1.0 lbs./mmBtu. Such allowance allocation shall be in lieu of any allocation of allowances under this section and section 7651d of this title.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title IV, §404, as added Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §401, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2592.)

### § 7651d. Phase II sulfur dioxide requirements

#### (a) Applicability

(1) After January 1, 2000, each existing utility unit as provided below is subject to the limitations or requirements of this section. Each utility unit subject to an annual sulfur dioxide tonnage emission limitation under this section is an affected unit under this subchapter. Each source that includes one or more affected units is an affected source. In the case of an existing unit that was not in operation during calendar year 1985, the emission rate for a calendar year after 1985, as determined by the Administrator, shall be used in lieu of the 1985 rate. The owner or operator of any unit operated in violation of this section shall be fully liable under this chapter for fulfilling the obligations specified in section 7651j of this title.

(2) In addition to basic Phase II allowance allocations, in each year beginning in calendar year 2000 and ending in calendar year 2009, inclusive, the Administrator shall allocate up to 530,000 Phase II bonus allowances pursuant to subsections (b)(2), (c)(4), (d)(3)(A) and (B), and (h)(2) of this section and section 7651e of this

<sup>10</sup>So in original. Probably should be section "7651a(4)".



title. Not later than June 1, 1998, the Administrator shall calculate, for each unit granted an extension pursuant to section 7651h of this title the difference between (A) the number of allowances allocated for the unit in calendar year 2000, and (B) the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by 1.20 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2000, and sum the computations. In each year, beginning in calendar year 2000 and ending in calendar year 2009, inclusive, the Administrator shall deduct from each unit's basic Phase II allowance allocation its pro rata share of 10 percent of the sum calculated pursuant to the preceding sentence.

(3) In addition to basic Phase II allowance allocations and Phase II bonus allowance allocations, beginning January 1, 2000, the Administrator shall allocate for each unit listed on Table A in section 7651c of this title (other than units at Kyger Creek, Clifty Creek, and Joppa Steam) and located in the States of Illinois, Indiana, Ohio, Georgia, Alabama, Missouri, Pennsylvania, West Virginia, Kentucky, or Tennessee allowances in an amount equal to 50,000 multiplied by the unit's pro rata share of the total number of basic allowances allocated for all units listed on Table A (other than units at Kyger Creek, Clifty Creek, and Joppa Steam). Allowances allocated pursuant to this paragraph shall not be subject to the 8,900,000 ton limitation in section 7651b(a) of this title.

**(b) Units equal to, or above, 75 MWe and 1.20 lbs/mmBtu**

(1) Except as otherwise provided in paragraph (3), after January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for any existing utility unit that serves a generator with nameplate capacity equal to, or greater, than 75 MWe and an actual 1985 emission rate equal to or greater than 1.20 lbs/mmBtu to exceed an annual sulfur dioxide tonnage emission limitation equal to the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by an emission rate equal to 1.20 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator of such unit holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

(2) In addition to allowances allocated pursuant to paragraph (1) and section 7651b(a)(1) of this title as basic Phase II allowance allocations, beginning January 1, 2000, and for each calendar year thereafter until and including 2009, the Administrator shall allocate annually for each unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of paragraph (1) with an actual 1985 emissions rate greater than 1.20 lbs/mmBtu and less than 2.50 lbs/mmBtu and a baseline capacity factor of less than 60 percent, allowances from the reserve created pursuant to subsection (a)(2) of this section in an amount equal to 1.20 lbs/mmBtu multiplied by 50 percent of the difference, on a Btu basis, between the unit's baseline and the unit's fuel consumption at a 60 percent capacity factor.

(3) After January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for any existing utility unit with an actual 1985 emissions rate equal to or greater than 1.20 lbs/mmBtu whose annual average fuel consumption during 1985, 1986, and 1987 on a Btu basis exceeded 90 percent in the form of lignite coal which is located in a State in which, as of July 1, 1989, no

county or portion of a county was designated nonattainment under section 7407 of this title for any pollutant subject to the requirements of section 7409 of this title to exceed an annual sulfur dioxide tonnage limitation equal to the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by the lesser of the unit's actual 1985 emissions rate or its allowable 1985 emissions rate, divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator of such unit holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

(4) After January 1, 2000, the Administrator shall allocate annually for each unit, subject to the emissions limitation requirements of paragraph (1), which is located in a State with an installed electrical generating capacity of more than 30,000,000 kw in 1988 and for which was issued a prohibition order or a proposed prohibition order (from burning oil), which unit subsequently converted to coal between January 1, 1980 and December 31, 1985, allowances equal to the difference between (A) the product of the unit's annual fuel consumption, on a Btu basis, at a 65 percent capacity factor multiplied by the lesser of its actual or allowable emissions rate during the first full calendar year after conversion, divided by 2,000, and (B) the number of allowances allocated for the unit pursuant to paragraph (1): *Provided*, That the number of allowances allocated pursuant to this paragraph shall not exceed an annual total of five thousand. If necessary to meeting the restriction imposed in the preceding sentence the Administrator shall reduce, pro rata, the annual allowances allocated for each unit under this paragraph.

**(c) Coal or oil-fired units below 75 MWe and above 1.20 lbs/mmBtu**

(1) Except as otherwise provided in paragraph (3), after January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for a coal or oil-fired existing utility unit that serves a generator with nameplate capacity of less than 75 MWe and an actual 1985 emission rate equal to, or greater than, 1.20 lbs/mmBtu and which is a unit owned by a utility operating company whose aggregate nameplate fossil fuel steam-electric capacity is, as of December 31, 1989, equal to, or greater than, 250 MWe to exceed an annual sulfur dioxide emissions limitation equal to the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by an emission rate equal to 1.20 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator of such unit holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

(2) After January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for a coal or oil-fired existing utility unit that serves a generator with nameplate capacity of less than 75 MWe and an actual 1985 emission rate equal to, or greater than, 1.20 lbs/mmBtu (excluding units subject to section 7411 of this title or to a federally enforceable emissions limitation for sulfur dioxide equivalent to an annual rate of less than 1.20 lbs/mmBtu) and which is a unit owned by a utility operating company whose aggregate nameplate fossil fuel steam-electric capacity is, as of December 31, 1989, less than 250 MWe, to exceed an annual sulfur dioxide tonnage emissions limitation equal to the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by the lesser of its actual 1985 emissions rate or its al-

allowable 1985 emissions rate, divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator of such unit holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

(3) After January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for any existing utility unit with a nameplate capacity below 75 MWe and an actual 1985 emissions rate equal to, or greater than, 1.20 lbs/mmBtu which became operational on or before December 31, 1965, which is owned by a utility operating company with, as of December 31, 1989, a total fossil fuel steam-electric generating capacity greater than 250 MWe, and less than 450 MWe which serves fewer than 78,000 electrical customers as of November 15, 1990, to exceed an annual sulfur dioxide emissions tonnage limitation equal to the product of its baseline multiplied by the lesser of its actual or allowable 1985 emission rate, divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions. After January 1, 2010, it shall be unlawful for each unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of this paragraph to exceed an annual emissions tonnage limitation equal to the product of its baseline multiplied by an emissions rate of 1.20 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

(4) In addition to allowances allocated pursuant to paragraph (1) and section 7651b(a)(1) of this title as basic Phase II allowance allocations, beginning January 1, 2000, and for each calendar year thereafter until and including 2009, inclusive, the Administrator shall allocate annually for each unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of paragraph (1) with an actual 1985 emissions rate equal to, or greater than, 1.20 lbs/mmBtu and less than 2.50 lbs/mmBtu and a baseline capacity factor of less than 60 percent, allowances from the reserve created pursuant to subsection (a)(2) of this section in an amount equal to 1.20 lbs/mmBtu multiplied by 50 percent of the difference, on a Btu basis, between the unit's baseline and the unit's fuel consumption at a 60 percent capacity factor.

(5) After January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for any existing utility unit with a nameplate capacity below 75 MWe and an actual 1985 emissions rate equal to, or greater than, 1.20 lbs/mmBtu which is part of an electric utility system which, as of November 15, 1990, (A) has at least 20 percent of its fossil-fuel capacity controlled by flue gas desulfurization devices, (B) has more than 10 percent of its fossil-fuel capacity consisting of coal-fired units of less than 75 MWe, and (C) has large units (greater than 400 MWe) all of which have difficult or very difficult FGD Retrofit Cost Factors (according to the Emissions and the FGD Retrofit Feasibility at the 200 Top Emitting Generating Stations, prepared for the United States Environmental Protection Agency on January 10, 1986) to exceed an annual sulfur dioxide emissions tonnage limitation equal to the product of its baseline multiplied by an emissions rate of 2.5 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's

total annual emissions. After January 1, 2010, it shall be unlawful for each unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of this paragraph to exceed an annual emissions tonnage limitation equal to the product of its baseline multiplied by an emissions rate of 1.20 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator holds for use allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

**(d) Coal-fired units below 1.20 lbs/mmBtu**

(1) After January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for any existing coal-fired utility unit the lesser of whose actual or allowable 1985 sulfur dioxide emissions rate is less than 0.60 lbs/mmBtu to exceed an annual sulfur dioxide tonnage emission limitation equal to the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by (A) the lesser of 0.60 lbs/mmBtu or the unit's allowable 1985 emissions rate, and (B) a numerical factor of 120 percent, divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator of such unit holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

(2) After January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for any existing coal-fired utility unit the lesser of whose actual or allowable 1985 sulfur dioxide emissions rate is equal to, or greater than, 0.60 lbs/mmBtu and less than 1.20 lbs/mmBtu to exceed an annual sulfur dioxide tonnage emissions limitation equal to the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by (A) the lesser of its actual 1985 emissions rate or its allowable 1985 emissions rate, and (B) a numerical factor of 120 percent, divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator of such unit holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

(3)(A) In addition to allowances allocated pursuant to paragraph (1) and section 7651b(a)(1) of this title as basic Phase II allowance allocations, at the election of the designated representative of the operating company, beginning January 1, 2000, and for each calendar year thereafter until and including 2009, the Administrator shall allocate annually for each unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of paragraph (1) allowances from the reserve created pursuant to subsection (a)(2) of this section in an amount equal to the amount by which (i) the product of the lesser of 0.60 lbs/mmBtu or the unit's allowable 1985 emissions rate multiplied by the unit's baseline adjusted to reflect operation at a 60 percent capacity factor, divided by 2,000, exceeds (ii) the number of allowances allocated for the unit pursuant to paragraph (1) and section 7651b(a)(1) of this title as basic Phase II allowance allocations.

(B) In addition to allowances allocated pursuant to paragraph (2) and section 7651b(a)(1) of this title as basic Phase II allowance allocations, at the election of the designated representative of the operating company, beginning January 1, 2000, and for each calendar year thereafter until and including 2009, the Administrator shall allocate annually for each unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of paragraph (2) allowances from the reserve created pursuant to subsection (a)(2) of this section in an amount equal to the amount by which (i) the product of the lesser of the unit's actual 1985 emissions rate or its allowable 1985 emissions rate multiplied by the unit's baseline adjusted

<sup>1</sup> So in original. Probably should be "unit's".



to reflect operation at a 60 percent capacity factor, divided by 2,000, exceeds (ii) the number of allowances allocated for the unit pursuant to paragraph (2) and section 7651b(a)(1) of this title as basic Phase II allowance allocations.

(C) An operating company with units subject to the emissions limitation requirements of this subsection may elect the allocation of allowances as provided under subparagraphs (A) and (B). Such election shall apply to the annual allowance allocation for each and every unit in the operating company subject to the emissions limitation requirements of this subsection. The Administrator shall allocate allowances pursuant to subparagraphs (A) and (B) only in accordance with this subparagraph.

(4) Notwithstanding any other provision of this section, at the election of the owner or operator, after January 1, 2000, the Administrator shall allocate in lieu of allocation, pursuant to paragraph (1), (2), (3), (5), or (6),<sup>2</sup> allowances for a unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of this subsection which commenced commercial operation on or after January 1, 1981 and before December 31, 1985, which was subject to, and in compliance with, section 7411 of this title in an amount equal to the unit's annual fuel consumption, on a Btu basis, at a 65 percent capacity factor multiplied by the unit's allowable 1985 emissions rate, divided by 2,000.

(5) For the purposes of this section, in the case of an oil- and gas-fired unit which has been awarded a clean coal technology demonstration grant as of January 1, 1991, by the United States Department of Energy, beginning January 1, 2000, the Administrator shall allocate for the unit allowances in an amount equal to the unit's baseline multiplied by 1.20 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000.

**(e) Oil and gas-fired units equal to or greater than 0.60 lbs/mmBtu and less than 1.20 lbs/mmBtu**

After January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for any existing oil and gas-fired utility unit the lesser of whose actual or allowable 1985 sulfur dioxide emission rate is equal to, or greater than, 0.60 lbs/mmBtu, but less than 1.20 lbs/mmBtu to exceed an annual sulfur dioxide tonnage limitation equal to the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by (A) the lesser of the unit's allowable 1985 emissions rate or its actual 1985 emissions rate and (B) a numerical factor of 120 percent divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator of such unit holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

**(f) Oil and gas-fired units less than 0.60 lbs/mmBtu**

(1) After January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for any oil and gas-fired existing utility unit the lesser of whose actual or allowable 1985 emission rate is less than 0.60 lbs/mmBtu and whose average annual fuel consumption during the period 1980 through 1989 on a Btu basis was 90 percent or less in the form of natural gas to exceed an annual sulfur dioxide tonnage emissions limitation equal to the product of the unit's baseline

multiplied by (A) the lesser of 0.60 lbs/mmBtu or the unit's allowable 1985 emissions, and (B) a numerical factor of 120 percent, divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator of such unit holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

(2) In addition to allowances allocated pursuant to paragraph (1) as basic Phase II allowance allocations and section 7651b(a)(1) of this title, beginning January 1, 2000, the Administrator shall,<sup>3</sup> in the case of any unit operated by a utility that furnishes electricity, electric energy, steam, and natural gas within an area consisting of a city and 1 contiguous county, and in the case of any unit owned by a State authority, the output of which unit is furnished within that same area consisting of a city and 1 contiguous county, the Administrator shall allocate for each unit in the utility its pro rata share of 7,000 allowances and for each unit in the State authority its pro rata share of 2,000 allowances.

**(g) Units that commence operation between 1986 and December 31, 1995**

(1) After January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for any utility unit that has commenced commercial operation on or after January 1, 1986, but not later than September 30, 1990 to exceed an annual tonnage emission limitation equal to the product of the unit's annual fuel consumption, on a Btu basis, at a 65 percent capacity factor multiplied by the unit's allowable 1985 sulfur dioxide emission rate (converted, if necessary, to pounds per mmBtu), divided by 2,000 unless the owner or operator of such unit holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

(2) After January 1, 2000, the Administrator shall allocate allowances pursuant to section 7651b of this title to each unit which is listed in table B of this paragraph in an annual amount equal to the amount specified in table B.

TABLE B

Unit	Allowances
Brandon Shores .....	8,907
Miller 4 .....	9,197
TNP One 2 .....	4,000
Zimmer 1 .....	18,458
Spruce 1 .....	7,647
Clover 1 .....	2,796
Clover 2 .....	2,796
Twin Oak 2 .....	1,760
Twin Oak 1 .....	9,158
Cross 1 .....	6,401
Malakoff 1 .....	1,759

Notwithstanding any other paragraph of this subsection, for units subject to this paragraph, the Administrator shall not allocate allowances pursuant to any other paragraph of this subsection, Provided<sup>4</sup> that the owner or operator of a unit listed on Table B may elect an allocation of allowances under another paragraph of this subsection in lieu of an allocation under this paragraph.

(3) Beginning January 1, 2000, the Administrator shall allocate to the owner or operator of any utility unit that commences commercial operation, or has commenced commercial oper-

<sup>2</sup>So in original. This subsection does not contain a paragraph (6).

<sup>3</sup>So in original. The words "the Administrator shall," probably should not appear.

<sup>4</sup>So in original. Probably should not be capitalized.

ation, on or after October 1, 1990, but not later than December 31, 1992 allowances in an amount equal to the product of the unit's annual fuel consumption, on a Btu basis, at a 65 percent capacity factor multiplied by the lesser of 0.30 lbs/mmBtu or the unit's allowable sulfur dioxide emission rate (converted, if necessary, to pounds per mmBtu), divided by 2,000.

(4) Beginning January 1, 2000, the Administrator shall allocate to the owner or operator of any utility unit that has commenced construction before December 31, 1990 and that commences commercial operation between January 1, 1993 and December 31, 1995, allowances in an amount equal to the product of the unit's annual fuel consumption, on a Btu basis, at a 65 percent capacity factor multiplied by the lesser of 0.30 lbs/mmBtu or the unit's allowable sulfur dioxide emission rate (converted, if necessary, to pounds per mmBtu), divided by 2,000.

(5) After January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for any existing utility unit that has completed conversion from predominantly gas fired existing operation to coal fired operation between January 1, 1985 and December 31, 1987, for which there has been allocated a proposed or final prohibition order pursuant to section 301(b)<sup>5</sup> of the Powerplant and Industrial Fuel Use Act of 1978 (42 U.S.C. 8301 et seq.,<sup>6</sup> repealed 1987) to exceed an annual sulfur dioxide tonnage emissions limitation equal to the product of the unit's annual fuel consumption, on a Btu basis, at a 65 percent capacity factor multiplied by the lesser of 1.20 lbs/mmBtu or the unit's allowable 1987 sulfur dioxide emissions rate, divided by 2,000, unless the owner or operator of such unit has obtained allowances equal to its actual emissions.

(6)(A)<sup>7</sup> Unless the Administrator has approved a designation of such facility under section 7651i of this title, the provisions of this subchapter shall not apply to a "qualifying small power production facility" or "qualifying cogeneration facility" (within the meaning of section 796(17)(C) or 796(18)(B) of title 16) or to a "new independent power production facility" as defined in section 7651o of this title except<sup>8</sup> that clause (iii)<sup>9</sup> of such definition in section 7651o of this title shall not apply for purposes of this paragraph if, as of November 15, 1990,

(i) an applicable power sales agreement has been executed;

(ii) the facility is the subject of a State regulatory authority order requiring an electric utility to enter into a power sales agreement with, purchase capacity from, or (for purposes of establishing terms and conditions of the electric utility's purchase of power) enter into arbitration concerning, the facility;

(iii) an electric utility has issued a letter of intent or similar instrument committing to purchase power from the facility at a previously offered or lower price and a power sales agreement is executed within a reasonable period of time; or

(iv) the facility has been selected as a winning bidder in a utility competitive bid solicitation.

<sup>5</sup> See References in Text note below.

<sup>6</sup> So in original. Probably should be "seq.,".

<sup>7</sup> So in original. No subpar. (B) has been enacted.

<sup>8</sup> So in original. Probably should be preceded by a comma.

<sup>9</sup> So in original. Probably means clause "(C)".

#### (h) Oil and gas-fired units less than 10 percent oil consumed

(1) After January 1, 2000, it shall be unlawful for any oil- and gas-fired utility unit whose average annual fuel consumption during the period 1980 through 1989 on a Btu basis exceeded 90 percent in the form of natural gas to exceed an annual sulfur dioxide tonnage limitation equal to the product of the unit's baseline multiplied by the unit's actual 1985 emissions rate divided by 2,000 unless the owner or operator of such unit holds allowances to emit not less than the unit's total annual emissions.

(2) In addition to allowances allocated pursuant to paragraph (1) and section 7651b(a)(1) of this title as basic Phase II allowance allocations, beginning January 1, 2000, and for each calendar year thereafter until and including 2009, the Administrator shall allocate annually for each unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of paragraph (1) allowances from the reserve created pursuant to subsection (a)(2) of this section in an amount equal to the unit's baseline multiplied by 0.050 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000.

(3) In addition to allowances allocated pursuant to paragraph (1) and section 7651b(a)(1) of this title, beginning January 1, 2010, the Administrator shall allocate annually for each unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of paragraph (1) allowances in an amount equal to the unit's baseline multiplied by 0.050 lbs/mmBtu, divided by 2,000.

#### (i) Units in high growth States

(1) In addition to allowances allocated pursuant to this section and section 7651b(a)(1) of this title as basic Phase II allowance allocations, beginning January 1, 2000, the Administrator shall allocate annually allowances for each unit, subject to an emissions limitation requirement under this section, and located in a State that—

(A) has experienced a growth in population in excess of 25 percent between 1980 and 1988 according to State Population and Household Estimates, With Age, Sex, and Components of Change: 1981-1988 allocated by the United States Department of Commerce, and

(B) had an installed electrical generating capacity of more than 30,000,000 kw in 1988,

in an amount equal to the difference between (A) the number of allowances that would be allocated for the unit pursuant to the emissions limitation requirements of this section applicable to the unit adjusted to reflect the unit's annual average fuel consumption on a Btu basis of any three consecutive calendar years between 1980 and 1989 (inclusive) as elected by the owner or operator and (B) the number of allowances allocated for the unit pursuant to the emissions limitation requirements of this section: *Provided*, That the number of allowances allocated pursuant to this subsection shall not exceed an annual total of 40,000. If necessary to meeting the 40,000 allowance restriction imposed under this subsection the Administrator shall reduce, pro rata, the additional annual allowances allocated to each unit under this subsection.

(2) Beginning January 1, 2000, in addition to allowances allocated pursuant to this section and section 7651b(a)(1) of this title as basic Phase II

allowance allocations, the Administrator shall allocate annually for each unit subject to the emissions limitation requirements of subsection (b)(1) of this section. (A) the lesser of whose actual or allowable 1980 emissions rate has declined by 50 percent or more as of November 15, 1990, (B) whose actual emissions rate is less than 1.2 lbs/mmBtu as of January 1, 2000, (C) which commenced operation after January 1, 1970, (D) which is owned by a utility company whose combined commercial and industrial kilowatt-hour sales have increased by more than 20 percent between calendar year 1980 and November 15, 1990, and (E) whose company-wide fossil-fuel sulfur dioxide emissions rate has declined 40 percent or more from 1980 to 1988, allowances in an amount equal to the difference between (i) the number of allowances that would be allocated for the unit pursuant to the emissions limitation requirements of subsection (b)(1) of this section adjusted to reflect the unit's annual average fuel consumption on a Btu basis for any three consecutive years between 1980 and 1989 (inclusive) as elected by the owner or operator and (ii) the number of allowances allocated for the unit pursuant to the emissions limitation requirements of subsection (b)(1) of this section: *Provided*, That the number of allowances allocated pursuant to this paragraph shall not exceed an annual total of 5,000. If necessary to meeting the 5,000-allowance restriction imposed in the last clause of the preceding sentence the Administrator shall reduce, pro rata, the additional allowances allocated to each unit pursuant to this paragraph.

**(j) Certain municipally owned power plants**

Beginning January 1, 2000, in addition to allowances allocated pursuant to this section and section 7651b(a)(1) of this title as basic Phase II allowance allocations, the Administrator shall allocate annually for each existing municipally owned oil and gas-fired utility unit with nameplate capacity equal to, or less than, 40 MWe, the lesser of whose actual or allowable 1985 sulfur dioxide emission rate is less than 1.20 lbs/mmBtu, allowances in an amount equal to the product of the unit's annual fuel consumption on a Btu basis at a 60 percent capacity factor multiplied by the lesser of its allowable 1985 emission rate or its actual 1985 emission rate, divided by 2,000.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title IV, §405, as added Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §401, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2605.)

REFERENCES IN TEXT

Section 301(b) of the Powerplant and Industrial Fuel Use Act of 1978, referred to in subsec. (g)(5), is section 301(b) of Pub. L. 95-620, which is classified to section 8341(b) of this title. A prior section 301(b) of Pub. L. 95-620, title III, Nov. 9, 1978, 92 Stat. 3305, which was formerly classified to section 8341(b) of this title, was repealed by Pub. L. 97-35, title X, §1021(a), Aug. 13, 1981, 95 Stat. 614.

**§ 7651e. Allowances for States with emissions rates at or below 0.80 lbs/mmBtu**

**(a) Election of Governor**

In addition to basic Phase II allowance allocations, upon the election of the Governor of any

State, with a 1985 state-wide annual sulfur dioxide emissions rate equal to or less than, 0.80 lbs/mmBtu, averaged over all fossil fuel-fired utility steam generating units, beginning January 1, 2000, and for each calendar year thereafter until and including 2009, the Administrator shall allocate, in lieu of other Phase II bonus allowance allocations, allowances from the reserve created pursuant to section 7651d(a)(2) of this title to all such units in the State in an amount equal to 125,000 multiplied by the unit's pro rata share of electricity generated in calendar year 1985 at fossil fuel-fired utility steam units in all States eligible for the election.

**(b) Notification of Administrator**

Pursuant to section 7651b(a)(1) of this title, each Governor of a State eligible to make an election under paragraph<sup>1</sup> (a) shall notify the Administrator of such election. In the event that the Governor of any such State fails to notify the Administrator of the Governor's elections, the Administrator shall allocate allowances pursuant to section 7651d of this title.

**(c) Allowances after January 1, 2010**

After January 1, 2010, the Administrator shall allocate allowances to units subject to the provisions of this section pursuant to section 7651d of this title.

(July 14, 1955, ch. 360, title IV, §406, as added Pub. L. 101-549, title IV, §401, Nov. 15, 1990, 104 Stat. 2613.)

**§ 7651f. Nitrogen oxides emission reduction program**

**(a) Applicability**

On the date that a coal-fired utility unit becomes an affected unit pursuant to sections 7651c, 7651d,<sup>1</sup> 7651h of this title, or on the date a unit subject to the provisions of section 7651c(d) or 7651h(b) of this title, must meet the SO<sub>2</sub> reduction requirements, each such unit shall become an affected unit for purposes of this section and shall be subject to the emission limitations for nitrogen oxides set forth herein.

**(b) Emission limitations**

(1) Not later than eighteen months after November 15, 1990, the Administrator shall by regulation establish annual allowable emission limitations for nitrogen oxides for the types of utility boilers listed below, which limitations shall not exceed the rates listed below: *Provided*, That the Administrator may set a rate higher than that listed for any type of utility boiler if the Administrator finds that the maximum listed rate for that boiler type cannot be achieved using low NO<sub>x</sub> burner technology. The maximum allowable emission rates are as follows:

(A) for tangentially fired boilers, 0.45 lb/mmBtu;

(B) for dry bottom wall-fired boilers (other than units applying cell burner technology), 0.50 lb/mmBtu.

After January 1, 1995, it shall be unlawful for any unit that is an affected unit on that date

<sup>1</sup> So in original. Probably should be "subsection".

<sup>1</sup> So in original. Probably should be followed by "or".



**§ 60.15**

amended prior to the change. Conversion to coal required for energy considerations, as specified in section 111(a)(8) of the Act, shall not be considered a modification.

(5) The addition or use of any system or device whose primary function is the reduction of air pollutants, except when an emission control system is removed or is replaced by a system which the Administrator determines to be less environmentally beneficial.

(6) The relocation or change in ownership of an existing facility.

(f) Special provisions set forth under an applicable subpart of this part shall supersede any conflicting provisions of this section.

(g) Within 180 days of the completion of any physical or operational change subject to the control measures specified in paragraph (a) of this section, compliance with all applicable standards must be achieved.

(h) No physical change, or change in the method of operation, at an existing electric utility steam generating unit shall be treated as a modification for the purposes of this section provided that such change does not increase the maximum hourly emissions of any pollutant regulated under this section above the maximum hourly emissions achievable at that unit during the 5 years prior to the change.

(i) Repowering projects that are awarded funding from the Department of Energy as permanent clean coal technology demonstration projects (or similar projects funded by EPA) are exempt from the requirements of this section provided that such change does not increase the maximum hourly emissions of any pollutant regulated under this section above the maximum hourly emissions achievable at that unit during the five years prior to the change.

(j)(1) Repowering projects that qualify for an extension under section 409(b) of the Clean Air Act are exempt from the requirements of this section, provided that such change does not increase the actual hourly emissions of any pollutant regulated under this section above the actual hourly emissions achievable at that unit during the 5 years prior to the change.

**40 CFR Ch. I (7-1-15 Edition)**

(2) This exemption shall not apply to any new unit that:

(i) Is designated as a replacement for an existing unit;

(ii) Qualifies under section 409(b) of the Clean Air Act for an extension of an emission limitation compliance date under section 405 of the Clean Air Act; and

(iii) Is located at a different site than the existing unit.

(k) The installation, operation, cessation, or removal of a temporary clean coal technology demonstration project is exempt from the requirements of this section. A *temporary clean coal control technology demonstration project*, for the purposes of this section is a clean coal technology demonstration project that is operated for a period of 5 years or less, and which complies with the State implementation plan for the State in which the project is located and other requirements necessary to attain and maintain the national ambient air quality standards during the project and after it is terminated.

(l) The reactivation of a very clean coal-fired electric utility steam generating unit is exempt from the requirements of this section.

[40 FR 58419, Dec. 16, 1975, as amended at 43 FR 34347, Aug. 3, 1978; 45 FR 5617, Jan. 23, 1980; 57 FR 32339, July 21, 1992; 65 FR 61750, Oct. 17, 2000]

**§ 60.15 Reconstruction.**

(a) An existing facility, upon reconstruction, becomes an affected facility, irrespective of any change in emission rate.

(b) “Reconstruction” means the replacement of components of an existing facility to such an extent that:

(1) The fixed capital cost of the new components exceeds 50 percent of the fixed capital cost that would be required to construct a comparable entirely new facility, and

(2) It is technologically and economically feasible to meet the applicable standards set forth in this part.

(c) “Fixed capital cost” means the capital needed to provide all the depreciable components.

(d) If an owner or operator of an existing facility proposes to replace components, and the fixed capital cost of

**Environmental Protection Agency**

**§ 60.16**

the new components exceeds 50 percent of the fixed capital cost that would be required to construct a comparable entirely new facility, he shall notify the Administrator of the proposed replacements. The notice must be postmarked 60 days (or as soon as practicable) before construction of the replacements is commenced and must include the following information:

(1) Name and address of the owner or operator.

(2) The location of the existing facility.

(3) A brief description of the existing facility and the components which are to be replaced.

(4) A description of the existing air pollution control equipment and the proposed air pollution control equipment.

(5) An estimate of the fixed capital cost of the replacements and of constructing a comparable entirely new facility.

(6) The estimated life of the existing facility after the replacements.

(7) A discussion of any economic or technical limitations the facility may have in complying with the applicable standards of performance after the proposed replacements.

(e) The Administrator will determine, within 30 days of the receipt of the notice required by paragraph (d) of this section and any additional information he may reasonably require, whether the proposed replacement constitutes reconstruction.

(f) The Administrator's determination under paragraph (e) shall be based on:

(1) The fixed capital cost of the replacements in comparison to the fixed capital cost that would be required to construct a comparable entirely new facility;

(2) The estimated life of the facility after the replacements compared to the life of a comparable entirely new facility;

(3) The extent to which the components being replaced cause or contribute to the emissions from the facility; and

(4) Any economic or technical limitations on compliance with applicable standards of performance which are inherent in the proposed replacements.

(g) Individual subparts of this part may include specific provisions which refine and delimit the concept of reconstruction set forth in this section.

[40 FR 58420, Dec. 16, 1975]

**§ 60.16 Priority list.**

**PRIORITIZED MAJOR SOURCE CATEGORIES**

Priority Number <sup>1</sup>	Source Category
1.	Synthetic Organic Chemical Manufacturing Industry (SOCMI) and Volatile Organic Liquid Storage Vessels and Handling Equipment (a) SOCMI unit processes (b) Volatile organic liquid (VOL) storage vessels and handling equipment (c) SOCMI fugitive sources (d) SOCMI secondary sources
2.	Industrial Surface Coating: Cans
3.	Petroleum Refineries: Fugitive Sources
4.	Industrial Surface Coating: Paper
5.	Dry Cleaning (a) Perchloroethylene (b) Petroleum solvent
6.	Graphic Arts
7.	Polymers and Resins: Acrylic Resins
8.	Mineral Wool (Deleted)
9.	Stationary Internal Combustion Engines
10.	Industrial Surface Coating: Fabric
11.	Industrial-Commercial-Institutional Steam Generating Units.
12.	Incineration: Non-Municipal (Deleted)
13.	Non-Metallic Mineral Processing
14.	Metallic Mineral Processing
15.	Secondary Copper (Deleted)
16.	Phosphate Rock Preparation
17.	Foundries: Steel and Gray Iron
18.	Polymers and Resins: Polyethylene
19.	Charcoal Production
20.	Synthetic Rubber (a) Tire manufacture (b) SBR production
21.	Vegetable Oil
22.	Industrial Surface Coating: Metal Coil
23.	Petroleum Transportation and Marketing
24.	By-Product Coke Ovens
25.	Synthetic Fibers
26.	Plywood Manufacture
27.	Industrial Surface Coating: Automobiles
28.	Industrial Surface Coating: Large Appliances
29.	Crude Oil and Natural Gas Production
30.	Secondary Aluminum
31.	Potash (Deleted)
32.	Lightweight Aggregate Industry: Clay, Shale, and Slate <sup>2</sup>
33.	Glass
34.	Gypsum
35.	Sodium Carbonate
36.	Secondary Zinc (Deleted)
37.	Polymers and Resins: Phenolic
38.	Polymers and Resins: Urea-Melamine
39.	Ammonia (Deleted)
40.	Polymers and Resins: Polystyrene
41.	Polymers and Resins: ABS-SAN Resins
42.	Fiberglass
43.	Polymers and Resins: Polypropylene
44.	Textile Processing
45.	Asphalt Processing and Asphalt Roofing Manufacture
46.	Brick and Related Clay Products

**Pt. 60, Subpt. A, Table 1**

**40 CFR Ch. I (7-1-15 Edition)**

time periods or deadlines may be changed by mutual agreement between the owner or operator and the Administrator. An owner or operator who wishes to request a change in a time period or postmark deadline for a particular requirement shall request the adjustment in writing as soon as practicable before the subject activity is required to take place. The owner or operator shall include in the request whatever information he or she considers useful to convince the Administrator that an adjustment is warranted.

(3) If, in the Administrator's judgment, an owner or operator's request for an adjustment to a particular time period or postmark deadline is warranted, the Administrator will approve the adjustment. The Administrator will notify the owner or operator in writing of approval or disapproval of the request for an adjustment within 15 calendar days of receiving sufficient information to evaluate the request.

(4) If the Administrator is unable to meet a specified deadline, he or she will notify the owner or operator of any significant delay and inform the owner or operator of the amended schedule.

[59 FR 12428, Mar. 16, 1994, as amended at 64 FR 7463, Feb. 12, 1998]

**TABLE 1 TO SUBPART A OF PART 60—DETECTION SENSITIVITY LEVELS (GRAMS PER HOUR)**

Monitoring frequency per subpart <sup>a</sup>	Detection sensitivity level
Bi-Monthly .....	60
Semi-Quarterly .....	85
Monthly .....	100

<sup>a</sup>When this alternative work practice is used to identify leaking equipment, the owner or operator must choose one of the monitoring frequencies listed in this table in lieu of the monitoring frequency specified in the applicable subpart. Bi-monthly means every other month. Semi-quarterly means twice per quarter. Monthly means once per month.

[73 FR 78211, Dec. 22, 2008]

**Subpart B—Adoption and Submittal of State Plans for Designated Facilities**

SOURCE: 40 FR 53346, Nov. 17, 1975, unless otherwise noted.

**§ 60.20 Applicability.**

The provisions of this subpart apply to States upon publication of a final guideline document under § 60.22(a).

**§ 60.21 Definitions.**

Terms used but not defined in this subpart shall have the meaning given them in the Act and in subpart A:

(a) *Designated pollutant* means any air pollutant, the emissions of which are subject to a standard of performance for new stationary sources, but for which air quality criteria have not been issued and that is not included on a list published under section 108(a) or section 112(b)(1)(A) of the Act.

(b) *Designated facility* means any existing facility (see § 60.2(aa)) which emits a designated pollutant and which would be subject to a standard of performance for that pollutant if the existing facility were an affected facility (see § 60.2(e)).

(c) *Plan* means a plan under section 111(d) of the Act which establishes emission standards for designated pollutants from designated facilities and provides for the implementation and enforcement of such emission standards.

(d) *Applicable plan* means the plan, or most recent revision thereof, which has been approved under § 60.27(b) or promulgated under § 60.27(d).

(e) *Emission guideline* means a guideline set forth in subpart C of this part, or in a final guideline document published under § 60.22(a), which reflects the degree of emission reduction achievable through the application of the best system of emission reduction which (taking into account the cost of such reduction) the Administrator has determined has been adequately demonstrated for designated facilities.

(f) *Emission standard* means a legally enforceable regulation setting forth an allowable rate of emissions into the atmosphere, establishing an allowance system, or prescribing equipment specifications for control of air pollution emissions.

(g) *Compliance schedule* means a legally enforceable schedule specifying a date or dates by which a source or category of sources must comply with specific emission standards contained in a



**Environmental Protection Agency****§ 60.22**

plan or with any increments of progress to achieve such compliance.

(h) *Increments of progress* means steps to achieve compliance which must be taken by an owner or operator of a designated facility, including:

(1) Submittal of a final control plan for the designated facility to the appropriate air pollution control agency;

(2) Awarding of contracts for emission control systems or for process modifications, or issuance of orders for the purchase of component parts to accomplish emission control or process modification;

(3) Initiation of on-site construction or installation of emission control equipment or process change;

(4) Completion of on-site construction or installation of emission control equipment or process change; and

(5) Final compliance.

(i) *Region* means an air quality control region designated under section 107 of the Act and described in part 81 of this chapter.

(j) *Local agency* means any local governmental agency.

[40 FR 53346, Nov. 17, 1975, as amended at 70 FR 28649, May 18, 2005; 77 FR 9447, Feb. 16, 2012]

**§ 60.22 Publication of guideline documents, emission guidelines, and final compliance times.**

(a) Concurrently upon or after proposal of standards of performance for the control of a designated pollutant from affected facilities, the Administrator will publish a draft guideline document containing information pertinent to control of the designated pollutant from designated facilities. Notice of the availability of the draft guideline document will be published in the FEDERAL REGISTER and public comments on its contents will be invited. After consideration of public comments and upon or after promulgation of standards of performance for control of a designated pollutant from affected facilities, a final guideline document will be published and notice of its availability will be published in the FEDERAL REGISTER.

(b) Guideline documents published under this section will provide information for the development of State plans, such as:

(1) Information concerning known or suspected endangerment of public health or welfare caused, or contributed to, by the designated pollutant.

(2) A description of systems of emission reduction which, in the judgment of the Administrator, have been adequately demonstrated.

(3) Information on the degree of emission reduction which is achievable with each system, together with information on the costs and environmental effects of applying each system to designated facilities.

(4) Incremental periods of time normally expected to be necessary for the design, installation, and startup of identified control systems.

(5) An emission guideline that reflects the application of the best system of emission reduction (considering the cost of such reduction) that has been adequately demonstrated for designated facilities, and the time within which compliance with emission standards of equivalent stringency can be achieved. The Administrator will specify different emission guidelines or compliance times or both for different sizes, types, and classes of designated facilities when costs of control, physical limitations, geographical location, or similar factors make subcategorization appropriate. (6) Such other available information as the Administrator determines may contribute to the formulation of State plans.

(c) Except as provided in paragraph (d)(1) of this section, the emission guidelines and compliance times referred to in paragraph (b)(5) of this section will be proposed for comment upon publication of the draft guideline document, and after consideration of comments will be promulgated in subpart C of this part with such modifications as may be appropriate.

(d)(1) If the Administrator determines that a designated pollutant may cause or contribute to endangerment of public welfare, but that adverse effects on public health have not been demonstrated, he will include the determination in the draft guideline document and in the FEDERAL REGISTER notice of its availability. Except as provided in paragraph (d)(2) of this section, paragraph (c) of this section shall be inapplicable in such cases.

**§ 60.23****40 CFR Ch. I (7–1–15 Edition)**

(2) If the Administrator determines at any time on the basis of new information that a prior determination under paragraph (d)(1) of this section is incorrect or no longer correct, he will publish notice of the determination in the FEDERAL REGISTER, revise the guideline document as necessary under paragraph (a) of this section, and propose and promulgate emission guidelines and compliance times under paragraph (c) of this section.

[40 FR 53346, Nov. 17, 1975, as amended at 54 FR 52189, Dec. 20, 1989]

**§ 60.23 Adoption and submittal of State plans; public hearings.**

(a)(1) Unless otherwise specified in the applicable subpart, within 9 months after notice of the availability of a final guideline document is published under § 60.22(a), each State shall adopt and submit to the Administrator, in accordance with § 60.4 of subpart A of this part, a plan for the control of the designated pollutant to which the guideline document applies.

(2) Within nine months after notice of the availability of a final revised guideline document is published as provided in § 60.22(d)(2), each State shall adopt and submit to the Administrator any plan revision necessary to meet the requirements of this subpart.

(b) If no designated facility is located within a State, the State shall submit a letter of certification to that effect to the Administrator within the time specified in paragraph (a) of this section. Such certification shall exempt the State from the requirements of this subpart for that designated pollutant.

(c)(1) Except as provided in paragraphs (c)(2) and (c)(3) of this section, the State shall, prior to the adoption of any plan or revision thereof, conduct one or more public hearings within the State on such plan or plan revision.

(2) No hearing shall be required for any change to an increment of progress in an approved compliance schedule unless the change is likely to cause the facility to be unable to comply with the final compliance date in the schedule.

(3) No hearing shall be required on an emission standard in effect prior to the effective date of this subpart if it was adopted after a public hearing and is at

least as stringent as the corresponding emission guideline specified in the applicable guideline document published under § 60.22(a).

(d) Any hearing required by paragraph (c) of this section shall be held only after reasonable notice. Notice shall be given at least 30 days prior to the date of such hearing and shall include:

(1) Notification to the public by prominently advertising the date, time, and place of such hearing in each region affected;

(2) Availability, at the time of public announcement, of each proposed plan or revision thereof for public inspection in at least one location in each region to which it will apply;

(3) Notification to the Administrator;

(4) Notification to each local air pollution control agency in each region to which the plan or revision will apply; and

(5) In the case of an interstate region, notification to any other State included in the region.

(e) The State shall prepare and retain, for a minimum of 2 years, a record of each hearing for inspection by any interested party. The record shall contain, as a minimum, a list of witnesses together with the text of each presentation.

(f) The State shall submit with the plan or revision:

(1) Certification that each hearing required by paragraph (c) of this section was held in accordance with the notice required by paragraph (d) of this section; and

(2) A list of witnesses and their organizational affiliations, if any, appearing at the hearing and a brief written summary of each presentation or written submission.

(g) Upon written application by a State agency (through the appropriate Regional Office), the Administrator may approve State procedures designed to insure public participation in the matters for which hearings are required and public notification of the opportunity to participate if, in the judgment of the Administrator, the procedures, although different from the requirements of this subpart, in fact

**Environmental Protection Agency****§ 60.24**

provide for adequate notice to and participation of the public. The Administrator may impose such conditions on his approval as he deems necessary. Procedures approved under this section shall be deemed to satisfy the requirements of this subpart regarding procedures for public hearings.

[40 FR 53346, Nov. 17, 1975, as amended at 60 FR 65414, Dec. 19, 1995]

**§ 60.24 Emission standards and compliance schedules.**

(a) Each plan shall include emission standards and compliance schedules.

(b) (1) Emission standards shall either be based on an allowance system or prescribe allowable rates of emissions except when it is clearly impracticable. Such cases will be identified in the guideline documents issued under § 60.22. Where emission standards prescribing equipment specifications are established, the plan shall, to the degree possible, set forth the emission reductions achievable by implementation of such specifications, and may permit compliance by the use of equipment determined by the State to be equivalent to that prescribed.

(2) Test methods and procedures for determining compliance with the emission standards shall be specified in the plan. Methods other than those specified in appendix A to this part may be specified in the plan if shown to be equivalent or alternative methods as defined in § 60.2 (t) and (u).

(3) Emission standards shall apply to all designated facilities within the State. A plan may contain emission standards adopted by local jurisdictions provided that the standards are enforceable by the State.

(c) Except as provided in paragraph (f) of this section, where the Administrator has determined that a designated pollutant may cause or contribute to endangerment of public health, emission standards shall be no less stringent than the corresponding emission guideline(s) specified in subpart C of this part, and final compliance shall be required as expeditiously as practicable but no later than the compliance times specified in subpart C of this part.

(d) Where the Administrator has determined that a designated pollutant

may cause or contribute to endangerment of public welfare but that adverse effects on public health have not been demonstrated, States may balance the emission guidelines, compliance times, and other information provided in the applicable guideline document against other factors of public concern in establishing emission standards, compliance schedules, and variances. Appropriate consideration shall be given to the factors specified in § 60.22(b) and to information presented at the public hearing(s) conducted under § 60.23(c).

(e)(1) Any compliance schedule extending more than 12 months from the date required for submittal of the plan must include legally enforceable increments of progress to achieve compliance for each designated facility or category of facilities. Unless otherwise specified in the applicable subpart, increments of progress must include, where practicable, each increment of progress specified in § 60.21(h) and must include such additional increments of progress as may be necessary to permit close and effective supervision of progress toward final compliance.

(2) A plan may provide that compliance schedules for individual sources or categories of sources will be formulated after plan submittal. Any such schedule shall be the subject of a public hearing held according to § 60.23 and shall be submitted to the Administrator within 60 days after the date of adoption of the schedule but in no case later than the date prescribed for submittal of the first semiannual report required by § 60.25(e).

(f) Unless otherwise specified in the applicable subpart on a case-by-case basis for particular designated facilities or classes of facilities, States may provide for the application of less stringent emissions standards or longer compliance schedules than those otherwise required by paragraph (c) of this section, provided that the State demonstrates with respect to each such facility (or class of facilities):

(1) Unreasonable cost of control resulting from plant age, location, or basic process design;

(2) Physical impossibility of installing necessary control equipment; or

**§ 60.25**

(3) Other factors specific to the facility (or class of facilities) that make application of a less stringent standard or final compliance time significantly more reasonable.

(g) Nothing in this subpart shall be construed to preclude any State or political subdivision thereof from adopting or enforcing (1) emission standards more stringent than emission guidelines specified in subpart C of this part or in applicable guideline documents or (2) compliance schedules requiring final compliance at earlier times than those specified in subpart C or in applicable guideline documents.

[40 FR 53346, Nov. 17, 1975, as amended at 60 FR 65414, Dec. 19, 1995; 65 FR 76384, Dec. 6, 2000; 70 FR 28649, May 18, 2005; 71 FR 33398, June 9, 2006; 72 FR 59204, Oct. 19, 2007; 77 FR 9447, Feb. 16, 2012]

**§ 60.25 Emission inventories, source surveillance, reports.**

(a) Each plan shall include an inventory of all designated facilities, including emission data for the designated pollutants and information related to emissions as specified in appendix D to this part. Such data shall be summarized in the plan, and emission rates of designated pollutants from designated facilities shall be correlated with applicable emission standards. As used in this subpart, “correlated” means presented in such a manner as to show the relationship between measured or estimated amounts of emissions and the amounts of such emissions allowable under applicable emission standards.

(b) Each plan shall provide for monitoring the status of compliance with applicable emission standards. Each plan shall, as a minimum, provide for:

(1) Legally enforceable procedures for requiring owners or operators of designated facilities to maintain records and periodically report to the State information on the nature and amount of emissions from such facilities, and/or such other information as may be necessary to enable the State to determine whether such facilities are in compliance with applicable portions of the plan. Submission of electronic documents shall comply with the requirements of 40 CFR part 3—(Electronic reporting).

**40 CFR Ch. I (7–1–15 Edition)**

(2) Periodic inspection and, when applicable, testing of designated facilities.

(c) Each plan shall provide that information obtained by the State under paragraph (b) of this section shall be correlated with applicable emission standards (see § 60.25(a)) and made available to the general public.

(d) The provisions referred to in paragraphs (b) and (c) of this section shall be specifically identified. Copies of such provisions shall be submitted with the plan unless:

(1) They have been approved as portions of a preceding plan submitted under this subpart or as portions of an implementation plan submitted under section 110 of the Act, and

(2) The State demonstrates:

(i) That the provisions are applicable to the designated pollutant(s) for which the plan is submitted, and

(ii) That the requirements of § 60.26 are met.

(e) The State shall submit reports on progress in plan enforcement to the Administrator on an annual (calendar year) basis, commencing with the first full report period after approval of a plan or after promulgation of a plan by the Administrator. Information required under this paragraph must be included in the annual report required by § 51.321 of this chapter.

(f) Each progress report shall include:

(1) Enforcement actions initiated against designated facilities during the reporting period, under any emission standard or compliance schedule of the plan.

(2) Identification of the achievement of any increment of progress required by the applicable plan during the reporting period.

(3) Identification of designated facilities that have ceased operation during the reporting period.

(4) Submission of emission inventory data as described in paragraph (a) of this section for designated facilities that were not in operation at the time of plan development but began operation during the reporting period.

(5) Submission of additional data as necessary to update the information submitted under paragraph (a) of this section or in previous progress reports.



**Environmental Protection Agency****§ 60.27**

(6) Submission of copies of technical reports on all performance testing on designated facilities conducted under paragraph (b)(2) of this section, complete with concurrently recorded process data.

[40 FR 53346, Nov. 17, 1975, as amended at 44 FR 65071, Nov. 9, 1979; 70 FR 59887, Oct. 13, 2005]

**§ 60.26 Legal authority.**

(a) Each plan shall show that the State has legal authority to carry out the plan, including authority to:

(1) Adopt emission standards and compliance schedules applicable to designated facilities.

(2) Enforce applicable laws, regulations, standards, and compliance schedules, and seek injunctive relief.

(3) Obtain information necessary to determine whether designated facilities are in compliance with applicable laws, regulations, standards, and compliance schedules, including authority to require recordkeeping and to make inspections and conduct tests of designated facilities.

(4) Require owners or operators of designated facilities to install, maintain, and use emission monitoring devices and to make periodic reports to the State on the nature and amounts of emissions from such facilities; also authority for the State to make such data available to the public as reported and as correlated with applicable emission standards.

(b) The provisions of law or regulations which the State determines provide the authorities required by this section shall be specifically identified. Copies of such laws or regulations shall be submitted with the plan unless:

(1) They have been approved as portions of a preceding plan submitted under this subpart or as portions of an implementation plan submitted under section 110 of the Act, and

(2) The State demonstrates that the laws or regulations are applicable to the designated pollutant(s) for which the plan is submitted.

(c) The plan shall show that the legal authorities specified in this section are available to the State at the time of submission of the plan. Legal authority adequate to meet the requirements of paragraphs (a)(3) and (4) of this section

may be delegated to the State under section 114 of the Act.

(d) A State governmental agency other than the State air pollution control agency may be assigned responsibility for carrying out a portion of a plan if the plan demonstrates to the Administrator's satisfaction that the State governmental agency has the legal authority necessary to carry out that portion of the plan.

(e) The State may authorize a local agency to carry out a plan, or portion thereof, within the local agency's jurisdiction if the plan demonstrates to the Administrator's satisfaction that the local agency has the legal authority necessary to implement the plan or portion thereof, and that the authorization does not relieve the State of responsibility under the Act for carrying out the plan or portion thereof.

**§ 60.27 Actions by the Administrator.**

(a) The Administrator may, whenever he determines necessary, extend the period for submission of any plan or plan revision or portion thereof.

(b) After receipt of a plan or plan revision, the Administrator will propose the plan or revision for approval or disapproval. The Administrator will, within four months after the date required for submission of a plan or plan revision, approve or disapprove such plan or revision or each portion thereof.

(c) The Administrator will, after consideration of any State hearing record, promptly prepare and publish proposed regulations setting forth a plan, or portion thereof, for a State if:

(1) The State fails to submit a plan within the time prescribed;

(2) The State fails to submit a plan revision required by § 60.23(a)(2) within the time prescribed; or

(3) The Administrator disapproves the State plan or plan revision or any portion thereof, as unsatisfactory because the requirements of this subpart have not been met.

(d) The Administrator will, within six months after the date required for submission of a plan or plan revision, promulgate the regulations proposed under paragraph (c) of this section with



**§ 60.28**

such modifications as may be appropriate unless, prior to such promulgation, the State has adopted and submitted a plan or plan revision which the Administrator determines to be approvable.

(e)(1) Except as provided in paragraph (e)(2) of this section, regulations proposed and promulgated by the Administrator under this section will prescribe emission standards of the same stringency as the corresponding emission guideline(s) specified in the final guideline document published under § 60.22(a) and will require final compliance with such standards as expeditiously as practicable but no later than the times specified in the guideline document.

(2) Upon application by the owner or operator of a designated facility to which regulations proposed and promulgated under this section will apply, the Administrator may provide for the application of less stringent emission standards or longer compliance schedules than those otherwise required by this section in accordance with the criteria specified in § 60.24(f).

(f) Prior to promulgation of a plan under paragraph (d) of this section, the Administrator will provide the opportunity for at least one public hearing in either:

(1) Each State that failed to hold a public hearing as required by § 60.23(c); or

(2) Washington, DC or an alternate location specified in the FEDERAL REGISTER.

[40 FR 53346, Nov. 17, 1975, as amended at 65 FR 76384, Dec. 6, 2000]

**§ 60.28 Plan revisions by the State.**

(a) Plan revisions which have the effect of delaying compliance with applicable emission standards or increments of progress or of establishing less stringent emission standards shall be submitted to the Administrator within 60 days after adoption in accordance with the procedures and requirements applicable to development and submission of the original plan.

(b) More stringent emission standards, or orders which have the effect of accelerating compliance, may be submitted to the Administrator as plan revisions in accordance with the procedures and requirements applicable to

**40 CFR Ch. I (7-1-15 Edition)**

development and submission of the original plan.

(c) A revision of a plan, or any portion thereof, shall not be considered part of an applicable plan until approved by the Administrator in accordance with this subpart.

**§ 60.29 Plan revisions by the Administrator.**

After notice and opportunity for public hearing in each affected State, the Administrator may revise any provision of an applicable plan if:

(a) The provision was promulgated by the Administrator, and

(b) The plan, as revised, will be consistent with the Act and with the requirements of this subpart.

**Subpart C—Emission Guidelines and Compliance Times****§ 60.30 Scope.**

The following subparts contain emission guidelines and compliance times for the control of certain designated pollutants in accordance with section 111(d) and section 129 of the Clean Air Act and subpart B of this part.

(a) Subpart Ca [Reserved]

(b) Subpart Cb—Municipal Waste Combustors.

(c) Subpart Cc—Municipal Solid Waste Landfills.

(d) Subpart Cd—Sulfuric Acid Production Plants.

(e) Subpart Ce—Hospital/Medical/Infectious Waste Incinerators.

[62 FR 48379, Sept. 15, 1997]

**§ 60.31 Definitions.**

Terms used but not defined in this subpart have the meaning given them in the Act and in subparts A and B of this part.

[42 FR 55797, Oct. 18, 1977]

**Subpart Ca [Reserved]**

§ 60.30c

40 CFR Ch. I (7–1–15 Edition)

Municipal waste combustor technology	Carbon monoxide emissions levels (parts per million by volume) <sup>a</sup>	Averaging time (hrs) <sup>b</sup>
Fluidized bed, mixed fuel (wood/refuse-derived fuel) .....	200	c 24
Bubbling fluidized bed combustor .....	100	4
Circulating fluidized bed combustor .....	100	4
Pulverized coal/refuse-derived fuel mixed fuel-fired combustor .....	150	4
Spreader stoker coal/refuse-derived fuel mixed fuel-fired combustor .....	200	24
Semi-suspension refuse-derived fuel-fired combustor/wet refuse-derived fuel process conversion .....	250	c 24
Spreader stoker fixed floor refuse-derived fuel-fired combustor/100 percent coal capable .....	250	c 24

<sup>a</sup> Measured at the combustor outlet in conjunction with a measurement of oxygen concentration, corrected to 7 percent oxygen, dry basis. Calculated as an arithmetic average.  
<sup>b</sup> Averaging times are 4-hour or 24-hour block averages.  
<sup>c</sup> 24-hour block average, geometric mean.

[71 FR 27334, May 10, 2006]

**Subpart Cc—Emission Guidelines and Compliance Times for Municipal Solid Waste Landfills**

SOURCE: 61 FR 9919, Mar. 12, 1996, unless otherwise noted.

**§ 60.30c Scope.**

This subpart contains emission guidelines and compliance times for the control of certain designated pollutants from certain designated municipal solid waste landfills in accordance with section 111(d) of the Act and subpart B.

**§ 60.31c Definitions.**

Terms used but not defined in this subpart have the meaning given them in the Act and in subparts A, B, and WWW of this part.

*Municipal solid waste landfill* or *MSW landfill* means an entire disposal facility in a contiguous geographical space where household waste is placed in or on land. An MSW landfill may also receive other types of RCRA Subtitle D wastes such as commercial solid waste, nonhazardous sludge, conditionally exempt small quantity generator waste, and industrial solid waste. Portions of an MSW landfill may be separated by access roads. An MSW landfill may be publicly or privately owned. An MSW landfill may be a new MSW landfill, an existing MSW landfill or a lateral expansion.

**§ 60.32c Designated facilities.**

(a) The designated facility to which the guidelines apply is each existing MSW landfill for which construction, reconstruction or modification was commenced before May 30, 1991.

(b) Physical or operational changes made to an existing MSW landfill solely to comply with an emission guideline are not considered a modification or reconstruction and would not subject an existing MSW landfill to the requirements of subpart WWW [see § 60.750 of subpart WWW].

(c) For purposes of obtaining an operating permit under title V of the Act, the owner or operator of a MSW landfill subject to this subpart with a design capacity less than 2.5 million megagrams or 2.5 million cubic meters is not subject to the requirement to obtain an operating permit for the landfill under part 70 or 71 of this chapter, unless the landfill is otherwise subject to either part 70 or 71. For purposes of submitting a timely application for an operating permit under part 70 or 71, the owner or operator of a MSW landfill subject to this subpart with a design capacity greater than or equal to 2.5 million megagrams and 2.5 million cubic meters on the effective date of EPA approval of the State's program under section 111(d) of the Act, and not otherwise subject to either part 70 or 71, becomes subject to the requirements of §§ 70.5(a)(1)(i) or 71.5(a)(1)(i) of this chapter 90 days after the effective date of such 111(d) program approval, even if the design capacity report is submitted earlier.

**Environmental Protection Agency****§ 60.33c**

(d) When a MSW landfill subject to this subpart is closed, the owner or operator is no longer subject to the requirement to maintain an operating permit under part 70 or 71 of this chapter for the landfill if the landfill is not otherwise subject to the requirements of either part 70 or 71 and if either of the following conditions are met.

(1) The landfill was never subject to the requirement for a control system under § 60.33c(c) of this subpart; or

(2) The owner or operator meets the conditions for control system removal specified in § 60.752(b)(2)(v) of subpart WWW.

[61 FR 9919, Mar. 12, 1996, as amended at 63 FR 32750, June 16, 1998]

**§ 60.33c Emission guidelines for municipal solid waste landfill emissions.**

(a) For approval, a State plan shall include control of MSW landfill emissions at each MSW landfill meeting the following three conditions:

(1) The landfill has accepted waste at any time since November 8, 1987, or has additional design capacity available for future waste deposition;

(2) The landfill has a design capacity greater than or equal to 2.5 million megagrams and 2.5 million cubic meters. The landfill may calculate design capacity in either megagrams or cubic meters for comparison with the exemption values. Any density conversions shall be documented and submitted with the design capacity report; and

(3) The landfill has a nonmethane organic compound emission rate of 50 megagrams per year or more.

(b) For approval, a State plan shall include the installation of a collection and control system meeting the conditions provided in § 60.752(b)(2)(ii) of this part at each MSW landfill meeting the conditions in paragraph (a) of this section. The State plan shall include a process for State review and approval of the site-specific design plans for the gas collection and control system(s).

(c) For approval, a State plan shall include provisions for the control of collected MSW landfill emissions through the use of control devices meeting the requirements of paragraph (c)(1), (2), or (3) of this section, except as provided in § 60.24.

(1) An open flare designed and operated in accordance with the parameters established in § 60.18; or

(2) A control system designed and operated to reduce NMOC by 98 weight percent; or

(3) An enclosed combustor designed and operated to reduce the outlet NMOC concentration to 20 parts per million as hexane by volume, dry basis at 3 percent oxygen, or less.

(d) For approval, a State plan shall require each owner or operator of an MSW landfill having a design capacity less than 2.5 million megagrams by mass or 2.5 million cubic meters by volume to submit an initial design capacity report to the Administrator as provided in § 60.757(a)(2) of subpart WWW by the date specified in § 60.35c of this subpart. The landfill may calculate design capacity in either megagrams or cubic meters for comparison with the exemption values. Any density conversions shall be documented and submitted with the report. Submittal of the initial design capacity report shall fulfill the requirements of this subpart except as provided in paragraph (d)(1) and (d)(2) of this section.

(1) The owner or operator shall submit an amended design capacity report as provided in § 60.757(a)(3) of subpart WWW. [Guidance: Note that if the design capacity increase is the result of a modification, as defined in § 60.751 of subpart WWW, that was commenced on or after May 30, 1991, the landfill will become subject to subpart WWW instead of this subpart. If the design capacity increase is the result of a change in operating practices, density, or some other change that is not a modification, the landfill remains subject to this subpart.]

(2) When an increase in the maximum design capacity of a landfill with an initial design capacity less than 2.5 million megagrams or 2.5 million cubic meters results in a revised maximum design capacity equal to or greater than 2.5 million megagrams and 2.5 million cubic meters, the owner or operator shall comply with paragraph (e) of this section.

(e) For approval, a State plan shall require each owner or operator of an MSW landfill having a design capacity equal to or greater than 2.5 million

**§ 60.34c**

megagrams and 2.5 million cubic meters to either install a collection and control system as provided in paragraph (b) of this section and § 60.752(b)(2) of subpart WWW or calculate an initial NMOC emission rate for the landfill using the procedures specified in § 60.34c of this subpart and § 60.754 of subpart WWW. The NMOC emission rate shall be recalculated annually, except as provided in § 60.757(b)(1)(ii) of subpart WWW.

(1) If the calculated NMOC emission rate is less than 50 megagrams per year, the owner or operator shall:

(i) Submit an annual emission report, except as provided for in § 60.757(b)(1)(ii); and

(ii) Recalculate the NMOC emission rate annually using the procedures specified in § 60.754(a)(1) of subpart WWW until such time as the calculated NMOC emission rate is equal to or greater than 50 megagrams per year, or the landfill is closed.

(2)(i) If the NMOC emission rate, upon initial calculation or annual recalculation required in paragraph (e)(1)(ii) of this section, is equal to or greater than 50 megagrams per year, the owner or operator shall install a collection and control system as provided in paragraph (b) of this section and § 60.752(b)(2) of subpart WWW.

(ii) If the landfill is permanently closed, a closure notification shall be submitted to the Administrator as provided in § 60.35c of this subpart and § 60.757(d) of subpart WWW.

[61 FR 9919, Mar. 12, 1996, as amended at 63 FR 32750, June 16, 1998; 64 FR 9261, Feb. 24, 1999]

**§ 60.34c Test methods and procedures.**

For approval, a State plan shall include provisions for: the calculation of the landfill NMOC emission rate listed in § 60.754, as applicable, to determine whether the landfill meets the condition in § 60.33c(a)(3); the operational standards in § 60.753; the compliance provisions in § 60.755; and the monitoring provisions in § 60.756.

**§ 60.35c Reporting and recordkeeping guidelines.**

For approval, a State plan shall include the recordkeeping and reporting provisions listed in §§ 60.757 and 60.758,

**40 CFR Ch. I (7–1–15 Edition)**

as applicable, except as provided under § 60.24.

(a) For existing MSW landfills subject to this subpart the initial design capacity report shall be submitted no later than 90 days after the effective date of EPA approval of the State's plan under section 111(d) of the Act.

(b) For existing MSW landfills covered by this subpart with a design capacity equal to or greater than 2.5 million megagrams and 2.5 million cubic meters, the initial NMOC emission rate report shall be submitted no later than 90 days after the effective date of EPA approval of the State's plan under section 111(d) of the Act.

[61 FR 9919, Mar. 12, 1996, as amended at 64 FR 9262, Feb. 24, 1999]

**§ 60.36c Compliance times.**

(a) Except as provided for under paragraph (b) of this section, planning, awarding of contracts, and installation of MSW landfill air emission collection and control equipment capable of meeting the emission guidelines established under § 60.33c shall be accomplished within 30 months after the date the initial NMOC emission rate report shows NMOC emissions equal or exceed 50 megagrams per year.

(b) For each existing MSW landfill meeting the conditions in § 60.33c(a)(1) and § 60.33c(a)(2) whose NMOC emission rate is less than 50 megagrams per year on the effective date of the State emission standard, installation of collection and control systems capable of meeting emission guidelines in § 60.33c shall be accomplished within 30 months of the date when the condition in § 60.33c(a)(3) is met (i.e., the date of the first annual nonmethane organic compounds emission rate which equals or exceeds 50 megagrams per year).

[61 FR 9919, Mar. 12, 1996, as amended at 63 FR 32750, June 16, 1998]

**Subpart Cd—Emissions Guidelines and Compliance Times for Sulfuric Acid Production Units**

SOURCE: 60 FR 65414, Dec. 19, 1995, unless otherwise noted.



by limiting GHG emissions through the establishment of CO<sub>2</sub> emission guidelines for existing affected fossil fuel-fired EGUs.

In addition to reducing CO<sub>2</sub> emissions, the guidelines finalized in this rulemaking would reduce other emissions from affected EGUs that reduce generation due to higher adoption of EE and RE. These emission reductions will include SO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>x</sub>, which form ambient PM<sub>2.5</sub> and ozone in the atmosphere, and HAP, such as mercury and hydrochloric acid. In the final rule revising the annual PM<sub>2.5</sub> NAAQS,<sup>1070</sup> the EPA identified low-income populations as being a vulnerable population for experiencing adverse health effects related to PM exposures. Low-income populations have been generally found to have a higher prevalence of pre-existing diseases, limited access to medical treatment, and increased nutritional deficiencies, which can increase this population's susceptibility to PM-related effects.<sup>1071</sup> In areas where this rulemaking reduces exposure to PM<sub>2.5</sub>, ozone, and methylmercury, low-income populations will also benefit from such emissions reductions. The RIA for this rulemaking, included in the docket for this rulemaking, provides additional information regarding the health and ecosystem effects associated with these emission reductions.

Additionally, as outlined in the community and environmental justice considerations section IX of this preamble, the EPA has taken a number of actions to help ensure that this action will not have potential disproportionately high and adverse human health or environmental effects on overburdened communities. The EPA consulted its May 2015, *Guidance on Considering Environmental Justice During the Development of Regulatory Actions*, when determining what actions to take.<sup>1072</sup> As described in the community and environmental justice considerations section of this preamble the EPA also conducted a proximity analysis, which is available in the docket of this rulemaking and is

<sup>1070</sup> "National Ambient Air Quality Standards for Particulate Matter, Final Rule," 78 FR 3086 (Jan. 15, 2013).

<sup>1071</sup> U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA). 2009. *Integrated Science Assessment for Particulate Matter (Final Report)*. EPA-600-R-08-139F. National Center for Environmental Assessment—RTP Division. December. Available on the Internet at <<http://cfpub.epa.gov/ncea/cfm/recordisplay.cfm?deid=216546>>.

<sup>1072</sup> *Guidance on Considering Environmental Justice During the Development of Regulatory Actions*. <http://epa.gov/environmentaljustice/resources/policy/considering-ej-in-rulemaking-guide-final.pdf>. May 2015.

discussed in section IX. Additionally, as outlined in sections I and IX of this preamble, the EPA has engaged with communities throughout this rulemaking and has devised a robust outreach strategy for continual engagement throughout the implementation phase of this rulemaking.

**K. Congressional Review Act (CRA)**

This final action is subject to the CRA, and the EPA will submit a rule report to each House of the Congress and to the Comptroller General of the United States. This action is a "major rule" as defined by 5 U.S.C. 804(2).

**XIII. Statutory Authority**

The statutory authority for this action is provided by sections 111, 301, 302, and 307(d)(1)(C) of the CAA as amended (42 U.S.C. 7411, 7601, 7602, 7607(d)(1)(C)). This action is also subject to section 307(d) of the CAA (42 U.S.C. 7607(d)).

**List of Subjects in 40 CFR Part 60**

Environmental protection, Administrative practice and procedure, Air pollution control, Intergovernmental relations, Reporting and recordkeeping requirements.

Dated: August 3, 2015.

**Gina McCarthy**,  
*Administrator.*

For the reasons stated in the preamble, title 40, chapter I, part 60 of the Code of the Federal Regulations is amended as follows:

**PART 60—STANDARDS OF PERFORMANCE FOR NEW STATIONARY SOURCES**

■ 1. The authority citation for Part 60 continues to read as follows:

**Authority:** 42 U.S.C. 7401 *et seq.*

■ 2. Add subpart UUUU to read as follows:

**Subpart—UUUU Emission Guidelines for Greenhouse Gas Emissions and Compliance Times for Electric Utility Generating Units**

Sec.

**Introduction**

- 60.5700 What is the purpose of this subpart?
- 60.5705 Which pollutants are regulated by this subpart?
- 60.5710 Am I affected by this subpart?
- 60.5715 What is the review and approval process for my State plan?
- 60.5720 What if I do not submit a plan or my plan is not approvable?
- 60.5725 In lieu of a State plan submittal, are there other acceptable option(s) for a

- State to meet its CAA section 111(d) obligations?
- 60.5730 Is there an approval process for a negative declaration letter?
- 60.5735 What authorities will not be delegated to State, local, or tribal agencies?
- 60.5736 Will the EPA impose any sanctions?
- 60.5737 What is the Clean Energy Incentive Program and how do I participate?

**State and Multi-State Plan Requirements**

- 60.5740 What must I include in my federally enforceable State or multi-State plan?
- 60.5745 What must I include in my final plan submittal?
- 60.5750 Can I work with other States to develop a multi-State plan?
- 60.5760 What are the timing requirements for submitting my plan?
- 60.5765 What must I include in an initial submittal if requesting an extension for a final plan submittal?
- 60.5770 What schedules, performance periods, and compliance periods must I include in my plan?
- 60.5775 What emission standards must I include in my plan?
- 60.5780 What State measures may I rely upon in support of my plan?
- 60.5785 What is the procedure for revising my plan?
- 60.5790 What must I do to meet my plan obligations?

**Emission Rate Credit Requirements**

- 60.5795 What affected EGUs qualify for generation of ERCs?
- 60.5800 What other resources qualify for issuance of ERCs?
- 60.5805 What is the process for the issuance of ERCs?
- 60.5810 What applicable requirements are there for an ERC tracking system?

**Mass Allocations Requirements**

- 60.5815 What are the requirements for State allocation of allowances in a mass-based program?
- 60.5820 What are my allowance tracking requirements?
- 60.5825 What is the process for affected EGUs to demonstrate compliance in a mass-based program?

**Evaluation Measurement and Verification Plans and Monitoring and Verification Reports**

- 60.5830 What are the requirements for EM&V plans for eligible resources?
- 60.5835 What are the requirements for M&V reports for eligible resources?

**Applicability of Plans to Affected EGUs**

- 60.5840 Does this subpart directly affect EGU owners and operators in my State?
- 60.5845 What affected EGUs must I address in my State plan?
- 60.5850 What EGUs are excluded from being affected EGUs?
- 60.5855 What are the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates for affected EGUs?
- 60.5860 What applicable monitoring, recordkeeping, and reporting



requirements do I need to include in my plan for affected EGUs?

**Recordkeeping and Reporting Requirements**

- 60.5865 What are my recordkeeping requirements?
- 60.5870 What are my reporting and notification requirements?
- 60.5875 How do I submit information required by these emission guidelines to the EPA?

**Definitions**

- 60.5880 What definitions apply to this subpart?
- Table 1 to Subpart UUUU of Part 60—CO<sub>2</sub> Emission Performance Rates (Pounds of CO<sub>2</sub> per Net MWh)
- Table 2 to Subpart UUUU of Part 60—Statewide Rate-based CO<sub>2</sub> Emission Goals (Pounds of CO<sub>2</sub> per Net MWh)
- Table 3 to Subpart UUUU of Part 60—Statewide Mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> Emission Goals (Short Tons of CO<sub>2</sub>)
- Table 4 to Subpart UUUU of Part 60—Statewide Mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> Emission Goals plus New Source CO<sub>2</sub> Emission Complement (Short Tons of CO<sub>2</sub>)

**Introduction**

**§ 60.5700 What is the purpose of this subpart?**

This subpart establishes emission guidelines and approval criteria for State or multi-State plans that establish emission standards limiting greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions from an affected steam generating unit, integrated gasification combined cycle (IGCC), or stationary combustion turbine. An affected steam generating unit, IGCC, or stationary combustion turbine shall, for the purposes of this subpart, be referred to as an affected EGU. These emission guidelines are developed in accordance with section 111(d) of the Clean Air Act and subpart B of this part. To the extent any requirement of this subpart is inconsistent with the requirements of subparts A or B of this part, the requirements of this subpart will apply.

**§ 60.5705 Which pollutants are regulated by this subpart?**

(a) The pollutants regulated by this subpart are greenhouse gases. The emission guidelines for greenhouse gases established in this subpart are expressed as carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) emission performance rates and equivalent statewide CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals.

(b) PSD and Title V Thresholds for Greenhouse Gases.

(1) For the purposes of § 51.166(b)(49)(ii), with respect to GHG emissions from facilities, the “pollutant that is subject to the standard promulgated under section 111 of the Act” shall be considered to be the pollutant that otherwise is subject to regulation under the Act as defined in

§ 51.166(b)(48) and in any State Implementation Plan (SIP) approved by the EPA that is interpreted to incorporate, or specifically incorporates, § 51.166(b)(48) of this chapter.

(2) For the purposes of § 52.21(b)(50)(ii), with respect to GHG emissions from facilities regulated in the plan, the “pollutant that is subject to the standard promulgated under section 111 of the Act” shall be considered to be the pollutant that otherwise is subject to regulation under the Act as defined in § 52.21(b)(49) of this chapter.

(3) For the purposes of § 70.2 of this chapter, with respect to greenhouse gas emissions from facilities regulated in the plan, the “pollutant that is subject to any standard promulgated under section 111 of the Act” shall be considered to be the pollutant that otherwise is “subject to regulation” as defined in § 70.2 of this chapter.

(4) For the purposes of § 71.2, with respect to greenhouse gas emissions from facilities regulated in the plan, the “pollutant that is subject to any standard promulgated under section 111 of the Act” shall be considered to be the pollutant that otherwise is “subject to regulation” as defined in § 71.2 of this chapter.

**§ 60.5710 Am I affected by this subpart?**

If you are the Governor of a State in the contiguous United States with one or more affected EGUs that commenced construction on or before January 8, 2014, you must submit a State or multi-State plan to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) that implements the emission guidelines contained in this subpart. If you are the Governor of a State in the contiguous United States with no affected EGUs for which construction commenced on or before January 8, 2014, in your State, you must submit a negative declaration letter in place of the State plan.

**§ 60.5715 What is the review and approval process for my plan?**

The EPA will review your plan according to § 60.27 except that under § 60.27(b) the Administrator will have 12 months after the date the final plan or plan revision (as allowed under § 60.5785) is submitted, to approve or disapprove such plan or revision or each portion thereof. If you submit an initial submittal under § 60.5765(a) in lieu of a final plan submittal the EPA will follow the procedure in § 60.5765(b).

**§ 60.5720 What if I do not submit a plan or my plan is not approvable?**

(a) If you do not submit an approvable plan the EPA will develop a Federal

plan for your State according to § 60.27. The Federal plan will implement the emission guidelines contained in this subpart. Owners and operators of affected EGUs not covered by an approved plan must comply with a Federal plan implemented by the EPA for the State.

(b) After a Federal plan has been implemented in your State, it will be withdrawn when your State submits, and the EPA approves, a final plan.

**§ 60.5725 In lieu of a State plan submittal, are there other acceptable option(s) for a State to meet its CAA section 111(d) obligations?**

A State may meet its CAA section 111(d) obligations only by submitting a final State or multi-State plan submittal or a negative declaration letter (if applicable).

**§ 60.5730 Is there an approval process for a negative declaration letter?**

No. The EPA has no formal review process for negative declaration letters. Once your negative declaration letter has been received, the EPA will place a copy in the public docket and publish a notice in the **Federal Register**. If, at a later date, an affected EGU for which construction commenced on or before January 8, 2014 is found in your State, you will be found to have failed to submit a final plan as required, and a Federal plan implementing the emission guidelines contained in this subpart, when promulgated by the EPA, will apply to that affected EGU until you submit, and the EPA approves, a final State plan.

**§ 60.5735 What authorities will not be delegated to State, local, or tribal agencies?**

The authorities that will not be delegated to State, local, or tribal agencies are specified in paragraphs (a) and (b) of this section.

(a) Approval of alternatives, not already approved by this subpart, to the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates in Table 1 to this subpart established under § 60.5855.

(b) Approval of alternatives, not already approved by this subpart, to the CO<sub>2</sub> emissions goals in Tables 2, 3 and 4 to this subpart established under § 60.5855.

**§ 60.5736 Will the EPA impose any sanctions?**

No. The EPA will not withhold any existing federal funds from a State on account of a State’s failure to submit, implement, or enforce an approvable plan or plan revision, or to meet any other requirements under this subpart or subpart B of this part.

**§ 60.5737 What is the Clean Energy Incentive Program and how do I participate?**

(a) This subpart establishes the Clean Energy Incentive Program (CEIP). Participation in this program is optional. The program enables States to award early action emission rate credits (ERCs) and allowances to eligible renewable energy (RE) or demand-side energy efficiency (EE) projects that generate megawatt hours (MWh) or reduce end-use energy demand during 2020 and/or 2021. Eligible projects are those that:

- (1) Are located in or benefit a state that has submitted a final state plan that includes requirements establishing its participation in the CEIP; and
- (2) Commence construction in the case of RE, or commence operation in the case of demand-side EE, following the submission of a final state plan to the EPA, or after September 6, 2018 for a state that chooses not to submit a final state plan by that date; and either
- (3) Generate metered MWh from any type of wind or solar resources; or
- (4) Result in quantified and verified electricity savings (MWh) through demand-side EE implemented in low-income communities.

(b) The EPA will award matching ERCs or allowances to States that award early action ERCs or allowances, up to a match limit equivalent to 300 million tons of CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. The awards will be executed as follows:

- (1) For RE projects that generate metered MWh from wind or solar resources: For every two MWh generated, the project will receive one early action ERC (or the equivalent number of allowances) from the State, and the EPA will provide one matching ERC (or the equivalent number of allowances) to the State to award to the project.
- (2) For EE projects implemented in low-income communities: For every two MWh in end-use demand savings achieved, the project will receive two early action ERCs (or the equivalent number of allowances) from the State, and the EPA will provide two matching ERCs (or the equivalent number of allowances) to the State to award to the project.
- (c) You may participate in this program by including in your State plan a mechanism that enables issuance of early action ERCs or allowances by the State to parties effectuating reductions in the calendar years 2020 and/or 2021 in a manner that would have no impact on the emission performance of affected EGUs required to meet rate-based or mass-based emission standards during the performance periods. This

mechanism is not required to account for matching ERCs or allowances that may be issued to the State by the EPA.

(d) If you are submitting an initial submittal by September 6, 2016, and you intend to participate in the CEIP, you must include a non-binding statement of intent to participate in the program. If you are submitting a final plan by September 6, 2016, and you intend to participate in the CEIP, your State plan must either include requirements establishing the necessary infrastructure to implement such a program and authorizing your affected EGUs to use early action allowances or ERCs as appropriate, or you must include a non-binding statement of intent as part of your supporting documentation and revise your plan to include the appropriate requirements at a later date.

(e) If you intend to participate in the CEIP, your final State plan, or plan revision if applicable, must require that projects eligible under this program be evaluated, monitored, and verified, and that resulting ERCs or allowances be issued, per applicable requirements of the State plan approved by the EPA as meeting § 60.5805 through § 60.5835.

**State and Multi-State Plan Requirements**

**§ 60.5740 What must I include in my federally enforceable State or multi State plan?**

(a) You must include the components described in paragraphs (a)(1) through (5) of this section in your plan submittal. The final plan must meet the requirements and include the information required under § 60.5745.

(1) *Identification of affected EGUs.* Consistent with § 60.25(a), you must identify the affected EGUs covered by your plan and all affected EGUs in your State that meet the applicability criteria in § 60.5845. In addition, you must include an inventory of CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from the affected EGUs during the most recent calendar year for which data is available prior to the submission of the plan.

(2) *Emission standards.* You must include an identification of all emission standards for each affected EGU according to § 60.5775, compliance periods for each emission standard according to § 60.5770, and a demonstration that the emission standards, when taken together, achieve the applicable CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals described in § 60.5855. Allowance systems are an acceptable form of emission standards under this subpart.

(i) Your plan does not need to include corrective measures specified in

paragraph (a)(2)(ii) of this section if your plan:

(A) Imposes emission standards on all affected EGUs that, assuming full compliance by all affected EGUs, mathematically assure achievement of the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates in the plan for each plan period;

(B) Imposes emission standards on all affected EGUS that, assuming full compliance by all affected EGUs, mathematically assure achievement of the CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals; or

(C) Imposes emission standards on all affected EGUs that, assuming full compliance by all affected EGUs, in conjunction with applicable requirements under state law for EGUs subject to subpart TTTT of this subpart, assuming the applicable requirements under state law are met by all EGUs subject to subpart TTTT of this subpart, achieve the applicable mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals plus new source CO<sub>2</sub> emission complement allowed for in § 60.5790(b)(5).

(ii) If your plan does not meet the requirements of (a)(2)(i) or (iii) of this section, your plan must include the requirement for corrective measures to be implemented if triggered. Upon triggering corrective measures, if you do not already have them included in your approved State plan, you must submit corrective measures to EPA for approval as a plan revision per the requirements of § 60.5785(c). These corrective measures must ensure that the interim period and final period CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals are achieved by your affected EGUs, as applicable, and must achieve additional emission reductions to offset any emission performance shortfall. Your plan must include the requirement that corrective measures be triggered and implemented according to paragraphs (a)(2)(ii)(A) through (H) of this section.

(A) Your plan must include a trigger for an exceedance of an interim step 1 or interim step 2 CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal by 10 percent or greater, either on average or cumulatively (if applicable).

(B) Your plan must include a trigger for an exceedance of an interim step 1 goal or interim step 2 goal of 10 percent or greater based on either reported CO<sub>2</sub> emissions with applied plus or minus net allowance export or import adjustments (if applicable), or based on the adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate (if applicable).

(C) Your plan must include a trigger for a failure to meet an interim period goal based on reported CO<sub>2</sub> emissions with applied plus or minus net allowance export or import adjustments



(if applicable), or based on the adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate (if applicable).

(D) Your plan must include a trigger for a failure to meet the interim period or any final reporting period CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal, either on average or cumulatively (as applicable).

(E) Your plan must include a trigger for a failure to meet any final reporting period goal based on reported CO<sub>2</sub> emissions with applied plus or minus net allowance export or import adjustments (if applicable).

(F) Your plan must include a trigger for a failure to meet the interim period CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal based on the adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate (if applicable).

(G) Your plan must include a trigger for a failure to meet any final reporting period CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal based on the adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate (if applicable).

(H) A net allowance import adjustment represents the CO<sub>2</sub> emissions (in tons) equal to the number of net imported CO<sub>2</sub> allowances. This adjustment is subtracted from reported CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. Under this adjustment, such allowances must be issued by a state with an emission budget trading program that only applies to affected EGUs (or affected EGUs plus EGUs covered by subpart TTTT of this part as applicable). A net allowance export adjustment represents the CO<sub>2</sub> emissions (in tons) equal to the number of net exported CO<sub>2</sub> allowances. This adjustment is added to reported CO<sub>2</sub> emissions.

(iii) If your plan relies upon State measures, in addition to or in lieu of emission standards on your affected EGUs, then the final State plan must include the requirements in paragraph (a)(3) of this section and the submittal must include the information listed in § 60.5745(a)(6).

(iv) If your plan requires emission standards in addition to relying upon State measures, then you must demonstrate that the emission standards and State measures, when taken together, result in the achievement of the applicable mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal described in § 60.5855 by your State's affected EGUs.

(3) *State measures backstop.* If your plan relies upon State measures, you must submit, as part of the plan in lieu of the requirements in paragraph (a)(2)(i) and (ii) of this section, a federally enforceable backstop that includes emission standards for affected EGUs that will be put into place, if there is a triggering event listed in paragraph (a)(3)(i) of this section, within 18

months of the due date of the report required in § 60.5870(b). The emission standards on the affected EGUs as part of the backstop must be able to meet either the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or mass-based or rate-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal for your State during the interim and final periods. You must either submit, along with the backstop emission standards, provisions to adjust the emission standards to make up for the prior emission performance shortfall, such that no later plan revision to modify the emission standards is necessary in order to address the emission performance shortfall, or you must submit, as part of the final plan, backstop emission standards that assure affected EGUs would achieve your State's CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or emission goals during the interim and final periods, and then later submit appropriate revisions to the backstop emission standards adjusting for the shortfall through the State plan revision process described in § 60.5785. The backstop must also include the requirements in paragraphs (a)(3)(i) through (iii) of this section, as applicable.

(i) You must include a trigger for the backstop to go into effect upon:

(A) A failure to meet a programmatic milestone;

(B) An exceedance of 10 percent or greater of an interim step 1 goal or interim step 2 goal based on reported CO<sub>2</sub> emissions, with applied plus or minus net allowance export or import adjustments (if applicable);

(C) A failure to meet the interim period goal based on reported CO<sub>2</sub> emissions, with applied plus or minus net allowance export or import adjustments (if applicable); or

(D) A failure to meet any final reporting period goal based on reported CO<sub>2</sub> emissions, with applied plus or minus net allowance export or import adjustments (if applicable).

(ii) You may include in your plan any additional triggers so long as they do not reduce the stringency of the triggers required under paragraph (a)(3)(i) of this section.

(iii) You must include a schedule for implementation of the backstop once triggered, and you must identify all necessary State administrative and technical procedures for implementing the backstop.

(4) *Identification of applicable monitoring, reporting, and recordkeeping requirements for each affected EGU.* You must include in your plan all applicable monitoring, reporting and recordkeeping requirements for each affected EGU and

the requirements must be consistent with or no less stringent than the requirements specified in § 60.5860.

(5) *State reporting.* You must include in your plan a description of the process, contents, and schedule for State reporting to the EPA about plan implementation and progress, including information required under § 60.5870.

(i) You must include in your plan a requirement for a report to be submitted by July 1, 2021, that demonstrates that the State has met, or is on track to meet, the programmatic milestone steps indicated in the timeline required in § 60.5770.

(b) You must follow the requirements of subpart B of this part and demonstrate that they were met in your State plan. However, the provisions of § 60.24(f) shall not apply.

**§ 60.5745 What must I include in my final plan submittal?**

(a) In addition to the components of the plan listed in § 60.5740, a final plan submittal to the EPA must include the information in paragraphs (a)(1) through (13) of this section. This information must be submitted to the EPA as part of your final plan submittal but will not be codified as part of the federally enforceable plan upon approval by EPA.

(1) You must include a description of your plan approach and the geographic scope of the plan (*i.e.*, State or multi-State, geographic boundaries related to the plan elements), including, if applicable, identification of multi-State plan participants.

(2) You must identify CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or equivalent statewide CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals that your affected EGUs will achieve. If the geographic scope of your plan is a single State, then you must identify CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or emission goals according to § 60.5855. If your plan includes multiple States and you elect to set CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals, you must identify CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals calculated according to § 60.5750.

(i) You must specify in the plan submittal the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or emission goals that affected EGUs will meet for the interim period, each interim step, and the final period (including each final reporting period) pursuant to § 60.5770.

(ii) [Reserved]

(3) You must include a demonstration that the affected EGUs covered by the plan are projected to achieve the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals described in § 60.5855.

(4) You must include a demonstration that each affected EGU's emission standard is quantifiable, non-

duplicative, permanent, verifiable, and enforceable according to § 60.5775.

(5) If your plan includes emission standards on your affected EGUs sufficient to meet either the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals, you must include in your plan submittal the information in paragraphs (a)(5)(i) through (v) of this section as applicable.

(i) If your plan applies separate rate-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission standards for affected EGUs (in lbs CO<sub>2</sub>/MWh) that are equal to or lower than the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates listed in Table 1 of this subpart or uniform rate-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission standards equal to or lower than the rate-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals listed in Table 2 of this subpart, then no additional demonstration is required beyond inclusion of the emission standards in the plan.

(ii) If a plan applies rate-based emission standards to individual affected EGUs at a lbs CO<sub>2</sub>/MWh rate that differs from the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates in Table 1 of this subpart or the State's rate-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal in Table 2 of this subpart, then a further demonstration is required that the application of the CO<sub>2</sub> emission standards will achieve the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or State rate-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal. You must demonstrate through a projection that the adjusted weighted average CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate of affected EGUs, when weighted by generation (in MWh), will be equal to or less than the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or the rate-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal. This projection must address the interim period and the final period. The projection in the plan submittal must include the information listed in paragraph (a)(5)(v) of this section and in addition the following:

(A) An analysis of the change in generation of affected EGUs given the compliance costs and incentives under the application of different emission rate standards across affected EGUs in a State;

(B) A projection showing how generation is expected to shift between affected EGUs and across affected EGUs and non-affected EGUs over time;

(C) Assumptions regarding the availability and anticipated use of the MWh of electricity generation or electricity savings from eligible resources that can be issued ERCs;

(D) The specific calculation (or assumption) of how eligible resource MWh of electricity generation or savings are being used in the projection to adjust the reported CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate of affected EGUs;

(E) If a state plan provides for the ability of renewable energy resources located in states with mass-based plans to be issued ERCs, consideration in the projection that such resources must meet geographic eligibility requirements, consistent with § 60.5800(a); and

(F) Any other applicable assumptions used in the projection.

(iii) If a plan establishes mass-based emission standards for affected EGUs that cumulatively do not exceed the State's EPA-specified mass CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal, then no additional demonstration is required beyond inclusion of the emission standards in the plan.

(iv) If a plan applies mass-based emission standards to individual affected EGUs that cumulatively exceed the State's EPA-specified mass CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal, then you must include a demonstration that your mass-based emission program will be designed such that compliance by affected EGUs would achieve the State mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals. This demonstration includes the information listed in paragraph (a)(5)(v) of this section.

(v) Your plan demonstration to be included in your plan submittal, if applicable, must include the information listed in paragraphs (a)(5)(v)(A) through (L) of this section.

(A) A summary of each affected EGU's anticipated future operation characteristics, including:

- (1) Annual generation;
- (2) CO<sub>2</sub> emissions;
- (3) Fuel use, fuel prices (when applicable), fuel carbon content;
- (4) Fixed and variable operations and maintenance costs (when applicable);
- (5) Heat rates; and
- (6) Electric generation capacity and capacity factors.

(B) An identification of any planned new electric generating capacity.

(C) Analytic treatment of the potential for building unplanned new electric generating capacity.

(D) A timeline for implementation of EGU-specific actions (if applicable).

(E) All wholesale electricity prices.

(F) A geographic representation appropriate for capturing impacts and/or changes in the electric system.

(G) A time period of analysis, which must extend through at least 2031.

(H) An anticipated electricity demand forecast (MWh load and MW peak demand) at the State and regional level, including the source and basis for these estimates, and, if appropriate, justification and documentation of underlying assumptions that inform the development of the demand forecast (e.g., annual economic and demand growth rate or population growth rate).

(J) A demonstration that each emission standard included in your plan meets the requirements of § 60.5775.

(J) Any ERC or emission allowance prices, when applicable.

(K) An identification of planning reserve margins.

(L) Any other applicable assumptions used in the projection.

(6) If your plan relies upon State measures, in addition to or in lieu of the emission standards required by paragraph § 60.5740(a)(2), the final State plan submittal must include the information under paragraphs (a)(5)(v) and (a)(6)(i) through (v) of this section.

(i) You must include a description of all the State measures the State will rely upon to achieve the applicable CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals required under § 60.5855(e), the projected impacts of the State measures over time, the applicable State laws or regulations related to such measures, and identification of parties or entities subject to or implementing such State measures.

(ii) You must include the schedule and milestones for the implementation of the State measures. If the State measures in your plan submittal rely upon measures that do not have a direct effect on the CO<sub>2</sub> emissions measured at an affected EGU's stack, you must also demonstrate how the minimum emission, monitoring and verification (EM&V) requirements listed under § 60.5795 that apply to those programs and projects will be met.

(iii) You must demonstrate that federally enforceable emission standards for affected EGUs in conjunction with any State measures relied upon for your plan, are sufficient to achieve the mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal for the interim period, each interim step in that interim period, the final period, and each final reporting period. In addition, you must demonstrate that each emission standard included in your plan meets the requirements of § 60.5775 and each State measure included in your plan submittal meets the requirements of § 60.5780.

(iv) You must include a CO<sub>2</sub> performance projection of your State measures that shows how the measures, whether alone or in conjunction with any federally enforceable CO<sub>2</sub> emission standards for affected EGUs, will result in the achievement of the future CO<sub>2</sub> performance at affected EGUs. Elements of this projection must include those specified in paragraph (a)(5)(v) of this section, as applicable, and the following for the interim period and the final period:



(A) A baseline demand and supply forecast as well as the underlying assumptions and data sources of each forecast;

(B) The magnitude of energy and emission impacts from all measures included in the plan and applicable assumptions;

(C) An identification of State-enforceable measures with electricity savings and RE generation, in MWh, expected for individual and collective measures and any assumptions related to the quantification of the MWh, as applicable.

(7) Your plan submittal must include a demonstration that the reliability of the electrical grid has been considered in the development of your plan.

(8) Your plan submittal must include a timeline with all the programmatic milestone steps the State intends to take between the time of the State plan submittal and January 1, 2022 to ensure the plan is effective as of January 1, 2022.

(9) Your plan submittal must adequately demonstrate that your State has the legal authority (e.g., through regulations or legislation) and funding to implement and enforce each component of the State plan submittal, including federally enforceable emission standards for affected EGUs, and State measures as applicable.

(10) Your State plan submittal must demonstrate that each interim step goal required under § 60.5855(c), will be met and include in its supporting documentation, if applicable, a description of the analytic process, tools, methods, and assumptions used to make this demonstration.

(11) Your plan submittal must include certification that a hearing required under § 60.23(c)(1) on the State plan was held, a list of witnesses and their organizational affiliations, if any, appearing at the hearing, and a brief written summary of each presentation or written submission, pursuant to the requirements of § 60.23(d) and (f).

(12) Your plan submittal must include documentation of any conducted community outreach and community involvement, including engagement with vulnerable communities.

(13) Your plan submittal must include supporting material for your plan including:

(i) Materials demonstrating the State's legal authority and funding to implement and enforce each component of its plan, including emissions standards and/or State measures that the plan relies upon;

(ii) Materials supporting that the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals will be achieved by

affected EGUs identified under the plan, according to paragraph (a)(3) of this section;

(iii) Materials supporting any calculations for CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals calculated according to § 60.5855, if applicable; and

(iv) Any other materials necessary to support evaluation of the plan by the EPA.

(b) You must submit your final plan to the EPA electronically according to § 60.5875.

**§ 60.5750 Can I work with other States to develop a multi-State plan?**

A multi-State plan must include all the required elements for a plan specified in § 60.5740(a). A multi-State plan must meet the requirements of paragraphs (a) and (b) of this section.

(a) The multi-State plan must demonstrate that all affected EGUs in all participating States will meet the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates listed in Table 1 of this subpart or an equivalent CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal according to paragraphs (a)(1) or (2) of this section. States may only follow the procedures in (a)(1) or (2) if they have functionally equivalent requirements meeting § 60.5775 and § 60.5790 included in their plans.

(1) For States electing to demonstrate performance with a CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate-based goal, the CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals identified in the plan according to § 60.5855 will be an adjusted weighted (by net energy output) average lbs CO<sub>2</sub>/MWh emission rate to be achieved by all affected EGUs in the multi-State area during the plan periods; or

(2) For States electing to demonstrate performance with a CO<sub>2</sub> emission mass-based goal, the CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals identified in the multi-State plan according to § 60.5855 will be total mass CO<sub>2</sub> emissions by all affected EGUs in the multi-State area during the plan periods, representing the sum of all individual mass CO<sub>2</sub> goals for states participating in the multi-state plan.

(b) Options for submitting a multi-State plan include the following:

(1) States participating in a multi-State plan may submit one multi-State plan submittal on behalf of all participating States. The joint submittal must be signed electronically, according to § 60.5875, by authorized officials for each of the States participating in the multi-State plan. In this instance, the joint submittal will have the same legal effect as an individual submittal for each participating State. The joint submittal must address plan components that apply jointly for all participating States and components that apply for each individual State in

the multi-State plan, including necessary State legal authority to implement the plan, such as State regulations and statutes.

(2) States participating in a multi-State plan may submit a single plan submittal, signed by authorized officials from each participating State, which addresses common plan elements. Each participating State must, in addition, provide individual plan submittals that address State-specific elements of the multi-State plan.

(3) States participating in a multi-State plan may separately make individual submittals that address all elements of the multi-State plan. The plan submittals must be materially consistent for all common plan elements that apply to all participating States, and also must address individual State-specific aspects of the multi-State plan. Each individual State plan submittal must address all required plan components in § 60.5740.

(c) A State may elect to participate in more than one multi-State plan. If your State elects to participate in more than one multi-State plan then you must identify in the State plan submittal required under § 60.5745, the subset of affected EGUs that are subject to the specific multi-State plan or your State's individual plan. An affected EGU can only be subject to one plan.

(d) A State may elect to allow its affected EGUs to interact with affected EGUs in other States through mass-based trading programs or a rate-based trading program without entering into a formal multi-State plan allowed for under this section, so long as such programs are part of an EPA-approved state plan and meet the requirements of paragraphs (d)(1) and (2) of this section, as applicable.

(1) For States that elect to do mass-based trading under this option the State must indicate in its plan that its emission budget trading program will be administered using an EPA-approved (or EPA-administered) emission and allowance tracking system.

(2) For States that elect to use a rate-based trading program which allows the affected EGUs to use ERCs from other State rate-based trading programs, the plan must require affected EGUs within their State to comply with emission standards equal to the sub-category CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates in Table 1 of this subpart.

**§ 60.5760 What are the timing requirements for submitting my plan?**

(a) You must submit a final plan with the information required under § 60.5745 by September 6, 2016, unless you are submitting an initial submittal,



allowed under § 60.5765, in lieu of a final State plan submittal, according to paragraph (b) of this section.

(b) For States seeking a two year extension for a final plan submittal, you must include the information in § 60.5765(a) in an initial submittal by September 6, 2016, to receive an extension to submit your final State plan submittal by September 6, 2018.

(c) You must submit all information required under paragraphs (a) and (b) of this section according to the electronic reporting requirements in § 60.5875.

**§ 60.5765 What must I include in an initial submittal if requesting an extension for a final plan submittal?**

(a) You must sufficiently demonstrate that your State is able to undertake steps and processes necessary to timely submit a final plan by the extended date of September 6, 2018, by addressing the following required components in an initial submittal by September 6, 2016, if requesting an extension for a final plan submittal:

(1) An identification of final plan approach or approaches under consideration and a description of progress made to date on the final plan components;

(2) An appropriate explanation of why the State requires additional time to submit a final plan by September 6, 2018; and

(3) A demonstration or description of the opportunity for public comment on the initial submittal and meaningful engagement with stakeholders, including vulnerable communities, during the time in preparation of the initial submittal and the plans for engagement during development of the final plan.

(b) You must submit an initial submittal allowed in paragraph (a) of this section, information required under paragraph (c) of this section (only if a State elects to submit an initial submittal to request an extension for a final plan submittal), and a final State plan submittal according to § 60.5870. If a State submits an initial submittal, an extension for a final State plan submittal is considered granted and a final State plan submittal is due according to § 60.5760(b) unless a State is notified within 90 days of the EPA receiving the initial submittal that the EPA finds the initial submittal does not meet the requirements listed in paragraph (a) of this section. If the EPA notifies the State that the initial submittal does not meet such requirements, the EPA will also notify the State that it has failed to submit the final plan required by September 6, 2016.

(c) If an extension for submission of a final plan has been granted, you must submit a progress report by September 6, 2017. The 2017 report must include the following:

(1) A summary of the status of each component of the final plan, including an update from the 2016 initial submittal and a list of which final plan components are not complete.

(2) A commitment to a plan approach (e.g., single or multi-State, rate-based or mass-based emission performance level, rate-based or mass-based emission standards), including draft or proposed legislation and/or regulations.

(3) An updated comprehensive roadmap with a schedule and milestones for completing the final plan, including any updates to community engagement undertaken and planned.

**§ 60.5770 What schedules, performance periods, and compliance periods must I include in my plan?**

(a) The affected EGUs covered by your plan must meet the CO<sub>2</sub> emission requirements required under § 60.5855 for the interim period, interim steps, and the final reporting periods according to paragraph (b) of this section. You must also include in your plan compliance periods for each affected EGU regulated under the plan according to paragraphs (c) and (d) of this section.

(b) Your plan must require your affected EGUs to achieve each CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal, as applicable, required under § 60.5855 over the periods according to paragraphs (b)(1) through (3) of this section.

(1) The interim period.

(2) Each interim step.

(3) Each final reporting period.

(c) The emission standards for affected EGUs regulated under the plan must include the following compliance periods:

(1) For the interim period, affected EGUs must have emission standards that have compliance periods that are no longer than each interim step and are imposed for the entirety of the interim step either alone or in combination.

(2) For the final period, affected EGUs must have emission standards that have compliance periods that are no longer than each final reporting period and are imposed for the entirety of the final reporting period either alone or in combination.

(3) Compliance periods for each interim step and each final reporting period may take forms shorter than specified in this regulation, provided the schedules of compliance collectively end on the same schedule as each interim step and final reporting period.

(d) If your plan relies upon State measures in lieu of or in addition to emission standards for affected EGUs regulated under the plan, then the performance periods must be identical to the compliance periods for affected EGUs listed in paragraphs (c)(1) through (3) of this section.

**§ 60.5775 What emission standards must I include in my plan?**

(a) Emission standard(s) for affected EGUs included under your plan must be demonstrated to be quantifiable, verifiable, non-duplicative, permanent, and enforceable with respect to each affected EGU. The plan submittal must include the methods by which each emission standard meets each of the following requirements in paragraphs (b) through (f) of this section.

(b) An affected EGU's emission standard is quantifiable if it can be reliably measured in a manner that can be replicated.

(c) An affected EGU's emission standard is verifiable if adequate monitoring, recordkeeping and reporting requirements are in place to enable the State and the Administrator to independently evaluate, measure, and verify compliance with the emission standard.

(d) An affected EGU's emission standard is non-duplicative with respect to a State plan if it is not already incorporated as an emission standard in another State plan unless incorporated in multi-State plan.

(e) An affected EGU's emission standard is permanent if the emission standard must be met for each compliance period, unless it is replaced by another emission standard in an approved plan revision, or the State demonstrates in an approvable plan revision that the emission reductions from the emission standard are no longer necessary for the State to meet its State level of performance.

(f) An affected EGU's emission standard is enforceable if:

(1) A technically accurate limitation or requirement and the time period for the limitation or requirement are specified;

(2) Compliance requirements are clearly defined;

(3) The affected EGUs responsible for compliance and liable for violations can be identified;

(4) Each compliance activity or measure is enforceable as a practical matter; and

(5) The Administrator, the State, and third parties maintain the ability to enforce against violations (including if an affected EGU does not meet its emission standard based on its

emissions, its allowances if it is subject to a mass-based emission standard, or its ERCs if it is subject to a rate-based emission standard) and secure appropriate corrective actions, in the case of the Administrator pursuant to CAA sections 113(a)–(h), in the case of a State, pursuant to its plan, State law or CAA section 304, as applicable, and in the case of third parties, pursuant to CAA section 304.

**§ 60.5780 What State measures may I rely upon in support of my plan?**

You may rely upon State measures in support of your plan that are not emission standard(s) on affected EGUs, provided those State measures meet the requirements in paragraph (a) of this section.

(a) Each State measure is quantifiable, verifiable, non-duplicative, permanent, and enforceable with respect to each affected entity (e.g., entities other than affected EGUs with no federally enforceable obligations under a State plan), and your plan supporting materials include the methods by which each State measure meets each of the following requirements in paragraphs (a)(1) through (5) of this section.

(1) A State measure is quantifiable with respect to an affected entity if it can be reliably measured in a manner that can be replicated.

(2) A State measure is verifiable with respect to an affected entity if adequate monitoring, recordkeeping and reporting requirements are in place to enable the State to independently evaluate, measure, and verify compliance with the State measure.

(3) A State measure is non-duplicative with respect to an affected entity if it is not already incorporated as a State measure or an emission standard in another State plan or State plan supporting material unless incorporated in a multi-State plan.

(4) A State measure is permanent with respect to an affected entity if the State measure must be met for at least each compliance period, or unless either it is replaced by another State measure in an approved plan revision, or the State demonstrates in an approved plan revision that the emission reductions from the State measure are no longer necessary for the State's affected EGUs to meet their mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal.

(5) A State measure is enforceable against an affected entity if:

(i) A technically accurate limitation or requirement and the time period for the limitation or requirement are specified;

(ii) Compliance requirements are clearly defined;

(iii) The affected entities responsible for compliance and liable for violations can be identified;

(iv) Each compliance activity or measure is enforceable as a practical matter; and

(v) The State maintains the ability to enforce violations and secure appropriate corrective actions.

(b) [Reserved]

**§ 60.5785 What is the procedure for revising my plan?**

(a) EPA-approved plans can be revised only with approval by the Administrator. The Administrator will approve a plan revision if it is satisfactory with respect to the applicable requirements of this subpart and any applicable requirements of subpart B of this part, including the requirement in § 60.5745(a)(3) to demonstrate achievement of the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals in § 60.5855. If one (or more) of the elements of the plan set in § 60.5740 require revision with respect to achieving the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals in § 60.5855, a request must be submitted to the Administrator indicating the proposed revisions to the plan to ensure the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals are met. In addition, the following provisions in paragraphs (b) through (d) of this section may apply.

(b) You may submit revisions to a plan to adjust CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals according to § 60.5855(d).

(c) If your State is required to submit a notification according to § 60.5870(d) indicating a triggering of corrective measures as described in § 60.5740(a)(2)(i) and your plan does not already include corrective measures to be implemented if triggered, you must revise your State plan to include corrective measures to be implemented. The corrective measures must ensure achievement of the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or State CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal. Additionally, the corrective measures must achieve additional CO<sub>2</sub> emission reductions to offset any CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance shortfall relative to the overall interim period or final period CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or State CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal. The State plan revision submission must explain how the corrective measures both make up for the shortfall and address the State plan deficiency that caused the shortfall. The State must submit the revised plan and explanation to the EPA within 24 months after submitting the State report required in § 60.5870(a) indicating the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance deficiency in lieu of the

requirements of § 60.28(a). The State must implement corrective measures within 6 months of the EPA's approval of a plan revision adding them. The shortfall must be made up as expeditiously as practicable.

(d) If your plan relies upon State measures, your backstop is triggered under § 60.5740(a)(3)(i), and your State measures plan backstop does not include a mechanism to make up the shortfall, you must revise your backstop emission standards to make up the shortfall. The shortfall must be made up as expeditiously as practicable.

(e) Reliability Safety Valve:

(1) In order to trigger a reliability safety valve, you must notify the EPA within 48 hours of an unforeseen, emergency situation that threatens reliability, such that your State will need a short-term modification of emission standards under a State plan for a specified affected EGU or EGUs. The EPA will consider the notification in § 60.5870(g)(1) to be an approved short-term modification to the State plan without needing to go through the full State plan revision process if the State provides a second notification to the EPA within seven days of the first notification. The short-term modification under a reliability safety valve allows modification to emission standards under the State plan for an affected EGU or EGUs for an initial period of up to 90 days. During that period of time, the affected EGU or EGUs will need to comply with the modified emission standards identified in the initial notification required under § 60.5870(g)(1) or amended in the second notification required under § 60.5870(g)(2). For the duration of the up to 90-day short-term modification, the CO<sub>2</sub> emissions of the affected EGU or EGUs that exceed their obligations under the originally approved State plan will not be counted against the State's CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal. The EPA reserves the right to review any such notification required under § 60.5870(g), and, in the event that the EPA finds such notification is improper, the EPA may disallow the short-term modification and affected EGUs must continue to operate under the approved State plan emission standards. As described more fully in § 60.5870(g)(3), at least seven days before the end of the initial 90-day reliability safety valve period, the State must notify the appropriate EPA regional office whether the reliability concern has been addressed and the affected EGU or EGUs can resume meeting the original emission standards established in the State plan prior to the short-term modification or whether a

serious, ongoing reliability issue necessitates the affected EGU or EGUs emitting beyond the amount allowed under the State plan.

(2) Plan revisions submitted pursuant to § 60.5870(g)(3) must meet the requirements for State plan revisions under § 60.5785(a).

**§ 60.5790 What must I do to meet my plan obligations?**

(a) To meet your plan obligations, you must demonstrate that your affected EGUs are complying with their emission standards as specified in § 60.5740, and you must demonstrate that the emission standards on affected EGUs, alone or in conjunction with any State measures, are resulting in achievement of the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or statewide CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals by affected EGUs using the procedures in paragraphs (b) through (d) of this section. If your plan requires the use of allowances for your affected EGUs to comply with their mass-based emission standards, you must follow the requirements under paragraph (b) of this section and § 60.5830. If your plan requires the use of ERCs for your affected EGUs to comply with their rate-based emission standards, you must follow the requirements under paragraphs (c) and (d) of this section and §§ 60.5795 through 60.5805.

(b) If you submit a plan that sets a mass-based emission trading program for your affected EGUs, the State plan

must include emission standards and requirements that specify the allowance system, related compliance requirements and mechanisms, and the emission budget as appropriate. These requirements must include those listed in paragraphs (b)(1) through (5) of this section.

(1) CO<sub>2</sub> emission monitoring, reporting, and recordkeeping requirements for affected EGUs.

(2) Requirements for State allocation of allowances consistent with § 60.5815.

(3) Requirements for tracking of allowances, from issuance through submission for compliance, consistent with § 60.5820.

(4) The process for affected EGUs to demonstrate compliance (allowance “true-up” with reported CO<sub>2</sub> emissions) consistent with § 60.5825.

(5) Requirements that address potential increased CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from new sources, beyond the emissions expected from new sources if affected EGUs were given emission standards in the form of the subcategory-specific CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates. You may meet this requirement by requiring one of the options under paragraphs (b)(5)(i) through (iii) of this section.

(i) You may include, as part of your plan’s supporting documentation, requirements enforceable as a matter of State law regulating CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from EGUs covered by subpart TTTT of this part under the mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> goal plus new source CO<sub>2</sub> emission complement

applicable to your State in Table 4 of this subpart. If you choose this option, the term “mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> goal plus new source CO<sub>2</sub> emission complement” shall apply rather than “CO<sub>2</sub> mass-based goal” and the term “CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal” shall include “mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> goal plus new source CO<sub>2</sub> emission complement” in these emission guidelines.

(ii) You may include requirements in your State plan for emission budget allowance allocation methods that align incentives to generate to affected EGUs or EGUs covered by subpart TTTT of this part that result in the affected EGUs meeting the mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal;

(iii) You may submit for the EPA’s approval, an equivalent method which requires affected EGUs to meet the mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal. The EPA will evaluate the approvability of such an alternative method on a case by case basis.

(c) If you submit a plan that sets rate-based emission standards on your affected EGUs, to meet the requirements of § 60.5775, you must follow the requirements in paragraphs (c)(1) through (4) of this section.

(1) You must require the owner or operator of each affected EGU covered by your plan to calculate an adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate to demonstrate compliance with its emission standard by factoring stack emissions and any ERCs into the following equation:

$$CO_2 \text{ emission rate} = \frac{\sum M_{CO_2}}{\sum MWh_{op} + \sum MWh_{ERC}}$$

Where:

CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate = An affected EGU’s adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate that will be used to determine compliance with the applicable CO<sub>2</sub> emission standard.

M<sub>CO<sub>2</sub></sub> = Measured CO<sub>2</sub> mass in units of pounds (lbs) summed over the compliance period for an affected EGU.

MWh<sub>op</sub> = Total net energy output over the compliance period for an affected EGU in units of MWh.

MWh<sub>ERC</sub> = ERC replacement generation for an affected EGU in units of MWh (ERCs are denominated in whole integers as specified in paragraph (d) of this section).

(2) Your plan must specify that an ERC qualifies for the compliance demonstration specified in paragraph (c)(1) of this section if the ERC meets the requirements of paragraphs (c)(2)(i) through (iv) of this section.

(i) An ERC must have a unique serial number.

(ii) An ERC must represent one MWh of actual energy generated or saved with zero associated CO<sub>2</sub> emissions.

(iii) An ERC must only be issued to an eligible resource that meets the requirements of § 60.5800 or to an affected EGU that meets the requirements of § 60.5795 and must only be issued by a State or its State agent through an EPA-approved ERC tracking system that meets the requirements of § 60.5810, or by the EPA through an EPA-administered tracking system.

(iv) An ERC must be surrendered and retired only once for purpose of compliance with this regulation through an EPA-approved ERC tracking system that meets the requirements of § 60.5810, or by the EPA through an EPA-administered tracking system.

(3) Your plan must specify that an ERC does not qualify for the compliance demonstration specified in paragraph

(c)(1) of this section if it does not meet the requirements of paragraph (c)(2) of this section or if any State has used that same ERC for purposes of demonstrating achievement of a CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal. The plan must additionally include provisions that address requirements for revocation or adjustment that apply if an ERC issued by the State is subsequently found to have been improperly issued.

(4) Your plan must include provisions either allowing for or restricting banking of ERCs between compliance periods for affected EGUs, and provisions not allowing any borrowing of any ERCs from future compliance periods by affected EGUs or eligible resources.



**Emission Rate Credit Requirements**

**§ 60.5795 What affected EGUs qualify for generation of ERCs?**

(a) For issuance of ERCs to the affected EGUs that generate them, the plan must specify the accounting method and process for ERC issuance. For plans that require that affected EGUs meet a rate-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal, where all affected EGUs have identical emission standards, you must specify the accounting method listed in paragraph (a)(1) of this section for generating ERCs. For plans that require affected EGUs to meet the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals where affected EGUs have emission standards that are not equal for all affected EGUs, you must specify the accounting methods listed in paragraphs (a)(1) and (2) of this section for generating ERCs.

(1) You must include the calculation method for determining the number of ERCs, denominated in MWh, that may be generated by and issued to an affected EGU that is in compliance with its emission standard, based on the difference between its emission standard and its reported CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate for the compliance period; and

(2) You must include the calculation method for determining the number of ERCs, denominated in MWh, that may be issued to affected EGUs that meet the definition of a stationary combustion turbine based on the displaced emissions from affected EGUs not meeting the definition of a stationary combustion turbine, resulting from the difference between its annualized net energy output in MWh for the calendar year(s) in the compliance period and its net energy output in MWh for the 2012 calendar year (January 1, 2012, through December 31, 2012).

(b) Any ERCs generated through the method described as required by paragraph (a)(2) of this section must not be used by any affected EGUs other than steam generating units or IGCCs to demonstrate compliance as prescribed under § 60.5790(c)(1).

(c) Any states in a multi-State plan that requires the use of ERCs for affected EGUs to comply with their emission standards must have functionally equivalent requirements pursuant to paragraphs (a)(1) and (2) of this section for generating ERCs.

**§ 60.5800 What other resources qualify for issuance of ERCs?**

(a) ERCs may only be issued for generation or savings produced on or after January 1, 2022, to a resource that qualifies as an eligible resource because it meets each of the requirements in

paragraphs (a)(1) through (4) of this section.

(1) Resources qualifying for eligibility only include resources that increased installed electrical generation nameplate capacity, or implemented new electrical savings measures, on or after January 1, 2013. If a resource had a nameplate capacity uprate, ERCs may be issued only for the difference in generation between its uprated nameplate capacity and its nameplate capacity prior to the uprate. ERCs must not be issued for generation for an uprate that followed a derate that occurred on or after January 1, 2013. A resource that is relicensed or receives a license extension is considered existing capacity and is not an eligible resource, unless it receives a capacity uprate as a result of the relicensing process that is reflected in its relicensed permit. In such a case, only the difference in nameplate capacity between its relicensed permit and its prior permit is eligible to be issued ERCs.

(2) The resource must be connected to, and deliver energy to or save electricity on, the electric grid in the contiguous United States.

(3) The resource must be located in either:

(i) A State whose affected EGUs are subject to rate-based emission standards pursuant to this regulation; or

(ii) A State with a mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal, and the resource can demonstrate (e.g., through a power purchase agreement or contract for delivery) that the electricity generated is delivered with the intention to meet load in a State with affected EGUs which are subject to rate-based emission standards pursuant to this regulation, and was treated as a generation resource used to serve regional load that included the State whose affected EGUs are subject to rate-based emission standards. Notwithstanding any other provision of paragraph (a)(4) of this section, the only type of eligible resource in the State with mass-based emission standards is renewable generating technologies listed in (a)(4)(i) of this section.

(4) The resource falls into one of the following categories of resources:

(i) Renewable electric generating technologies using one of the following renewable energy resources: Wind, solar, geothermal, hydro, wave, tidal;

(ii) Qualified biomass;

(iii) Waste-to-energy (biogenic portion only);

(iv) Nuclear power;

(v) A non-affected combined heat and power (CHP) unit, including waste heat power;

(vi) A demand-side EE or demand-side management measure that saves electricity and is calculated on the basis of quantified ex post savings, not “projected” or “claimed” savings; or

(vii) A category identified in a State plan and approved by the EPA to generate ERCs.

(b) Any resource that does not meet the requirements of this subpart or an approved State plan cannot be issued ERCs for use by an affected EGU with its compliance demonstration required under § 60.5790(c).

(c) ERCs may not be issued to or for any of the following:

(1) New, modified, or reconstructed EGUs that are subject to subpart TTTT of this part, except CHP units that meet the requirements of a CHP unit under paragraph (a);

(2) EGUs that do not meet the applicability requirements of §§ 60.5845 and 60.5850, except CHP units that meet the requirements of a CHP unit under paragraph (a);

(3) Measures that reduce CO<sub>2</sub> emissions outside the electric power sector, including, for example, GHG offset projects representing emission reductions that occur in the forestry and agriculture sectors, direct air capture, and crediting of CO<sub>2</sub> emission reductions that occur in the transportation sector as a result of vehicle electrification; and

(4) Any measure not approved by the EPA for issuance of ERCs in connection with a specific State plan.

(d) You must include the appropriate requirements in paragraphs (d)(1) through (3) of this section for an applicable eligible resource in your plan.

(1) If qualified biomass is an eligible resource, the plan must include a description of why the proposed feedstocks or feedstock categories should qualify as an approach for controlling increases of CO<sub>2</sub> levels in the atmosphere as well as the proposed valuation of biogenic CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. In addition, for sustainably-derived agricultural and forest biomass feedstocks, the state plan must adequately demonstrate that such feedstocks appropriately control increases of CO<sub>2</sub> levels in the atmosphere and methods for adequately monitoring and verifying these feedstock sources and related sustainability practices. For all qualified biomass feedstocks, plans must specify how biogenic CO<sub>2</sub> emissions will be monitored and reported, and identify specific EM&V, tracking and auditing approaches.

(2) If waste-to-energy is an eligible resource, the plan must assess both the

capacity to strengthen existing or implement new waste reduction, reuse, recycling and composting programs, and measures to minimize any potential negative impacts of waste-to-energy operations on such programs. Additionally the plan must include a method for determining the proportion of total MWh generation from a waste-to-energy facility that is eligible for use in adjusting a CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate (*i.e.*, that which is generated from biogenic materials).

(3) If carbon capture and utilization (CCU) is an eligible resource in a plan, the plan must include analysis supporting how the proposed qualifying CCU technology results in CO<sub>2</sub> emission mitigation from affected EGUs and provide monitoring, reporting, and verification requirements to demonstrate the reductions.

(e) States and areas of Indian country that do not have any affected EGUs, and other countries, may provide ERCs to adjust CO<sub>2</sub> emissions provided they are connected to the contiguous U.S. grid and meet the other requirements for eligibility and eligible resources and the issuance of ERCs included in these emission guidelines, except that such States and other countries may not provide ERCs from resources described in § 60.5800(a)(4)(vi).

#### **§ 60.5805 What is the process for the issuance of ERCs?**

If your plan uses ERCs your plan must include the process and requirements for issuance of ERCs to affected EGUs and eligible resources set forth in paragraphs (a) through (f) of this section.

(a) *Eligibility application.* Your plan must require that, to receive ERCs, the owner or operator must submit an eligibility application to you that demonstrates that the requirements of your State plan as approved by the EPA as meeting § 60.5795 (for an affected EGU) or § 60.5800 (for an eligible resource) are met, and, in the case of an eligible resource, includes at a minimum:

(1) Documentation that the eligibility application has only been submitted to you, or pursuant to an EPA-approved multi-State collaborative approach;

(2) An EM&V plan that meets the requirements of the State plan as approved by the EPA as meeting § 60.5830; and

(3) A verification report from an independent verifier that verifies the eligibility of the eligible resource to be issued an ERC and that the EM&V plan meets the requirements of the State plan as approved by the EPA of meeting § 60.5805.

(b) *Registration.* Your plan must require that any affected EGU or eligible resource register with an ERC tracking system that meets the requirements of § 60.5810 prior to the issuance of ERCs, and your plan must specify that you will only register an affected EGU or eligible resource after you approve its eligibility application and determine that the requirements of paragraph (a) of this section are met.

(c) *M&V reports.* For an eligible resource registered pursuant to paragraph (b) of this section, your plan must require that, prior to issuance of ERCs by you, the owner or operator must submit the following:

(1) An M&V report that meets the requirements of your State plan as approved by the EPA as meeting § 60.5835; and

(2) A verification report from an independent verifier that verifies that the requirements for the M&V report are met.

(e) *Issuance of ERCs.* Your plan must specify your procedure for issuance of ERCs based on your review of an M&V report and verification report, and must require that ERCs be issued only on the basis of energy actually generated or saved, and that only one ERC is issued for each verified MWh.

(f) *Tracking system.* Your plan must require that ERCs may only be issued through an ERC tracking system approved as part of the State plan.

(g) *Error adjustment.* Your plan must include a mechanism to adjust the number of ERCs issued if any are issued based on error (clerical, formula input error, etc.).

(h) *Qualification status of an eligible resource.* Your plan must include a mechanism to temporarily or permanently revoke the qualification status of an eligible resource, such that it can no longer be issued ERCs for at least the duration that it does not meet the requirements for being issued ERCs in your State plan.

(i) *Qualification status of an independent verifier—(1) Eligibility.* To be an independent verifier, a person must be approved by the State as:

(A) An independent verifier, as defined by this regulation; and

(B) Eligible to verify eligibility applications, EM&V plans, and/or M&V reports per the requirements of the approved State plan as meeting §§ 60.5830 and 60.5835 respectively.

(2) *Revocation of qualification.* Your plan must include a mechanism to temporarily or permanently revoke the qualification status of an independent verifier, such that it can no longer verify eligibility applications, EM&V plans or M&V reports for at least the duration of

the period it does not meet the requirements of your State plan.

#### **§ 60.5810 What applicable requirements are there for an ERC tracking system?**

(a) Your plan must include provisions for an ERC tracking system, if applicable, that meets the following requirements:

(1) It electronically records the issuance of ERCs, transfers of ERCs among accounts, surrender of ERCs by affected EGUs as part of a compliance demonstration, and retirement or cancellation of ERCs; and

(2) It documents and provides electronic, internet-based public access to all information that supports the eligibility of eligible resources and issuance of ERCs and functionality to generate reports based on such information, which must include, for each ERC, an eligibility application, EM&V plan, M&V reports, and independent verifier verification reports.

(b) If approved in a State plan, an ERC tracking system may provide for transfers of ERCs to or from another ERC tracking system approved in a State plan, or provide for transfers of ERCs to or from an EPA-administered ERC tracking system used to administer a Federal plan.

#### **Mass Allocation Requirements**

#### **§ 60.5815 What are the requirements for State allocation of allowances in a mass-based program?**

(a) For a mass-based trading program, a State plan must include requirements for CO<sub>2</sub> allowance allocations according to paragraphs (b) through (f) of this section.

(b) Provisions for allocation of allowances for each compliance period prior to the beginning of the compliance period.

(c) Provisions for allocation of set-aside allowance, if applicable, must be established to ensure that the eligible resources must meet the same requirements for the ERC eligible resource requirements of § 60.5800, and the State must include eligibility application and verification provisions equivalent to those for ERCs in § 60.5805 and EM&V plan and M&V report provisions that meet the requirements of § 60.5830 and § 60.5835.

(d) Provisions for adjusting allocations if the affected EGUs or eligible resources are incorrectly allocated CO<sub>2</sub> allowances.

(e) Provisions allowing for or restricting banking of allowances between compliance periods for affected EGUs.



(f) Provisions not allowing any borrowing of allowances from future compliance periods by affected EGUs.

**§ 60.5820 What are my allowance tracking requirements?**

(a) Your plan must include provisions for an allowance tracking system, if applicable, that meets the following requirements:

(1) It electronically records the issuance of allowances, transfers of allowances among accounts, surrender of allowances by affected EGUs as part of a compliance demonstration, and retirement of allowances; and

(2) It documents and provides electronic, internet-based public access to all information that supports the eligibility of eligible resources and issuance of set aside allowances, if applicable, and functionality to generate reports based on such information, which must include, for each set aside allowance, an eligibility application, EM&V plan, M&V reports, and independent verifier verification reports.

(b) If approved in a State plan, an allowance tracking system may provide for transfers of allowances to or from another allowance tracking system approved in a State plan, or provide for transfers of allowances to or from an EPA-administered allowance tracking system used to administer a Federal plan.

**§ 60.5825 What is the process for affected EGUs to demonstrate compliance in a mass-based program?**

(a) A plan must require an affected EGU's owners or operators to demonstrate compliance with emission standards in a mass based program by holding an amount of allowances not less than the tons of total CO<sub>2</sub> emissions for such compliance period from the affected EGUs in the account for the affected EGU's emissions in the allowance tracking system required under § 60.5820 during the applicable compliance period.

(b) In a mass-based trading program a plan may allow multiple affected EGUs co-located at the same facility to demonstrate that they are meeting the applicable emission standards on a facility-wide basis by the owner or operator holding enough allowances to cover the CO<sub>2</sub> emissions of all the affected EGUs at the facility.

(1) If there are not enough allowances to cover the facility's affected EGUs' CO<sub>2</sub> emissions then there must be provisions for determining the compliance status of each affected EGU located at that facility.

(2) [Reserved]

**Evaluation Measurement and Verification Plans and Monitoring and Verification Reports**

**§ 60.5830 What are the requirements for EM&V plans for eligible resources?**

(a) If your plan requires your affected EGUs to meet their emission standards in accordance with § 60.5790, your plan must include requirements that any EM&V plan that is submitted in accordance with the requirements of § 60.5805, in support of the issuance of an ERC or set-aside allowance that can be used in accordance with § 60.5790, must meet the EM&V criteria approved as part of your State plan.

(b) Your plan must require each EM&V plan to include identification of the eligible resource.

(c) Your plan must require that an EM&V plan must contain specific criteria, as applicable to the specific eligible resource.

(1) For RE resources, your plan must include requirements discussing how the generation data will be physically measured on a continuous basis using, for example, a revenue-quality meter.

(2) For demand-side EE, your plan must require that each EM&V plan quantify and verify electricity savings on a retrospective (ex-post) basis using industry best-practice EM&V protocols and methods that yield accurate and reliable measurements of electricity savings. Your plan must also require each EM&V plan to include an assessment of the independent factors that influence the electricity savings, the expected life of the savings (in years), and a baseline that represents what would have happened in the absence of the demand-side EE activity.

Additionally, your plan must require that each EM&V plan include a demonstration of how the industry best-practices protocol and methods were applied to the specific activity, project, measure, or program covered in the EM&V plan, and include an explanation of why these protocols or methods were selected. EM&V plans must require eligible resources to demonstrate how all such best-practice approaches will be applied for the purposes of quantifying and verifying MWh results. Subsequent reporting of demand-side EE savings values must demonstrate and explain how the EM&V plan was followed.

**§ 60.5835 What are the requirements for M&V reports for eligible resources?**

(a) If your plan requires your affected EGUs to meet their emission standards in accordance with § 60.5790, your plan must include requirements that any M&V report that is submitted in accordance with the requirements of

§ 60.5805, in support of the issuance of an ERC or set-aside allocation that can be used in accordance with § 60.5790, must meet the requirements of this section.

(b) Your plan must require that each M&V report include the following:

(1) For the first M&V report submitted, documentation that the energy-generating resources, energy-saving measures, or practices were installed or implemented consistent with the description in the approved eligibility application required in § 60.5805(a).

(2) Each M&V report submitted must include the following:

(i) Identification of the time period covered by the M&V report;

(ii) A description of how relevant quantification methods, protocols, guidelines, and guidance specified in the EM&V plan were applied during the reporting period to generate the quantified MWh of generation or MWh of energy savings;

(iii) Documentation (including data) of the energy generation and/or energy savings from any activity, project, measure, resource, or program addressed in the EM&V plan, quantified and verified in MWh for the period covered by the M&V report, in accordance with its EM&V plan, and based on ex-post energy generation or savings; and

(iv) Documentation of any change in the energy generation or savings capability of the eligible resource from the description of the resource in the approved eligibility application during the period covered by the M&V report and the date on which the change occurred, and/or demonstration that the eligible resource continued to meet the requirements of § 60.5800.

**Applicability of Plans to Affected EGUs**

**§ 60.5840 Does this subpart directly affect EGU owners or operators in my State?**

(a) This subpart does not directly affect EGU owners or operators in your State. However, affected EGU owners or operators must comply with the plan that a State or States develop to implement the emission guidelines contained in this subpart.

(b) If a State does not submit a final plan to implement and enforce the emission guidelines contained in this subpart, or an initial submittal for which an extension to submit a final plan can be granted, by September 6, 2016, or the EPA disapproves a final plan, the EPA will implement and enforce a Federal plan, as provided in § 60.5720, applicable to each affected EGU within the State that commenced

construction on or before January 8, 2014.

**§ 60.5845 What affected EGUs must I address in my State plan?**

(a) The EGUs that must be addressed by your plan are any affected steam generating unit, IGCC, or stationary combustion turbine that commenced construction on or before January 8, 2014.

(b) An affected EGU is a steam generating unit, IGCC, or stationary combustion turbine that meets the relevant applicability conditions specified in paragraph (b)(1) through (3) of this section, as applicable, except as provided in § 60.5850.

(1) Serves a generator or generators connected to a utility power distribution system with a nameplate capacity greater than 25 MW-net (*i.e.*, capable of selling greater than 25 MW of electricity);

(2) Has a base load rating (*i.e.*, design heat input capacity) greater than 260 GJ/hr (250 MMBtu/hr) heat input of fossil fuel (either alone or in combination with any other fuel); and

(3) Stationary combustion turbines that meet the definition of either a combined cycle or combined heat and power combustion turbine.

**§ 60.5850 What EGUs are excluded from being affected EGUs?**

EGUs that are excluded from being affected EGUs are:

(a) EGUs that are subject to subpart TTTT of this part as a result of commencing construction after the subpart TTTT applicability date;

(b) Steam generating units and IGCCs that are, and always have been, subject to a federally enforceable permit limiting annual net-electric sales to one-third or less of its potential electric output, or 219,000 MWh or less;

(c) Non-fossil units (*i.e.*, units that are capable of combusting 50 percent or more non-fossil fuel) that have always historically limited the use of fossil fuels to 10 percent or less of the annual capacity factor or are subject to a federally enforceable permit limiting fossil fuel use to 10 percent or less of the annual capacity factor;

(d) Stationary combustion turbines not capable of combusting natural gas (*e.g.*, not connected to a natural gas pipeline);

(e) EGUs that are combined heat and power units that have always historically limited, or are subject to a federally enforceable permit limiting, annual net-electric sales to a utility distribution system to no more than the greater of either 219,000 MWh or the product of the design efficiency and the potential electric output;

(f) EGUs that serve a generator along with other steam generating unit(s), IGCC(s), or stationary combustion turbine(s) where the effective generation capacity (determined based on a prorated output of the base load rating of each steam generating unit, IGCC, or stationary combustion turbine) is 25 MW or less;

(g) EGUs that are a municipal waste combustor unit that is subject to subpart Eb of this part; and

(h) EGUs that are a commercial or industrial solid waste incineration unit that is subject to subpart CCCC of this part.

**§ 60.5855 What are the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates for affected EGUs?**

(a) You must require, in your plan, emission standards on affected EGUs to meet the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates listed in Table 1 of this subpart except as provided in paragraph (b) of this section. In addition, you must set CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates for the interim steps, according to paragraph (a)(1) of this section, except as provided in paragraph (b) of this section.

(1) You must set CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates for your affected EGUs to meet during the interim step periods on average and as applicable for the two subcategories of affected EGUs.

(2) [Reserved]

(b) You may elect to require your affected EGUs to meet emission standards that differ from the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates listed in Table 1 of this subpart, provided that you demonstrate that the affected EGUs in your State will collectively meet their CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate by achieving statewide emission goals that are equivalent and no less stringent than the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates listed in Table 1, and provided that your equivalent statewide CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals take one of the following forms:

(1) Average statewide rate-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals listed in Table 2 of this subpart, except as provided in paragraphs (c) and (d); or

(2) Cumulative statewide mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals listed in Table 3 of this subpart, except as provided in paragraphs (c) and (d) of this section.

(c) If your plan meets CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals listed in paragraphs (b)(1) or (2) of this section you must develop your own interim step goals and final reporting period goal for your affected EGUs to meet either on average (in the case of rate-based goals) or cumulatively (in the case of mass-based goals). Additionally the following applies if you develop your own goals:

(1) The interim period and interim steps CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals must be in the

same form, either both rate (in units of pounds per net MWh) or both mass (in tons); and

(2) You must set interim step goals that will either on average or cumulatively meet the State's interim period goal, as applicable to a rate-based or mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal.

(d) Your plan's interim period and final period CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals required to be met pursuant to paragraph (b)(1) or (2) of this section, may be changed in the plan only according to situations listed in paragraphs (d)(1) through (3) of this section. If a situation requires a plan revision, you must follow the procedures in § 60.5785 to submit a plan revision.

(1) If your plan implements CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals, you may submit a plan or plan revision, allowed in § 60.5785, to make corrections to them, subject to EPA's approval, as a result of changes in the inventory of affected EGUs; and

(2) If you elect to require your affected EGUs to meet emission standards to meet mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goals in your plan, you may elect to incorporate, as a matter of state law, the mass emissions from EGUs that are subject to subpart TTTT of this part that are considered new affected EGUs under subpart TTTT of this part.

(e) If your plan relies upon State measures in addition to or in lieu of emission standards, you must only use the mass-based goals allowed for in paragraph (b)(2) of this section to demonstrate that your affected EGUs are meeting the required emissions performance.

(f) Nothing in this subpart precludes an affected EGU from complying with its emission standard or you from meeting your obligations under the State plan.

**§ 60.5860 What applicable monitoring, recordkeeping, and reporting requirements do I need to include in my plan for affected EGUs?**

(a) Your plan must include monitoring for affected EGUs that is no less stringent than what is described in (a)(1) through (8) of this section.

(1) The owner or operator of an affected EGU (or group of affected EGUs that share a monitored common stack) that is required to meet rate-based or mass-based emission standards must prepare a monitoring plan in accordance with the applicable provisions in § 75.53(g) and (h) of this chapter, unless such a plan is already in place under another program that requires CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions to be monitored and reported according to part 75 of this chapter.

(2) For rate-based emission standards, each compliance period shall include



only “valid operating hours” in the compliance period, *i.e.*, full or partial unit (or stack) operating hours for which:

(i) “Valid data” (as defined in § 60.5880) are obtained for all of the parameters used to determine the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions (lbs). For the purposes of this subpart, substitute data recorded under part 75 of this chapter are not considered to be valid data; and

(ii) The corresponding hourly net energy output value is also valid data (**Note:** For operating hours with no useful output, zero is considered to be a valid value).

(3) For rate-based emission standards, the owner or operator of an affected EGU must measure and report the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions (lbs) from each affected unit using the procedures in paragraphs (a)(3)(i) through (vi) of this section, except as otherwise provided in paragraph (a)(4) of this section.

(i) The owner or operator of an affected EGU must install, certify, operate, maintain, and calibrate a CO<sub>2</sub> continuous emissions monitoring system (CEMS) to directly measure and record CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations in the affected EGU exhaust gases emitted to the atmosphere and an exhaust gas flow rate monitoring system according to § 75.10(a)(3)(i) of this chapter. As an alternative to direct measurement of CO<sub>2</sub> concentration, provided that the affected EGU does not use carbon separation (*e.g.*, carbon capture and storage), the owner or operator of an affected EGU may use data from a certified oxygen (O<sub>2</sub>) monitor to calculate hourly average CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations, in accordance with § 75.10(a)(3)(iii) of this chapter. However, when an O<sub>2</sub> monitor is used this way, it only quantifies the combustion CO<sub>2</sub>; therefore, if the EGU is equipped with emission controls that produce non-combustion CO<sub>2</sub> (*e.g.*, from sorbent injection), this additional CO<sub>2</sub> must be accounted for, in accordance with section 3 of appendix G to part 75 of this chapter. If CO<sub>2</sub> concentration is measured on a dry basis, the owner or operator of the affected EGU must also install, certify, operate, maintain, and calibrate a continuous moisture monitoring system, according to § 75.11(b) of this chapter. Alternatively, the owner or operator of an affected EGU may either use an appropriate fuel-specific default moisture value from § 75.11(b) or submit a petition to the Administrator under § 75.66 of this chapter for a site-specific default moisture value.

(ii) For each “valid operating hour” (as defined in paragraph (a)(2) of this

section), calculate the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emission rate (tons/hr), either from Equation F–11 in Appendix F to part 75 of this chapter (if CO<sub>2</sub> concentration is measured on a wet basis), or by following the procedure in section 4.2 of Appendix F to part 75 of this chapter (if CO<sub>2</sub> concentration is measured on a dry basis).

(iii) Next, multiply each hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emission rate by the EGU or stack operating time in hours (as defined in § 72.2 of this chapter), to convert it to tons of CO<sub>2</sub>. Multiply the result by 2,000 lbs/ton to convert it to lbs.

(iv) The hourly CO<sub>2</sub> tons/hr values and EGU (or stack) operating times used to calculate CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions are required to be recorded under § 75.57(e) of this chapter and must be reported electronically under § 75.64(a)(6), if required by a plan. The owner or operator must use these data, or equivalent data, to calculate the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions.

(v) Sum all of the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions values from paragraph (a)(3)(ii) of this section over the entire compliance period.

(vi) For each continuous monitoring system used to determine the CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions from an affected EGU, the monitoring system must meet the applicable certification and quality assurance procedures in § 75.20 of this chapter and Appendices A and B to part 75 of this chapter.

(4) The owner or operator of an affected EGU that exclusively combusts liquid fuel and/or gaseous fuel may, as an alternative to complying with paragraph (a)(3) of this section, determine the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions according to paragraphs (a)(4)(i) through (a)(4)(vi) of this section.

(i) Implement the applicable procedures in appendix D to part 75 of this chapter to determine hourly EGU heat input rates (MMBtu/hr), based on hourly measurements of fuel flow rate and periodic determinations of the gross calorific value (GCV) of each fuel combusted. The fuel flow meter(s) used to measure the hourly fuel flow rates must meet the applicable certification and quality-assurance requirements in sections 2.1.5 and 2.1.6 of appendix D to part 75 (except for qualifying commercial billing meters). The fuel GCV must be determined in accordance with section 2.2 or 2.3 of appendix D, as applicable.

(ii) For each measured hourly heat input rate, use Equation G–4 in Appendix G to part 75 of this chapter to calculate the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emission rate (tons/hr).

(iii) For each “valid operating hour” (as defined in paragraph (a)(2) of this

section), multiply the hourly tons/hr CO<sub>2</sub> mass emission rate from paragraph (a)(4)(ii) of this section by the EGU or stack operating time in hours (as defined in § 72.2 of this chapter), to convert it to tons of CO<sub>2</sub>. Then, multiply the result by 2,000 lbs/ton to convert it to lbs.

(iv) The hourly CO<sub>2</sub> tons/hr values and EGU (or stack) operating times used to calculate CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions are required to be recorded under § 75.57(e) of this chapter and must be reported electronically under § 75.64(a)(6), if required by a plan. You must use these data, or equivalent data, to calculate the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions.

(v) Sum all of the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions values (lb) from paragraph (a)(4)(iii) of this section over the entire compliance period.

(vi) The owner or operator of an affected EGU may determine site-specific carbon-based F-factors (F<sub>c</sub>) using Equation F–7b in section 3.3.6 of appendix F to part 75 of this chapter, and may use these F<sub>c</sub> values in the emissions calculations instead of using the default F<sub>c</sub> values in the Equation G–4 nomenclature.

(5) For both rate-based and mass-based standards, the owner or operator of an affected EGU (or group of affected units that share a monitored common stack) must install, calibrate, maintain, and operate a sufficient number of watt meters to continuously measure and record on an hourly basis net electric output. Measurements must be performed using 0.2 accuracy class electricity metering instrumentation and calibration procedures as specified under ANSI Standards No. C12.20. Further, the owner or operator of an affected EGU that is a combined heat and power facility must install, calibrate, maintain and operate equipment to continuously measure and record on an hourly basis useful thermal output and, if applicable, mechanical output, which are used with net electric output to determine net energy output. The owner or operator must use the following procedures to calculate net energy output, as appropriate for the type of affected EGU(s).

(i) Determine P<sub>net</sub> the hourly net energy output in MWh. For rate-based standards, perform this calculation only for valid operating hours (as defined in paragraph (a)(2) of this section). For mass-based standards, perform this calculation for all unit (or stack) operating hours, *i.e.*, full or partial hours in which any fuel is combusted.

(ii) If there is no net electrical output, but there is mechanical or useful thermal output, either for a particular valid operating hour (for rate-based

applications), or for a particular operating hour (for mass-based applications), the owner or operator of the affected EGU must still determine the net energy output for that hour.

(iii) For rate-based applications, if there is no (*i.e.*, zero) gross electrical, mechanical, or useful thermal output for a particular valid operating hour, that

hour must be used in the compliance determination. For hours or partial hours where the gross electric output is equal to or less than the auxiliary loads, net electric output shall be counted as zero for this calculation.

(iv) Calculate  $P_{net}$  for your affected EGU (or group of affected EGUs that share a monitored common stack) using

$$P_{net} = \frac{(Pe)_{ST} + (Pe)_{CT} + (Pe)_{IE} - (Pe)_A}{TDF} + [(Pt)_{PS} + (Pt)_{HR} + (Pt)_{IE}]$$

Where:

$P_{net}$  = Net energy output of your affected EGU for each valid operating hour (as defined in 60.5860(a)(2)) in MWh.

$(Pe)_{ST}$  = Electric energy output plus mechanical energy output (if any) of steam turbines in MWh.

$(Pe)_{CT}$  = Electric energy output plus mechanical energy output (if any) of stationary combustion turbine(s) in MWh.

$(Pe)_{IE}$  = Electric energy output plus mechanical energy output (if any) of your affected EGU's integrated equipment that provides electricity or mechanical energy to the affected EGU or auxiliary equipment in MWh.

$(Pe)_A$  = Electric energy used for any auxiliary loads in MWh.

$(Pt)_{PS}$  = Useful thermal output of steam (measured relative to SATP conditions, as applicable) that is used for applications that do not generate additional electricity, produce mechanical energy output, or enhance the performance of the affected EGU. This is calculated using the equation specified in paragraph (a)(5)(v) of this section in MWh.

$(Pt)_{HR}$  = Non-steam useful thermal output (measured relative to SATP conditions, as applicable) from heat recovery that is used for applications other than steam generation or performance enhancement of the affected EGU in MWh.

$(Pt)_{IE}$  = Useful thermal output (relative to SATP conditions, as applicable) from any integrated equipment is used for applications that do not generate additional steam, electricity, produce mechanical energy output, or enhance the performance of the affected EGU in MWh.

TDF = Electric Transmission and Distribution Factor of 0.95 for a combined heat and power affected EGU where at least on an annual basis 20.0 percent of the total gross or net energy output consists of electric or direct mechanical output and 20.0 percent of the total net energy output consist of useful thermal output on a 12-operating month rolling average basis, or 1.0 for all other affected EGUs.

(v) If applicable to your affected EGU (for example, for combined heat and power), you must calculate  $(Pt)_{PS}$  using the following equation:

$$(Pt)_{PS} = \frac{Q_m \times H}{CF}$$

Where:

$Q_m$  = Measured steam flow in kilograms (kg) (or pounds (lbs)) for the operating hour.

$H$  = Enthalpy of the steam at measured temperature and pressure (relative to SATP conditions or the energy in the condensate return line, as applicable) in Joules per kilogram (J/kg) (or Btu/lb).

$CF$  = Conversion factor of  $3.6 \times 10^9$  J/MWh or  $3.413 \times 10^6$  Btu/MWh.

(vi) For rate-based standards, sum all of the values of  $P_{net}$  for the valid operating hours (as defined in paragraph (a)(2) of this section), over the entire compliance period. Then, divide the total CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions for the valid operating hours from paragraph (a)(3)(v) or (a)(4)(v) of this section, as applicable, by the sum of the  $P_{net}$  values for the valid operating hours plus any ERC replacement generation (as shown in § 60.5790(c)), to determine the CO<sub>2</sub> emissions rate (lb/net MWh) for the compliance period.

(vii) For mass-based standards, sum all of the values of  $P_{net}$  for all operating hours, over the entire compliance period.

(8) In accordance with § 60.13(g), if two or more affected EGUs implementing the continuous emissions monitoring provisions in paragraph (a)(2) of this section share a common exhaust gas stack and are subject to the same emissions standard, the owner or operator may monitor the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions at the common stack in lieu of monitoring each EGU separately. If an owner or operator of an affected EGU chooses this option, the hourly net electric output for the common stack must be the sum of the hourly net electric output of the individual affected EGUs and the operating time must be expressed as "stack operating hours" (as defined in § 72.2 of this chapter).

(7) In accordance with § 60.13(g), if the exhaust gases from an affected EGU implementing the continuous emissions monitoring provisions in paragraph (a)(2) of this section are emitted to the

the following equation. All terms in the equation must be expressed in units of MWh. To convert each hourly net energy output value reported under part 75 of this chapter to MWh, multiply by the corresponding EGU or stack operating time.

atmosphere through multiple stacks (or if the exhaust gases are routed to a common stack through multiple ducts and you elect to monitor in the ducts), the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions and the "stack operating time" (as defined in § 72.2 of this chapter) at each stack or duct must be monitored separately. In this case, the owner or operator of an affected EGU must determine compliance with an applicable emissions standard by summing the CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions measured at the individual stacks or ducts and dividing by the net energy output for the affected EGU.

(8) Consistent with § 60.5775 or § 60.5780, if two or more affected EGUs serve a common electric generator, you must apportion the combined hourly net energy output to the individual affected EGUs according to the fraction of the total steam load contributed by each EGU. Alternatively, if the EGUs are identical, you may apportion the combined hourly net electrical load to the individual EGUs according to the fraction of the total heat input contributed by each EGU.

(b) For mass-based standards, the owner or operator of an affected EGU must determine the CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions (tons) for the compliance period as follows:

(1) For each operating hour, calculate the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass (tons) according to paragraph (a)(3) or (4) of this section, except that a complete data record is required, *i.e.*, CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions must be reported for each operating hour. Therefore, substitute data values recorded under part 75 of this chapter for CO<sub>2</sub> concentration, stack gas flow rate, stack gas moisture content, fuel flow rate and/or GCV shall be used in the calculations; and

(2) Sum all of the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions values over the entire compliance period.

(3) The owner or operator of an affected EGU must install, calibrate, maintain, and operate a sufficient number of watt meters to continuously

measure and record on an hourly basis net electric output. Measurements must be performed using 0.2 accuracy class electricity metering instrumentation and calibration procedures as specified under ANSI Standards No. C12.20. Further, the owner or operator of an affected EGU that is a combined heat and power facility must install, calibrate, maintain and operate equipment to continuously measure and record on an hourly basis useful thermal output and, if applicable, mechanical output, which are used with net electric output to determine net energy output ( $P_{net}$ ). The owner or operator must calculate net energy output according to paragraphs (a)(5)(i)(A) and (B) of this section.

(c) Your plan must require the owner or operator of each affected EGU covered by your plan to maintain the records, as described in paragraphs (b)(1) and (2) of this section, for at least 5 years following the date of each compliance period, occurrence, measurement, maintenance, corrective action, report, or record.

(1) The owner or operator of an affected EGU must maintain each record on site for at least 2 years after the date of each compliance period, occurrence, measurement, maintenance, corrective action, report, or record, whichever is latest, according to § 60.7. The owner or operator of an affected EGU may maintain the records off site and electronically for the remaining year(s).

(2) The owner or operator of an affected EGU must keep all of the following records, in a form suitable and readily available for expeditious review:

(i) All documents, data files, and calculations and methods used to demonstrate compliance with an affected EGU's emission standard under § 60.5775.

(ii) Copies of all reports submitted to the State under paragraph (c) of this section.

(iii) Data that are required to be recorded by 40 CFR part 75 subpart F.

(iv) Data with respect to any ERCs generated by the affected EGU or used by the affected EGU in its compliance demonstration including the information in paragraphs (c)(2)(iv)(A) and (B) of this section.

(A) All documents related to any ERCs used in a compliance demonstration, including each eligibility application, EM&V plan, M&V report, and independent verifier verification report associated with the issuance of each specific ERC.

(B) All records and reports relating to the surrender and retirement of ERCs for compliance with this regulation, including the date each individual ERC

with a unique serial identification number was surrendered and/or retired.

(d) Your plan must require the owner or operator of an affected EGU covered by your plan to include in a report submitted to you at the end of each compliance period the information in paragraphs (d)(1) through (5) of this section.

(1) Owners or operators of an affected EGU must include in the report all hourly CO<sub>2</sub> emissions, for each affected EGU (or group of affected EGUs that share a monitored common stack).

(2) For rate-based standards, each report must include:

(i) The hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emission rate values (tons/hr) and unit (or stack) operating times, (as monitored and reported according to part 75 of this chapter), for each valid operating hour in the compliance period;

(ii) The net electric output and the net energy output ( $P_{net}$ ) values for each valid operating hour in the compliance period;

(iii) The calculated CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions (lb) for each valid operating hour in the compliance period;

(iv) The sum of the hourly net energy output values and the sum of the hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions values, for all of the valid operating hours in the compliance period;

(v) ERC replacement generation (if any), properly justified (see paragraph (c)(5) of this section); and

(vi) The calculated CO<sub>2</sub> mass emission rate for the compliance period (lbs/net MWh).

(3) For mass-based standards, each report must include:

(i) The hourly CO<sub>2</sub> mass emission rate value (tons/hr) and unit (or stack) operating time, as monitored and reported according to part 75 of this chapter, for each unit or stack operating hour in the compliance period;

(ii) The calculated CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions (tons) for each unit or stack operating hour in the compliance period;

(iii) The sum of the CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions (tons) for all of the unit or stack operating hours in the compliance period;

(iv) The net electric output and the net energy output ( $P_{net}$ ) values for each unit or stack operating hour in the compliance period; and

(v) The sum of the hourly net energy output values for all of the unit or stack operating hours in the compliance period.

(vi) Notwithstanding the requirements in paragraphs (c)(3)(i) through (c)(3)(iii) of this section, if the compliance period is a discrete number of calendar years (e.g., one year, three years), in lieu of

reporting the information specified in those paragraphs, the owner or operator may report:

(A) The cumulative annual CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions (tons) for each year of the compliance period, derived from the electronic emissions report for the fourth calendar quarter of that year, submitted to EPA under § 75.64(a) of this chapter; and

(B) The sum of the cumulative annual CO<sub>2</sub> mass emissions values from paragraph (c)(3)(v)(A) of this section, if the compliance period includes multiple years.

(4) For each affected EGU's compliance period, the report must also include the applicable emission standard and demonstration that it met the emission standard. An owner or operator must also include in the report the affected EGU's calculated emission performance as a CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate or cumulative mass in units of the emission standard required in §§ 60.5790(b) through (c) and 60.5855, as applicable.

(5) If the owner or operator of an affected EGU is complying with an emission standard by using ERCs, they must include in the report a list of all unique ERC serial numbers that were retired in the compliance period, and, for each ERC, the date an ERC was surrendered and retired and eligible resource identification information sufficient to demonstrate that it meets the requirements of § 60.5800 and qualifies to be issued ERCs (including location, type of qualifying generation or savings, date commenced generating or saving, and date of generation or savings for which the ERC was issued).

(6) If the owner or operator of an affected EGU is complying with an emission standard by using allowances, they must include in the report a list of all unique allowance serial numbers that were retired in the compliance period, and, for each allowance, the date an allowance was surrendered and retired and if the allowance was a set-aside allowance the eligible resource identification information sufficient to demonstrate that it meets the requirements of § 60.5815(c) and qualifies to be issued set-aside allowances (including location, type of qualifying generation or savings, date commenced generating or saving, and date of generation or savings for which the allowance was issued).

(e) The owner or operator of an affected EGU must follow any additional requirements for monitoring, recordkeeping and reporting in a plan that are required under § 60.5745(a)(4), if applicable.



(f) If an affected EGU captures CO<sub>2</sub> to meet the applicable emission limit, the owner or operator must report in accordance with the requirements of 40 CFR part 98 subpart PP and either:

(1) Report in accordance with the requirements of 40 CFR part 98 subpart RR, if injection occurs on-site;

(2) Transfer the captured CO<sub>2</sub> to an EGU or facility that reports in accordance with the requirements of 40 CFR part 98 subpart RR, if injection occurs off-site; or

(3) Transfer the captured CO<sub>2</sub> to a facility that has received an innovative technology waiver from EPA pursuant to paragraph (g) of this section.

(g) Any person may request the Administrator to issue a waiver of the requirement that captured CO<sub>2</sub> from an affected EGU be transferred to a facility reporting under 40 CFR part 98 subpart RR. To receive a waiver, the applicant must demonstrate to the Administrator that its technology will store captured CO<sub>2</sub> as effectively as geologic sequestration, and that the proposed technology will not cause or contribute to an unreasonable risk to public health, welfare, or safety. In making this determination, the Administrator shall consider (among other factors) operating history of the technology, whether the technology will increase emissions or other releases of any pollutant other than CO<sub>2</sub>, and permanence of the CO<sub>2</sub> storage. The Administrator may test the system itself, or require the applicant to perform any tests considered by the Administrator to be necessary to show the technology's effectiveness, safety, and ability to store captured CO<sub>2</sub> without release. The Administrator may grant conditional approval of a technology, the approval conditioned on monitoring and reporting of operations. The Administrator may also withdraw approval of the waiver on evidence of releases of CO<sub>2</sub> or other pollutants. The Administrator will provide notice to the public of any application under this provision, and provide public notice of any proposed action on a petition before the Administrator takes final action.

### **Recordkeeping and Reporting Requirements**

#### **§ 60.5865 What are my recordkeeping requirements?**

(a) You must keep records of all information relied upon in support of any demonstration of plan components, plan requirements, supporting documentation, State measures, and the status of meeting the plan requirements defined in the plan for each interim step and the interim period. After 2029, States must keep records of all

information relied upon in support of any continued demonstration that the final CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rates or CO<sub>2</sub> emissions goals are being achieved.

(b) You must keep records of all data submitted by the owner or operator of each affected EGU that is used to determine compliance with each affected EGU emissions standard or requirements in an approved State plan, consistent with the affected EGU requirements listed in § 60.5860.

(c) If your State has a requirement for all hourly CO<sub>2</sub> emissions and net generation information to be used to calculate compliance with an annual emissions standard for affected EGUs, any information that is submitted by the owners or operators of affected EGUs to the EPA electronically pursuant to requirements in Part 75 meets the recordkeeping requirement of this section and you are not required to keep records of information that would be in duplicate of paragraph (b) of this section.

(d) You must keep records at a minimum for 10 years, for the interim period, and 5 years, for the final period, from the date the record is used to determine compliance with an emissions standard, plan requirement, CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or CO<sub>2</sub> emissions goal. Each record must be in a form suitable and readily available for expeditious review.

#### **§ 60.5870 What are my reporting and notification requirements?**

(a) In lieu of the annual report required under § 60.25(e) and (f) of this part, you must report the information in paragraphs (b) through (f) of this section.

(b) You must submit a report covering each interim step within the interim period and each of the final 2-calendar year periods due no later than July 1 of the year following the end of the period. The interim period reporting starts with a report covering interim step 1 due no later than July 1, 2025. The final period reports start with a biennial report covering the first final reporting period (which is due by July 1, 2032), a 2-calendar year average of emissions or cumulative sum of emissions used to determine compliance with the final CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal (as applicable). The report must include the information in paragraphs (b)(1) through (4) of this section.

(1) The report must include the emissions performance achieved by all affected EGUs during the reporting period, consistent with the plan approach according to § 60.5745(a), and identification of whether each affected

EGU is in compliance with its emission standard and whether the collective of all affected EGUs covered by the State are on schedule to meet the applicable CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or emission goal during the performance periods and compliance periods, as specified in the plan.

(2) The report must include a comparison of the CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal identified in the State plan for the applicable interim step period versus the actual average, cumulative, or adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance (as applicable) achieved by all affected EGUs.

(i) For interim step 3, you do not need to include a comparison between the applicable interim step 3 CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or emission goal; you must only submit the average, cumulative or adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance (as applicable) of your affected EGUs during that period in units of your applicable CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or emission goal.

(3) The report must include all other required information, as specified in your State plan according to § 60.5740(a)(5).

(4) If applicable, the report must include a program review that your State has conducted that addresses all aspects of the administration of the State plan and overall program, including State evaluations and regulatory decisions regarding eligibility applications for ERC resources and M&V reports (and associated EM&V activities), and State issuance of ERCs. The program review must assess whether the program is being administered properly in accordance with the approved plan, whether reported annual MWh of generation and savings from qualified ERC resources are being properly quantified, verified, and reported in accordance with approved EM&V plans, and whether appropriate records are being maintained. The program review must also address determination of the eligibility of verifiers by the State and the conduct of independent verifiers, including the quality of verifier reviews.

(c) If your plan relies upon State measures, in lieu of or in addition to emission standards, then you must submit an annual report to the EPA in addition to the reports required under paragraph (b) of this section for the interim period. In the final period, you must submit biennial reports consistent with those required under paragraph (b) of this section. The annual reports in the interim period must be submitted no later than July 1 following the end of each calendar year starting with 2022.

The annual and biennial reports must include the information in paragraphs (c)(1) and (2) of this section for the preceding year or two years, as applicable.

(1) You must include in your report the status of implementation of federally enforceable emission standards (if applicable) and State measures.

(2) You must include information regarding the status of the periodic programmatic milestones to show progress in program implementation. The programmatic milestones with specific dates for achievement must be consistent with the State measures included in the State plan submittal.

(d) If your plan includes the requirement for emission standards on your affected EGUs, then you must submit a notification, if applicable, in the report required under paragraph (b) of this section to the EPA if your affected EGUs trigger corrective measures as described in § 60.5740(a)(2)(i). If corrective measures are required and were not previously submitted with your state plan, you must follow the requirements in § 60.5785 for revising your plan to implement the corrective measures.

(e) If your plan relies upon State measures, in lieu of or in addition to emission standards, than you must submit a notification as required under paragraphs (e)(1) and (2) of this section.

(1) You must submit a notification in the report required under paragraph (c) of this section to the EPA if at the end of the calendar year your State did not meet a programmatic milestone included in your plan submittal. This notification must detail the implementation of the backstop required in your plan to be fully in place within 18 months of the due date of the report required in paragraph (b) of this section. In addition, the notification must describe the steps taken by the State to inform the affected EGUs in its State that the backstop has been triggered.

(2) You must submit a notification in the report required under paragraph (b) of this section to the EPA if you trigger the backstop as described in § 60.5740(a)(3)(i). This notification must detail the steps that will be taken by you to implement the backstop so that it is fully in place within 18 months of the due date of the report required in paragraph (b) of this section. In addition, the notification must describe the steps taken by the State to inform the affected EGUs that the backstop has been triggered.

(f) You must include in your 2029 report (which is due by July 1, 2030) the calculation of average CO<sub>2</sub> emissions

rate, cumulative sum of CO<sub>2</sub> emissions, or adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> emissions rate (as applicable) over the interim period and a comparison of those values to your interim CO<sub>2</sub> emission performance rate or emission goal. The calculated value must be in units consistent with the approach you set in your plan for the interim period.

(g) The notifications listed in paragraphs (g)(1) through (3) of this section are required for the reliability safety valve allowed in § 60.5785(e).

(1) As required under § 60.5785(e), you must submit an initial notification to the appropriate EPA regional office within 48 hours of an unforeseen, emergency situation. The initial notification must:

(i) Include a full description, to the extent that it is known, of the emergency situation that is being addressed;

(ii) Identify the affected EGU or EGUs that are required to run to assure reliability; and

(iii) Specify the modified emission standards at which the identified EGU or EGUs will operate.

(2) Within 7 days of the initial notification in § 60.5870(g)(1), the State must submit a second notification to the appropriate EPA regional office that documents the initial notification. If the State fails to submit this documentation on a timely basis, the EPA will notify the State, which must then notify the affected EGU(s) that they must operate or resume operations under the original approved State plan emission standards. This notification must include the following:

(i) A full description of the reliability concern and why an unforeseen, emergency situation that threatens reliability requires the affected EGU or EGUs to operate under modified emission standards from those originally required in the State plan including discussion of why the flexibilities provided under the state's plan are insufficient to address the concern;

(ii) A description of how the State is coordinating or will coordinate with relevant reliability coordinators and planning authorities to alleviate the problem in an expedited manner;

(iii) An indication of the maximum time that the State anticipates the affected EGU or EGUs will need to operate in a manner inconsistent with its or their obligations under the State's approved plan;

(iv) A written concurrence from the relevant reliability coordinator and/or planning authority confirming the existence of the imminent reliability threat and supporting the temporary

modification request or an explanation of why this kind of concurrence cannot be provided;

(v) The modified emission standards or levels that the affected EGU or EGU will be operating at for the remainder of the 90-day period if it has changed from the initial notification; and

(vi) Information regarding any system-wide or other analysis of the reliability concern conducted by the relevant planning authority, if any.

(3) At least 7 days before the end of the 90-day reliability safety valve period, the State must notify the appropriate EPA regional office that either:

(i) The reliability concern has been addressed and the affected EGU or EGUs can resume meeting the original emission standards in the State plan approved prior to the short-term modification; or

(ii) There still is a serious, ongoing reliability issue that necessitates the affected EGU or EGUs to emit beyond the amount allowed under the State plan. In this case, the State must provide a notification to the EPA that it will be submitting a State plan revision according to paragraph § 60.5785(a) of this section to address the reliability issue. The notification must provide the date by which a revised State plan will be submitted to EPA and documentation of the ongoing emergency with a written concurrence from the relevant reliability coordinator and/or planning authority confirming the continuing urgent need for the affected EGU or EGUs to operate beyond the requirements of the State plan and that there is no other reasonable way of addressing the ongoing reliability emergency but for the affected EGU or EGUs to operate under an alternative emission standard than originally approved under the State plan. After the initial 90-day period, any excess emissions beyond what is authorized in the original approved State plan will count against the State's overall CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal or emission performance rate for affected EGUs.

**§ 60.5875 How do I submit information required by these Emission Guidelines to the EPA?**

(a) You must submit to the EPA the information required by these emission guidelines following the procedures in paragraphs (b) through (e) of this section.

(b) All negative declarations, State plan submittals, supporting materials that are part of a State plan submittal, any plan revisions, and all State reports required to be submitted to the EPA by the State plan must be reported through EPA's State Plan Electronic Collection

System (SPeCS). SPeCS is a web accessible electronic system accessed at the EPA's Central Data Exchange (CDX) (<http://www.epa.gov/cdx/>). States who claim that a State plan submittal or supporting documentation includes confidential business information (CBI) must submit that information on a compact disc, flash drive, or other commonly used electronic storage media to the EPA. The electronic media must be clearly marked as CBI and mailed to U.S. EPA/OAQPS/CORE CBI Office, Attention: State and Local Programs Group, MD C539-01, 4930 Old Page Rd., Durham, NC 27703.

(c) Only a submittal by the Governor or the Governor's designee by an electronic submission through SPeCS shall be considered an official submittal to the EPA under this subpart. If the Governor wishes to designate another responsible official the authority to submit a State plan, the EPA must be notified via letter from the Governor prior to the September 6, 2016, deadline for plan submittal so that the official will have the ability to submit the initial or final plan submittal in the SPeCS. If the Governor has previously delegated authority to make CAA submittals on the Governor's behalf, a State may submit documentation of the delegation in lieu of a letter from the Governor. The letter or documentation must identify the designee to whom authority is being designated and must include the name and contact information for the designee and also identify the State plan preparers who will need access to SPeCS. A State may also submit the names of the State plan preparers via a separate letter prior to the designation letter from the Governor in order to expedite the State plan administrative process. Required contact information for the designee and preparers includes the person's title, organization and email address.

(d) The submission of the information by the authorized official must be in a non-editable format. In addition to the non-editable version all plan components designated as federally enforceable must also be submitted in an editable version. Following initial plan approval, States must provide the EPA with an editable copy of any submitted revision to existing approved federally enforceable plan components, including State plan backstop measures. The editable copy of any such submitted plan revision must indicate the changes made at the State level, if any, to the existing approved federally enforceable plan components, using a mechanism such as redline/strikethrough. These changes are not part of the State plan until formal approval by EPA.

(e) You must provide the EPA with non-editable and editable copies of any submitted revision to existing approved federally enforceable plan components, including State plan backstop measures. The editable copy of any such submitted plan revision must indicate the changes made at the State level, if any, to the existing approved federally enforceable plan components, using a mechanism such as redline/strikethrough. These changes are not part of the State plan until formal approval by EPA.

#### Definitions

##### **§ 60.5880 What definitions apply to this subpart?**

As used in this subpart, all terms not defined herein will have the meaning given them in the Clean Air Act and in subparts A, B, and TTTT, of this part.

##### **Adjusted CO<sub>2</sub> Emission Rate Means**

(1) For an affected EGU, the reported CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate of an affected EGU, adjusted as described in § 60.5790(c)(1) to reflect any ERCs used by an affected EGU to demonstrate compliance with its CO<sub>2</sub> emission standards; or

(2) For a State (or states in a multi-state plan) calculating a collective CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate achieved under the plan, the actual CO<sub>2</sub> emission rate during a plan reporting period of the affected EGUs subject to the rate specified in the plan, adjusted by the ERCs used for compliance by those EGUs (total CO<sub>2</sub> mass divided by the sum of the total MWh and ERCs).

*Affected electric generating unit* or *Affected EGU* means a steam generating unit, integrated gasification combined cycle (IGCC), or stationary combustion turbine that meets the relevant applicability conditions in section § 60.5845.

*Allowance* means an authorization for each specified unit of actual CO<sub>2</sub> emitted from an affected EGU or a facility during a specified period.

*Allowance system* means a control program under which the owner or operator of each affected EGU is required to hold an allowance for each specified unit of CO<sub>2</sub> emitted from that affected EGU or facility during a specified period and which limits the total amount of such allowances for a specified period and allows the transfer of such allowances.

*Annual capacity factor* means the ratio between the actual heat input to an EGU during a calendar year and the potential heat input to the EGU had it been operated for 8,760 hours during a calendar year at the base load rating.

*Base load rating* means the maximum amount of heat input (fuel) that an EGU can combust on a steady-state basis, as

determined by the physical design and characteristics of the EGU at ISO conditions. For a stationary combustion turbine, *base load rating* includes the heat input from duct burners.

*Biomass* means biologically based material that is living or dead (e.g., trees, crops, grasses, tree litter, roots) above and below ground, and available on a renewable or recurring basis. Materials that are biologically based include non-fossilized, biodegradable organic material originating from modern or contemporarily grown plants, animals, or microorganisms (including plants, products, byproducts and residues from agriculture, forestry, and related activities and industries, as well as the non-fossilized and biodegradable organic fractions of industrial and municipal wastes, including gases and liquids recovered from the decomposition of non-fossilized and biodegradable organic material).

*CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal* means a statewide rate-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal or mass-based CO<sub>2</sub> emission goal specified in § 60.5855.

*Combined cycle unit* means an electric generating unit that uses a stationary combustion turbine from which the heat from the turbine exhaust gases is recovered by a heat recovery steam generating unit to generate additional electricity.

*Combined heat and power unit* or *CHP unit*, (also known as "cogeneration") means an electric generating unit that uses a steam-generating unit or stationary combustion turbine to simultaneously produce both electric (or mechanical) and useful thermal output from the same primary energy source.

*Compliance period* means a discrete time period for an affected EGU to comply with either an emission standard or State measure.

*Demand-side energy efficiency project* means an installed piece of equipment or system, a modification of an existing piece of equipment or system, or a strategy intended to affect consumer electricity-use behavior, that results in a reduction in electricity use (in MWh) at an end-use facility, premises, or equipment connected to the electricity grid.

*Derate* means a decrease in the available capacity of an electric generating unit, due to a system or equipment modification or to discounting a portion of a generating unit's capacity for planning purposes.

*Eligible resource* means a resource that meets the requirements of § 60.5800(a).



*Emission Rate Credit or ERC* means a tradable compliance instrument that meets the requirements of § 60.5790(c).

*EM&V plan* means a plan that meets the requirements of § 60.5830.

*ERC tracking system* means a system for the issuance, surrender and retirement of ERCs that meets the requirements of § 60.5810.

*Final period* means the period that begins on January 1, 2030, and continues thereafter. The final period is comprised of final reporting periods, each of which may be no longer than two calendar years (with a calendar year beginning on January 1 and ending on December 31).

*Final reporting period* means an increment of plan performance within the final period, with each final reporting period being no longer than two calendar years (with a calendar year beginning on January 1 and ending on December 31), with the first final reporting period in the final period beginning on January 1, 2030, and ending no later than December 31, 2031.

*Fossil fuel* means natural gas, petroleum, coal, and any form of solid fuel, liquid fuel, or gaseous fuel derived from such material for the purpose of creating useful heat.

*Heat recovery steam generating unit (HRSG)* means a unit in which hot exhaust gases from the combustion turbine engine are routed in order to extract heat from the gases and generate useful output. Heat recovery steam generating units can be used with or without duct burners.

*Independent verifier* means a person (including any individual, corporation, partnership, or association) who has the appropriate technical and other qualifications to provide verification reports. The independent verifier must not have, or have had, any direct or indirect financial or other interest in the subject of its verification report or ERCs that could impact their impartiality in performing verification services.

*Integrated gasification combined cycle facility or IGCC* means a combined cycle facility that is designed to burn fuels containing 50 percent (by heat input) or more solid-derived fuel not meeting the definition of natural gas plus any integrated equipment that provides electricity or useful thermal output to either the affected facility or auxiliary equipment. The Administrator may waive the 50 percent solid-derived fuel requirement during periods of the gasification system construction, startup and commissioning, shutdown, or repair. No solid fuel is directly burned in the unit during operation.

*Interim period* means the period of eight calendar years from January 1,

2022, to December 31, 2029. The interim period is composed three interim steps, interim step 1, interim step 2, and interim step 3.

*Interim step* means an increment of plan performance within the interim period.

*Interim step 1* means the period of three calendar years from January 1, 2022, to December 31, 2024.

*Interim step 2* means the period of three calendar years from January 1, 2025, to December 31, 2027.

*Interim step 3* means the period of two calendar years from January 1, 2028, to December 31, 2029.

*ISO conditions* means 288 Kelvin (15 °C), 60 percent relative humidity and 101.3 kilopascals pressure.

*M&V report* means a report that meets the requirements of § 60.5835.

*Mechanical output* means the useful mechanical energy that is not used to operate the affected facility, generate electricity and/or thermal output, or to enhance the performance of the affected facility. Mechanical energy measured in horsepower hour must be converted into MWh by multiplying it by 745.7 then dividing by 1,000,000.

*Nameplate capacity* means, starting from the initial installation, the maximum electrical generating output that a generator, prime mover, or other electric power production equipment under specific conditions designated by the manufacturer is capable of producing (in MWe, rounded to the nearest tenth) on a steady-state basis and during continuous operation (when not restricted by seasonal or other deratings) as of such installation as specified by the manufacturer of the equipment, or starting from the completion of any subsequent physical change resulting in an increase in the maximum electrical generating output that the equipment is capable of producing on a steady-state basis and during continuous operation (when not restricted by seasonal or other deratings), such increased maximum amount (in MWe, rounded to the nearest tenth) as of such completion as specified by the person conducting the physical change.

*Natural gas* means a fluid mixture of hydrocarbons (e.g., methane, ethane, or propane), composed of at least 70 percent methane by volume or that has a gross calorific value between 35 and 41 megajoules (MJ) per dry standard cubic meter (950 and 1,100 Btu per dry standard cubic foot), that maintains a gaseous State under ISO conditions. In addition, natural gas contains 20.0 grains or less of total sulfur per 100 standard cubic feet. Finally, natural gas does not include the following gaseous

fuels: Landfill gas, digester gas, refinery gas, sour gas, blast furnace gas, coal-derived gas, producer gas, coke oven gas, or any gaseous fuel produced in a process which might result in highly variable sulfur content or heating value.

*Net allowance export/import* means a net transfer of CO<sub>2</sub> allowances during an interim step, the interim period, or a final reporting period which represents the net number of CO<sub>2</sub> allowances (issued by a State) that are transferred from the compliance accounts of affected EGUs in that state to the compliance accounts of affected EGUs in another State. This net transfer is determined based on compliance account holdings at the end of the plan performance period. Compliance account holdings, as used here, refer to the number of CO<sub>2</sub> allowances surrendered for compliance during a plan performance period, as well as any remaining CO<sub>2</sub> allowances held in a compliance account as of the end of a plan performance period.

*Net electric output* means the amount of gross generation the generator(s) produce (including, but not limited to, output from steam turbine(s), combustion turbine(s), and gas expander(s)), as measured at the generator terminals, less the electricity used to operate the plant (i.e., auxiliary loads); such uses include fuel handling equipment, pumps, fans, pollution control equipment, other electricity needs, and transformer losses as measured at the transmission side of the step up transformer (e.g., the point of sale).

*Net energy output* means:

(1) The net electric or mechanical output from the affected facility, plus 100 percent of the useful thermal output measured relative to SATP conditions that is not used to generate additional electric or mechanical output or to enhance the performance of the unit (e.g., steam delivered to an industrial process for a heating application).

(2) For combined heat and power facilities where at least 20.0 percent of the total gross or net energy output consists of electric or direct mechanical output and at least 20.0 percent of the total gross or net energy output consists of useful thermal output on a 12-operating month rolling average basis, the net electric or mechanical output from the affected EGU divided by 0.95, plus 100 percent of the useful thermal output; (e.g., steam delivered to an industrial process for a heating application).

*Programmatic milestone* means the implementation of measures necessary for plan progress, including specific dates associated with such

implementation. Prior to January 1, 2022, programmatic milestones are applicable to all state plan approaches and measures. Subsequent to January 1, 2022, programmatic milestones are applicable to state measures.

*Qualified biomass* means a biomass feedstock that is demonstrated as a method to control increases of CO<sub>2</sub> levels in the atmosphere.

*Standard ambient temperature and pressure (SATP) conditions* means 298.15 Kelvin (25 °C, 77 °F) and 100.0 kilopascals (14.504 psi, 0.987 atm) pressure. The enthalpy of water at SATP conditions is 50 Btu/lb.

*State agent* means an entity acting on behalf of the State, with the legal authority of the State.

*State measures* means measures that are adopted, implemented, and enforced as a matter of State law. Such measures are enforceable only per State law, and are not included in and codified as part of the federally enforceable State plan.

*Stationary combustion turbine* means all equipment, including but not limited to the turbine engine, the fuel, air, lubrication and exhaust gas systems, control systems (except emissions control equipment), heat recovery system, fuel compressor, heater, and/or pump, post-combustion emissions control technology, and any ancillary components and sub-components comprising any simple cycle stationary combustion turbine, any combined cycle combustion turbine, and any combined heat and power combustion turbine based system plus any integrated equipment that provides electricity or useful thermal output to the combustion turbine engine, heat recovery system or auxiliary equipment.

Stationary means that the combustion turbine is not self-propelled or intended to be propelled while performing its function. It may, however, be mounted on a vehicle for portability. If a stationary combustion turbine burns any solid fuel directly it is considered a steam generating unit.

*Steam generating unit* means any furnace, boiler, or other device used for combusting fuel and producing steam (nuclear steam generators are not included) plus any integrated equipment that provides electricity or useful thermal output to the affected facility or auxiliary equipment.

*Uprate* means an increase in available electric generating unit power capacity due to a system or equipment modification.

*Useful thermal output* means the thermal energy made available for use in any heating application (e.g., steam delivered to an industrial process for a heating application, including thermal cooling applications) that is not used for electric generation, mechanical output at the affected EGU, to directly enhance the performance of the affected EGU (e.g., economizer output is not useful thermal output, but thermal energy used to reduce fuel moisture is considered useful thermal output), or to supply energy to a pollution control device at the affected EGU. Useful thermal output for affected EGU(s) with no condensate return (or other thermal energy input to the affected EGU(s)) or where measuring the energy in the condensate (or other thermal energy input to the affected EGU(s)) would not meaningfully impact the emission rate calculation is measured against the energy in the thermal output at SATP conditions.

Affected EGU(s) with meaningful energy in the condensate return (or other thermal energy input to the affected EGU) must measure the energy in the condensate and subtract that energy relative to SATP conditions from the measured thermal output.

*Valid data* means quality-assured data generated by continuous monitoring systems that are installed, operated, and maintained according to part 75 of this chapter. For CEMS, the initial certification requirements in § 75.20 of this chapter and appendix A to part 75 of this chapter must be met before quality-assured data are reported under this subpart; for on-going quality assurance, the daily, quarterly, and semiannual/annual test requirements in sections 2.1, 2.2, and 2.3 of appendix B to part 75 of this chapter must be met and the data validation criteria in sections 2.1.5, 2.2.3, and 2.3.2 of appendix B to part 75 of this chapter apply. For fuel flow meters, the initial certification requirements in section 2.1.5 of appendix D to part 75 of this chapter must be met before quality-assured data are reported under this subpart (except for qualifying commercial billing meters under section 2.1.4.2 of appendix D), and for on-going quality assurance, the provisions in section 2.1.6 of appendix D to part 75 of this chapter apply (except for qualifying commercial billing meters).

*Waste-to-Energy* means a process or unit (e.g., solid waste incineration unit) that recovers energy from the conversion or combustion of waste stream materials, such as municipal solid waste, to generate electricity and/or heat.

TABLE 1 TO SUBPART UUUU OF PART 60—CO<sub>2</sub> EMISSION PERFORMANCE RATES  
 [Pounds of CO<sub>2</sub> per net MWh]

Affected EGU	Interim rate	Final rate
Steam generating unit or integrated gasification combined cycle (IGCC) .....	1,534	1,305
Stationary combustion turbine .....	832	771

TABLE 2 TO SUBPART UUUU OF PART 60—STATEWIDE RATE-BASED CO<sub>2</sub> EMISSION GOALS  
 [Pounds of CO<sub>2</sub> per net MWh]

State	Interim emission goal	Final emission goal
Alabama .....	1,157	1,018
Arizona .....	1,173	1,031
Arkansas .....	1,304	1,130
California .....	907	828
Colorado .....	1,362	1,174
Connecticut .....	852	786
Delaware .....	1,023	916
Florida .....	1,026	919
Georgia .....	1,198	1,049
Idaho .....	832	771
Illinois .....	1,456	1,245



TABLE 2 TO SUBPART UUUU OF PART 60—STATEWIDE RATE-BASED CO<sub>2</sub> EMISSION GOALS—Continued  
 [Pounds of CO<sub>2</sub> per net MWh]

State	Interim emission goal	Final emission goal
Indiana	1,451	1,242
Iowa	1,505	1,283
Kansas	1,519	1,293
Kentucky	1,509	1,286
Lands of the Fort Mojave Tribe	832	771
Lands of the Navajo Nation	1,534	1,305
Lands of the Uintah and Ouray Reservation	1,534	1,305
Louisiana	1,293	1,121
Maine	842	779
Maryland	1,510	1,287
Massachusetts	902	824
Michigan	1,355	1,169
Minnesota	1,414	1,213
Mississippi	1,061	945
Missouri	1,490	1,272
Montana	1,534	1,305
Nebraska	1,522	1,296
Nevada	942	855
New Hampshire	947	858
New Jersey	885	812
New Mexico	1,325	1,146
New York	1,025	918
North Carolina	1,311	1,136
North Dakota	1,534	1,305
Ohio	1,383	1,190
Oklahoma	1,223	1,068
Oregon	964	871
Pennsylvania	1,258	1,095
Rhode Island	832	771
South Carolina	1,338	1,156
South Dakota	1,352	1,167
Tennessee	1,411	1,211
Texas	1,188	1,042
Utah	1,368	1,179
Virginia	1,047	934
Washington	1,111	983
West Virginia	1,534	1,305
Wisconsin	1,364	1,176
Wyoming	1,526	1,299

TABLE 3 TO SUBPART UUUU OF PART 60—STATEWIDE MASS-BASED CO<sub>2</sub> EMISSION GOALS  
 [Short tons of CO<sub>2</sub>]

State	Interim emission goal (2022–2029)	Final emission goals (2 year blocks starting with 2030–2031)
Alabama	497,682,304	113,760,948
Arizona	264,495,976	60,341,500
Arkansas	269,466,064	60,645,264
California	408,216,600	96,820,240
Colorado	267,103,064	59,800,794
Connecticut	57,902,920	13,883,046
Delaware	40,502,952	9,423,650
Florida	903,877,832	210,189,408
Georgia	407,408,672	92,693,692
Idaho	12,401,136	2,985,712
Illinois	598,407,008	132,954,314
Indiana	684,936,520	152,227,670
Iowa	226,035,288	50,036,272
Kansas	198,874,664	43,981,652
Kentucky	570,502,416	126,252,242
Lands of the Fort Mojave Tribe	4,888,824	1,177,038
Lands of the Navajo Nation	196,462,344	43,401,174
Lands of the Uintah and Ouray Reservation	20,491,560	4,526,862
Louisiana	314,482,512	70,854,046
Maine	17,265,472	4,147,884
Maryland	129,675,168	28,695,256
Massachusetts	101,981,416	24,209,494
Michigan	424,457,200	95,088,128

TABLE 3 TO SUBPART UUUU OF PART 60—STATEWIDE MASS-BASED CO<sub>2</sub> EMISSION GOALS—Continued  
 [Short tons of CO<sub>2</sub>]

State	Interim emission goal (2022–2029)	Final emission goals (2 year blocks starting with 2030–2031)
Minnesota .....	203,468,736	45,356,736
Missouri .....	500,555,464	110,925,768
Mississippi .....	218,706,504	50,608,674
Montana .....	102,330,640	22,606,214
Nebraska .....	165,292,128	36,545,478
Nevada .....	114,752,736	27,047,168
New Hampshire .....	33,947,936	7,995,158
New Jersey .....	139,411,048	33,199,490
New Mexico .....	110,524,488	24,825,204
New York .....	268,762,632	62,514,858
North Carolina .....	455,888,200	102,532,468
North Dakota .....	189,062,568	41,766,464
Ohio .....	660,212,104	147,539,612
Oklahoma .....	356,882,656	80,976,398
Oregon .....	69,145,312	16,237,308
Pennsylvania .....	794,646,616	179,644,616
Rhode Island .....	29,259,080	7,044,450
South Carolina .....	231,756,984	51,997,936
South Dakota .....	31,591,600	7,078,962
Tennessee .....	254,278,880	56,696,792
Texas .....	1,664,726,728	379,177,684
Utah .....	212,531,040	47,556,386
Virginia .....	236,640,576	54,866,222
Washington .....	93,437,656	21,478,344
West Virginia .....	464,664,712	102,650,684
Wisconsin .....	250,066,848	55,973,976
Wyoming .....	286,240,416	63,268,824

TABLE 4 TO SUBPART UUUU OF PART 60— STATEWIDE MASS-BASED CO<sub>2</sub> GOALS PLUS NEW SOURCE CO<sub>2</sub> EMISSION  
 COMPLEMENT  
 [Short tons of CO<sub>2</sub>]

State	Interim emission goal (2022–2029)	Final emission goals (2 year blocks starting with 2030–2031)
Alabama .....	504,534,496	115,272,348
Arizona .....	275,895,952	64,760,392
Arkansas .....	272,756,576	61,371,058
California .....	430,988,824	105,647,270
Colorado .....	277,022,392	63,645,748
Connecticut .....	58,986,192	14,121,986
Delaware .....	41,133,688	9,562,772
Florida .....	917,904,040	213,283,190
Georgia .....	412,826,944	93,888,808
Idaho .....	13,155,256	3,278,026
Illinois .....	604,953,792	134,398,348
Indiana .....	692,451,256	153,885,208
Iowa .....	228,426,760	50,563,762
Kansas .....	200,960,120	44,441,644
Kentucky .....	576,522,048	127,580,002
Lands of the Fort Mojave Tribe .....	5,186,112	1,292,276
Lands of the Navajo Nation .....	202,938,832	45,911,608
Lands of the Uintah and Ouray Reservation .....	21,167,080	4,788,708
Louisiana .....	318,356,976	71,708,642
Maine .....	17,592,128	4,219,936
Maryland .....	131,042,600	28,996,872
Massachusetts .....	103,782,424	24,606,744
Michigan .....	429,446,408	96,188,604
Minnesota .....	205,761,008	45,862,346
Mississippi .....	221,990,024	51,332,926
Missouri .....	505,904,560	112,105,626
Montana .....	105,704,024	23,913,816
Nebraska .....	167,021,320	36,926,888
Nevada .....	120,916,064	29,436,214
New Hampshire .....	34,519,280	8,121,182
New Jersey .....	141,919,248	33,752,728
New Mexico .....	114,741,592	26,459,850

TABLE 4 TO SUBPART UUUU OF PART 60— STATEWIDE MASS-BASED CO<sub>2</sub> GOALS PLUS NEW SOURCE CO<sub>2</sub> EMISSION COMPLEMENT—Continued  
 [Short tons of CO<sub>2</sub>]

State	Interim emission goal (2022–2029)	Final emission goals (2 year blocks starting with 2030–2031)
New York .....	272,940,440	63,436,364
North Carolina .....	461,424,928	103,753,712
North Dakota .....	191,025,152	42,199,354
Ohio .....	667,812,080	149,215,950
Oklahoma .....	361,531,056	82,001,704
Oregon .....	72,774,608	17,644,106
Pennsylvania .....	804,705,296	181,863,274
Rhode Island .....	29,819,360	7,168,032
South Carolina .....	234,516,064	52,606,510
South Dakota .....	31,963,696	7,161,036
Tennessee .....	257,149,584	57,329,988
Texas .....	1,707,356,792	396,210,498
Utah .....	220,386,616	50,601,386
Virginia .....	240,240,880	55,660,348
Washington .....	97,691,736	23,127,324
West Virginia .....	469,488,232	103,714,614
Wisconsin .....	252,985,576	56,617,764
Wyoming .....	295,724,848	66,945,204

[FR Doc. 2015–22842 Filed 10–22–15; 8:45 am]

BILLING CODE 6560–50–P

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that, on this 19th day of February 2016, a copy of the foregoing Addendum Pursuant to Circuit Rule 28(a)(5) to Opening Brief of Petitioners on Core Legal Issues was served electronically through the Court's CM/ECF system on all ECF-registered counsel.

/s/ Elbert Lin  
Elbert Lin